

SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME I

PREFACE	i
GLOSSARY	iii
INTRODUCTION	1
CHAPTER 1: OVERVIEW.....	3
CHAPTER 2: THE PRECOMPLAINT PROCESS—COUNSELING.....	35
CHAPTER 3: FORMAL COMPLAINT PROCESS— ACCEPTANCE AND DISMISSAL	139
CHAPTER 4: INVESTIGATION OF COMPLAINTS.....	309
CHAPTER 5: SETTLEMENT OF COMPLAINTS.....	343
CHAPTER 6: EEO HEARINGS.....	449
CHAPTER 7: FINAL AGENCY ACTION	561
CHAPTER 8: EEOC APPEALS.....	575
CHAPTER 9: REPRESENTATIVES AND OFFICIAL TIME	659
CHAPTER 10: THEORIES OF DISCRIMINATION— INTENTIONAL DISCRIMINATION.....	695
CHAPTER 11: THEORIES OF DISCRIMINATION— ADVERSE/DISPARATE IMPACT	793
CHAPTER 12: THEORIES OF DISCRIMINATION— HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT.....	815
CHAPTER 13: BASES OF DISCRIMINATION UNDER TITLE VII	999

VOLUME II

CHAPTER 14: REHABILITATION ACT	1145
CHAPTER 15: REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION AND GINA.....	1323
CHAPTER 16: AGE DISCRIMINATION IN EMPLOYMENT ACT.....	1513
CHAPTER 17: REPRISAL	1547
CHAPTER 18: PERSONNEL ACTIONS.....	1629
CHAPTER 19: CLASS ACTION COMPLAINTS	1699
CHAPTER 20: EEO ALTERNATIVES	1751
CHAPTER 21: FORMS OF RELIEF	1785
CHAPTER 22: ATTORNEY FEES.....	2067
CIRCUIT COURT CASE CHART 2000–2026	2131
TABLE OF CASES	2133
INDEX	2199

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME I

PREFACE	i
COMMISSION CHANGES.....	i
SUPREME COURT CASES	i
FEDERAL COURT CASES.....	i
COMMISSION CASES.....	i
ATTORNEY FEES.....	i
MEDICAL EXAMS/BLOOD TESTS.....	i
OPPOSITION	i
REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION	i
RELIGIOUS ACCOMMODATION.....	i
SETTLEMENT AGREEMENTS.....	i
THANKS	ii
GLOSSARY	iii
INTRODUCTION	1
I. ORGANIZATION OF THE <i>GUIDE</i>	1
A. RESEARCH FOR THE BOOK	2
B. OTHER REFERENCE SOURCES	2
CHAPTER 1: OVERVIEW.....	3
I. AUTHORITY AND JURISDICTION	3
A. STATUTORY AUTHORITY	3
1. Title VII of the 1964 Civil Rights Act	3
2. Rehabilitation Act of 1973	3
3. Americans With Disabilities Act Amendment Act of 2008	4
4. Age Discrimination in Employment Act	4
5. Equal Pay Act	4
6. Civil Rights Act of 1991	4
7. Congressional Accountability Act of 1995	5
8. No FEAR Act of 2002	5
9. Genetic Information Nondiscrimination Act of 2008.....	7
B. EFFECT OF THE CIVIL SERVICE REFORM ACT	7
C. ORGANIZATION OF THE COMMISSION	7
D. JURISDICTION	8
1. Agencies Covered	8
2. Covered Actions	8
3. Employees Covered	8
4. Remedial Powers	9
5. Unions	9
E. CIVIL ACTIONS	10
II. AGENCY EEO PROGRAMS	11
A. ORGANIZATION OF PART 1614	11
B. AGENCY PROGRAMS	11
1. Affirmative Employment Under Part 1614	11
2. Management Directive 715	12
3. Commission Review of Agency Programs and Policies.....	17
III. PROCESSING EEO COMPLAINTS—PART 1614 AND MD-110	20
A. COMPLAINT COVERAGE	20
1. Department of Veterans Affairs	20
2. General Accounting Office	20
3. Legislative and Judicial Branches	20
4. Military Employees	21

5. Overseas Employees	21
B. AGENCY PROCESSING OF COMPLAINTS	21
1. Administrative Judge Decisions	21
2. Alternative Dispute Resolutions	21
3. Appeals to the EEOC	22
4. Complaint Processing Variances.....	22
5. Conflicts of Interest/Interference With Agency Counsel.....	23
6. Dismissal of Complaints	24
7. Disposition of Complaints	24
8. EEO Counselors and the Precomplaint Stage	25
9. EEO Directors	26
a. Avoiding Conflicts of Interest.....	26
10. Final Agency Decisions and Actions	27
11. Formal Complaints	27
12. Hearings	28
13. Interim Relief	28
14. Investigations	29
15. Notice of Final Interview	30
16. Partial Dismissals	30
17. Requests for Reconsideration	31
IV. CLASS COMPLAINTS	31
A. EEO COUNSELING	31
B. FORMAL COMPLAINT REQUIREMENTS	31
C. AGENCY PROCESSING.....	31
D. PROCESSING BY ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE	32
1. Notification of Class Members	32
2. Development of the Record	32
3. Resolution of Complaints	32
4. Hearings	33
5. Judges' Decisions	33
E. FINAL AGENCY ACTIONS	33
1. Individual Relief	33

CHAPTER 2: THE PRECOMPLAINT PROCESS—COUNSELING..... 35

I. THE 45-DAY TIME LIMIT	36
A. AGENCY BURDEN ON APPEAL	36
B. WAIVER OF PRECOMPLAINT COUNSELING	37
1. Delay by Agency	37
2. Denial of Counseling	37
3. Reopening Counseling.....	38
C. DETERMINING THE PERIOD FOR INITIATING COUNSELING	38
1. Events Not Constituting Personnel Actions	38
2. Events Occurring During Counseling	39
3. New Claims Raised After Counseling	39
4. Notification of Personnel Action	39
5. Personnel Actions	41
D. ESTABLISHING DATE OF COUNSELOR CONTACT	43
II. EXTENDING THE TIME PERIOD FOR INITIATING COUNSELING	43
A. TOLLING THE PERIOD FOR COUNSELING	44
1. Awareness Personnel Action Is Final	44
2. Disabled Employees—Tolling as a Reasonable Accommodation	45
3. Evidence on Tolling	46
4. Language Barriers	46
5. Reasonable Suspicion Standard	46
6. Uncertainty of Law.....	51
B. NOTICE OF PROCEDURES AND TIME LIMITS	51
1. Age Discrimination	51
2. Agency's Burden.....	52
3. Constructive Notice	52
a. Applicants	55
4. Posting Requirements	56

C.	WAIVER OF TIME LIMIT	57
1.	Agency Waiver of Time Limit.....	58
2.	Amended Complaints	58
3.	Circumstances Beyond Control.....	58
4.	Complainants Who Are Attorneys.....	58
5.	Counsel, Death of	58
6.	COVID-19.....	58
7.	Doctrine of Laches	59
a.	Waiting for Agency to Act	59
8.	Family Death or Illness	59
9.	Fear of Reprisal	59
10.	Independent Consultants and Contractors	60
11.	Mental Duress or Physical Inability	60
12.	Military Duty	62
13.	Negotiated Grievance Procedure, Use of	62
14.	New Employees and Applicants	63
15.	Procedures Other Than EEO, Use of	63
16.	Self-Incrimination Concerns.....	64
17.	Status as Minor.....	64
D.	ESTOPPEL	64
1.	Advice by Third Parties	65
2.	Agency Advice and Actions	65
3.	Agency Inaction.....	71
4.	Developing Record on Estoppel.....	71
5.	Failure to Assert Timeliness	71
III.	CONTINUING VIOLATIONS	73
A.	THE SUPREME COURT'S VIEW— <i>MORGAN</i>	73
B.	THE COMMISSION'S VIEW BEFORE <i>MORGAN</i> — <i>ANISMAN</i>	77
C.	PRESENT VIABILITY OF CONTINUING VIOLATION CLAIMS	79
D.	ELEMENTS OF SERIAL CONTINUING VIOLATION CLAIM	80
1.	Personnel Actions	80
2.	Nexus Requirement.....	81
3.	Knew or Should Have Known Requirement	82
4.	Standards of Proof	85
E.	HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT CASES	85
F.	SYSTEMIC OR RECURRING VIOLATIONS	92
1.	Lilly Ledbetter Fair Pay Act of 2009.....	95
2.	Reasonable Accommodation Cases	97
3.	Health Insurance Benefit Cases.....	102
G.	UNTIMELY FORMAL COMPLAINT	102
H.	ISSUES OF RELIEF	102
I.	PARTIAL DISMISSALS	102
1.	Identical Complaints	102
IV.	REQUESTS FOR COUNSELING	103
A.	AMENDING PREVIOUS COMPLAINTS	103
B.	ANONYMOUS CONTACTS.....	103
C.	CONTACT BY REPRESENTATIVES	103
D.	CONTACT DOCUMENTATION	104
E.	CONTACT NOT INVOLVING COUNSELORS	104
1.	"Logically Connected"/Wrong Agency Officials.....	104
a.	Background Caselaw.....	104
b.	Employee and Human Relations Specialists.....	105
c.	Management Officials.....	105
d.	Employee Assistance Program Counselors	106
e.	EEO Assistants.....	106
f.	Internal Affairs/Inspector General	107
g.	Union Officials	107
h.	Reasonable Accommodation Coordinator.....	107
2.	Wrong Agency or Wrong Agency Component	107
3.	Contact With EEOC	108
F.	CONTENTS OF CONTACT	108

G.	EMAIL CONTACT	108
H.	EXTENDING THE COUNSELING PERIOD	109
I.	MAIL CONTACT	109
J.	MIXED CASE APPEALS.....	109
K.	PHONE CONTACT	109
L.	PREMATURE COMPLAINTS	110
V.	DUTIES OF EEO COUNSELOR	110
A.	ADVISING COMPLAINANTS ON PROCEDURES	111
1.	ADEA and EPA Complaints.....	113
2.	Alternative Dispute Resolution	113
3.	Alternative Forums: MSPB & Grievances	113
4.	Class Complaint Counseling	115
5.	Counselor as Investigator	115
6.	Initial Interview	115
B.	DETERMINING CLAIMS	116
1.	Definition of Claim.....	117
2.	Definition of Issues	117
3.	Definition of Evidence	118
4.	Counselor's Duty to Clarify	118
C.	INQUIRIES AND RESOLUTION EFFORTS BY COUNSELORS	119
1.	Limited Inquiry.....	119
2.	Resolution Efforts.....	121
D.	CHOICE OF COUNSELOR	124
E.	ANONYMITY FOR COMPLAINANTS	124
VI.	PROTECTION FOR COUNSELORS	124
A.	RESTRAINT BY COUNSELOR.....	124
VII.	EXCLUSION OF ALLEGATIONS	125
A.	SUFFICIENCY OF ALLEGATIONS	125
B.	DISMISSAL OF COMPLAINTS	125
C.	FAILURE TO PROSECUTE	126
D.	WITHDRAWAL OF ALLEGATIONS	126
VIII.	NOTICE OF FINAL INTERVIEW	127
A.	CONSTRUCTIVE RECEIPT OF NOTICE	130
IX.	EEO COUNSELOR'S REPORT	132
A.	RESPONDING MANAGEMENT OFFICIALS	132
X.	INCIDENTS OCCURRING AFTER PRECOMPLAINT COUNSELING	133
XI.	ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE RESOLUTION	133
A.	CORE PRINCIPLES	133
1.	Confidentiality.....	133
2.	Enforceability.....	134
3.	Neutrality.....	134
4.	Voluntariness	135
B.	TYPES OF ADR	135
1.	Facilitation	135
2.	Mediation	135
3.	Settlement Conferences	135
C.	DEVELOPING ADR PROGRAMS	135
1.	Factors to Consider	136
2.	Training.....	136
3.	Resources for Neutrals.....	136
D.	AGENCY ADMINISTRATION AND PROCESSING	137
1.	ADR and Complaint Processing	137
2.	Alternatives to ADR	137
3.	Attorney Fees.....	137
4.	Counseling Process and ADR.....	137
5.	EEO Counselor's Role	137
6.	Information About the Agency's ADR Program	137
7.	Notice of Rights and Responsibilities.....	138
8.	Requirements of Resolutions.....	138
9.	Time Frames.....	138
E.	ADR AFTER PRECOMPLAINT PROCESSING	138

CHAPTER 3: FORMAL COMPLAINT PROCESS— ACCEPTANCE AND DISMISSAL139

I.	REQUIREMENTS OF FORMAL COMPLAINT	139
A.	COMPLAINANT’S DUTY TO PROCEED/CHANGE IN REPRESENTATION OR ADDRESS.....	141
II.	AGENCY PROCESSING OF COMPLAINT	141
A.	ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF COMPLAINT	141
B.	DEFINING COMPLAINT CLAIMS	143
1.	Avoiding Fragmentation	145
2.	Spin-Off and Dissatisfaction With Process Complaints	148
C.	DISMISSAL PROCESS	150
1.	Partial Dismissals	151
2.	Termination of Agency Jurisdiction to Dismiss	152
D.	ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE RESOLUTION.....	152
E.	EFFECT OF HEARING REQUEST	152
III.	BASES FOR DISMISSAL OF COMPLAINTS	152
A.	UNTIMELY COMPLAINTS	152
1.	Active Military Duty	154
2.	Actual Receipt vs. Availability	154
3.	Bad Faith and Mistaken Advice by Agency	154
4.	Calendar Days	155
5.	Circumstances Beyond Complainant’s Control	155
6.	Clarifying Allegations.....	155
7.	Complaint, Failure to Sign	156
8.	Constructive Receipt.....	156
9.	COVID-19.....	157
10.	Death or Illness in Family	158
11.	Email Filing	159
12.	Failure to Provide Complaint Form.....	159
13.	Formal Complaint, Failure to Include.....	160
14.	Harm	160
15.	In Person Filing.....	160
16.	Incapacity, Mental, or Physical	160
a.	Supporting Evidence.....	162
17.	Inter-Office Mail Filing.....	162
18.	Laches	162
19.	Language Barriers	164
20.	Mail Filing	164
21.	Official Time, Denial.....	165
22.	Posters and Notice	165
23.	Postmarks	165
24.	Premature Complaints	166
25.	Reasonable Accommodation.....	166
26.	Receipt of ROI	166
27.	Representative	167
28.	Representative, Illness of	167
29.	Representative Mistake.....	167
30.	Serious Medical Condition.....	167
31.	Service on Attorney Representative	168
32.	Service on Non-Attorney Representative	168
33.	Severity of the Harassment.....	169
34.	Supporting Documentation.....	170
35.	Telefax Filing	170
36.	Training—Insufficient/Incomplete	171
37.	Unavailability of Complainant.....	171
38.	Unclear Filing Instructions by Agency.....	171
39.	Wrong Agency	171
40.	Wrong EEO Representative	172
B.	STANDING: FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM	172
1.	Standard of Review.....	173
2.	Injury in Fact.....	173

a.	Alleging Harm and the Terms, Conditions and Privileges of Employment.....	173
b.	Disparate Treatment.....	174
c.	Like or Related Claims.....	175
3.	Injury Based on Protected Status	175
4.	Standing in the Federal Courts.....	176
C.	STANDING: FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM—DEFINITION OF EMPLOYEE	178
1.	Applicants for Employment	178
2.	Compensated Work Therapy Program	180
3.	Complaints on Behalf of Others	180
4.	Current Employees	181
5.	Deceased Employees	181
6.	Foreign Nationals	182
7.	Former Employees	182
8.	Group Complaints.....	185
9.	Independent Consultants and Contractors	185
a.	Alleged Wrongdoer	186
b.	Applicants Through Staffing Agencies	187
c.	Contract Employment Agreement.....	188
d.	Control Over Work Environment.....	189
e.	Day to Day Activities; Performance; and Supervision	189
f.	Degree of Control Test	193
g.	Discriminatory Actions Committed by Independent Contractors or Consultants	195
h.	Employment Recommendations.....	195
i.	Interview Process.....	195
j.	Length of Time Working at the Agency.....	196
k.	Level of Skill Required for the Position	196
l.	Location of Work.....	196
m.	Method of Pay and Tax Withholdings.....	196
n.	Mission Critical Work	197
o.	Power to Hire or Terminate	198
p.	Work Performed on Agency Premises and Equipment	200
10.	Informants	201
11.	Interns	201
12.	Law Enforcement and Security Contractors.....	201
13.	National Guard Technicians	202
14.	Other Agency's Employees.....	206
15.	Other Military/Civilian Positions	207
16.	Peace Corps Volunteers	207
17.	Prisoners	208
18.	Public Health Service—Commissioned Officers	208
19.	Reinstated Employees	208
20.	Relatives of Employees.....	208
21.	Senior Environmental Employee (SEE) Program.....	208
22.	Temporary Appointees	208
23.	Trainees.....	208
24.	Tribal Employees	209
25.	Veterans	209
26.	Volunteers	209
D.	STANDING: FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM—AGENCY JURISDICTION	211
1.	Advisory Councils.....	213
2.	Auxiliary Agencies	214
3.	Collateral Attacks on Jurisdiction	215
4.	Employee Organizations	215
5.	Employees Working at Other Agency Locations	215
6.	Executive Agencies	216
7.	General Services Administration	216
8.	Legislative and Judicial Employees	216
9.	Military Departments	217
10.	Office of Personnel Management	220
11.	Presidio Trust.....	222
12.	Unions	222

E.	FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM: INVESTIGATIONS AND OTHER PROCEEDINGS—COLLATERAL ATTACKS	223
1.	Arbitration Awards and the Grievance Process.....	223
2.	Debt Collection Act	223
3.	Drug Tests—Agency Imposed.....	223
4.	EEO and Other Internal Agency Investigations.....	223
5.	Occupational Health and Safety Claims.....	225
6.	Offers of Reemployment	226
7.	Office of Inspector General	227
8.	Office of Workers Compensation Programs	227
9.	On-The-Job Injuries and Workers' Compensation	228
10.	OPM Retirement Process	229
11.	Retaliation Exception to Collateral Attacks Rule	229
F.	STANDING: FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM—SPECIFIC ACTIONS	230
1.	Actions Taken by Entities or Persons Other Than the Agency	230
2.	Agency Organized Activities and Special Emphasis Programs	230
3.	Bases of Discrimination Not Alleged.....	230
4.	Benefits of Employment	231
5.	Cancelled Vacancy Announcements.....	231
6.	Change in Position Description—Work Duties	231
7.	Change in Schedule	232
8.	Collateral Duties	232
9.	Compensatory Damages	232
10.	Complaints on Behalf of Others.....	232
11.	Continuing Vacancies	232
12.	COVID-19	233
a.	Exposure	233
b.	Agency Policies Mandating Vaccinations	233
c.	Vaccination Status Is Not a Covered Basis	234
d.	Religious Accommodation.....	235
13.	Denial of Opportunity to Apply for Position	235
14.	Derogatory Information Disclosed to New Employer.....	235
15.	Discipline.....	235
a.	Failure to Discipline	235
b.	Letters of Counseling	236
c.	Letters of Warning	236
d.	Oral and Written Work Discussions	236
e.	Report of Contact	236
16.	Disclosures to Counsel	236
17.	Discretionary Duties.....	237
18.	Dismissal on Merits	237
19.	Drug and Alcohol Tests	237
20.	Duties, Performance.....	237
21.	EAP Referrals	238
22.	EEO Complaints, Complaints About.....	238
23.	Family and Medical Leave Act Claims	238
24.	Forced Leave	238
25.	Future Actions	239
26.	Harassment Investigations	239
27.	Medical Suitability Determinations	239
28.	Mental Evaluations	239
29.	Negative Recommendations	240
30.	Nonselection—Failure to Apply for Position.....	240
31.	Nonsupervisory Employees, Complaints About	240
32.	Outside Activities	240
33.	Performance Standards	240
34.	Personal Harm Not Alleged	241
35.	Premium Pay	241
36.	Privileges of Employment	241
37.	Proposed Actions and Preliminary Steps	242
38.	Refusal to Discriminate	245
39.	Reimbursement of Medical Expenses.....	245

40. Reliance Upon Other Statutes—Privacy Act and FOIA.....	245
41. Safety Concerns.....	246
42. Searches.....	246
43. Security Clearances/Suitability Determinations.....	246
44. Service Conversions.....	247
45. Settlement Negotiations.....	247
46. Temporary Agency Action.....	248
47. Testimony and Statements in Proceedings.....	248
48. Training.....	249
49. Transfers.....	249
50. Union Activities.....	249
51. Upward Mobility.....	249
52. Whistleblowing.....	249
53. Work Orders.....	249
G. STANDING: FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM—HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT/HARASSMENT.....	250
1. Derogatory Remarks.....	250
2. Duties, Performance.....	254
3. Epithets vs. Derogatory Remarks.....	254
4. Harassment and Reasonable Accommodation.....	255
5. Physical Touching.....	255
6. Sexual Harassment.....	256
7. Subordinate-To-Supervisor Harassment.....	256
8. Threats of Violence.....	257
H. STANDING: FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM—REPRISAL COMPLAINTS.....	257
1. Actions Taken Against Persons Other Than the Complainant.....	258
2. Actions Related to the EEO Process.....	259
3. Actions Related to Worker’s Compensation.....	260
4. Assessments Concerning “Participation in the EEO Process”.....	260
5. Chilling Effect/Future Deterrent.....	260
6. Comments by Supervisors.....	261
7. Duties, Modification.....	261
8. Failure to Discipline for Retaliatory Conduct.....	261
9. Information Provided to Others.....	261
10. Leave Requests.....	261
11. Proposed Actions/Preliminary Steps to Action/Threats.....	261
12. Requests for Medical Information.....	262
13. Retaliatory Investigations.....	262
14. Security Clearance Investigations.....	263
15. Supervisory Refusal to Meet With Complainant.....	263
I. IDENTICAL COMPLAINTS.....	263
1. Identical Civil Actions.....	264
2. <i>Res Judicata</i> and Collateral Estoppel.....	266
a. <i>Res Judicata</i>	267
b. Collateral Estoppel.....	267
c. Settlement Agreement Terms.....	269
3. Offensive Collateral Estoppel.....	269
4. Dismissal for Failure to Exhaust.....	270
5. Law of the Case Doctrine.....	270
J. PROCESSING DISSATISFACTION OR SPIN-OFF COMPLAINTS.....	270
1. Spin-Off Complaints Processing.....	270
2. Investigations of Alleged Discrimination Outside EEO Complaints Process.....	271
3. Compensatory Damages Claims.....	271
4. Hearing Conduct.....	271
5. Reprisal Allegations.....	271
6. Conflict of Interest.....	272
7. Spin-Off Complaints.....	273
K. FAILURE TO PROSECUTE OR COOPERATE.....	273
1. Adjudication on Record.....	274
2. Cooperation With Investigators.....	275
3. Delay by Agency.....	276
4. Hearings.....	277

5. Inability to Locate Complainant.....	277
6. Precomplaint Counseling	277
7. Requests for Additional Information.....	278
8. Settlement Negotiations	281
L. ABUSE OF PROCESS	282
1. Unclean Hands Doctrine.....	286
2. Agency Abuse of Process	287
3. Agency Conflict of Interest	287
4. Numerous Complaints/Claims	287
M. OFFERS OF FULL RELIEF	291
1. Offer of Resolution	291
N. MOOTNESS	292
1. Allegations of Harassment.....	293
2. Apologies	295
3. Attorney Fees	295
4. Cancellation of Vacancy Announcement	295
5. Compensatory Damages	296
6. Constructive Discharge.....	296
7. Discipline of RMO.....	296
8. Job Assignments	296
9. Performance and Other Work Appraisals	297
10. Reasonable Accommodation	297
11. Relief Through Other Forums	297
12. Rescinded Disciplinary Actions.....	298
13. Subsequent Promotions	298
14. Termination of Employment.....	298
O. MATTERS NOT RAISED WITH COUNSELOR	299
1. Matters Raised and Not Included in Formal Complaint	300
P. ELECTION OF REMEDIES	300
1. Negotiated Grievance Procedure	300
2. MSPB Appeals	301
Q. EFFECT OF STATUTES AND REGULATIONS	302
R. CONTRACTUAL OBLIGATIONS	302
S. RELIEF REQUESTED	302
IV. AMENDMENT AND CONSOLIDATION OF COMPLAINTS	302
A. BASIS OF DISCRIMINATION	303
B. SUBSTANTIVE AMENDMENTS	303
1. Time Limits	305
2. MSPB Appeals.....	305
3. Amendment After Hearing Request.....	305
C. CONSOLIDATION	305
1. Time Limits	307
2. Amending Consolidated Complaints	307
3. Different Complainants.....	307
V. WITHDRAWAL OF COMPLAINTS	307

CHAPTER 4: INVESTIGATION OF COMPLAINTS.....309

I. TRAINING FOR INVESTIGATORS	310
II. INVESTIGATIVE PROCEDURES	310
A. METHODS OF INVESTIGATION	311
B. TIMELINESS	312
III. ROLE OF THE INVESTIGATOR	312
A. GATHERING INFORMATION	313
B. RULES OF EVIDENCE.....	313
1. Characteristics of Evidence.....	313
2. Types of Evidence.....	314
3. Sources of Evidence	314
4. Evidence on Remedies	314
C. FACILITATING ADR	315
D. ROLE OF AGENCY COUNSEL	315
E. ROLE OF COMPLAINANT'S REPRESENTATIVE	315

IV. DISMISSAL OF ALLEGATIONS	315
A. UNCLEAR ALLEGATIONS	315
B. PARTIAL DISMISSAL OF CLAIMS	316
C. BAD FAITH ALLEGATIONS.....	316
D. <i>PRIMA FACIE</i> CASE	316
E. RELIEF GRANTED	316
F. PROCEDURAL ISSUES	316
G. FAILURE TO GIVE AFFIDAVIT	317
V. DEVELOPMENTS DURING INVESTIGATION.....	317
A. EVIDENCE	317
B. AMENDMENTS	317
C. NEW CLAIMS	318
VI. FAILURE TO INVESTIGATE CLAIMS	319
A. DIFFERENT BASIS OF DISCRIMINATION	319
B. INADEQUATE INVESTIGATIONS	319
1. Sanctions Against the Agency.....	319
2. Adverse Inference	320
3. Default Judgment	321
4. Summary Judgment	323
5. Remanding for Further Investigation After a Final Decision or Hearing.....	323
6. Final Agency Decisions	324
7. Disability Discrimination Claims.....	328
8. Reasonable Accommodation Claims.....	328
9. Evidence on Remedies	329
10. Shortage of Investigators/Outsourcing Investigations	329
C. <i>EX PARTE</i> INVESTIGATIONS	330
VII. INTERVIEW OF WITNESSES	330
A. DISCLOSURE OF INFORMATION TO WITNESSES.....	330
B. FAILURE TO INTERVIEW WITNESSES	330
C. EMPLOYEE'S RIGHT TO INTERVIEW WITNESSES	331
D. RESPONSIBLE MANAGEMENT OFFICIALS	331
E. RIGHT TO UNION REPRESENTATION	332
VIII. COMPLAINT FILE	332
A. EVIDENCE	332
1. Rejection of Evidence	332
2. Completeness of Record.....	332
B. COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS	333
C. REQUIRED DOCUMENTS	333
1. Retention of Records	333
2. FOIA and Privacy Act Requirements	334
IX. COOPERATION OF COMPLAINANT	335
A. RIGHT TO IMPARTIAL INVESTIGATION	337
B. UNTIMELY INVESTIGATIONS	339
C. LOCATION OF INVESTIGATION	339
D. SUPPLEMENTAL INVESTIGATIONS	340
X. CONSOLIDATION	340
XI. OFFICIAL TIME	340
A. TRAVEL TIME	340
B. TRAVEL EXPENSES	340
XII. CONCLUSIONS OF INVESTIGATORS	341
A. CREDIBILITY FINDINGS OF INVESTIGATOR.....	341
XIII. NOTICE OF HEARING RIGHTS	341

CHAPTER 5: SETTLEMENT OF COMPLAINTS.....343

I. SETTLEMENT POLICIES	343
A. REGULATORY GUIDANCE	343
B. CONFIDENTIALITY AND PRIVILEGE	344
1. Offers of Reemployment	345
C. SETTLEMENT REMEDIES	345
D. SETTLEMENT REQUIREMENTS	346
1. Oral Agreements	346

2.	Knowing and Voluntary Agreements	349
3.	Intent of the Parties	352
4.	Signature of Agreement	355
5.	Consideration	359
6.	Overall Fairness of the Agreement.....	360
7.	Responding Management Official.....	360
E.	EFFECT OF SETTLEMENT	360
II.	OFFERS OF RESOLUTION	361
A.	MODEL LANGUAGE FOR OFFER.....	362
B.	OFFERS OF FULL RELIEF	363
III.	INTERPRETATION OF AGREEMENTS	363
A.	PLAIN ENGLISH RULE	363
1.	Use of Extrinsic Evidence.....	364
B.	INTERPRETING LANGUAGE IN CONTEXT.....	364
C.	CONSTRUING LANGUAGE AGAINST DRAFTER	364
D.	WAIVER OF RIGHTS	365
1.	Waiving Prospective Rights	365
2.	Waiver as a Defense.....	367
3.	ADEA Rights	368
E.	VAGUE AGREEMENTS	368
F.	SPECIFIC TERMS OF SETTLEMENT.....	369
1.	Apologies	369
2.	Back Pay	370
3.	Fair Treatment.....	371
4.	Interest	372
5.	Lump Sum Payments and Taxes	372
6.	Performance Appraisals	373
7.	Priority Consideration.....	373
8.	Promises to Never Apply to the Agency	375
9.	Promotions	375
10.	Reinstatement.....	376
11.	Restoration of Benefits.....	376
12.	Seniority	377
13.	Supervisory Contact.....	378
14.	Telework	378
15.	Terms of Art	378
16.	Transfers; Reassignments	378
G.	SELECTIVE INTERPRETATION	379
H.	EXPUNGEMENT OF RECORDS—"CLEAN PAPER" AGREEMENTS	379
1.	Employment References	381
2.	The History of Executive Orders and Clean Paper Agreements	383
a.	Historical Reference to EO 13839.....	384
I.	TIME LIMITS ON AGREEMENTS	385
1.	Duration of Agreement.....	385
a.	Settlements With Time Limitations	385
b.	Settlements Without Time Limitations	386
c.	Reasonableness Standard and Good Faith Compliance	387
d.	Modifying the Agreement.....	388
2.	Execution of Terms.....	388
J.	ELEMENT OF GOOD FAITH	390
1.	Bad Faith Negotiations	391
2.	Bad Faith Execution.....	393
K.	INTEGRATION OR ZIPPER CLAUSES	395
L.	CONFIDENTIALITY CLAUSES	395
1.	Disclosure of Settlements	398
2.	Confidentiality of Settlement Process	398
M.	SEVERABILITY CLAUSES	399
N.	SUPERVISION CLAUSES	399
O.	GENERAL RELEASES	399
P.	MISREPRESENTATIONS IN THE SETTLEMENT PROCESS	400
Q.	COLLECTIVE BARGAINING AGREEMENTS	401

R. AGENCY POLICIES AND PROCEDURES	403
IV. COMPENSATORY DAMAGES	404
V. COMPLIANCE WITH SETTLEMENT AGREEMENTS	405
A. ENFORCEMENT OF AGREEMENTS	405
1. Agreements Reached After Decision	406
2. Agreements With More Than One Complainant	406
3. Bankruptcy	406
4. Compliance Through Prior Acts	406
5. Death of Complainant	406
6. Impossibility of Compliance	406
7. Invalid Settlement Agreements	407
8. Time Limits	408
B. REMEDIES FOR FAILURE OF AGENCY TO COMPLY	411
1. Partial Compliance—Return to <i>Status Quo Ante</i>	412
2. Partial Compliance—Age Discrimination	415
3. Interest as Sanction	415
4. Attorney Fees	415
C. FAILURE OF EMPLOYEE TO COMPLY	415
1. Agency Compliance Petitions	416
D. SETTLEMENTS IN CIVIL ACTIONS	416
E. FILING OF NEW COMPLAINTS	416
F. REPRISAL	416
G. DISCRIMINATORY SETTLEMENT AGREEMENTS	417
H. SUBSEQUENT ACTS	419
VI. VOIDING SETTLEMENT AGREEMENTS	419
A. UNFORESEEN CIRCUMSTANCES	420
B. BAD FAITH	420
1. Coercive Agreements	421
2. Rescinding of Agreement	422
C. ADVICE OF REPRESENTATIVES	422
D. DETRIMENTAL RELIANCE AND RATIFICATION	422
E. LACK OF CONSIDERATION—ILLUSORY AGREEMENTS	425
1. Benefits Already Incurred	425
2. Discretionary Benefits	425
3. Impossibility	425
4. Legal Detriment Requirement	426
5. Mutual Mistake of Fact or Law	427
a. Void	427
b. Voidable	429
c. Reforming an Agreement	430
d. Unilateral Mistake of Fact	430
6. Promises to Grant Something to Which an Employee Is Already Entitled	431
7. Promises to Not Break the Law	432
8. Vague Provisions	433
F. WAIVER OF PROSPECTIVE EEO CLAIMS AND LAST CHANCE SETTLEMENTS	433
G. LACK OF REPRESENTATIVE AUTHORITY	435
H. OLDER WORKERS' BENEFIT PROTECTION ACT	435
1. Broad Application and Scope of the OWBPA	437
2. Court Decisions: Void vs. Voidable	439
3. Reinstating the Complaint and Tender Back Provisions	443
4. Remedial Effect of OWBPA Violations	444
5. Time Limits for Breach Claims Under the OWBPA	444
I. SUBSEQUENT AGREEMENTS	444
VII. SETTLEMENTS REACHED THROUGH OTHER PROCEDURES	444
VIII. RETIREMENT ISSUES	445
IX. ATTORNEY FEE ISSUES	447
A. FAILURE TO MENTION FEE ISSUE	447
B. SEVERANCE OF FEE ISSUES	447
1. Fee Determination by Judge	448
C. DETERMINING REASONABLE FEES	448

CHAPTER 6: EEO HEARINGS.....449

I. PREHEARING MATTERS	450
A. POWERS OF THE ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE.....	450
1. Administrative Judges' Handbook	453
2. Subpoenas	453
3. Contract Administrative Judges	453
B. RIGHT TO HEARING	453
1. Request for Hearing	454
a. Timing.....	454
b. Method of Communicating Request for a Hearing.....	455
c. Effect of Filing Hearing Request.....	455
d. Constructive and Imputed Notice of Right to Request a Hearing	455
e. Content of Notice of Right to a Hearing.....	456
f. Content of the Request for a Hearing	456
g. Filing Request With the Incorrect Entity or Office	456
h. Effect of Waiving or Failure to Request a Hearing.....	457
2. Service of Hearing Request	457
3. Effect of Hearing Request.....	458
4. Withdrawal of Request for Hearing	458
5. Waiver of Hearing.....	458
6. Failure to Attend Hearing	459
C. AGENCY'S HEARING RESPONSIBILITIES	460
D. RIGHT TO NEUTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE	460
E. VENUE	460
F. REVIEW OF REPORT OF INVESTIGATION	461
1. Sanctions for Nonhearing-Related Conduct	462
G. DISMISSAL OF COMPLAINTS.....	464
1. Review of Partial Dismissals.....	464
H. PREHEARING ORDERS	465
1. Docketing Order.....	465
2. Acknowledgment and Order	465
3. Scheduling Order	466
4. Prehearing Conference	466
I. WITNESS LISTS	466
1. Unavailability of Witnesses	467
J. SCHEDULING OF HEARING	467
1. Notice of Remand	468
2. Convenience to Parties	468
3. Hearing Notice	469
K. BIFURCATED DAMAGES HEARINGS	469
L. POSTPONEMENT OR CONTINUANCE OF HEARING	469
M. SETTLEMENT	471
1. Conferences With Hearing Judge.....	471
2. Conferences With Settlement Judge.....	471
3. Alternative Dispute Resolution	472
4. Settlement Agreements.....	472
N. OFFERS OF FULL RELIEF	472
1. Admission of Discrimination.....	473
2. Back Pay	473
3. Compensatory Damages	474
4. Enforcement of Offers	474
5. Final Action.....	474
6. Full Relief Elements	474
7. Harassment.....	474
8. Interest	475
9. Leave Denial.....	475
10. Performance Ratings.....	475
11. <i>Poirrier</i> Settlements	475
12. Reassignments.....	476
13. Reinstatement	476
14. Relief Through Other Procedures.....	476

15. Reputational Damage.....	476
16. Retirement Issues.....	476
17. Test for Full Relief.....	476
18. Time Limits.....	477
19. Training.....	477
20. Unconditional Relief.....	477
21. Writing Requirement.....	478
O. STIPULATIONS.....	478
P. AGENCY REPRESENTATIVES.....	478
Q. SPIN-OFF COMPLAINTS.....	478
R. AMENDMENT AND CONSOLIDATION OF COMPLAINTS.....	478
1. Amendments.....	478
2. Consolidation.....	480
S. DEFINITION OF CLAIMS.....	480
T. RULINGS OF ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE.....	480
1. Nondispositive Rulings.....	480
2. Motion Practice.....	481
3. Motion to Reconsider.....	481
II. SUMMARY JUDGMENT.....	481
A. SUMMARY JUDGMENT STANDARDS.....	482
1. Appellate Standards.....	485
B. SUMMARY JUDGMENT PROCEDURES.....	485
1. <i>Sua Sponte</i> Summary Judgment.....	485
2. Motion by Party.....	486
3. Oral Argument.....	486
4. Failure to Respond to Motion.....	486
5. Pending Discovery Issues.....	487
C. DISPUTES OF MATERIAL FACT.....	488
1. Burden.....	488
2. Inferences.....	488
3. Credibility Issues.....	488
4. Extension of the Investigative Process.....	491
5. Evidence of Discrimination.....	493
6. Inadequate Investigation/Development of the Record.....	493
7. Summary Judgment as Sanction.....	494
8. Selection Cases.....	494
9. Harassment Cases.....	496
10. Disability/Reasonable Accommodation Cases.....	499
11. Comparators.....	500
12. "Allegations, Speculations and Conclusory Statements" and Additional Details.....	500
D. JUDGMENT AS A MATTER OF LAW.....	501
E. PARTIAL SUMMARY JUDGMENT.....	501
III. DISCOVERY.....	501
A. DISCOVERY SCOPE AND PROCEDURES.....	502
1. Time Period Covered by Discovery.....	504
B. DISCOVERY DEVICES.....	504
1. Commission Guidance on Discovery.....	504
2. Depositions.....	506
3. Discovery Costs.....	508
4. Interrogatories.....	508
5. Medical Examinations.....	509
6. Production of Documents.....	510
7. Requests for Admissions.....	510
8. Restrictions on Medical Records.....	511
9. Restrictions on Tax Records.....	511
C. OBLIGATION TO PRODUCE EVIDENCE.....	511
1. <i>In Camera</i> Review.....	511
2. Privacy Act Objections.....	511
3. <i>Pro Se</i> Complainants.....	512
4. Protective Orders.....	512
5. Designation of Most Knowledgeable Person.....	513

6. Tax Returns	513
D. MOTIONS TO COMPEL DISCOVERY	514
E. DISCOVERY SANCTIONS	514
1. Justice Memo Halting Fees as Sanctions	516
2. Reinstatement of Fees as Sanctions	519
3. Good Faith Obligation	520
4. Sanctions Against Complainants	521
5. Sanction Procedures	523
6. Sanction Orders	523
F. PSYCHOTHERAPIST PRIVILEGE	523
IV. HEARING PROCEDURES	526
A. PRELIMINARY HEARING MATTERS	526
1. Persons Allowed at Hearing	526
2. Off-The-Record Discussions	527
3. Presentation of Evidence	527
4. Reasonable Accommodation of Complainant and Witnesses	527
5. Introductory and Opening Statements	527
B. EVIDENCE	527
1. Best Evidence	527
2. Destruction of Evidence	527
3. Documentary Evidence	530
4. Failure to Produce Evidence	531
5. Hearsay Evidence	532
6. Relevancy	532
7. Unduly Repetitious Evidence	533
8. Use of "Private" Documents	533
C. WITNESSES	533
1. Alternative Means of Testimony	534
2. Designation of Witnesses	534
3. EEO Counselors	535
4. Exclusion of Complainant	535
5. Exclusion of Witnesses	535
6. Failure to Produce Witness	537
7. Presence of Complainant	538
8. Representations of Counsel	539
9. Statement During Settlement	539
10. Telephonic Hearings and Testimony	539
11. Video Hearings and Testimony	542
12. Witness Intimidation	543
D. CREDIBILITY DETERMINATIONS	543
1. Appeal of Credibility Findings	544
2. Corroboration Evidence	544
3. Credibility vs. Veracity	544
4. Demeanor	545
5. Findings Based on Assumptions	546
6. Findings Based on Evidence of Record	546
7. Findings Related to Motivation	546
8. Impeachment Evidence	547
9. Internally Inconsistent Testimony	547
10. Leading Questions	548
11. Plausibility of Testimony	548
12. Previous Credibility Findings	548
13. Qualifications of Witness	548
14. Refusal to Testify	548
15. Relationship of Parties	548
16. Rules of Deference	548
17. Scripted Testimony	550
18. Self-Serving Testimony	550
19. Split Credibility Findings	550
20. Testimony and Findings in Other Proceedings	550
E. ALLEGATIONS RAISED AT HEARING	551

F. OBJECTIONS	551
G. OFFICIAL TIME	551
H. ROLE OF JUDGE	551
1. Regulating Conduct of Hearing	552
2. Developing the Record	553
3. Amended Complaints	553
I. RESPONSIBLE MANAGEMENT OFFICIAL	554
J. RECORD OF HEARING	554
K. CLOSING STATEMENTS	555
L. CONDUCT OF REPRESENTATIVES	555
1. <i>Ex Parte</i> Communications	555
M. CLOSING THE HEARING RECORD	556
V. POSTHEARING MATTERS	556
A. DECISION OF ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE	556
1. Adopting Position of Parties	556
2. Bench Decisions	556
3. Contents of Decision	557
4. Decision by Judge Not Presiding	558
5. Default Judgments	558
6. Delay in Decisions	558
7. Directed Verdict	558
8. Errata Decisions	559
9. External Evidence	559
10. Relief	559
B. BIAS	559

CHAPTER 7: FINAL AGENCY ACTION561

I. FINAL AGENCY ORDER AFTER HEARING	562
A. TIME LIMITS	562
B. PROCEDURAL ISSUES	563
II. FINAL AGENCY DECISION WITHOUT HEARING	563
A. COMPLAINANT'S CONSIDERATIONS	564
B. CONTENTS OF FINAL DECISION	565
1. Credibility Findings	565
C. ADOPTING FINDINGS OF INVESTIGATOR	566
D. REASONS ARTICULATED	566
E. DECIDING OFFICIAL	566
F. RESCINDING FINAL AGENCY DECISION	567
1. Draft Decisions	568
G. ADJUDICATION IN LIEU OF DISMISSAL	568
III. REQUIREMENTS OF FINAL AGENCY ACTION	568
A. APPEAL RIGHTS	569
1. Partial Dismissals	569
2. Failure to Issue Final Agency Action	569
B. ATTORNEY FEES	570
IV. CONFLICTS OF INTEREST	571
V. FILING OF CIVIL ACTION	571
VI. ENFORCEMENT OF FINAL AGENCY DECISIONS	572

CHAPTER 8: EEOC APPEALS575

I. APPEALABLE ACTIONS	575
A. FINAL AGENCY ACTIONS	575
1. Failure to Issue Final Agency Action	576
B. FINAL AGENCY DECISIONS	577
1. Failure to Issue Final Agency Decision	577
C. MSPB AND NEGOTIATED GRIEVANCE DECISIONS	578
II. PROCEDURES FOR APPEAL—COMPLAINANTS	578
A. TIME LIMITS	579
1. Dismissal by Administrative Judge	579
2. Computation of Time	579
3. Decisions Amended by Administrative Judge	580

4. Waiver of Time Limit	580
5. Agency Failure to Issue Final Decision/Order	582
6. Filing With Wrong Agency	583
7. Filing by Telephone	583
B. SERVICE OF DOCUMENTS	584
III. PROCEDURES FOR APPEAL—AGENCIES	584
A. TIME LIMITS	584
B. SERVICE OF DOCUMENTS.....	585
C. INTERIM RELIEF	585
D. BRIEF IN SUPPORT OF APPEAL	585
IV. RECORD ON APPEAL	585
A. COMPLAINT FILE	586
B. IDENTIFICATION OF PARTIES.....	587
C. SUPPLEMENTATION OF RECORD	587
1. New Evidence	588
D. SUBMISSION OF EVIDENCE	588
E. DISMISSED CLAIMS	589
V. SCOPE OF REVIEW	589
A. JURISDICTIONAL ISSUES	589
B. PRESERVING ISSUES FOR APPEAL	589
1. Withdrawal of Hearing Request.....	589
2. Agency Implementation of Decision	589
C. HARMLESS ERROR	589
D. SELF-CORRECTION OF ERROR	589
1. Effect of Other Cases	590
E. MULTIPLE CLAIMS.....	590
F. NEW CLAIMS	590
1. Claims Not Raised by Parties	590
G. CONSOLIDATION OF APPEALS	591
VI. STANDARDS OF REVIEW	591
A. ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE DECISIONS	592
1. Summary Judgment	592
2. Witness Credibility	592
3. Burdens of Persuasion	594
4. Prehearing and Hearing Rulings.....	594
5. Basis of Discrimination.....	594
6. Factual Errors	594
7. Attorney Fee Awards	595
B. FINAL AGENCY DECISIONS	595
1. Credibility Determinations	595
C. PROCESSING COMPLAINTS	596
D. <i>PRO SE</i> COMPLAINANTS.....	596
E. SHORT-FORM DECISIONS.....	596
F. PRECEDENTIAL VALUE OF EEOC DECISIONS	597
G. PRECEDENTIAL VALUE OF DECISIONS BY OTHER AGENCIES.....	597
H. INTERPRETATION OF COURT DECISIONS	597
I. DEFERENCE TO AGENCIES INTERPRETATION OF LAW AND POLICYMAKING.....	597
VII. REVIEW OF SANCTIONS	597
A. AJ RESPONSIBILITIES PRIOR TO ISSUING SANCTIONS.....	598
B. CONFUSING/BURDENSOME/ONEROUS AJ ORDERS	600
C. DEFAULT JUDGMENT.....	601
D. SANCTIONS AGAINST AGENCIES	601
1. Failure to Timely Complete Investigation/Issue Final Agency Decision.....	602
2. Failure to Produce or Destruction of Documents.....	603
3. Failure to Produce or Destruction of Supervisory Notes	607
4. Failure to Produce Witnesses or Secure Affidavits.....	608
5. Failure to Respond to Judge's Orders.....	610
6. Failure to Produce File on Appeal.....	611
7. Failure to Produce Hearing Transcript	613
8. Default Judgments	613
a. Agency Delay.....	613

b. Failure to Comply With an Order.....	620
c. Failure to Produce Report of Investigation	622
d. Frivolous Motions Practice	623
e. Show Cause Requirement	623
f. Compensatory Damages After a Default Judgment Award	626
9. Intrusion by Agency Counsel in Case Processing	627
E. ATTORNEY FEES AS SANCTIONS	627
1. Fees as Sanctions Under ADEA.....	629
2. Appointment of Attorney as Sanction	629
F. SANCTIONS AGAINST COMPLAINANTS	630
1. Assessing Costs Against a Complainant	630
2. Attorney Fees Awards.....	630
3. Contumacious Conduct.....	630
4. Discovery Conduct	632
5. Failure to Appear at Hearing	633
6. Failure to Comply With AJ's Orders/Requests/Instructions.....	634
a. Hearing Dismissal Upheld	634
b. Hearing Dismissal Reversed.....	635
c. Exclusion of Evidence.....	638
d. Health of the Representative.....	638
e. Adverse Inference.....	638
7. Imposing Settlement as a Form of Sanctions	638
8. Mutual Failures.....	638
9. Notice	638
10. Threatening Conduct.....	639
G. SANCTIONS AT APPELLATE LEVEL	639
1. Sanctions on Procedural Dismissals	641
H. EFFECT OF DISMISSAL ON SANCTIONS.....	641
VIII. COMPLIANCE AND ENFORCEMENT	642
A. ENFORCEMENT OF COMMISSION DECISIONS	642
1. Remands.....	647
B. PREVENTATIVE RELIEF	647
C. COMPLIANCE	649
IX. FILING OF CIVIL ACTION	651
A. EFFECT OF FILING	651
B. TIME FOR FILING.....	651
X. REQUESTS FOR RECONSIDERATION	651
A. PROCEDURES AND TIME LIMITS	652
B. EFFECT OF REQUEST	653
C. CRITERIA FOR RECONSIDERATION	653
1. Clearly Erroneous Interpretation	654
2. Substantial Impact.....	655
3. New and Material Evidence	655
4. Inconsequential Factual Error.....	656
5. Commission's Own Motion	656
XI. REQUESTS FOR CLARIFICATION	657
A. REQUESTS FOR ENFORCEMENT	657
XII. APPEAL OF EEOC DECISIONS	658
A. DELAY IN EEOC DECISIONS.....	658

CHAPTER 9: REPRESENTATIVES AND OFFICIAL TIME659

I. RIGHT TO REPRESENTATION	659
II. AGENCY REPRESENTATIVES	659
A. ROLE OF AGENCY REPRESENTATIVE.....	659
1. Definition of Agency Representative.....	659
2. Role During Agency Processing of Complaint; Intrusion/Interference Complaints	659
3. Attorney-Client Relationship	666
B. SCOPE OF REPRESENTATION	667
C. EEOC RESTRICTIONS ON AGENCY REPRESENTATIVES	667
D. FLRA RESTRICTIONS ON AGENCY REPRESENTATIVES	668
1. Disciplinary Meetings.....	668

2. Formal Meetings.....	668
III. COMPLAINANTS' REPRESENTATIVES.....	671
A. SCOPE OF REPRESENTATION	671
B. DESIGNATION OF REPRESENTATIVE	672
C. SERVICE OF DOCUMENTS	673
D. UNION REPRESENTATIVES	673
E. WITHDRAWAL FROM REPRESENTATION	673
F. COMPLAINTS BY REPRESENTATIVES	673
IV. WAIVER OF ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGE OR WORK PRODUCT; AGENCY DELIBERATIVE PROCESS	673
V. EXCLUSION, DISQUALIFICATION, AND LIMITATIONS ON REPRESENTATIVES	674
A. CONFLICTS OF INTEREST	674
1. Official Time Restrictions	676
B. EXCLUSION OF REPRESENTATIVES	676
1. Exclusion Procedure	676
2. Authority for Exclusion.....	676
3. Standards for Exclusion.....	677
4. Exclusion Through Settlement	679
C. DISQUALIFICATION AND SUSPENSION	679
1. Procedure for Disqualification and Suspension	679
2. Standard for Disqualification and Suspension	680
3. Referral to Bar	684
D. USE OF SANCTIONS	684
VI. USE OF OFFICIAL TIME	685
A. OFFICIAL TIME COMPLAINTS	685
B. DEFINITION OF REASONABLE TIME	685
1. Consultations With Representative	686
2. EEO Counseling	687
3. EEO Meetings.....	687
4. EEOC Settlement Conferences	687
5. Preparation Time	687
6. Soliciting Evidence on Agency Time	687
7. Official Time Policies.....	688
8. Official Time Requests and Denials	688
9. Duty Status of Employee	688
10. Civil Actions	688
C. REPRESENTATIVES AND OFFICIAL TIME	689
1. Restrictions on Representatives' Time	689
2. Official Time Complaints	690
3. Representation of Applicants for Employment	691
4. Representation of Former Employees	691
D. TECHNICAL REPRESENTATIVES	692
E. COMPENSATION AND BENEFIT ISSUES.....	692
1. Overtime	692
2. Restoration of Time.....	693
3. Payment of Costs	693
VII. USE OF AGENCY EQUIPMENT AND RESOURCES	693
VIII. PROCESSING OFFICIAL TIME COMPLAINTS	694

CHAPTER 10: THEORIES OF DISCRIMINATION— INTENTIONAL DISCRIMINATION.....695

I. CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE CASES	696
A. EVOLUTION OF "DISPARATE TREATMENT" THEORY	696
1. Elements of <i>Prima Facie</i> Case	698
2. Penalties	700
3. Effect of Regulations and Policies	700
4. Discretionary Acts	700
5. Performance Expectations	700
B. BASIS FOR DISPARATE TREATMENT	701
1. Comparison Employees	702
a. Similarly Situated.....	702

b. Agency Policies.....	703
c. Nonselection.....	703
d. Disciplinary Cases.....	703
e. Duties/Benefits/Position Titles.....	706
f. Length of Service.....	706
g. Supervisors/Chain of Command.....	706
2. No Comparison Employees	707
a. Nonselection.....	710
b. Discipline.....	710
3. Subjective Criteria.....	710
4. Accuracy of Beliefs.....	710
C. APPLICATION FOR POSITION	710
1. Cancellation of Position	710
2. Constructive Application.....	711
3. Multiple Vacancies	711
D. QUALIFICATION FOR POSITION	711
E. ALLEGED DISCRIMINATING OFFICIALS.....	711
F. ELEMENT OF INTENT	711
1. Knowledge of Protected Group	712
2. Genuine Mistakes.....	714
3. Intent of Third Parties	716
G. DISCRIMINATORY INFLUENCE OF OTHERS—THE “CAT’S PAW”	716
H. DIRECT EVIDENCE OF DISCRIMINATION	721
II. AGENCY BURDEN OF PRODUCTION—CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE.....	721
A. DISPARATE TREATMENT	721
1. Best Interests of Agency	724
2. Experience	724
3. Failure of Agency to Cooperate	725
4. Failure of Agency to Provide Reasons	725
5. Leave Restrictions	726
6. Mandatory Sanctions	726
7. Natural Consequences of Discriminatory Acts.....	727
8. Nonselections and Promotions	727
9. Past Discipline	729
10. <i>Post Hoc</i> Justifications.....	729
11. Probationary Employees	730
12. Similarly Situated Employees; Meaningful Distinctions	730
13. Training.....	732
14. Work Habits.....	732
B. WITNESS CREDIBILITY	732
C. AFFIRMATIVE ACTION PLANS	733
D. AVOIDING ADVERSE IMPACT LITIGATION.....	734
E. RELIANCE ON AGENCY REGULATIONS	736
F. RELIANCE ON COLLECTIVE BARGAINING AGREEMENT	736
G. RELIANCE ON STATE LAW	736
H. CORRECTING DISCRIMINATION BY NONSUPERVISORY PERSONNEL	737
III. PRETEXT—CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE CASES	737
A. <i>HICKS</i> AND THE BURDEN OF PERSUASION	737
1. Commission Interpretation of <i>Hicks</i>	741
2. Agency’s Burden Under <i>Hicks</i>	745
3. Proof of Intent Under <i>Hicks</i>	746
4. <i>Hicks</i> in Jury Cases.....	748
5. Case Law Prior to <i>Hicks</i>	748
B. CAUSAL CONNECTION	749
1. Disciplinary Cases	749
2. Hiring Freezes	751
3. Inadequate Resources	751
4. Light Duty	751
5. Nonselection	752
6. Preselection	755
7. Qualifications	755

8. Receipt of Unemployment Compensation	756
9. Test Results	756
10. Training	756
11. Work Environment	756
12. Zero Tolerance Policies	757
C. INCONSISTENT EVIDENCE/TESTIMONY	758
D. PRIOR DISCRIMINATION	759
E. STATISTICAL EVIDENCE	759
F. PROCEDURAL IRREGULARITIES	760
G. COLLECTIVE BARGAINING AGREEMENTS	761
H. DEROGATORY COMMENTS	761
I. EVIDENCE OF BIAS	762
1. Past Statements and Actions	763
2. "Me Too" Evidence	763
J. TIMING OF AGENCY ACTION	764
K. CROSS EXAMINATION	764
1. Inconsistent Statements	764
L. EQUITABLE AND COLLATERAL ESTOPPEL	765
M. COURT ORDERS	765
N. ALTERNATIVE, NONDISCRIMINATORY REASONS	765
IV. DIRECT EVIDENCE AND "MIXED MOTIVE" CASES	766
A. THE <i>PRICE WATERHOUSE</i> ANALYSIS	767
B. CIVIL RIGHTS ACT OF 1991	771
1. ADEA	772
C. <i>DESERT PALACE</i> , CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE AND THE MIXED-MOTIVE ANALYSIS	772
D. DEFINING DIRECT EVIDENCE	775
E. MIXED MOTIVES IN HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT CASES	779
F. REBUTTING MIXED MOTIVE EVIDENCE	780
G. REPRISAL AND MIXED MOTIVES	783
V. LIMITATIONS ON LIABILITY	783
A. AFTER-ACQUIRED EVIDENCE DOCTRINE	783
B. STANDARD OF PROOF	787
C. THE "CLEAR AND CONVINCING" STANDARD	789

CHAPTER 11: THEORIES OF DISCRIMINATION— ADVERSE/DISPARATE IMPACT793

I. THE <i>GRIGGS</i> CASE	793
II. THE <i>WARDS COVE</i> CASE	794
III. THE CIVIL RIGHTS ACT OF 1991	796
A. <i>PRIMA FACIE</i> CASE	797
1. Agency's Investigatory Burden	798
B. AGENCY'S BURDEN—BUSINESS NECESSITY	798
1. Personal Protective Equipment	798
2. Criminal Arrests	799
C. ALTERNATIVE METHODS	802
D. SUBJECTIVE SELECTION PRACTICES	802
E. STATUTE OF LIMITATIONS	802
F. AGE DISCRIMINATION IN EMPLOYMENT ACT	802
G. PREGNANCY DISCRIMINATION ACT	803
IV. UNCONSCIOUS/IMPLICIT BIAS	803
V. UNIFORM GUIDELINES ON EMPLOYEE SELECTION PROCEDURES	805
A. "BOTTOM LINE" CONCEPT	805
B. VALIDITY STUDIES	808
C. SUITABLE ALTERNATIVES	808
1. Affirmative Action	809
VI. AFFIRMATIVE ACTION PROGRAMS	809
A. RECRUITMENT	810
1. Responsibilities of OPM	810
2. Responsibilities of Agencies	810
B. SELECTION AND ADVANCEMENT	811

1. Conditions for Affirmative Action	812
2. Establishing Affirmative Action Plans	812
3. Effects of Adopting a Plan.....	812
4. Using Plan as Affirmative Defense	812
5. Training Programs.....	812
C. VIOLATIONS OF AFFIRMATIVE ACTION PLANS	812
1. Court Orders and Consent Decrees	813
2. Special Emphasis Programs.....	813

CHAPTER 12: THEORIES OF DISCRIMINATION— HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT.....

815

I. TANGIBLE EMPLOYMENT ACTION: SEXUAL HARASSMENT	817
A. DEFINITIONS	817
1. Link With Hostile Environment.....	817
2. Supervisors	818
3. Tangible Employment Action	820
4. Tangible Employment Actions on Bases Other Than Sex.....	821
B. ELEMENTS OF A CLAIM	822
1. Causal Connection With Gender.....	822
2. Knowledge of Agency	823
3. Preferential Treatment for Submission to Advances	823
4. <i>Prima Facie</i> Case	825
5. Reprisal	825
6. Tangible Employment Actions	826
7. Threats of Tangible Employment Actions	826
8. Unwelcome Advances	826
9. Violent Responses to Harassment	827
II. HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT/HARASSMENT, GENERALLY.....	828
A. <i>MERITOR</i> AND <i>HARRIS</i>	828
B. OTHER BASES OF HARASSMENT.....	830
C. BURDENS OF PROOF	830
1. “ <i>Prima Facie</i> ” Case	830
2. Agency’s Burden	832
D. FRAGMENTED OR PIECEMEAL ANALYSIS.....	833
III. HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT—HARASSMENT BASES	834
A. NATURE OF CONDUCT—ALL BASES	834
B. SEX-BASED.....	836
1. Non-Sexual/Gender-Based Harassment	836
a. Comments.....	836
b. Obscene, Rude, Aggressive Conduct.....	837
c. Attire and Dress.....	838
2. Sexual Harassment	839
a. Conduct	839
b. Unwelcome Advances	844
c. Consensual Conduct	848
3. Sexual Orientation and Gender Identification.....	849
4. Pregnancy	850
5. Severe or Pervasive Requirement	850
a. By Supervisor	851
b. Comments and Rumors	852
c. Conduct Directed Toward Others.....	853
d. Context in Which the Alleged Harassment Occurred.....	854
e. Continuous Conduct or Presence of Harasser	855
f. Corroborative Evidence and Demeanor Evidence	855
g. Harassment Outside of the Workplace	856
h. Isolated or One-Time Incidents	857
i. Low-Level Harassment.....	860
j. Name Calling.....	861
k. Nature of Work.....	861
l. Offensive Looks.....	861

m.	Passage of Time Between Incidents.....	862
n.	Physical Contact or Conduct	864
o.	Physical Proximity.....	866
p.	Preferred Pronoun/Misgendering/Deadnaming	866
q.	Psychological Harm	870
r.	“Reasonable Person” vs. “Reasonable Woman”	872
s.	Repeated Incidents.....	874
t.	Routine Work Assignments.....	874
u.	Rumors	875
v.	Severity	875
w.	Severity and Frequency of Conduct—Sliding Scale	876
x.	Sexual Innuendo.....	876
y.	Subjective Test.....	877
z.	Tangible Employment Actions	877
aa.	Trivial or Inconsequential Conduct—Sexual Harassment.....	880
bb.	Verbal Abuse	880
cc.	Work Performance and the “Hostility” Requirement	880
dd.	Work Scrutiny and Increased Assignments.....	881
6.	Sex of Perpetrator and Victim	881
a.	Harassment of Male Employees	881
b.	Environment Hostile Toward Females.....	883
c.	Complaints by Alleged Harasser	885
d.	Same-Sex Harassment and <i>Oncale</i>	886
e.	<i>Oncale</i> —Establishing Same-Sex Harassment as a Claim	886
f.	Gender Stereotyping.....	888
g.	Commission Cases.....	888
h.	Harassment of Both Sexes.....	891
C.	RELIGION-BASED HARASSMENT	893
1.	Tangible Employment Actions	894
2.	Hostile Work Environment	895
3.	Anti-Harassment and Proselytizing	899
4.	Liability.....	900
D.	COLOR-BASED HARASSMENT.....	901
E.	RACE-BASED HARASSMENT	901
1.	Tangible Employment Actions	902
2.	Racial Slurs.....	902
3.	One-Time Incidents.....	907
4.	Repeated Incidents.....	908
5.	Incidents Occurring Outside of the Complainant’s Presence.....	909
6.	Increased Work Scrutiny and Assignments.....	911
7.	Same Race Harassment.....	911
8.	Racist Symbols.....	911
9.	Microaggressions	915
10.	Inferiority/Intelligence/Cultural References.....	917
11.	Conduct Directed Toward Others.....	918
12.	Performance-Related.....	918
13.	Subjective Test.....	918
F.	NATIONAL ORIGIN-BASED HARASSMENT	919
1.	Severe or Pervasive Analysis	919
2.	Slurs.....	921
3.	Liability.....	922
G.	DISABILITY-BASED HARASSMENT	922
1.	“Based on Disability” Requirement.....	924
2.	Harassment Causing a Disabling Condition	925
3.	Comments About Reasonable Accommodations.....	925
4.	Comments Made in Front of Others.....	926
5.	Comments Made Outside of the Complainant’s Presence.....	926
6.	Isolated Incidents	926
7.	Increased Scrutiny of Work and Assignments.....	926
8.	Failure to Accommodate	927
9.	Program Audits	927

10. Reasonable Accommodation Denial.....	928
11. Unwelcome Requirement	929
12. Absence Inquiry Letters	929
H. AGE-BASED HARASSMENT	930
I. REPRISAL-BASED HARASSMENT	931
1. Harassment by Filing Civil Action.....	933
J. COVID-RELATED.....	934
1. EEOC’S Technical Assistance on Pandemic-Related Harassment Due to National Origin, Race, or Other Protected Characteristics	934
a. Addressing COVID-Related Harassment	934
b. Responding to COVID-Related Harassment	934
2. COVID and Harassment.....	934
K. GENETIC INFORMATION.....	935
L. INTERSECTION OF TWO OR MORE PROTECTED BASES.....	935
M. INTRACLASS HARASSMENT	938
N. STEREOTYPING.....	938
IV. SOCIAL MEDIA/TEXTING AND HARASSMENT.....	939
A. CLAIMS OF HARASSMENT VIA SOCIAL MEDIA	939
B. LINK TO THE WORKPLACE/AGENCY INVOLVEMENT	940
C. DISCIPLINING SOCIAL MEDIA HARASSERS	942
D. PRIVACY VIOLATIONS RELATED TO SOCIAL MEDIA POSTS.....	942
V. OVERVIEW OF LIABILITY FOR HARASSMENT	942
A. THE RULES OF AGENCY: THE MASTER-SERVANT RELATIONSHIP	943
B. BASIC RULES OF LIABILITY	944
C. TANGIBLE EMPLOYMENT ACTION HARASSMENT	944
1. Supervisors.....	945
2. Supervisors Who Lack Authority.....	945
D. HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT HARASSMENT—SUPERVISORS AND COWORKERS	945
1. Prompt and Effective Corrective Action.....	946
a. Notice.....	947
b. Notice—Source of Knowledge.....	948
c. Notice—Past Knowledge of Harassing Behavior	948
d. Counseling.....	949
e. Agency Policies and Guidance on Responding to Claims of Harassment	949
f. Prompt Action and Investigations.....	949
g. Harasser Unknown.....	951
h. Corrective Action.....	952
i. Strength of Corroborating Evidence	953
j. Complainant’s Duty to Take Advantage of Corrective Opportunities.....	954
k. Effect of Agency Anti-Harassment Policies on Liability	955
l. Severity or Pervasiveness of Harassing Behavior	956
m. Preventing Harassment.....	956
n. Separating the Harasser and the Victim: Moving the Harasser.....	957
o. Separating the Harasser and the Victim: Moving the Victim	958
p. Returning the Alleged Harasser to the Workplace	960
q. Limiting Liability	960
r. Disciplining the Victim.....	961
s. <i>Pre-Burlington Industries and Faragher</i> Caselaw	962
2. Restoration of Employee Benefits.....	963
3. Duty to Make Follow-Up Inquiries	964
4. Past Harassment by Perpetrator	965
5. Cessation of Conduct	965
E. HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT HARASSMENT—SUPERVISORS TO SUBORDINATE EMPLOYEES.....	966
1. Definition of Supervisor.....	967
2. Knowledge of Agency	972
3. Reasonable Care and the Affirmative Defense	972
4. Harassment Policies	976
5. Failure to Avoid Harm	977
6. Harassment of Detailed Employees.....	978
7. Prompt Remedial Action	979
8. “Alter Ego” Theory.....	980

F.	HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT HARASSMENT—COWORKER TO COWORKER	980
1.	Knowledge of Agency	980
2.	Agency's Duty to Investigate	983
3.	Failure to Cooperate in Investigation	985
G.	HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT HARASSMENT—SUBORDINATE EMPLOYEES TO SUPERVISORS	985
H.	HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT HARASSMENT—NON-EMPLOYEES TO EMPLOYEES	987
1.	Employee Organizations	989
2.	Hospitals/Veterans Affairs	989
I.	SUMMARY JUDGMENT	991
J.	DISCIPLINE OF RMO	992
1.	Harassers' Claims Over Discipline	993
K.	AGENCY-WIDE CORRECTIVE MEASURES	994
L.	CONSTRUCTIVE ADVERSE ACTIONS	994
M.	MOOTNESS	997
VI.	PROOF PROBLEMS	997

CHAPTER 13: BASES OF DISCRIMINATION UNDER TITLE VII999

I.	DIVERSITY, EQUITY AND INCLUSION	1000
II.	RACE AND COLOR DISCRIMINATION	1000
A.	THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN RACE AND COLOR	1001
1.	Same Race or Color	1001
2.	Racial Stereotyping	1002
B.	MARITAL STATUS AND OTHER ASSOCIATIONS	1002
C.	SICKLE CELL ANEMIA	1002
D.	CRIMINAL ARRESTS AND CONVICTIONS	1002
E.	POLITICAL STATEMENTS	1006
F.	GROOMING CODES	1006
III.	SEX DISCRIMINATION	1006
A.	<i>BONA FIDE</i> OCCUPATIONAL QUALIFICATION	1007
B.	SENIORITY SYSTEMS	1012
C.	MARITAL STATUS	1012
D.	SEXUAL ORIENTATION; TRANSGENDER STATUS/GENDER IDENTIFICATION	1013
1.	Executive Order 14168—"Defending Women"	1013
2.	Transgender as a Protected Basis Related to Single-Person Bathroom Usage and Other "Intimate Areas"	1013
3.	Current Caselaw	1016
4.	<i>Bostock v. Clayton</i> : Recognizing Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity Under Title VII	1017
5.	Gender Stereotyping	1019
6.	History of Commission Cases on Transgender Status and Sexual Orientation	1020
7.	Post- <i>Bostock</i> Commission Decisions	1028
8.	Gender Identification—Bathroom Usage	1030
a.	<i>Lusardi</i> —No Longer Good Federal Sector Law	1030
9.	Religious Objections	1033
10.	Sexual Orientation, Transgender Status, and the Courts	1034
11.	Prohibited Personnel Practice	1037
12.	Office of Special Counsel	1038
E.	ASSOCIATIONAL DISCRIMINATION	1038
F.	CAREGIVER RESPONSIBILITIES	1039
G.	FALSE ALLEGATIONS OF SEXUAL HARASSMENT	1040
H.	RECRUITMENT	1041
I.	PREGNANCY DISCRIMINATION ACT	1041
1.	Pregnant Workers Fairness Act of 2022	1042
a.	Addressing Gaps in Protection	1042
2.	Definitions	1043
3.	Burdens of Proof	1043
4.	Direct Evidence of Pregnancy Discrimination	1048
5.	Disparate Treatment	1049
6.	Past and Potential Pregnancy	1051
7.	Remarks About Pregnancy	1052
8.	Lactation and Breast-Feeding	1053
9.	Abortion and Contraception	1055
a.	Abortion Under the Pregnant Workers Fairness Act	1055

10. Marital Status	1056
11. Leave	1056
12. Light Duty	1057
13. BFOQ Defense	1057
J. GENDER-BASED SUBJECTIVE CRITERIA	1057
K. DRESS CODES AND GROOMING STANDARDS	1058
L. MEDICAL EXAMS.....	1059
M. COLLECTION OF GENDER INFORMATION.....	1060
N. EQUAL PAY ACT	1060
1. Regulatory Guidance	1060
2. EPA Analysis and Burdens of Proof/Substantially Equal Work	1060
a. Statutes and Policies Governing Pay	1061
b. Prior Compensation.....	1061
c. Pay Band Systems.....	1063
d. Location of Work.....	1064
e. Negotiated Salaries.....	1064
f. Job Tasks	1064
g. Common Core of Tasks	1065
h. Desk Audits/Job Classification Systems	1065
i. Recruitment and Retention Pay	1066
j. “Bureaucratic Inertia”.....	1067
k. Resume and Hiring Criteria	1068
l. Special Assignments.....	1068
3. “Pay Setting” Policies.....	1068
4. Relationship to Title VII	1068
5. Liquidated Damages	1068
O. “SEX PLUS” DISCRIMINATION	1069
IV. NATIONAL ORIGIN	1069
A. CITIZENSHIP	1071
B. SECURITY CLEARANCES	1071
C. MARITAL STATUS AND OTHER ASSOCIATIONS	1071
1. Client and Customer Preferences	1072
D. SELECTION PROCEDURES	1072
1. Bottom Line Concept	1072
2. Height and Weight Requirements	1072
3. Education	1072
E. LANGUAGE FLUENCY	1072
1. Accent Discrimination	1074
2. Foreign Languages/Bilingual Requirements	1078
3. “Speak English Only” Rule and Restrictive Language Policies	1079
F. MIXED NATIONALITY	1084
G. <i>BONA FIDE</i> OCCUPATIONAL QUALIFICATION	1084
H. NATIVE AMERICANS	1084
V. RELIGION	1085
A. 2020 ENFORCEMENT GUIDANCE REVISIONS	1086
B. DEFINITION	1086
1. Nature and Sincerity of Belief	1087
C. INTENTIONAL DISCRIMINATION CASES.....	1088
1. Discrimination Within Religions.....	1089
2. Failure to Hold Belief	1089
3. Espousal of Beliefs	1089
4. Clothing and Religious Articles.....	1092
5. Observances on Agency Premises	1093
6. Same-Sex Marriage and Communications With LGBTQ Content	1093
7. National Security Interests.....	1093
D. ACCOMMODATION OF BELIEFS	1094
1. <i>Prima Facie</i> Case	1094
2. Request for Accommodation	1095
3. Privacy Act Considerations	1096
4. Accuracy of Employee’s Beliefs	1097
5. Practices Requiring Accommodation	1097

6. Choice of Accommodation.....	1097
7. Unduly Burdening the Employee With No Justification.....	1098
E. ACCOMMODATION PROCEDURES AND ANALYSIS	1099
F. SPECIFIC ACCOMMODATIONS.....	1101
1. Agency Communications.....	1101
2. Agency Investigations, Cooperation in	1102
3. Assignments of Work.....	1102
4. COVID-19.....	1102
5. Dress and Grooming Standards	1104
6. Drug Rehabilitation Programs	1106
7. Health Effects of Religious Observances	1106
8. Optional Religious Activities.....	1106
9. Personal Effects	1108
10. Personal Identification.....	1109
11. Prayer and Proselytizing	1109
12. Probationary Employees	1110
13. Reassignments.....	1110
14. "Requirements of the Job"	1110
15. Schedules	1111
a. Break Schedules.....	1112
b. Claims of Discrimination Based on the Religious Accommodation of Another	1112
c. Denying "Significant Employment Benefits".....	1112
d. Leave	1112
e. "Swapping" Shifts	1113
16. Teleworking.....	1113
17. Training—Opting Out	1114
18. Use of Agency Facilities.....	1115
G. UNDUE HARDSHIP	1115
1. Burden.....	1115
2. Cost.....	1115
3. Overtime	1117
4. Collective Bargaining Agreements	1117
5. Espousing Religious Ideas	1120
6. Photographs	1120
7. Postal Service Oath	1121
8. Preemployment Inquiries	1121
9. Selection Schedules	1121
10. Sex-Segregated Schools	1121
11. Work Schedules	1122
VI. REVERSE DISCRIMINATION	1126
A. BENEFICENT DISCRIMINATION	1126
B. REMEDIAL DISCRIMINATION	1126
VII. INTERSECTIONAL DISCRIMINATION	1126
VIII. WHITE HOUSE GUIDELINES ON RELIGION	1127
A. EXPRESSION IN WORKPLACE	1127
1. Private Work Areas	1127
2. Expression Among Employees.....	1128
3. Expression Directed at Employees.....	1128
4. Expression in Public Areas	1129
B. DISCRIMINATION BASED ON RELIGION	1129
1. Personnel Actions and Employment Conditions.....	1129
2. Hostile Environment	1129
3. <i>Bona Fide</i> Occupational Requirement	1129
C. RELIGIOUS ACCOMMODATION	1130
IX. CIVIL RIGHTS ACT OF 1991	1131
A. PURPOSE OF LEGISLATION	1131
B. DISCRIMINATION REMEDIES	1131
1. Intentional Discrimination	1131
2. Punitive Damages	1131
3. Compensatory Damages	1131
4. Expert Witness Fees	1132

5. Interest on Back Pay Awards	1132
6. Retroactivity of Remedies	1132
7. Jury Trials	1135
C. BURDENS OF PROOF	1135
1. Intentional Discrimination Cases.....	1135
2. Disparate or Adverse Impact Cases	1136
3. Seniority Systems	1136
4. Consent Orders and Decrees	1136
D. STATUTE OF LIMITATIONS	1137
1. Age Discrimination in Employment Act.....	1137
E. LEGISLATIVE BRANCH EMPLOYEES	1137
1. House of Representatives Employees	1137
2. U.S. Senate Employees	1137
VIII. CONGRESSIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY ACT—LEGISLATIVE EMPLOYEES	1140
A. EMPLOYEES COVERED.....	1140
B. COVERAGE PROVIDED	1140
C. RIGHTS AND REMEDIES	1141
D. ATTORNEY FEES	1141
E. ENFORCEMENT	1141
F. ADMINISTRATIVE AND JUDICIAL PROCEDURES	1143
1. Counseling.....	1143
2. Mediation.....	1143
G. ELECTION OF REMEDIES	1143
1. Administrative Hearing.....	1143
2. Appeals	1144
3. Judicial Review	1144
H. CIVIL ACTIONS.....	1144

VOLUME II

CHAPTER 14: REHABILITATION ACT 1145

I. COVERAGE UNDER THE REHABILITATION ACT	1147
A. IMPACT OF THE ADA AMENDMENTS ACT OF 2008.....	1147
1. Effective Date.....	1148
2. ADAAA Regulations.....	1148
B. QUALIFIED INDIVIDUALS	1148
1. Individuals Without Disabilities	1149
2. Drug and Alcohol Abuse	1150
C. AGENCIES AND EMPLOYEES COVERED	1150
1. Legislative and Judicial Employees	1150
2. Probationary Employees	1150
3. Temporary Employees.....	1151
4. Association With Persons With Disabilities	1151
5. Disabled Veterans	1153
D. THEORIES OF DISCRIMINATION	1153
II. DEFINING QUALIFIED INDIVIDUALS	1153
A. PHYSICAL AND MENTAL IMPAIRMENTS	1155
1. Record of Impairment.....	1155
2. Regarded as Impairments	1156
B. MAJOR LIFE ACTIVITIES	1156
1. <i>Toyota</i> and Major Life Activities	1157
2. Major Bodily Functions	1158
3. Working	1159
C. SUBSTANTIAL LIMITATION UNDER THE ADA	1159
1. Substantial Limitation: Commission's Past View	1159
2. Substantial Limitation and the <i>Sutton</i> Trilogy	1160
3. <i>Toyota</i> and Substantial Limitation	1162
D. SUBSTANTIAL LIMITATION UNDER THE ADAAA—RULES OF CONSTRUCTION	1166
1. Broad and Inclusive Coverage	1167
2. Most People Comparison	1167

3.	Extensive Analysis Not Required	1168
4.	Individualized Assessment	1169
5.	No Scientific or Medical Evidence Required.....	1169
6.	Mitigating Medications, Measures and Devices	1169
7.	Episodic Conditions; Conditions in Remission	1172
8.	Limitation of Major Life Activities.....	1173
9.	Transitory or Temporary and Minor Impairments	1174
a.	Severity.....	1174
b.	No End Date.....	1176
c.	Pre-ADAAA Case Law	1176
10.	COVID-19.....	1177
a.	Commission's Technical Assistance	1177
b.	Long-Term COVID	1177
c.	Vaccination Status.....	1179
11.	A Common-Sense Approach.....	1180
12.	Substantial Limitation on Working	1180
13.	Predictable Assessments	1182
14.	Condition, Manner and Duration	1183
15.	Proving Substantial Limitation	1184
E.	CASE LAW ANALYSIS UNDER THE ADAAA	1185
F.	RECORD OF DISABILITIES	1190
G.	REGARDED AS DISABILITIES.....	1191
1.	<i>Nassau County School Board v. Arline</i>	1191
2.	Regarded as Disabilities and Working	1195
a.	Caselaw Prior to the ADAAA.....	1198
3.	Regarded as and Other Major Life Activities	1200
4.	COVID-19 and "Regarded As"	1203
H.	DEMONSTRATION OF QUALIFIED	1203
1.	Official Diagnosis Not Necessary/Focus on Effects	1204
2.	The "Relevant Position".....	1204
3.	Agency Efforts to Reasonably Accommodate in Determining "Qualified"	1206
4.	Essential Job Functions, Generally	1206
5.	Nexus Requirement	1208
6.	Job Attendance.....	1210
a.	Current Conventions and Past Practice	1210
b.	Nexus	1211
c.	Essential Functions and Undue Hardship.....	1213
d.	Overtime.....	1219
e.	Return to Work Requirement	1219
f.	Views of the Courts	1220
g.	Shifting Burdens of Proof.....	1220
7.	Performance of Essential Job Functions	1221
a.	Performance Issues vs. Ability to Perform Essential Functions of the Job	1223
8.	How Essential Job Functions Are Performed	1224
9.	Essential Job Functions and Production Standards.....	1225
10.	Essential Job Functions and Position Descriptions.....	1226
11.	Essential Job Functions and Performance Ratings	1226
12.	Removing Essential Job Functions	1227
13.	Reassignment and Modifying Essential Functions	1227
14.	Essential Functions and Position Requirements	1228
15.	Inability to Perform in Current Position	1228
16.	Reasonable Accommodation	1229
17.	Removal of Essential Functions During COVID-19.....	1231
18.	Effect of Disability Retirement	1231
19.	Collaboration	1232
I.	KNOWLEDGE OF DISABILITY	1232
1.	Intentional Discrimination	1233
2.	Constructive Knowledge	1233
J.	REQUESTS FOR ACCOMMODATION	1235
K.	MEDICAL EVIDENCE	1237
1.	Reasonable Medical Documentation.....	1238

2.	Updating Medical Information.....	1241
3.	Agency's Burden—Individualized Assessment.....	1242
4.	Conflicting Medical Opinions.....	1242
III.	SPECIFIC DISABILITIES.....	1243
A.	DRUG AND ALCOHOL ABUSE.....	1243
1.	Statutory Basis.....	1243
2.	1991 Civil Rights Act and ADA.....	1244
3.	Evidence of Disability.....	1246
IV.	PROCESSING COMPLAINTS UNDER REHABILITATION ACT.....	1247
A.	INITIATION OF COMPLAINT.....	1247
1.	Combination With Title VII Bases.....	1247
B.	COMPLAINT STAGE.....	1247
1.	Investigations.....	1247
V.	ANALYZING DISPARATE TREATMENT COMPLAINTS UNDER REHABILITATION ACT.....	1247
A.	INTENTIONAL DISCRIMINATION CASES: ANALYSIS.....	1247
1.	<i>Prima Facie</i> Case.....	1248
2.	Burden Shifting.....	1248
B.	INTENTIONAL DISCRIMINATION CASES BASED ON DISABILITY.....	1249
1.	Agency Imposed Job Requirements.....	1249
2.	Forced to Work in Excess of Medical Restrictions.....	1249
3.	Temporary Appointments.....	1249
4.	Reductions-In-Force.....	1250
5.	Misconduct and Performance Cases.....	1250
6.	Agency-Induced Misconduct.....	1251
7.	Selection and Promotion.....	1252
8.	Reassignments.....	1252
9.	Fear for Safety of Others.....	1252
10.	Requiring Acceptance of Accommodation.....	1253
11.	Overtime.....	1253
12.	Medical Insurance Benefits.....	1253
13.	Alternative Discrimination Theories.....	1256
C.	DISPARATE IMPACT CASES.....	1256
D.	HOSTILE WORK ENVIRONMENT.....	1256
E.	HEARING STAGE.....	1257
VI.	HIRING, PLACEMENT AND ADVANCEMENT.....	1257
A.	PREFERENTIAL TREATMENT.....	1258
1.	Affirmative Action Plans and Goals.....	1259
2.	Targeted Disabilities.....	1259
3.	Veterans Preference.....	1259
4.	Executive Order 13163.....	1259
B.	SCHEDULE A APPOINTMENTS.....	1259
C.	JOB INTERVIEWS.....	1261
1.	Reasonable Accommodation.....	1261
D.	EMPLOYMENT CRITERIA AND QUALIFICATION STANDARDS.....	1261
1.	Requiring a Disability.....	1266
2.	Applicants for Employment.....	1266
3.	Uncorrected Vision Standards.....	1267
4.	Aviation and Transportation Security Act.....	1272
E.	CLASS ACTIONS.....	1275
VII.	MEDICAL INQUIRIES AND EXAMINATIONS.....	1275
A.	PREEMPLOYMENT INQUIRIES.....	1275
1.	OPM Inquiries.....	1281
2.	Conditional Offers of Employment.....	1281
3.	Drug Tests.....	1282
4.	Disabled Veterans.....	1282
5.	Polygraph Examinations.....	1282
6.	Medical Clearance.....	1282
7.	Relief for Violations.....	1282
B.	POSTAPPOINTMENT INQUIRIES.....	1285
1.	Absence Inquiry Letters.....	1286
2.	Fitness-For-Duty Examinations: Performing Essential Functions and Direct Threat.....	1286

a. Fitness-For-Duty Examinations Found Permissible	1287
b. Fitness-For-Duty Examinations Not Permissible	1290
c. Continued Medical Examinations.....	1294
3. Fitness-For-Duty Exams and the MSPB.....	1295
4. Documentation of Continuing Absence or Accommodation	1296
5. Clearance to Return to Work	1296
6. Routine Blood Tests	1298
7. Requests for Updated Medical Information	1298
8. Medical Inquiries and <i>Giglio</i>	1300
9. Annual Hearing Tests	1301
10. Bid Positions.....	1301
11. Employee Assistance Programs	1301
12. Disability Retirement	1301
13. Medical Inquiries by Supervisors to Other Agency Components	1301
14. Security Clearance-Related Inquiries	1302
15. Obvious Disabilities.....	1302
16. <i>Per Se</i> Violations	1302
C. COVID-RELATED MEDICAL INQUIRIES.....	1302
1. Hiring and Onboarding	1304
D. MEDICAL DISCLOSURES AND CONFIDENTIALITY OF MEDICAL INFORMATION	1305
1. Complaints on Behalf of Others.....	1306
2. EEOC'S Technical Assistance on Reasonable Accommodations	1306
a. Storing Medical Information	1306
b. Reporting/Disclosing COVID-19 Diagnosis	1307
3. COVID-19 Contact Tracing Process	1307
4. Disclosure in EEO Investigations.....	1308
5. Disclosure by Agency Counsel	1308
6. Inadvertent Disclosures	1309
7. Information Disclosed	1309
8. Need to Know/Logically Connected	1311
9. Subpoena of Medical Information	1312
10. Waiver of Confidentiality	1313
E. CONFIDENTIALITY OF MEDICAL DOCUMENTS	1314
VIII. PERFORMANCE AND CONDUCT ISSUES	1315
A. ADOPTING PERFORMANCE AND CONDUCT STANDARDS	1316
B. PERFORMANCE STANDARDS	1316
1. Performance Evaluations.....	1317
C. PERFORMANCE PROBLEMS CAUSED BY A DISABILITY	1318
D. CONDUCT STANDARDS.....	1319
1. Source of Rules.....	1320
2. Disciplinary Actions.....	1320
E. DISCUSSION OF DISABILITY	1322

CHAPTER 15: REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION AND GINA..... 1323

I. OVERVIEW OF REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION AND UNDUE HARDSHIP	1323
A. <i>PRIMA FACIE</i> CASE	1323
B. BURDEN SHIFTING ANALYSIS.....	1324
1. Medical Documentation and Examinations.....	1326
a. Workplace Policies	1326
C. AGENCY KNOWLEDGE OF DISABILITY	1327
1. Constructive Knowledge	1328
D. DEFINITION OF REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION	1329
1. Nexus Requirement.....	1330
2. Acceptance or Rejection of Accommodation	1330
3. Constructive Discharge	1331
4. Balancing Test	1331
5. Presumption of Reasonableness	1331
6. Temporary Accommodations	1332
7. Preference of Employee	1333
8. Good Faith Accommodation Efforts	1335
9. Rights of Other Employees	1339

10. Discipline as Accommodation	1339
II. DEFENSES TO REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION	1339
A. UNDUE HARDSHIP	1339
1. Proving Undue Hardship	1341
a. Undue Hardship Claims Must Be Detailed and Specific	1341
b. Last Minute Requests	1343
c. Impact on Other Employees and Work	1344
d. Evidence of Past Accommodations	1345
e. Cost	1346
f. Credibility of Undue Hardship Defense	1346
B. "DIRECT THREAT" DEFENSE	1346
1. Requirements of Direct Threat Defense	1349
2. Drivers	1352
3. Epileptic Seizures; Diabetics	1352
4. "Regarded As" Disabled and Substantially Limited	1354
5. Hearing Impairments	1356
6. HIV-Status	1357
7. Threatening or Violent Behavior	1357
8. Psychiatric Illnesses	1358
9. Intermittent Symptoms	1360
10. Liability Concerns of the Agency	1360
11. Agency Knew of Disability and Allowed Employee to Work	1360
12. Agency Failure to Accommodate	1360
13. Medical Exams and Inquiries	1361
14. Conflicting Medical Opinions	1362
15. Personal Protective Equipment	1363
16. Inherently Dangerous Positions	1365
17. Agency Policy	1369
III. INTERACTIVE PROCESS AND REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION REQUESTS	1369
A. KNOWLEDGE OF ACCOMMODATION NEED	1370
1. Who Needs to Know	1370
B. FORM OF ACCOMMODATION REQUESTS	1371
1. Timing of Request	1373
2. Timing of Submission of Medical Information	1374
3. Failure to Request	1374
4. Agency Policy Regarding Request Procedures	1374
C. INDIVIDUALIZED INQUIRIES ON DISABILITIES	1375
1. Reasonable Documentation	1375
2. Health Providers	1376
3. Accuracy of Agency Information	1376
4. Comparative Evidence	1376
5. What Constitutes an Individualized Inquiry	1376
D. IDENTIFYING POSSIBLE ACCOMMODATIONS	1376
1. Failure of Complainant to Cooperate	1378
2. Effect of OWCP Considerations	1380
E. HALTING THE INTERACTIVE PROCESS	1380
F. INTERIM ACCOMMODATIONS	1382
G. TIMELINESS OF REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION	1384
1. Delay Not Excused	1385
2. Delay Excused	1388
H. FAILURE TO ENGAGE IN THE INTERACTIVE PROCESS	1389
I. TRIAL PERIODS FOR ACCOMMODATIONS	1391
J. MODIFYING EXISTING ACCOMMODATIONS	1392
K. SETTLEMENT DISCUSSIONS AS EVIDENCE OF INTERACTIVE PROCESS	1393
IV. FAMILY AND MEDICAL LEAVE ACT AND REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION	1393
V. REPRISAL FOR REQUESTING A REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION	1395
VI. TYPES OF REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION	1395
A. AFFIRMATIVE ACTION	1395
B. AGENCY REGULATIONS	1396
C. AGGRAVATION OF EXISTING CONDITION	1396
D. ALCOHOL AND DRUG DEPENDENCY	1396

1. The MSPB and EEOC—Causal Connection and Punishment	1397
2. Pretreatment Offenses	1402
3. Attendance Problems	1403
4. Relapses	1403
5. Programs With Religious Affiliations	1404
6. Offers of Employment	1404
E. BENEFITS AND PRIVILEGES OF EMPLOYMENT	1405
F. BUILDING AND WORKSPACE ACCOMMODATIONS	1405
G. CAREER DEVELOPMENT	1406
H. CAREGIVING RESPONSIBILITIES	1406
I. COLLECTIVE BARGAINING AGREEMENTS	1406
1. Union Duties	1408
J. COVID-19 CONSIDERATIONS	1408
1. EEOC'S Technical Assistance on COVID-19 and Reasonable Accommodations	1408
a. Accommodations Upon Return From Telework	1408
b. Exposing Family Members	1408
c. Interactive Process	1408
d. Medical Documentation Requests	1409
e. Preexisting Accommodations	1409
f. Preexisting Conditions	1409
g. Telework	1409
h. Temporary Accommodations	1410
i. Undue Hardship	1410
K. DISABILITY RETIREMENT	1410
1. Constructive Discharge	1411
L. DISCRIMINATION IN ACCOMMODATION	1411
1. Changes in Accommodations	1411
2. Employee Assistance Programs	1411
M. DRUG AND ALCOHOL TESTS	1411
N. INTERPRETERS AND READING ASSISTANTS	1412
1. Interpreters and Signers	1412
2. Lip Readers	1413
3. Agency Good Faith	1413
4. Devices as a Reasonable Accommodation	1413
5. Interpreters	1413
6. Video Remote Interpreting	1418
7. TTY and TDD Devices	1418
8. Management Cooperation in Use of Assistive Devices	1418
9. Reading Assistants	1419
O. JOB ANALYSIS	1420
P. JOB RESTRUCTURING	1421
Q. LEAVE USAGE	1422
1. Leave Without Pay	1426
2. Forced Leave	1426
3. Leave Offenses	1427
4. Conditioning Accommodation on Leave Usage	1427
5. Denial of Leave as Retaliation	1427
6. Pregnant Workers Fairness Act	1427
a. Reasonable Accommodation	1429
7. Family and Medical Leave Act	1431
8. Separation for Medical Reasons	1432
R. MEDICAL QUALIFICATIONS	1432
1. Physical Qualifications	1432
S. MENTAL ILLNESS	1433
1. Stress-Related Conditions	1434
2. Resignations and Constructive Discharges	1434
3. Supervisory Changes	1435
T. MOBILITY ACCOMMODATIONS	1436
U. PERSONAL EQUIPMENT	1436
1. Hearing Devices	1437
V. PREVENTIVE HEALTH CARE	1437

W. PRIVATE SPACE	1437
X. REASSIGNMENT, PROMOTIONS, AND DEMOTIONS	1437
1. <i>Ignacio v. USPS</i>	1438
2. Reassignment Under Part 1614	1439
3. Reassignment Under the ADA	1441
4. Search for a Vacant, Funded Positions	1447
5. Position in Question	1448
6. Accommodation in Reassignment Position	1449
7. Ceiling on Advancement	1450
8. Promotion as Accommodation	1450
9. Reassignment to Previous Position	1451
10. Reassignment to Special Needs Position	1451
11. Job Modification in Lieu of Reassignment	1451
12. Applicants for Employment	1454
13. Probationary Employees	1454
14. Light or Limited Duty	1454
15. Work-Related Injuries	1456
16. Collective Bargaining Agreements	1457
17. Reassignment to Different Supervisor	1461
18. Conditions Attached to Reassignment	1461
19. Never Qualified for Position Held	1461
20. Requests to Remain in Current Position in Lieu of Reassignment	1463
21. Reassignment for Others	1464
22. Transfers	1464
Y. REMEDIES	1464
Z. REQUESTS FOR ASSISTANCE	1464
1. Single-Day Accommodations	1465
AA. RESPIRATORY CONDITIONS	1465
1. Chemical/Fragrance/"Smell"-Free Environments	1465
2. Pungent Food	1467
3. Smoke-Free Environments	1468
BB. SANITARY WORKING CONDITIONS	1469
CC. SECURITY CLEARANCES	1470
DD. SERVICE ANIMALS	1470
EE. SETTLEMENT AGREEMENTS	1474
FF. TRAINING AS AN ACCOMMODATION	1474
1. Accommodations for Training	1475
2. Travel for Training	1476
GG. TRANSPORTATION	1476
1. Parking Spaces	1478
2. Travel Requirements	1479
3. Transfer for Medical Treatment	1479
HH. VOLUNTARY DUTIES	1479
II. WORK HOUR MODIFICATIONS	1480
1. Shift Changes and Work Schedules	1480
2. Training	1484
3. Breaks	1484
4. Overtime Assignments	1485
5. Bidding for Schedules	1486
JJ. TELEWORKING AND WORK LOCATION MODIFICATION	1486
1. Teleworking and the "Return to Work" Mandate	1486
2. Teleworking Policies in General	1487
3. Teleworking as an Accommodation	1487
a. COVID-19 Related	1489
b. Transfers	1489
c. Working From Home	1490
d. Equipment and Assistive Technology to Support Telework	1492
e. Duties That Can Only Be Performed at the Workplace	1492
f. Changes in Medical Condition	1494
g. Minimum Time in the Job	1495
h. Poor Performance	1495

i. Commuting.....	1496
4. Telework Policies	1496
5. Foreign Service Assignments.....	1498
6. Privacy Accommodations.....	1498
KK. WORKERS' COMPENSATION	1498
1. Restoration of Employment	1501
2. Modified Duty Positions	1501
3. OWCP and Reasonable Accommodation	1502
VII. WORKPLACE POLICIES.....	1502
VIII. BACK PAY	1503
A. RESIGNATION OR RETIREMENT	1503
B. GOOD FAITH EXCEPTION TO DAMAGES	1503
IX. THE GENETIC INFORMATION NONDISCRIMINATION ACT—OVERVIEW	1503
A. GINA-SPECIFIC DEFINITIONS	1503
1. Genetic Information Generally	1503
2. Genetic Tests	1504
3. Genetic Monitoring	1504
4. Genetic Services	1504
5. Manifested Disease or Disorder	1504
B. EMPLOYEES AND AGENCIES COVERED	1505
1. Family Members	1505
2. Family Medical History	1506
C. PROHIBITED EMPLOYMENT PRACTICES	1506
1. Employment Actions and Terms of Employment	1506
2. Segregating and Classifying Employees	1507
3. Retaliation for Protected Activity	1507
4. Acquisition of Genetic Information	1507
5. Confidentiality of Collected Information	1510
6. COVID-Related	1511
D. REMEDIES	1512

CHAPTER 16: AGE DISCRIMINATION IN EMPLOYMENT ACT 1513

I. STRUCTURE OF THE ACT	1513
A. PROHIBITED ACTIVITIES	1513
1. Reprisal	1514
2. Older Workers Benefits Act	1516
B. LAWFUL ACTIVITIES	1516
1. <i>Bona Fide</i> Occupational Requirements	1516
2. Benefit Plans	1516
3. Maximum Entry Age Limits—Law Enforcement Officers and Firefighters	1518
4. Mandatory Retirement Age	1518
C. PROCEDURES FOR FILING ADMINISTRATIVE ADEA COMPLAINTS	1519
1. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies	1519
D. PROCEDURES FOR FILING IN U.S. DISTRICT COURT	1519
1. Proper Defendants	1520
2. Statute of Limitations	1520
3. Part 1614 Statute of Limitations	1523
4. Jury Trials	1524
II. AGE DISCRIMINATION ANALYSIS	1524
A. <i>BABB V. WILKIE</i>	1524
B. CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE	1526
1. Discrimination Against Persons Under 40	1526
2. Discrimination Within Protected Group	1526
3. Reverse Age Discrimination	1527
4. Rehired Annuitants.....	1529
5. “Age Plus” Discrimination	1529
6. Direct Evidence of Discrimination	1529
C. DISPARATE IMPACT	1529
1. Court Opinions on the ADEA and Disparate Impact	1529
2. Commission on ADEA and Disparate Impact.....	1532
3. <i>Bona Fide</i> Occupational Qualification	1532

4.	Bottom Line Concept	1532
5.	Preemployment Inquiries	1533
6.	Experience	1533
D.	HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT	1533
E.	PAY SCALES.....	1533
F.	ACCOMMODATION	1533
III.	THE AGENCY'S BURDEN.....	1533
A.	INTENTIONAL DISCRIMINATION	1533
1.	Recency of Experience	1534
2.	Recency of Education	1534
3.	Length of Service.....	1535
4.	Career Goals	1535
5.	Performance.....	1535
6.	Tests.....	1536
B.	DISPARATE IMPACT	1536
1.	<i>Bona Fide</i> Occupational Qualification	1536
2.	Factors Other Than Age	1537
3.	Education	1537
4.	Recruitment.....	1537
5.	Training.....	1537
6.	Physical Requirements	1537
IV.	ESTABLISHING PRETEXT	1537
A.	DISCRIMINATORY STATEMENTS	1538
B.	ECONOMIC FACTORS	1539
C.	AGE AS DETERMINATIVE FACTOR	1539
1.	Element of Intent	1544
D.	RETIREMENT ELIGIBILITY	1544
E.	FORCED RETIREMENT	1544
V.	COMPENSATORY AND LIQUIDATED DAMAGES	1545
VI.	ATTORNEY FEES	1545

CHAPTER 17: REPRISAL 1547

I.	INITIATING COMPLAINTS OF REPRISAL.....	1548
A.	PROCESSING COMPLAINTS OF REPRISAL	1548
1.	Filing Reprisal Complaints.....	1548
2.	Amendment and Consolidation	1548
3.	Expedited Complaints of Reprisal.....	1548
4.	Processing Delays	1548
5.	Settlement Agreements	1548
II.	PROTECTED ACTIVITY—PARTICIPATION CLAUSE	1548
A.	ADMINISTRATIVE DECISIONS.....	1549
B.	AFFIRMATIVE ACTION	1550
C.	AGENCY REPRESENTATIVES	1550
D.	COMPLAINTS BEYOND EEO PURVIEW.....	1550
E.	COMPLAINTS BY OTHERS—ASSOCIATION COMPLAINTS	1550
1.	Participation in Proceedings Involving Others	1553
2.	Soliciting Complaints.....	1554
F.	CONTACTS OUTSIDE EEO PROCESS	1554
G.	DENIAL OF OFFICIAL TIME	1554
H.	DISCOVERY PARTICIPATION	1555
I.	EEO COUNSELING	1555
J.	EEO EMPLOYEES	1556
K.	FITNESS FOR DUTY	1557
L.	GRIEVANCES	1557
M.	HARASSMENT COMPLAINTS	1557
N.	MANAGEMENT EMPLOYEES	1557
O.	MSPB APPEALS	1558
P.	PUBLICATION OF EEO ACTIVITIES	1558
Q.	REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION REQUESTS	1558
R.	REPRESENTATIVES	1559
S.	RESPONSIBLE MANAGEMENT OFFICIALS	1559

T.	SETTLEMENT	1559
U.	TAKING CONFIDENTIAL DOCUMENTS.....	1560
1.	Use of Confidential Documents at Hearing	1560
V.	WHISTLEBLOWING	1561
W.	WITNESSES	1562
X.	WORKERS' COMPENSATION CLAIMS	1562
III.	PROTECTED ACTIVITY—OPPOSITION CLAUSE	1562
A.	BASIS OF OPPOSITION	1565
1.	Association With Opponents	1565
2.	Discrimination Against Others	1565
B.	BALANCING TEST	1565
1.	Manner of Opposition Must Be Reasonable.....	1566
C.	THREATS TO FILE COMPLAINTS	1567
1.	Requests to Withdraw Complaint	1568
D.	GRIEVANCES	1568
E.	INTERNAL HARASSMENT INVESTIGATIONS	1569
IV.	PROOF IN REPRISAL CASES	1569
A.	NASSAR AND THE "BUT FOR" TEST	1570
B.	PRIMA FACIE CASE	1574
1.	Good Faith Belief	1575
C.	ADVERSE TREATMENT REQUIREMENT	1576
1.	The History of the Adverse Treatment Requirement.....	1576
2.	<i>Burlington Northern</i> and Beyond	1577
3.	Types of Materially Adverse Actions.....	1580
4.	Proposed Actions and Preliminary Steps.....	1582
5.	Former Employers and Employees	1582
6.	Actions by Non-Employers	1583
7.	Chilling Effect and the Reasonably Likely to Deter Standard	1583
a.	Actions Affecting Pay	1584
b.	Actions Against Persons Other Than Complainant	1584
c.	Acts of Aggression.....	1584
d.	Agency Actions Involving an EEO Complaint/Interference With EEO Activity.....	1584
e.	Agency Failure to Act	1587
f.	Defamation Actions—Threatened Civil Actions	1588
g.	Disclosure of EEO Complaints.....	1589
h.	Duties, Modification	1590
i.	EEO Process.....	1590
j.	Former Employee Claims.....	1591
k.	Letters of Warning	1591
l.	Limits on the Chilling Effect Doctrine	1592
m.	Questions or Comments Made Pertaining to EEO Complaints.....	1592
n.	Referral to an EAP Counselor.....	1596
o.	Supervisor's Change in Behavior	1596
p.	Threats and Proposed Agency Actions.....	1597
q.	Work Performance Critiques.....	1597
D.	CAUSAL CONNECTION	1598
E.	LEGITIMATE REASONS	1599
F.	CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE AND PRETEXT	1602
1.	Agency Failure to Follow Regulations	1603
2.	Agency Failure to Substantiate Its Legitimate Nondiscriminatory Reason.....	1603
3.	Behavior Towards the Complainant	1604
4.	Blaming the Victim of Harassment.....	1605
5.	Changes to Manner of Work, Work Assignments, Duties, and Performance Assessments	1606
6.	Disparate Treatment.....	1608
7.	Implausible and Illogical Results	1609
8.	Knowledge Gained During Settlement Discussions	1609
9.	Knowledge Requirement—Agency	1610
10.	Knowledge Requirement—Complainant	1611
11.	Nexus With Personnel Actions.....	1611
12.	Nonselections.....	1613
13.	Patterns of Reprisal.....	1613

14. Proximity in Time	1613
G. DIRECT EVIDENCE OF REPRISAL	1618
H. MIXED MOTIVE CASES.....	1620
I. STATEMENTS MADE DURING TESTIMONY	1622
1. Alleged False Statements	1622
V. RESTRAINT AND INTERFERENCE WITH PROCESS: <i>PER SE</i> VIOLATIONS	1622

CHAPTER 18: PERSONNEL ACTIONS..... 1629

I. DISCIPLINARY ACTIONS	1629
A. PROPOSED DISCIPLINARY ACTIONS	1629
1. Work Discussions	1630
2. Written Work Criticisms.....	1631
3. Monitoring Work Behavior.....	1632
B. CONSTRUCTIVE DISCHARGE	1632
1. Competitive Service Employees	1638
2. Agency Bad Faith.....	1639
C. CONSTRUCTIVE SUSPENSION	1639
D. OTHER CONSTRUCTIVE ACTIONS.....	1639
E. PROBATIONARY EMPLOYEES	1639
F. CONSISTENCY OF DISCIPLINE	1639
1. Problem Employees.....	1640
2. Progressive Discipline	1640
3. Supervisory Orders	1641
G. HARASSMENT AS DEFENSE TO DISCIPLINE	1641
H. SOCIAL MEDIA/ONLINE HARASSMENT AS BASIS FOR DISCIPLINE	1641
I. FITNESS FOR DUTY EXAMINATION	1641
J. CRIMINAL OFFENSES	1643
1. Criminal Investigations	1643
2. Non-Criminal Investigations	1643
K. ACTS OCCURRING IN CONTEXT OF PERSONNEL ACTION.....	1643
L. BASIS OF CHARGE	1643
M. RECORDS OF DISCIPLINARY ACTION	1643
II. NONSELECTION: PROMOTIONS AND APPOINTMENTS	1644
A. <i>PRIMA FACIE</i> CASE	1645
B. BEST QUALIFIED LISTS	1646
1. Unqualified Candidates	1646
2. Ranking Candidates	1647
3. Failure to Apply for Position	1647
4. Superior Qualifications— <i>Ash v. Tyson Foods</i>	1648
C. SELECTION CRITERIA	1650
1. Criminal Convictions	1650
2. Education and Licenses	1650
3. EEO Activity	1651
4. Failure to Disclose Criteria.....	1651
5. Interviews	1651
6. Past Experience	1653
7. References.....	1653
8. Selection Certificates	1654
9. Selection Panels and Recommending Officials	1654
10. Subjective vs. Objective	1655
11. Supervisory Appraisals	1657
12. Temporary Appointments	1657
13. Tests and Assessments	1657
14. Training	1659
D. FAILURE TO FOLLOW PROCEDURES	1659
1. Rule of Three	1660
E. AGENCY'S BURDEN	1661
F. NONCOMPETITIVE SELECTIONS	1663
1. Conversions	1663
2. Accretion of Duties	1663
G. RECOMMENDING OFFICIALS	1664

H.	PRESELECTION	1664
1.	Unfair Advantages in Selection Process.....	1665
I.	POSTSELECTION PERFORMANCE.....	1666
J.	BIDDING FOR FUTURE VACANCIES	1666
K.	RECRUITMENT	1666
L.	RESCISSION OF VACANCY ANNOUNCEMENT	1666
1.	Priority Referrals	1667
2.	Failure to Post Vacancy.....	1668
M.	FALSIFIED APPLICATIONS	1668
N.	COMMUNICATION OF DECISION.....	1668
O.	REASONS FOR DECISION	1669
P.	OFFERS OF EMPLOYMENT: RESCINDED.....	1669
III.	PERFORMANCE-BASED ACTIONS	1670
A.	<i>PRIMA FACIE</i> CASE	1670
1.	Midyear Reviews	1671
B.	NOTICE OF POOR PERFORMANCE	1671
1.	Documentation of Poor Performance	1671
C.	OPPORTUNITY TO IMPROVE	1671
D.	SUBJECTIVE APPRAISAL CRITERIA	1672
E.	PERFORMANCE EVALUATIONS	1672
1.	Past Performance Ratings	1672
F.	PERSONNEL ACTIONS BASED ON PERFORMANCE	1673
G.	SCRUTINY OF WORK	1673
H.	EMPLOYMENT REFERENCES	1674
I.	FALSE STATEMENTS RELATED TO PERFORMANCE.....	1674
IV.	REDUCTION-IN-FORCE	1674
A.	SEVERANCE PAY VS. RETIREMENT ANNUITY.....	1675
B.	PERFORMANCE CREDITS.....	1675
C.	REASSIGNMENTS	1675
V.	TERMS AND CONDITIONS OF EMPLOYMENT	1675
A.	ACTIVITIES OUTSIDE WORKPLACE.....	1675
B.	AGENCY FACILITIES, USE OF	1676
C.	CHANGE OF DUTIES.....	1676
D.	COMMON WORKPLACE OCCURRENCES.....	1676
E.	CONDITIONS OF EMPLOYMENT, FAILURE TO MAINTAIN	1677
F.	DEROGATORY COMMENTS AND ACTIONS	1678
1.	Release of Information on Employee	1678
2.	FOIA and Privacy Act Requests	1678
G.	DISABILITY RETIREMENT	1678
H.	DRESS CODES	1679
I.	EMPLOYEE SEARCHES	1679
J.	GARNISHMENT OF WAGES	1679
K.	HEALTH BENEFITS	1679
1.	Gender-Affirming Care/Gender Dysphoria.....	1680
L.	LEAVE	1682
M.	OUTSIDE CONTRACTS	1682
N.	OVERTIME COMPENSATION	1683
1.	Assignment of Work Hours	1683
O.	PARTICIPATION IN EEO PROCESS.....	1683
P.	POSITION CLASSIFICATION	1683
Q.	POSITION TITLES AND WORK DUTIES.....	1684
R.	PREDECISIONAL ACTIONS.....	1684
S.	REASSIGNMENTS.....	1684
T.	REGULATIONS COMPLIANCE	1684
U.	REORGANIZATIONS	1684
V.	SCHEDULE CHANGES	1684
W.	SECURITY CLEARANCES	1684
1.	Scope of Review.....	1684
2.	Remedial Authority	1686
3.	Burden of Proof.....	1687
4.	Distinguishing Between Underlying Actions and Merits of a Security Clearance Decision	1689

5. Initiating a Security Clearance Review	1691
6. Initiating a Security Clearance Review: Court Opinions	1693
7. Examining Agency Policies and Regulations	1693
8. Security Clearances and the Rehabilitation Act	1694
X. TEMPORARY ASSIGNMENTS	1695
Y. TRANSFERS	1695
Z. TRAVEL BOOKING SERVICES	1695
AA. UNEMPLOYMENT COMPENSATION	1695
BB. UNION ACTIVITIES	1695
1. Collective Bargaining Agreements	1696
2. Union Representation	1696
CC. WORK ENVIRONMENT	1696
1. Smoking Policies	1696
DD. WORK HOURS	1697
EE. WORKERS' COMPENSATION	1697

CHAPTER 19: CLASS ACTION COMPLAINTS 1699

I. FILING A CLASS COMPLAINT	1699
A. DEFINITION OF CLASS	1699
B. REQUIREMENTS OF A CLASS COMPLAINT	1699
C. CLASS COMPLAINT COUNSELING	1700
1. Time Frame for Counseling	1700
2. EEO Counselors	1700
3. Individual Complaints	1700
4. Mandatory Counseling.....	1700
5. Exception to Mandatory Counseling	1701
6. Notice of Final Interview	1701
D. FORMAL COMPLAINT	1701
1. Effect of Filing on Individuals; Subsumed Claims	1701
E. ASSIGNMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE	1703
II. CERTIFICATION STAGE	1703
A. DISMISSAL OF COMPLAINT	1703
1. Lack of Specificity and Detail	1703
2. Dismissal Under 1614.107	1704
3. Timeliness of Complaint	1704
4. Issues Not Raised in Counseling	1704
5. Identical Complaints	1704
6. Failure to Prosecute	1705
7. Failure to Meet Class Prerequisites	1705
8. Delay in Seeking Certification	1705
9. Settlement Prior to Certification.....	1706
10. Notification of Dismissal	1706
B. CLASS PREREQUISITES	1706
1. Numerosity	1707
2. Commonality and Typicality	1708
3. Adequacy of Representation	1720
4. Waiver of Requirements	1723
C. EFFECT OF WITHDRAWAL OR DISMISSAL	1723
1. Individual Civil Actions	1723
D. ABEYANCE OF INDIVIDUAL COMPLAINTS	1724
E. CERTIFICATION DECISION	1724
1. Notification of Acceptance	1724
2. Conditional Certification and Modification of Certification	1725
3. Final Agency Action	1725
4. Opting Out	1725
III. POST-CERTIFICATION PROCESSING.....	1725
A. DEVELOPMENT OF RECORD: DISCOVERY	1725
B. SETTLEMENT OR INFORMAL RESOLUTION OF CLASS ACTIONS	1726
1. Settlement Orders.....	1729
C. SUMMARY JUDGMENT	1729
D. HEARING	1729

1. Official Time	1729
2. Mixed Cases	1729
E. DECISION	1730
F. FINAL AGENCY ACTION	1730
1. Notifying Class Members of Decision	1731
2. Individual Claims for Relief	1731
G. APPEAL STANDARDS	1731
1. Agency Appeals	1731
2. Complainant Appeals	1731
H. REQUESTS TO REOPEN	1732
I. ATTORNEY FEES	1732
IV. CLASS ACTION THEORIES	1732
A. INTENTIONAL DISCRIMINATION	1732
1. <i>Prima Facie</i> Case	1732
2. Disparate Treatment Analysis	1732
B. ADVERSE IMPACT	1734
1. Use of Statistical Evidence	1734
2. Use of Anecdotal Evidence	1738
C. HOSTILE WORK ENVIRONMENT	1738
D. REPRISAL	1740
E. DISABILITY DISCRIMINATION AND REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION	1740
F. VIOLATION OF CONSENT DECREES	1747
V. CLASS ACTION RELIEF	1747
A. ESTABLISHING INDIVIDUAL RELIEF	1747
B. CLASS RELIEF	1748

CHAPTER 20: EEO ALTERNATIVES 1751

I. NEGOTIATED GRIEVANCE PROCEDURES	1751
A. EMPLOYEES AND AGENCIES COVERED	1752
1. U.S. Postal Service	1752
2. Other Exempt Agencies	1753
B. ELECTING THE FORUM	1753
1. Electing Both Forums	1754
2. Union Election	1754
3. Unsuccessful Election	1754
4. Withdrawal of Grievance	1755
5. Adjudication of Grievance	1755
6. Failure to Raise Discrimination Allegation	1755
7. Unfair Labor Practice Complaints	1755
8. Subsequent Actions	1755
C. EFFECTS OF ELECTION	1756
1. Application of Law	1756
2. Preservation of Grievance Rights	1756
D. KNOWLEDGE OF DISCRIMINATION	1756
E. ABSENCE OF DISCRIMINATION PROVISION IN AGREEMENT	1756
1. Expiration of Agreement	1756
F. DISCRIMINATION IN GRIEVANCE PROCEDURE	1756
1. Inadequate Representation	1757
G. EFFECT OF ARBITRATION DECISION	1757
H. REVIEW BY EEOC	1757
1. Arbitrability	1758
2. Failure to Address Discrimination Allegations	1758
3. Enforcement of Arbitration Awards	1758
II. MIXED CASES BEFORE THE MERIT SYSTEMS PROTECTION BOARD	1758
A. DEFINITION OF MIXED CASES AND APPEALS	1759
B. JURISDICTION OF THE MSPB	1759
1. Purpose of Mixed Case Legislation	1760
2. Matters Clearly Within Board Jurisdiction	1760
3. Matters Not Within Board Jurisdiction	1761
4. Multiple Personnel Actions or Claims	1763
a. "Inextricably Intertwined": History	1763

b. “Inextricably Intertwined”: Current Guidance	1763
5. Constructive Adverse Actions.....	1766
6. Probationary Employees	1769
7. Failure to Give Hearing Rights	1769
8. Incorrect Appeal Rights	1769
9. Whistleblower Complaints.....	1769
C. ELECTION OF FORUM	1770
1. Notice of Election Rights	1770
2. Filing With Wrong Agency	1771
3. Withdrawal of Appeal	1771
D. EFFECTS OF ELECTION	1772
1. Election of MSPB.....	1772
2. Election of EEO Procedure	1773
3. Effect of Final Agency Decision	1773
4. Breach of Settlement Allegations	1773
5. Last Chance Settlement Agreements	1773
E. DUAL FILING PROCEDURES	1774
F. REVIEW OF MSPB DECISIONS BY EEOC	1774
1. Contents of Petition for Review	1775
2. Consideration by EEOC	1775
3. Failure to Raise Allegations of Discrimination	1775
4. Failure of Board to Consider Allegations	1776
5. Failure of Board to Consider Evidence.....	1778
G. REFERRAL TO THE MSPB	1778
1. Remand for Additional Evidence.....	1779
H. REFERRAL TO SPECIAL PANEL	1779
I. PARTIAL RELIEF	1779
1. Relief Through Settlement	1779
J. ALLEGATIONS RELATED TO BOARD PROCEEDINGS	1779
1. Board-Ordered Relief	1780
K. APPEAL OF DECISION TO DISMISS MIXED CASE	1780
L. EFFECT OF DECISIONS BY OTHER AGENCIES	1780
M. JUDICIAL REVIEW IN MIXED CASES	1780
III. OTHER FORUMS	1781
A. ADMINISTRATIVE GRIEVANCE PROCEDURES	1781
B. WORKERS’ COMPENSATION	1782
C. ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE RESOLUTION	1782

CHAPTER 21: FORMS OF RELIEF 1785

I. ELEMENTS OF EQUITABLE RELIEF	1785
A. COMMISSION REGULATIONS ON RELIEF	1786
B. NOTICE OF VIOLATION	1786
1. Other Remedial Postings.....	1787
C. RELIEF FOR INDIVIDUALS	1787
1. Default Judgment	1788
D. PUNITIVE RELIEF	1788
E. CORRECTIVE RELIEF	1788
F. COMPENSATORY DAMAGES	1788
G. ESCAPING LIABILITY FOR DISCRIMINATION	1789
H. EFFECT OF BANKRUPTCY ON ENTITLEMENT TO RELIEF	1790
II. PERSONS ELIGIBLE FOR RELIEF	1790
A. RELIEF FOR APPLICANTS	1790
B. RELIEF FOR EMPLOYEES	1791
1. Displacement of Beneficiaries of Discrimination/“Bumping”	1791
2. Conditional Relief	1793
3. Interim Relief	1794
4. Reinstatement	1794
5. Partial Remedies	1795
6. Relief Following Default Judgment.....	1797
7. Scope of Relief.....	1798
C. RELIEF FOR THIRD PARTIES	1799

D. RELIEF FOR CONTRACTORS	1799
III. TYPES OF EQUITABLE RELIEF	1799
A. BACK PAY	1800
1. Ready, Willing, and Able to Work	1802
2. Loss of Pay by Spouse	1803
3. Calculating Back Pay	1804
a. Level of Back Pay	1804
b. Period of Back Pay	1805
c. Pay Steps	1806
d. Overtime	1807
e. Premium Pay	1808
f. SES Positions	1809
g. Thrift Savings and 401(k) Plans	1809
4. Contract Employees	1810
5. Deductions From Back Pay	1811
a. Duty to Mitigate Damages	1811
b. Corresponding Personnel Actions	1819
c. Unemployment Compensation	1820
d. Workers Compensation	1821
e. Self-Employment Income	1822
f. Health Insurance Premiums	1823
g. Retirement Benefits	1824
h. Debt to Agency	1826
i. Voluntary Separation Incentive Pay	1826
j. Union Dues	1826
6. Interest on Back Pay	1826
a. Age Discrimination in Employment Act	1830
b. U.S. Postal Service	1830
7. <i>Ford</i> Offer of Reemployment	1830
8. Nonappropriated Fund Agencies	1831
9. Tax Consequences of Back Pay and Damages	1831
a. Taxability of Back Pay and Damages	1832
b. Adverse Tax Consequences of a Back Pay Award	1836
10. U.S. Postal Service	1838
B. ENTITLEMENT TO POSITIONS	1838
1. Substantially Equivalent Positions	1840
a. Good Faith	1843
b. Eliminated Positions	1844
2. Geographic Location	1844
3. Subsequent Promotions—"Job Skipping"	1846
4. Probation	1849
5. Temporary Appointments	1849
6. Priority Consideration	1849
7. Noncompetitive Selections	1851
8. Failure to Qualify	1851
9. Multiple Victims of Discrimination	1852
10. Limited Liability Defense	1854
C. OTHER FORMS OF EQUITABLE RELIEF	1855
1. Apologies	1855
2. Certifications and Background Checks	1855
3. Cost of Living Allowances	1855
4. Declaratory and Injunctive Relief	1855
5. Front Pay	1856
6. Housing Expenses	1861
7. Leave and Benefits Restoration	1861
8. Medical Expenses	1862
9. Performance-Based Awards	1863
10. Performance Evaluations	1863
11. Reassignment or Transfer	1863
12. Recruitment	1864
13. Relief Requested	1865

14. Remand vs. Relief	1865
15. Resignation or Retirement, Effect of	1865
a. Constructive Discharge	1865
16. Seniority	1868
17. Speculative Relief	1869
18. Systemic Relief	1869
19. Taxes, Reimbursement	1870
20. Training, Remedial and Preventive	1870
21. Travel Expenses	1874
22. Vehicle, Loss of	1874
D. RELIEF IN HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT CASES	1874
E. RETIREMENT BENEFITS, ADJUSTMENT	1874
IV. RELIEF UNDER THE ADEA AND EPA	1874
A. LIQUIDATED DAMAGES	1874
V. COMPENSATORY DAMAGES	1874
A. AUTHORITY TO AWARD	1875
1. Adverse Impact Cases	1883
2. Unintentional Discrimination Cases	1883
B. DEFINITION OF COMPENSATORY DAMAGES	1883
1. Damages vs. Equitable Relief	1884
2. Past Pecuniary Damages	1885
3. Future Pecuniary Damages	1885
4. Nonpecuniary Damages	1887
5. Causation	1887
6. Findings of Administrative Judge	1888
C. DAMAGES UNDER REHABILITATION ACT	1888
1. Delay in Providing Reasonable Accommodation	1889
2. Good Faith Exception	1889
D. DAMAGES UNDER ADEA	1893
E. DAMAGES UNDER EPA	1893
F. SEVERANCE OF DAMAGE ISSUES	1893
1. Offers of Full Relief	1893
G. TIME FOR ASSERTING DAMAGES	1893
1. Sufficiency of Claim	1895
2. Damages Hearings	1896
H. COMMISSION TRILOGY ON DAMAGES	1897
I. MOOTNESS	1907
J. PECUNIARY DAMAGE AWARD	1907
1. Attorney Fees	1908
2. Back Pay as Pecuniary Damages	1908
3. Computer Equipment	1908
4. Documenting/Proving Out of Pocket Expenses	1908
5. Dog-Walking Expenses	1909
6. Housing Expenses	1909
7. Medical Expenses	1910
8. Mortgage Foreclosure	1912
9. Nominal Damages	1912
10. Outside Earnings	1912
11. Service Animals	1912
K. FUTURE PECUNIARY DAMAGES	1912
L. CALCULATING NONPECUNIARY DAMAGES	1915
1. Using Commission Case Law to Determine Damage Amounts	1916
2. Credibility Determinations	1918
3. Evidence	1918
a. Evidence Required	1918
b. Failure to Produce Evidence	1919
c. Sufficiency of Medical Evidence	1919
4. Length of Discrimination	1919
5. Harm Suffered	1920
6. "Intuitively Obvious" Harm	1920
7. Temporal Scope	1921

8.	Monetary Awards	1921
a.	\$5,000 and Less	1921
b.	\$5,001–\$10,000	1928
c.	\$10,001–\$15,000	1934
d.	\$15,001–\$20,000	1939
e.	\$20,001–\$25,000	1944
f.	\$25,001–\$30,000	1948
g.	\$30,001–\$35,000	1949
h.	\$35,001–\$40,000	1955
i.	\$40,001–\$50,000	1957
j.	\$50,001–\$60,000	1970
k.	\$60,001–\$70,000	1975
l.	\$70,001–\$75,000	1977
m.	\$75,001–\$80,000	1984
n.	\$80,001–\$90,000	1987
o.	\$90,001–\$100,000	1993
p.	\$100,001–\$125,000	2001
q.	\$125,001–\$150,000	2008
r.	\$150,001–\$200,000	2017
s.	\$200,001 and Above	2027
t.	Present-Day Value of Comparable Past Awards—Inflation	2031
9.	Presumption of Harm	2032
10.	Statutory Cap	2033
M.	SPECIFIC DAMAGE ISSUES	2034
1.	Age Discrimination Claims	2035
2.	Auto Accidents	2035
3.	Breach of Settlement Agreements	2035
4.	Chiropractor Expenses	2035
5.	Collateral Source Rule	2035
6.	Conduct Outside Workplace	2035
7.	Couples Therapy	2035
8.	Exacerbation of Preexisting Conditions	2036
9.	Expert or Medical Testimony, Lack of	2037
10.	External Factors	2038
11.	FECA Claims	2040
12.	Foreclosure Costs	2041
13.	Harm to Others	2041
14.	Health Care Travel Expenses	2041
15.	Health Insurance and Medical Expenses	2041
16.	Housekeeping Expenses	2042
17.	Inability to Find Employment	2042
18.	Job Search Expenses	2042
19.	Litigation Effects	2042
20.	Loans	2042
21.	Interest and Penalties	2043
22.	Loss of Outside Employment	2043
23.	Low Resistance Due to Stress or Fatigue	2044
24.	Massage Therapy	2044
25.	Miscarriage/Pregnancy	2044
26.	Mitigation of Damages	2044
27.	Moving and Housing Expenses and Loss on Sale of Home	2044
28.	Multiple Claims of Discrimination	2046
29.	Multiple Victims of Discrimination	2046
30.	Nervous Breakdown	2046
31.	Partially Prevailing Complainants	2046
32.	Pet Care	2047
33.	Physical Injuries	2047
34.	Pre-Act Conduct	2047
35.	Preexisting Fears	2047
36.	Previous Physical or Mental Illness	2047
37.	Previous Rape	2053

38. Psychiatric Evidence	2053
39. Rental Income, Loss of	2053
40. Repossession of Auto.....	2053
41. Retaliation Claims	2053
42. Termination of Employment	2053
43. Travel Expenses	2054
44. Undisputed Amounts	2054
N. ISSUANCE OF DAMAGE DECISIONS.....	2054
1. Appellate Decisions.....	2054
O. INTEREST ON COMPENSATORY DAMAGES	2054
P. TAXES ON COMPENSATORY DAMAGES	2055
1. Jurisdiction Over Complaints Related to Taxes	2057
Q. PUNITIVE DAMAGES	2057
R. DAMAGES IN OTHER FORUMS.....	2060
1. Merit Systems Protection Board	2060
2. Arbitration	2061
VI. DISCIPLINARY AND CORRECTIVE ACTION	2061
A. OFFICE OF SPECIAL COUNSEL	2063
B. MERIT SYSTEMS PROTECTION BOARD	2063
VII. ENFORCEMENT OF REMEDIES	2064
A. PETITIONS FOR ENFORCEMENT	2065
B. ENFORCEMENT BY COMMISSION.....	2065
1. Sanctions for Noncompliance	2065
VIII. TIMING OF RELIEF	2066
A. DOCTRINE OF LACHES	2066
CHAPTER 22: ATTORNEY FEES.....	2067
I. PROCEDURES FOR SUBMITTING FEE REQUEST	2068
A. REQUIREMENTS OF FEE PETITION	2069
1. Proper Party	2069
B. EXTENSIONS OF TIME	2070
C. FILING WITH WRONG AGENCY	2070
D. FAILURE TO ISSUE FEE DECISION	2070
E. MSPB CASES	2071
II. PREVAILING PARTIES	2071
A. PRESUMPTION OF ENTITLEMENT.....	2076
B. REVIEW STANDARD FOR AJ AWARDS	2076
C. PREVAILING THROUGH SETTLEMENT	2076
1. Breach of Settlement Agreements	2078
2. Compliance and Enforcement Petitions	2078
D. PREVAILING ON PROCEDURAL ISSUES	2079
1. Fees as Sanctions	2079
2. Fees Against Employees	2080
3. Official Time Complaints	2081
4. <i>Per Se</i> Regulatory Violations	2081
E. PREVAILING THROUGH GRIEVANCE PROCEDURE	2081
F. ACTIONS OUTSIDE TITLE VII.....	2082
G. OFFERS OF RESOLUTION	2082
H. MOOT CASES	2082
I. UNJUST AWARDS	2083
III. THE “LODESTAR”	2083
A. REASONABLE HOURLY RATE	2086
1. Prevailing Market Rate and Nonlocal Counsel	2087
2. Applicable Time Period	2089
3. <i>Laffey</i> Matrix	2090
4. Customary Rate	2090
5. Contractual Rate	2091
6. Discount Rates	2092
7. Rates in MSPB Cases	2093
8. Excise Taxes	2093
9. Journals and Other Law Based Articles	2093

10. Contingency Agreements	2094
11. Hybrid Agreements	2094
B. ADJUSTMENTS TO HOURLY RATES	2094
1. Downward Adjustments	2094
2. Fee Enhancements	2095
3. Experience of Counsel	2098
C. HOURS REASONABLY EXPENDED	2098
1. Ascertaining Case Status	2099
2. Claims Not Raised in Complaint	2099
3. Clerical Work	2099
4. Contact With Clients	2100
5. Description of Work Performed	2100
6. Experience of Counsel	2100
7. Fee Petitions	2101
8. Fees in Counseling Stage	2102
9. File Updates	2102
10. Frivolous Claims	2102
11. Hearing Preparation	2102
12. Hearing Pursuit or Withdraw	2103
13. Investigation by Counsel	2103
14. Investigation Preparation	2103
15. Legal Research	2103
16. Degree of Success	2104
17. Preparation of Complaint	2108
18. Preparation of Discovery Materials	2108
19. Related Actions	2108
20. Review of Decisions	2108
21. Review of Documents	2108
22. Settlement Negotiations	2109
23. Summary Judgment Motions	2109
24. Time Records	2109
25. "Vigorous Litigation"	2110
26. Work on Appeal	2111
D. TAXES ON FEE AWARDS	2111
E. INTEREST ON FEE AWARDS	2112
F. FAILURE OF COUNSEL TO REIMBURSE COMPLAINANT	2113
1. Attorney Fee Liens	2113
G. MIXED MOTIVE CASES	2113
H. BAR STATUS OF COUNSEL	2115
I. SERVICES RENDERED BY OTHERS	2116
1. Multiple Attorneys	2116
2. Change in Counsel	2119
3. Paralegals	2120
4. Investigators	2120
J. COMPENSATORY DAMAGES	2120
K. AGE DISCRIMINATION	2120
1. Reprisal	2121
2. Mixed Cases	2121
3. Civil Actions	2121
4. Fees as Sanctions	2122
L. ADA INQUIRY AND EXAMINATION VIOLATIONS	2122
M. NOTICE OF REPRESENTATION	2123
N. DEFENSE OF FEE AWARDS	2123
1. Standard of Review	2124
O. UNION AND NON-PROFIT LEGAL REPRESENTATIVES	2124
P. FEDERAL EMPLOYEE REPRESENTATIVES	2124
Q. LAYMAN REPRESENTATIVES	2124
R. BURDENS OF PROOF	2124
S. ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS	2124
1. Petitions for Enforcement	2126
T. FEDERAL COURT WORK	2126

U. TRAVEL TIME2126

V. AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES FOR AGENCIES2126

W. COSTS2126

1. Witness Fees2128

2. Expert Witness Fees2128

3. Out-Of-Town Attorneys2129

4. Business Equipment.....2129

5. Interest2129

6. Taxes2129

7. Reasonable Accommodation Expenses.....2129

CIRCUIT COURT CASE CHART 2000–20262131

TABLE OF CASES2133

INDEX2199