SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE i

CHAPTER ONE: EEOC COMPLAINT PROCESS OVERVIEW 1

CHAPTER TWO: THEORIES OF DISCRIMINATION 33

CHAPTER THREE: CASE EVALUATION 125

CHAPTER FOUR: PREHEARING PRACTICE AND DISCOVERY 141

CHAPTER FIVE: SETTLEMENT 207

CHAPTER SIX: INDIVIDUAL COMPLAINT HEARING PRACTICE 227

CHAPTER SEVEN: CLASS ACTION PRACTICE 269

CHAPTER EIGHT: REMEDIES 285

CHAPTER NINE: DECISIONS, APPEALS, AND ENFORCEMENT 315

TABLE OF CASES 331

INDEX 335

REFERENCE MATERIALS

(DOWNLOAD AT WWW.DEWEYPUB.COM/REFRAC)

REFERENCE MATERIALS A: 29 CFR 1614 ..... Ref Mat-3

REFERENCE MATERIALS B: MD-110: CHAPTER 7—HEARINGS ..... Ref Mat-45

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE i

CHAPTER ONE: EEOC COMPLAINT PROCESS OVERVIEW 1

I. INTRODUCTION 1
II. EEOC STATUTORY JURISDICTION 3
A. TITLE VII OF THE CIVIL RIGHTS ACT OF 1964 3
1. Civil Rights Act of 1991 4
2. Sexual Orientation and Transgender Discrimination 4
B. REHABILITATION ACT OF 1973 4
1. Civil Rights Act of 1991 5
2. Americans With Disabilities Act of 1990 5
3. ADA Amendments Act of 2008 5
C. AGE DISCRIMINATION IN EMPLOYMENT ACT 5
1. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies 6
D. EQUAL PAY ACT 6
1. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies 6
E. GENETIC INFORMATION NONDISCRIMINATION ACT 6
F. PREGNANT WORKERS FAIRNESS ACT 7
G. REPRISAL 7
III. EEOC INDIVIDUAL COMPLAINT PROCESS 7
A. EEO COUNSELING 8
B. ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE RESOLUTION 9
C. FORMAL COMPLAINT REQUIREMENTS 11
1. Amendment of Complaints 11
2. Consolidation 12
D. REGULATIONS REGARDING ACCEPTANCE AND DISMISSAL OF COMPLAINTS 12
1. Basis of Dismissal 16
2. Partial Dismissals 17
3. Agency Offers of Resolution 18
E. INVESTIGATION OF COMPLAINTS 19
F. REQUEST FOR HEARING 21
G. REQUEST FOR DECISION ON THE RECORD OR FINAL AGENCY DECISION 21
H. HEARINGS 21
1. Discovery 22
2. Summary Judgment 23
3. Decisions 23
4. Bench Decisions 24
I. FINAL AGENCY ACTION AND DECISIONS 24
1. Final Agency Actions 24
2. Final Agency Decisions 24
J. EEOC APPEALS 24
1. Agency Appeals 24
2. Complainant Appeals 25
3. EEOC Procedures 25
4. Requests for Reconsideration 26
K. CIVIL ACTIONS 26
IV. EEOC CLASS COMPLAINT PROCESS 27
A. EEO COUNSELING 27
B. FORMAL COMPLAINT REQUIREMENTS 28
C. AGENCY PROCESSING 28
D. PROCESSING BY ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE 29
1. Notification of Class Members 29
2. Development of the Record 30
3. Resolution of Complaints 30
4. Hearings 31

5. Decisions 31
E. FINAL AGENCY ACTION 31
1. Individual Relief 32

CHAPTER TWO: THEORIES OF DISCRIMINATION 33
I. THEORY OF INTENTIONAL DISCRIMINATION 33
A. METHODS OF PROOF 34
B. CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE 34
1. Significant Cases 35
a. *McDonnell Douglas* 35
b. *Furnco Construction Corp.* 37
c. *Burdine* 38
d. *Aikens* 39
e. *Hicks* 40
f. *Reeves* 40
C. MIXED MOTIVE CASES—"MOTIVATING FACTOR" VS. "BUT FOR" TEST 42
D. DIRECT EVIDENCE 43
E. MIXED MOTIVE ANALYSIS 45
F. SIGNIFICANT CASES 45
1. *Price Waterhouse* 45
2. 1991 Civil Rights Act 49
G. AFTER-ACQUIRED EVIDENCE DEFENSE 50
1. Significant Case 50
a. *McKennon v. Nashville Banner* 50
2. Clear and Convincing Evidence 52
H. COMMISSION'S INTENTIONAL DISCRIMINATION MODEL 53
I. AGE DISCRIMINATION CASES 54
II. THEORY OF DISPARATE IMPACT DISCRIMINATION 54
A. METHOD OF PROOF 54
B. SIGNIFICANT CASES 55
1. *Griggs v. Duke Power* 55
2. *Watson v. Fort Worth* 57
3. *Wards Cove v. Atonio* 58
C. CIVIL RIGHTS ACT OF 1991 61
D. AGE DISCRIMINATION 62
III. THEORY OF HARASSMENT 62
A. METHODS OF PROOF 64
1. Tangible Employment Actions 65
a. Definition of Tangible Employment Action 66
b. Definition of Supervisors 67
2. Hostile Environment Harassment 67
B. SIGNIFICANT CASES 69
1. *Meritor Savings Bank* 69
2. *Harris v. Forklift Systems* 71
3. *Oncale v. Sundowner* 71
4. *Burlington Industries* and *Faragher* 73
5. *Vance v. Ball State University* 77
6. *Macy v. Attorney General* 78
C. COMMISSION GUIDANCE ON LIABILITY 86
D. FAILURE TO PREVENT, CORRECT, OR REMEDY HARM 87
E. AVOIDING HARM 88
IV. THEORY OF REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION 89
A. DISABILITY ACCOMMODATION—STATUTORY BASIS 89
B. DISABILITY ACCOMMODATION—REGULATORY BASIS 89
C. DISABILITY ACCOMMODATION—OVERVIEW 89
1. Disability Accommodation—Analytical Model 90
a. Individual With Disability 90
b. Impairment 91
c. Major Life Activities 91
d. Substantially Limited 92

e. Qualified Individual With Disability 93
f. Essential Functions 94
g. Position in Question 95
h. Request for Accommodation 95
i. Reasonable Accommodation 95
j. Undue Hardship 96
2. Significant Cases 97
a. *Nassau County v. Arline* 97
b. *Cleveland v. Policy Management* 99
c. *Sutton*, *Murphy* and *Albertsons* 100
d. *Toyota v. Williams* 102
D. ACCOMMODATION OF RELIGIOUS BELIEFS 103
E. ACCOMMODATION OF PREGNANCY 105
V. THEORY OF REPRISAL OR RETALIATION 106
A. STATUTORY OVERVIEW 106
B. REGULATORY OVERVIEW 107
C. COMPLAINT PROCESSING 107
D. METHODS OF PROOF 108
1. Circumstantial Evidence 109
2. Direct Evidence 109
E. PROTECTED ACTIVITY 110
1. Participation Clause 110
2. Opposition Clause 111
a. Balancing Test 113
F. ADVERSE TREATMENT REQUIREMENT 114
1. Former Employers 115
2. Chilling Effect 115
G. CAUSAL CONNECTION 115
H. SIGNIFICANT CASES 116
1. *Robinson v. Shell Oil Co.* 116
2. *Burlington Northern v. White* 118
3. *Crawford v. Nashville* 121
4. *Thompson v. North American Stainless* 122
5. *University of Texas v. Nassar* 123

CHAPTER THREE: CASE EVALUATION 125
I. PREINVESTIGATION EVALUATION 126
A. COMPLAINANT'S FACT GATHERING 127
1. Interviews With Complainant 127
2. Documents 128
3. Interviews With Other Witnesses 128
4. Corroborating Evidence 129
B. AGENCY'S FACT GATHERING 129
1. Interviews With Management Officials 130
2. Documents 130
3. Interviews With Agency Employees 131
4. Credibility Assessments 132
C. LEGAL RESEARCH 132
II. POSTINVESTIGATION EVALUATION 133
A. THE REPORT OF INVESTIGATION 134
1. Investigation Standard 134
2. The EEO Counselor's Report 134
3. The Complaint and the Acceptance Letter 135
4. The Investigation 136
B. REMEDIES FOR INADEQUATE INVESTIGATION 138
1. Complainant's Letter of Deficiencies 138
2. Agency's Response to Deficiencies 139
III. PROCEDURAL ISSUES 140
IV. ASSESSING THE CASE 140

CHAPTER FOUR: PREHEARING PRACTICE AND DISCOVERY 141
I. REQUEST FOR HEARING 142
A. THE HEARING REQUEST 142
B. CONSIDERATIONS IN ELECTING HEARING 143
C. AGENCY OBLIGATION UPON RECEIPT 144
II. DOCKETING; ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND ORDER 144
A. ROLE OF ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE 144
1. Case Assessment 145
2. Development of Record 145
3. Subpoena Authority 146
4. Authority of Administrative Judge 146
5. Communications With Administrative Judge 149
B. INITIAL STATUS CONFERENCE 150
C. CASE MANAGEMENT ORDER 151
III. AMENDMENT AND CONSOLIDATION 151
A. CONSOLIDATION OF COMPLAINTS 151
B. AMENDMENT OF COMPLAINTS 151
IV. RULINGS AND ORDERS 152
A. NONDISPOSITIVE RULINGS 152
B. DISPOSITIVE RULINGS 152
1. Decisions on the Merits 152
2. Orders of Dismissal 152
V. GENERAL MOTION PRACTICE 153
A. FORM OF MOTIONS 153
1. Evidence in Support of Motion 154
B. CONSULTATION WITH OPPOSING PARTY 155
C. PROPOSED ORDERS 155
D. FILING OF MOTIONS 155
E. CERTIFICATES OF SERVICE 156
F. ORAL ARGUMENT 156
VI. PREDISCOVERY MOTIONS 156
A. MOTIONS TO DISMISS 157
1. Failure to State a Claim 158
2. Complaint Pending or Adjudicated 160
3. Untimely Complaints 160
4. Identical Civil Actions 162
5. Election of Non-EEO Remedy 162
6. Moot Cases and Preliminary Actions 164
7. Failure to Prosecute 165
8. Spin-Off Complaints 165
9. Abuse of Process 166
B. MOTION FOR CHANGE OF VENUE 167
C. MOTIONS TO AMEND/CONSOLIDATE/REFRAME ACCEPTED CLAIMS 167
VII. DISCOVERY PRACTICE AND MOTIONS 168
A. DISCOVERY RULE SOURCES 169
B. SCOPE OF DISCOVERY 169
C. TIME LIMITS ON DISCOVERY 170
1. Discovery 170
2. Discovery Instructions 171
D. DISCOVERY PLANS 172
E. DISCOVERY CONFERENCES 173
F. DESCRIPTION OF DISCOVERY DEVICES 174
1. Requests for Production of Documents 174
2. Interrogatories 176
3. Requests for Admissions 178
4. Combining Admissions With Interrogatories 179
5. Depositions 180
a. Stipulations 183
b. Objections 184
6. Medical Examinations 184

G. INFORMAL DISCOVERY DEVICES 186
1. Investigation 187
a. Agency Considerations 187
b. Complainant Considerations 187
H. DISCOVERY RESPONSES 188
1. Compliance 189
a. Form of Responses 190
2. Opposition and Protective Orders 190
a. Privilege and Information Protected by Law 191
3. Stipulations 193
4. *In Camera* Review 193
5. Extensions of Time 193
I. MOTIONS TO COMPEL DISCOVERY 194
1. Time Limits 195
2. Requirements 195
J. MOTIONS FOR SANCTIONS 196
1. Time Limits 197
2. Requirements 197
3. Incomplete Investigations 198
VIII. POSTDISCOVERY MOTIONS 199
A. MOTIONS FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT 199
1. Uncontested Material Facts 200
2. Legal Argument 202
3. Exhibits 203
4. Partial Summary Judgment 204
5. Summary Judgment Procedures 204
B. MOTIONS TO RECUSE, EXCLUDE, OR DISQUALIFY 204
1. Motion to Recuse Judge 204
2. Motions to Exclude or Disqualify 205

CHAPTER FIVE: SETTLEMENT 207
I. REASONS FOR SETTLEMENT 207
A. EXPENSE OF LITIGATION 208
B. UNCERTAINTY OF LITIGATION 208
C. CONFINEMENT OF LEGAL REMEDIES 208
D. PRESERVING WORK RELATIONSHIPS 209
II. PREPARING THE CLIENT 210
III. METHODS OF SETTLEMENT 211
A. DIRECT NEGOTIATIONS 211
1. Proposals 212
B. SETTLEMENT CONFERENCES 212
1. Neutral Settlement Judges 214
2. Determining Whether to Use a Settlement Judge 214
C. MEDIATION 215
1. Sources for Mediators 215
2. Rights Resolution vs. Interests Resolution 215
IV. DRAFTING SETTLEMENT AGREEMENTS 216
A. COMMISSION REQUIREMENTS 216
1. Written Agreements 216
2. Oral Agreements 217
3. Knowing and Voluntary Requirement 218
B. RULES OF INTERPRETATION 219
1. Plain English Rule 219
2. Terms of Art 219
3. Intent of Parties 220
4. Parol Evidence 221
5. Confidentiality Clauses 221
C. CONSIDERATION 222
1. Dignity and Respect and Nonretaliation Clauses 222
D. WAIVER OF RIGHTS 222

1. Prospective Waivers 223
2. ADEA and OWBPA Rights 223
V. "UNSETTLING" SETTLEMENTS 224
A. COMPENSATORY DAMAGES 224
B. ATTORNEY FEES 224
VI. OFFERS OF RESOLUTION 225

CHAPTER SIX: INDIVIDUAL COMPLAINT HEARING PRACTICE 227
I. PREPARING FOR HEARING 227
A. PURPOSE OF THE HEARING 228
B. EVALUATING THE ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE 229
C. PREHEARING ORDERS 230
1. Witness Lists 230
a. Objections 232
2. Exhibit Lists 233
a. Objections 233
D. PREHEARING CONFERENCES 233
1. Exceptions to Rulings 235
E. HEARING ARRANGEMENTS 235
1. Continuances 236
F. CASE PREPARATION 237
1. Organizing the Case 237
a. Trial Notebooks 237
2. Witness Selection 238
3. Exhibit Selection 239
a. Discovery Responses 240
b. Deposition Transcripts 240
4. Witness Preparation 240
5. Order of Witnesses 242
a. Complainant's Considerations 242
b. Agency's Considerations 243
c. Other Considerations 244
d. Judge's Considerations 245
II. THE HEARING 245
A. PRELIMINARY MATTERS 245
1. Persons Attending Hearing 245
2. Off-the-Record Discussions 245
3. Requests for Reconsideration 245
4. Preservation of Objections 246
5. Sequestration of Witnesses 246
6. Settlement 246
B. JUDGE'S INTRODUCTORY STATEMENT 247
C. OPENING STATEMENTS 247
1. Purposes of Statement 247
2. Agency's Opening Statement 248
D. EXAMINATION OF WITNESSES 248
1. Direct Examination 249
2. Cross-Examination 252
3. Redirect Examination 254
4. Recross-Examination 255
5. Deposition Testimony 255
a. Refreshing Recollections 256
b. Impeaching Testimony 256
6. Rebuttal Witnesses 257
7. Expert Witnesses 257
a. Complainant's Physician 257
b. Direct Examination of the Expert 259
c. Cross-Examination of the Expert 260
d. Reports of Experts 262
8. Considerations for Virtual Hearings 262

III. INTRODUCTION OF DOCUMENTS 262
A. THE COMPLAINT FILE 263
B. MARKING OF EXHIBITS 263
C. IDENTIFICATION AND AUTHENTICATION 263
D. QUESTIONING OF WITNESSES 264
E. ADMISSION OF EXHIBITS 265
F. REJECTED EXHIBITS 265
IV. OBJECTIONS 265
A. TIMING OF OBJECTIONS 266
B. ARGUING OBJECTIONS 267
C. STANDING OBJECTIONS 267
V. CLOSING ARGUMENTS 267
A. PURPOSE 267
B. ORAL VS. WRITTEN 268
VI. BIFURCATED HEARINGS 268
A. DISCOVERY 268
B. SUBMISSIONS IN LIEU OF HEARING 268

CHAPTER SEVEN: CLASS ACTION PRACTICE 269
I. CLASS CERTIFICATION 270
A. FORMAL COMPLAINT 271
B. DISMISSAL BY ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE 271
1. Dismissals Under Section 1614.107 272
2. Specificity and Detail 272
3. Undue Delay 273
C. CERTIFICATION BY ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE 273
1. Burden of Proof 274
2. Elements of Class Certification 274
a. Numerosity 274
b. Commonality and Typicality 275
c. Adequacy of Representation 275
3. Certification Decision 276
a. Conditional Certification 276
4. Notification of the Class 277
5. Opting Out 277
II. CLASS ACTION HEARINGS—LIABILITY 277
A. DISCOVERY IN CLASS ACTIONS 278
1. Limits on Discovery 278
B. CHANGE OF VENUE 278
C. HEARINGS 279
D. CLASS ACTION DECISIONS 279
E. IMPACT ON INDIVIDUAL CLASS MEMBERS 280
F. NOTIFICATION OF CLASS MEMBERS 280
III. PROCEEDINGS ON REMEDIES 280
A. CLAIMS OF INDIVIDUAL RELIEF 281
B. STANDARD OF PROOF 281
C. AGENCY REMEDY DECISIONS 282
D. ROLE OF ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE 282
IV. SETTLING CLASS ACTIONS 283
A. PRE-RESOLUTION NOTIFICATION 283
B. REVIEW OF PROPOSED SETTLEMENT 284

CHAPTER EIGHT: REMEDIES 285
I. TYPES OF RELIEF 285
A. TAKING OR RESCINDING PERSONNEL ACTION 287
1. Displacement of Innocent Beneficiary 287
2. Subsequent Promotions 288
3. Probation 288
B. BACK PAY 289
1. Deductions 289

2. Mitigation of Damages 290
3. Overtime 290
4. Interest 291
C. FRONT PAY 291
D. BENEFITS 291
1. Leave 291
2. Health Care 291
3. Thrift Savings Plan 292
4. Retirement Contributions and Credit 292
E. COMPENSATORY DAMAGES 292
1. Past Pecuniary Damages 293
a. Collateral Source Rule 294
2. Future Pecuniary Damages 294
3. Nonpecuniary Damages 294
a. Causation 294
b. Taxes 295
c. Interest 295
F. ATTORNEY FEES AND COSTS 295
1. Standards for Fee Awards 295
2. Reasonable Hourly Rates 296
3. Hours Reasonably Expended 296
G. OTHER TYPES OF RELIEF 297
1. Remedial Training 297
2. Posting of Notice 297
3. Consideration of Discipline 297
II. HEARING PRACTICES 297
A. TRADITIONAL MAKE-WHOLE RELIEF 298
1. Mitigation of Damages 298
2. Overtime 299
3. After-Acquired Evidence 300
B. COMPENSATORY DAMAGES 301
1. Evidence of Damages 301
a. Past Pecuniary Damages 301
b. Future Pecuniary Damages 302
c. Nonpecuniary Damages 302
2. Hearing Strategy Considerations 304
a. Complainant's Considerations 304
b. Agency's Considerations 305
3. Research 306
C. ATTORNEY FEES AND COSTS 306
1. Fee Award Procedures 307
2. Verified Statement of Fees 308
3. Agency's Opposition to Fee Request 309
a. Reasonable Hourly Rate 309
b. Hours Reasonably Expended 310
III. REMEDY PROCEDURES 311
A. RELIEF ORDERED BY ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE 311
B. RELIEF ORDERED BY AGENCY 312
1. Final Agency Decisions 312
2. Interim Relief 312
C. RELIEF ORDERED BY OFO 313

CHAPTER NINE: DECISIONS, APPEALS, AND ENFORCEMENT 315

I. ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE'S DECISION 315
A. REQUIREMENTS OF DECISION 316
B. BENCH DECISIONS 317
C. BIFURCATED HEARINGS 317
II. FINAL AGENCY ACTION 319
A. TIME LIMITS 319
B. CONTENT OF AGENCY'S FINAL ACTION 320

1. Judge's Decision Implemented 320
a. Appeal Rights 320
b. Civil Action Rights 320
2. Judge's Decision Not Implemented 321
a. Appeal Rights 321
b. Civil Action Rights 321
III. FINAL AGENCY DECISIONS 321
A. TIME LIMITS FOR DECISION 322
B. CONTENTS OF FINAL AGENCY DECISION 322
C. APPEAL AND CIVIL ACTION RIGHTS 323
IV. EEOC APPEALS PROCEDURES 323
A. NOTICE OF APPEAL 323
B. AGENCY'S SUBMISSION OF COMPLAINT FILE 324
C. SUPPLEMENTATION OF RECORD 324
V. APPELLATE STANDARDS OF REVIEW 324
A. SUBSTANTIAL EVIDENCE STANDARD 325
B. *DE NOVO* STANDARD 325
C. NEW EVIDENCE ON APPEAL 326
D. BURDENS OF PERSUASION 326
E. APPELLATE BRIEFS 327
F. SANCTIONS 327
VI. REQUESTS FOR RECONSIDERATION 328
VII. COMPLIANCE AND ENFORCEMENT 328
A. AVOIDING ENFORCEMENT ISSUES 328
B. PETITIONS FOR ENFORCEMENT 329

TABLE OF CASES 331

INDEX 335

REFERENCE MATERIALS

(DOWNLOAD AT WWW.DEWEYPUB.COM/REFRAC)

REFERENCE MATERIALS A: 29 CFR 1614 ..... Ref Mat-3

REFERENCE MATERIALS B: MD-110: CHAPTER 7—HEARINGS ..... Ref Mat-45