

SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME I

PREFACE	i
GLOSSARY	iii
CHAPTER 1: MSPB STRUCTURE AND JURISDICTION.....	1
CHAPTER 2: APPEAL	881
CHAPTER 3: DISCOVERY; SANCTIONS	1245
CHAPTER 4: HEARING.....	1325
CHAPTER 5: EVIDENCE.....	1475
CHAPTER 6: INITIAL DECISION	1631
CHAPTER 7: PETITION FOR REVIEW	1653

VOLUME II

CHAPTER 8: ADVERSE ACTIONS	1905
CHAPTER 9: NEXUS	2323
CHAPTER 10: PENALTY DETERMINATION.....	2369
CHAPTER 11: SUBSTANTIVE OFFENSES.....	2473
CHAPTER 12: PERFORMANCE CASES	2929
CHAPTER 13: REDUCTIONS IN FORCE.....	3055
CHAPTER 14: HARMFUL ERROR.....	3199
CHAPTER 15: DISCRIMINATION	3381

VOLUME III

CHAPTER 16: PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICES.....	3649
CHAPTER 17: RETIREMENT	4163
CHAPTER 18: RESTORATION RIGHTS	4541

CHAPTER 19: ATTORNEY FEES.....	4631
CHAPTER 20: SETTLEMENT	4851
CHAPTER 21: REMEDIES.....	4965
CHAPTER 22: ENFORCEMENT.....	5081
CHAPTER 23: JUDICIAL REVIEW.....	5273
CHAPTER 24: RESEARCH, REFERENCE MATERIALS, AND FORMS.....	5533
BIBLIOGRAPHY	5555
TABLE OF CASES	5563
INDEX	5735

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME I

PREFACE	i
GLOSSARY	iii
CHAPTER 1: MSPB STRUCTURE AND JURISDICTION.....	1
I. REFORM ACT.....	1
A. CAPSULE HISTORY	1
B. OFFICE OF SPECIAL COUNSEL	4
II. MSPB ORGANIZATION AND ADMINISTRATIVE OPERATION.....	5
A. IMPARTIAL ADJUDICATION.....	6
1. <i>De Novo</i> Review of Agency Actions	7
a. Deference to OPM Regulations	7
b. Consideration of Agency Regulations	8
2. Prohibition Against Advisory Opinion; Internal Guidance; Request for Advisory Opinion.....	9
B. ORGANIZATION	9
1. Clerk.....	11
2. Office of Appeals Counsel.....	11
C. ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGES	14
1. Delegations of Authority.....	17
a. Administrative Law Judges Adjudicating Specialized Cases	17
2. <i>Judges' Handbook</i> ; Internal Guidance.....	17
3. Qualifications, Performance Standards for Administrative Judge.....	18
a. Judges' Position Description, Performance Standards	18
b. Regional Director (Chief Administrative Judge) Position Description and SES Performance Plan.....	19
4. Regulatory Responsibilities of Judge.....	20
a. Waiver of Procedural Regulations	21
5. Quality Review	21
D. BOARD DECISIONS; PRECEDENTIAL SIGNIFICANCE.....	22
1. Nonprecedential Decisions, Final Orders	23
2. Arbitration Award.....	23
3. Sensitive, Public Interest Appeal	24
4. Referral to OPM, OSC	24
E. MSPB RECORDS	24
1. Gaining Access; Review Procedure	28
2. Precluding Access	28
a. Sealing of Record or Files.....	28
b. Attempt to Preclude Publication of Decision.....	31
c. Expungement of Record.....	31
d. Redaction of Initial Decision.....	31
e. Classified Information	32
F. RULEMAKING PETITIONS.....	33
G. RESPONSIBILITY OF PARTIES IN MSPB CASES.....	33
III. JURISDICTIONAL OVERVIEW.....	34
A. SOURCES OF JURISDICTION.....	36
1. Original Jurisdiction Cases.....	36
2. Appealable Actions	37
a. Adverse Action	38
b. Performance-Based Action	38
c. Demonstration Project	38
3. Jurisdiction Through Agency Regulation.....	40
B. PRELIMINARY APPELLATE JURISDICTIONAL ANALYSIS	40
1. Lack of Jurisdiction; Failure to State a Claim	41

IV. EMPLOYEES WHO MAY APPEAL; APPEALABLE ISSUES	42
A. NATURE OF CIVIL SERVICE APPOINTMENTS	43
B. CONCEPTS COMMON TO DEFINITION OF "EMPLOYEE" FOR COMPETITIVE AND EXCEPTED SERVICE.....	44
1. Current Continuous Service	45
a. Break in Service	46
b. Effect of Grievance or Other Settlement; Collective Bargaining Contract.....	50
c. Service During Detail or in Acting Position.....	50
d. Period of Non-Pay Status	50
2. Not Serving a Probationary or Trial Period Under an Initial Appointment.....	51
3. Counting Service Time in a Prior Position or Appointment; <i>McCormick</i>	52
a. Time in Nonpermanent Appointment as a Component of Current Continuous Service.....	58
C. COMPETITIVE SERVICE EMPLOYEES	64
1. Other Than a Temporary Appointment Limited to One Year or Less.....	65
D. EXCEPTED SERVICE EMPLOYEES.....	67
1. 1990 Civil Service Due Process Amendments; Nonpreference Eligible Employees.....	68
a. Excepted Service Employees Excluded From Due Process Amendments; Statutory Appointment Discretion.....	69
2. Preference Eligible Status.....	76
a. Campaign Badge	80
b. Documentation.....	82
c. Disabled Veteran.....	83
d. Derivative Preference Eligible Status.....	84
3. Same or Similar Position	86
a. Factual Dispute Concerning Similarity of Positions	94
b. In an Executive Agency	95
4. Appointment Pending Conversion to Competitive Service	99
E. PROBATION OR TRIAL PERIOD.....	102
1. Probationary Classification Issues.....	103
a. Appointment From Register.....	103
b. Transfer.....	105
c. Reassignment; Promotion.....	106
d. Temporary Appointment Pending Establishment of a Register (TAPER).....	106
e. Direct Hire Authority	106
f. Career Reinstatement	106
2. Department of Defense	109
3. Calculating Year of Service.....	110
a. Incorrect Determination of Duration of Probation	111
b. Effective Time and Date of Inexplicit Termination Notice.....	116
c. Significance of SF-50; Unclear Appointment Date	116
d. WAE Appointment	117
e. Military Service	118
4. Counting or Tacking of Prior Service: Competitive Service Probation.....	119
a. Same Agency	125
b. Same Line of Work.....	126
5. Agreement to Serve Probationary Period; Waiver of Preexisting Appeal Rights	129
6. Imposition of Probation Following Break in Service	132
7. Creation of Probationary Period Not Required by Statute or Regulation.....	132
8. Representation by Agency That Probation Is Not Required; Equitable Estoppel	133
9. Lack of Notice of Probationary Period	135
F. APPEAL RIGHTS OF PROBATIONER.....	136
1. Appeal of Probationary Termination.....	137
a. Actions Other Than Termination.....	138
2. Classification of Probationers and Their Appeals	139
a. Competitive Service Term Appointee; Trial Period	139
b. Probationary Supervisor	140
3. Jurisdictional Issue; Right to Hearing.....	144
a. Effect of Collective Bargaining Contract; Agency Regulation	146
b. Other Contract.....	148
c. Harmful Error Analysis; <i>Stephen</i>	148
d. Relation to Suitability Determination	150
4. Preappointment Conditions	153
a. Harmful Error Analysis: Lack of Proper Advance Notice, Other Procedural Error	154
b. Entitlement to Hearing.....	159

c.	Measure of Substantive Review	159
5.	Postappointment Reasons.....	160
a.	Pre- and Postappointment Distinctions.....	160
6.	Defective or Untimely Termination Notice	166
a.	Termination by Unauthorized Official.....	168
7.	Discrimination and Partisan Politics	169
a.	Nonfrivolous Allegations	169
b.	Partisan Political Reason	171
c.	Marital Status	174
d.	Other Discrimination.....	181
8.	Constitutional Claim	181
9.	Involuntary Resignation.....	183
G.	LOSS OF APPEAL RIGHTS BY CHANGE IN POSITION.....	183
1.	Movement Between Positions in Same Agency; Lack of Notice of Requirement of Probation.....	184
a.	Movement to Position Through Settlement Agreement	191
2.	Movement From One Agency to Another; Transfer; Lack of Notice of Requirement of Probation	191
H.	TEMPORARY AND TERM APPOINTMENTS	195
1.	Competitive Service Temporary, Term Appointees.....	198
2.	Excepted Service Preference Eligible Temporary Appointees	203
3.	Excepted Service Nonpreference Eligible Temporary Appointees.....	204
4.	Particular Temporary or Irregular Schedule Appointments.....	204
a.	TAPER	204
b.	Seasonal; On-Call	204
c.	Intermittent	208
d.	Full-Time/Part-Time.....	209
e.	Postal Service Light Duty.....	210
f.	Indefinite Appointment	210
5.	Jurisdictional Effect of Lapse of Term or Temporary Appointment	210
6.	Appeal if Termination Occurs Before End of Expiration of Limited Appointment.....	212
I.	PARTICULAR APPOINTMENTS.....	213
1.	Nonappropriated Fund	213
2.	Veterans Readjustment Act	214
3.	Reemployed Annuitant.....	219
a.	Exceptions.....	221
4.	Senior Executive Service.....	223
5.	Administrative Law Judge.....	223
6.	Disabled Employee.....	223
7.	Employees in Confidential, Policy-Making, Policy-Determining Positions; Presidential Appointee.....	226
a.	White House, Executive Office	230
b.	Schedule F Positions.....	231
8.	Alien; Noncitizen	233
9.	Students.....	233
a.	Federal Career Intern Program	235
b.	Student Temporary Employment Program; Recent Graduates Program; Student Career Experience Program.....	241
c.	Pathways.....	243
10.	Judicial Branch	244
11.	Government Corporation.....	245
12.	Postal Service.....	246
a.	One Year of Qualifying Service; Current Continuous Service in Same or Similar Position	250
b.	Postal Supervisors, Managers	255
c.	Postal Personnel Officials, Confidential Employees	261
d.	Postal Service Employees Who Lack Preference Eligibility, Have No Negotiated Grievance Procedures, and Who Are Neither Managers Nor Personnelists	266
13.	Contractors	269
14.	Stafford Act.....	269
15.	Others.....	271
J.	AGENCIES WITH SPECIALIZED PERSONNEL SYSTEMS: MSPB JURISDICTIONAL EXCLUSIONS AND MODIFICATIONS.....	271
1.	Department of Homeland Security	271
a.	Human Resources Management System's Rise and Demise	272
b.	Transportation Security Agency: Screeners; Other Employees	272
(i)	Probationer	275
(ii)	Other TSA Employees.....	276

c.	RIF.....	280
2.	Federal Aviation Administration.....	280
a.	2012 Legislation Restoring Back Pay Authority as a Component of MSPB Jurisdiction	283
b.	2000 Legislation Restoring MSPB Jurisdiction; Back Pay Issues	284
c.	1996 Legislation Removing MSPB Jurisdiction.....	292
3.	Department of Defense National Security Personnel System	292
4.	District of Columbia	292
5.	Central Intelligence Agency; Defense Department Intelligence; Other Intelligence or Security Agencies.....	293
6.	Federal Bureau of Investigation	294
7.	Canal Zone.....	294
8.	National Archives	295
9.	National Guard Technicians, Other Employees	295
10.	Tennessee Valley Authority Employees.....	302
11.	Library of Congress; GAO; Congressional Employees.....	302
a.	Ramspeck Act	302
12.	Smithsonian Institution	303
13.	Bureau of Indian Affairs.....	303
14.	MSPB Employees	303
15.	Department of Veterans Affairs.....	303
a.	USERRA Coverage.....	317
b.	Actions Against Healthcare Professionals Not Involving Professional Conduct or Competence.....	318
(i)	Involuntary Retirement, Resignation.....	319
c.	Veterans Canteen Service	322
16.	Agriculture: Stabilization and Conservation Service; Cooperative Extension Services	324
17.	Department of Defense Education Activity.....	324
18.	Office of Independent Counsel.....	325
19.	Foreign Service.....	325
20.	World Bank	326
K.	NATURE OF PERSONNEL ACTION APPEALED.....	326
1.	Possible Adverse Action; Proposal	326
2.	Suspension	326
a.	Paper Suspension	327
b.	Consolidation of Short Suspensions.....	327
c.	Calculating Duration of Suspension	329
d.	Erroneous Imposition of Suspension Exceeding 14 Days.....	329
e.	Indefinite Suspension	330
3.	Position Change.....	330
a.	Rank Reduction	332
b.	Nonselection	332
c.	Loss of Earnings Opportunities; Change in Work Schedule.....	334
d.	Disciplinary Reassignment; Unified Penalties; Reassignment Leading to Reduction in Pay.....	335
4.	Pay and Benefits; Classification; Debt; Leave	337
a.	Classification	338
b.	Pay System Conversion; Grade Reduction.....	340
c.	Correction of Pay, Grade	344
d.	Reduction in Pay; Locality Pay Issue; Failure to Obtain Pay Increase	350
e.	Misrepresentation Concerning Pay Rates.....	355
f.	Termination of Premium Pay; Bonus; LEAPA; Seniority, Overtime Adjustments	356
g.	Retirement Credit, Contributions, and Incentives; Individual Retirement Record.....	361
h.	Debt Collection, Recoupment, Retirement Funds: Agency, OPM Involvement.....	363
i.	Leave Dispute; Administrative Leave; Notice, Investigation Leave	366
j.	Pay and Compensation Claims: Role of OPM	370
5.	Severance Pay.....	371
6.	Promotion Claim.....	371
a.	Termination of Temporary Promotion	372
b.	Loss of Promotion Opportunities	374
c.	Lower Graded Position Through Return Right—Overseas Employee.....	376
7.	Back Pay Dispute	377
a.	Retirement Payment.....	377
8.	Resignation.....	377
a.	Abandonment of Position	377
9.	Mandatory Retirement.....	379

10. OWCP Benefits	379
11. Insurance Programs.....	381
12. Requests for Reinstatement: Non-Military Personnel.....	387
a. Failure to Rehire	387
b. Reinstatement Rights—Occupational Illness or Injury; Others.....	387
13. Performance Standard; Rating; PIP.....	388
14. Miscellaneous Actions.....	388
L. NATURE OF STATUTORY VIOLATION ALLEGED	389
1. Prohibited Personnel Practices; Discrimination	389
2. Merit System Principles Violations	392
3. Constitutional Violation	393
M. EFFECT OF COLLECTIVE BARGAINING CONTRACT GRIEVANCE OR RELATED PROCEDURES; 5 USC 7121	398
1. Postal Service Employees.....	401
a. Effect of EEO Allegation or EEO Complaint.....	402
2. Department of Veterans Affairs; 38 USC 714.....	403
3. Administrative Grievance System	404
4. Statutory Grievance System; Foreign Service Grievance Board	404
5. Employee Choice: Adverse Action; Performance Case.....	404
6. Collective Bargaining Contract Exclusivity	405
a. Appeal Right With EEO Allegation.....	406
b. USERRA Claim	409
c. RIF.....	413
d. Acceptable Level of Competence Determination; Within-Grade Increase.....	415
7. Problems Arising From Choice of Collective Bargaining Contract Procedure	415
a. Incorrect or Inadequate Notice From Agency.....	415
b. Dispute Over Bargaining Unit Status or Arbitrability; Ineffective Elections; Cross-Filing; Withdrawal of Grievance.....	417
c. Defunct Union	420
d. Union Action on Behalf of Employee	422
e. What Constitutes Filing of Grievance	424
f. Premature Elections.....	425
g. Belated Grievance	426
h. Failure to Obtain Arbitration Hearing	426
8. Indefinite Suspension.....	429
9. Appeal Right With Arbitration Award; Employees of Agencies Other Than Postal Service	430
10. Unfair Labor Practice Charge	431
N. GRADE AND PAY RETENTION	433
1. <i>Atwell</i>	435
a. Restoration Action	437
2. Absence of Retention; Benefits Declined	437
3. Appeal of RIF; Classification.....	438
4. Termination of Pay Retention	440
V. APPEAL RIGHTS BASED ON MILITARY SERVICE AND VETERANS PREFERENCE.....	440
A. REGULATIONS GOVERNING USERRA, VEOA CLAIMS.....	445
B. JUDGE’S RESPONSIBILITY.....	447
C. HEARING ENTITLEMENT; BOARD DISPOSITION.....	448
1. USERRA	448
2. VEOA	450
D. EXCLUSIVITY OF VEOA OR USERRA APPEAL; JOINDER OF CLAIMS.....	452
E. UNIFORMED SERVICE EMPLOYMENT AND REEMPLOYMENT RIGHTS ACT	453
1. USERRA Statutory Structure	458
a. Related EEO Violation; Prohibited Personnel Practice Allegation.....	463
b. Affirmative Defense	465
2. Time for USERRA Appeal	466
a. Laches.....	468
b. Waiver of Right to Appeal.....	469
3. Permissive Exhaustion of Labor Department Remedy.....	471
a. Referral to OSC.....	473
4. Liberal Pleading Standard.....	474
a. Nonfrivolous Jurisdictional Allegations	480
b. Summary Disposition of Claim	481
5. Burden of Proof.....	482

a.	Analysis of Alleged Discrimination or Reprisal Based on Military Service	486
b.	Reprisal Against Exercise of USERRA Rights.....	492
c.	Circumstantial Evidence; Statistics.....	494
d.	Preselection	498
e.	Discrimination Motivated by Lower-Level Supervisor; Cat's Paw	499
f.	Disability Incurred While in Military Service; Use of Leave for Disability.....	501
g.	Disparate Impact Theory Inapplicable.....	502
6.	Recovery Period.....	504
a.	Nonretroactive Substantive Application.....	506
b.	Vietnam Era Veterans' Readjustment Assistance Act of 1974.....	509
7.	Covered Personnel; Agencies	510
a.	Contractor Employee	515
b.	Relatives of Service Members	517
8.	Military Restoration Rights	517
a.	National Guard USERRA Discrimination and Restoration Claims.....	521
b.	Length of Service Before Loss of Restoration Right.....	525
c.	Conditions of Discharge From Military Service	526
d.	Effect of Release From Service for Disability.....	527
e.	Delay in Requesting Restoration Following Military Service.....	530
f.	Elimination of Position Through RIF	530
9.	Other Personnel Action, Benefits; Damages	532
a.	Dismissal From Employment; Demotion; Abandonment of Civilian Career.....	532
b.	Constructive Adverse Action.....	539
c.	Suspension.....	539
d.	Failure to Appoint.....	539
e.	Failure to Consider Employee for Vacant Positions; Nonpromotion; Manipulation or Abolition of Positions.....	546
f.	Denial of Priority Consideration.....	550
g.	Performance Appraisal; References	550
h.	Noncompetitive Promotion; Bid Assignment; Escalator Principle; Interim Promotion.....	551
i.	Reassignment	558
j.	Retirement Benefits	559
k.	Education Benefits	559
l.	Military Leave; <i>Butterbaugh</i>	560
m.	Charge to Leave	568
n.	Differential Pay	568
o.	Harassment; Hostile Working Environment; Remedy	570
p.	Change in Employment Status; Reemployment; Benefits Following Restoration to Duty.....	575
q.	Ready Reserve Status	583
F.	VETERANS EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITIES ACT	583
1.	Statutory Structure	586
a.	Definition of Agency	587
b.	Burden of Proof	589
c.	Related EEO Violation, Prohibited Personnel Practice, Other Challenges.....	590
2.	Covered Personnel.....	591
a.	Training Status.....	594
b.	Disabled Veteran.....	595
3.	Student, Intern Recruitment Programs	595
a.	Federal Career Intern Program	595
b.	Outstanding Scholar Program	604
c.	Pathways, Recent Graduates Program	610
4.	Particular Agencies; Positions.....	616
a.	Postal Service	616
b.	Foreign Service.....	618
c.	Nonappropriated Fund	619
d.	Public Health Service.....	620
e.	Statutory Exclusions	620
f.	VA Medical Professionals	621
g.	FAA, TSA Employees	622
h.	National Guard Technicians	624
i.	Title 10 Intelligence Position	624
5.	Time for VEOA Appeal	625

6.	Mandatory Exhaustion of DOL Remedy; Time for Complaint	626
a.	Specificity Required for DOL Complaint	631
b.	Equitable Tolling of DOL Time Limit; Waiver of Administrative Exhaustion Requirement	633
c.	Effect of Settlement Reached by DOL.....	644
d.	Termination of Proceedings to Pursue Case in Court.....	645
7.	Liberal Pleading Standard.....	645
8.	Basis for Veterans Preference	647
a.	Excepted Service Position; “Positive Factor”; Attorneys; Passover Process	649
9.	Application of Veterans Preference to Appointment Process.....	664
a.	Necessity for Application.....	665
b.	Appointment Through Reinstatement	665
c.	Impact of Collective Bargaining Contract	666
d.	Background Investigation	667
e.	Failure to Provide Proper Veterans Preference.....	667
f.	Improper Appointment Authority; Priority Consideration.....	669
g.	Manipulation of Appointments; Cancellation of Vacancy	671
h.	Geographic Extent of Competition.....	680
i.	Category Rating System.....	680
10.	Qualifications for Position; Exclusion From Consideration; Consideration of Experience; Multiple Referral Certificates.....	685
a.	Education	697
b.	Time-In-Grade.....	698
c.	Medical Fitness.....	700
d.	Age Limit on Appointment.....	700
e.	Consideration for Position but Nonselection; Limitation on Consideration Imposed by Applicant.....	706
f.	Improper Assessment of Qualifications	707
11.	Appointment and Promotion Processes Challenges	710
a.	Competitive Appointment Procedures; Exceptions to Competitive Requirements; Expedited Hiring for Acquisitions Positions.....	710
b.	Merit Promotion With Internal Candidates Only; Reassignment; Reinstatement.....	716
c.	Merit Promotion, Open to External Candidates; Canceled Announcement; “Right to Compete” Claim	719
d.	Position Announced Under Both Open Competition and Merit Promotion Procedures.....	732
e.	Veterans Readjustment Act Appointment	737
12.	Remedial Structure; Reconstruction of Selection Process; Removal of Selectee	739
a.	Passover	753
b.	Mootness; Review of Agency-Initiated Reconstruction Effort	758
13.	Damages, Other Benefits.....	759
14.	Disciplinary Case	765
15.	Reassignment; Transfer	765
16.	Retirement Benefit.....	766
VI.	SUITABILITY DETERMINATION.....	766
A.	APPELLATE PROCEDURES.....	772
B.	APPLICATION TO COMPETITIVE SERVICE APPOINTEES.....	773
1.	Employees Serving in Probationary or Trial Periods.....	774
C.	SUITABILITY DETERMINATIONS BY AGENCIES OPERATING UNDER AUTHORITY DELEGATED BY OPM.....	774
1.	Evidence of Material, Intentional False Statement, or Deception or Fraud.....	777
2.	Constructive Suitability Determination	778
3.	Nonselection for Position; Constructive Suitability Determination Under Delegated Authority	780
a.	Decisions Under OPM Regulations Predating 2008.....	788
4.	Impact of 2008 OPM Suitability Regulations.....	794
D.	ADJUDICATION STANDARDS	795
1.	Mitigation; EEO Defenses	798
2.	Disparate Treatment; Comparator	799
3.	Rehabilitation	799
E.	EVIDENCE	800
1.	Collateral Estoppel; <i>Res Judicata</i>	801
F.	BASES FOR SUITABILITY DETERMINATIONS.....	802
1.	Falsification of Employment Document	802
2.	Drug Involvement.....	803
3.	Criminal or Dishonest Conduct.....	804
4.	Other Problems.....	805

G. BAR ORDERS.....	805
H. REMEDIES.....	805
1. Mootness.....	808
I. RELATION OF SUITABILITY AND PASSEVER DETERMINATIONS.....	808
J. RELATION OF OPM-DIRECTED SUITABILITY REMOVAL AND ADVERSE ACTION APPEAL RIGHTS, MITIGATION ANALYSIS; <i>AGUZIE</i> ; 2015 LEGISLATIVE MODIFICATION.....	810
VII. OPM REGULATION REVIEW; CHALLENGES TO AGENCY IMPLEMENTATION OF OPM REGULATIONS; CHALLENGES TO OPM EMPLOYMENT PRACTICES.....	823
A. REGULATION AND REGULATION IMPLEMENTATION REVIEW PROCEDURES.....	823
1. General Criteria for Regulation Review and Regulation Implementation Review.....	823
a. Distinction Between Regulation Review, Implementation Review.....	827
2. Pleading Requirements; Scope of Review.....	828
a. Discretionary Review; Likelihood of Success.....	829
b. Likelihood of Harm.....	830
c. Likelihood Issues Will Be Addressed in a Different MSPB Appeal or a Different Forum.....	830
d. Standing; “Interested Person”.....	832
e. Covered Personnel Action.....	832
3. Examples of Regulation Review.....	832
a. Administrative Law Judge Examination Authority.....	832
b. SES Reassignment, Work Schedule.....	833
c. Administration of Leave.....	834
d. OPM Qualification Standards.....	834
e. Scope of Administrative Grievance Procedure.....	835
f. Other Issues.....	836
4. Examples of Regulation Implementation Review.....	837
a. SES Performance Appraisal Dispute.....	838
B. EMPLOYMENT PRACTICE CHALLENGES.....	840
1. Time and Place for Filing Appeal.....	846
2. Agency Misapplication of Valid OPM Requirement; Agency Employment Practices; Nonselections.....	846
3. Standing to Raise Challenge.....	852
4. General Characteristics of Tests Rather Than Individual Examination Results.....	854
5. Failure to Hire; Nonselection.....	855
6. Scope of Competition.....	856
7. Position Qualification Standard; Educational Requirement.....	857
8. Medical and Physical Qualification Requirements.....	863
9. OPM Involvement in Agency Selection.....	864
10. Selection and Examination Practices for Administrative Law Judges.....	866
a. Rule of Three.....	873
11. Passover Determination.....	875
12. Time-In-Grade Restriction.....	876
13. Eligibility Rating and Suitability Determination.....	877
14. Failure to Promote.....	878
15. Remedy.....	878
VIII. CHALLENGES TO ADVERSE PERSONNEL RECORDS NOTATIONS.....	878

CHAPTER 2: APPEAL 881

I. INITIATING AN APPEAL.....	881
A. RULES AND PRACTICES OF GENERAL APPLICATION GOVERNING APPEALS.....	881
1. Dates of Filing.....	881
2. Service of Pleadings.....	881
3. Filing Regulation; Electronic Filing; Technical Difficulties.....	882
4. Processing of Appeal.....	888
B. TIME FOR FILING APPEAL.....	889
1. Treatment of Timeliness Issues.....	890
2. Jurisdiction or Timeliness as Alternate Bases for Dismissal of Appeal.....	891
3. Time to Appeal; Regulatory Provisions; Computation of Time.....	894
a. Allegations of Discrimination—Mixed Case.....	894
b. Effect of Collective Bargaining Contract Grievance Procedure.....	894
c. Computation of Time.....	895
d. Technical Constructions.....	895
e. Request for Extension of Time to Appeal.....	896

4.	Suspension Appeal.....	897
a.	Indefinite Suspension; Enforced Leave.....	897
5.	Individual Right of Action Appeal.....	901
6.	USERRA Appeal.....	902
7.	Negative OPM Reconsideration Decision Appeal.....	902
a.	Failure to Seek Timely Reconsideration; Requests to Extend Time to Request Reconsideration.....	906
b.	Belated Receipt of Reconsideration Decision.....	912
c.	Relation Between Scope of Reconsideration Request and Appeal.....	912
d.	Failure of OPM to Act on Reconsideration Request; Failure of OPM to Advise of Reconsideration Right.....	912
e.	Overpayment Determinations.....	917
8.	Law Enforcement Officer Retirement Credit Appeal.....	918
9.	Department of Veterans Affairs; 38 USC 714; Mixed Cases; Equitable Tolling.....	920
a.	Hybrid Employees.....	923
C.	METHOD AND PLACE OF FILING.....	926
1.	Method of Filing.....	926
a.	Mail.....	927
b.	Significance of Postmark: Presumptive Filing Date.....	927
c.	Significance of Actual Mailing Date; Mailstream Rule: Actual Filing Date.....	927
d.	Commercial Delivery.....	928
e.	Facsimile.....	928
f.	Personal Delivery.....	928
g.	Electronic Filing.....	928
2.	Irregular and Misdirected Filings.....	929
a.	Appeal To or From Congressional Office.....	929
b.	Misfiled Mixed-Case Appeal.....	930
c.	Non-Mixed Appeal Filed With Employing Agency.....	932
d.	Appeal Misdirected Within MSPB, to OPM, or to OSC.....	933
e.	Incomplete Appeal.....	934
D.	PREMATURE APPEALS.....	934
1.	Abeyance Arrangement.....	935
2.	Premature Appeal That Ripens Into Appealable Action During Regional Adjudication or During PFR.....	936
3.	Retirement Appeal.....	937
4.	Mixed and Whistleblowing Cases.....	939
E.	TIMELINESS OF APPEALS.....	940
1.	Judge's Responsibility to Provide Notice Concerning a Timeliness Issue.....	940
a.	Mental or Physical Illness; <i>Lacy</i> Notice.....	943
b.	Duty of Appellant to Produce Evidence Concerning Timeliness.....	945
c.	Duty of Agency and Judge to Produce and Develop Evidence Concerning Timeliness.....	945
2.	Waiver of Time Limit for Appeal; <i>Alonzo</i>	948
a.	Prejudice to Respondent; <i>Laches</i>	951
b.	Current Law on Waiver; Multifactor Analysis.....	952
c.	Historical Position on Waiver.....	957
d.	Retirement Appeals.....	958
3.	Application for Waiver.....	959
a.	Due Diligence.....	961
4.	Collective Bargaining Contract Stay Provision; Postal Service Employee; Agency-Initiated Stay.....	961
5.	Hearing on Timeliness Issue.....	963
F.	JUSTIFICATION FOR LATE FILING.....	965
1.	Sickness or Hospitalization.....	965
a.	Supporting Evidence.....	966
b.	Mental Impairment.....	967
c.	Effect of Continuing Mental Disorder on Filing Deadline.....	969
2.	Substitute Employment, Travel, or Other Activities.....	971
3.	Military Service.....	972
4.	Incarceration; Criminal Proceeding.....	974
5.	Need to Obtain Documentation.....	975
6.	Need to Obtain Counsel.....	975
7.	Unfamiliarity With MSPB Procedures and Law; Ambiguous Agency Communications.....	976
a.	Language Difficulties.....	977
b.	Miscalculation of Time for Appeal.....	977
8.	Lack of Notice of Appeal Rights.....	978

a.	Failure to Provide Notice.....	979
b.	Belated Receipt of Adverse Action Decision.....	984
c.	Constructive Receipt of Decision Notice.....	985
d.	Proof Concerning Delivery of Notice of Appeal Rights.....	988
e.	Notice of Appeal Rights to Appellant’s Representative.....	988
f.	Appellant’s Responsibility When Decision Notice or Information About Appeal Rights Is Not Received	989
g.	Constructive Adverse Action; Notice if Agency Learns of Employee’s Protest.....	990
h.	Constructive Adverse Action Without Notice of Employee’s Protest to Agency	992
(i)	<i>Jones, Krizman and Beyond</i>	999
i.	Agency on Notice but Fails to Provide Appeal Rights; Secondary Information Concerning Appeal Rights	1003
j.	Adverse Action or Performance-Based Appeal Arising From Last Chance or Other Settlement Agreement	1004
k.	Lack of Notice Concerning Restoration and Reemployment Appeal Rights	1007
l.	Enforced Leave	1010
m.	Prior or Subsequent Notice of Filing Deadline	1011
n.	Agency Misrepresentation.....	1012
o.	Threats by Agency Personnel.....	1014
p.	Mixed Case Notice Problems.....	1014
q.	Problem With or Delayed Receipt of Domestic, Certified, or International Mail, or Commercial Delivery; Address Change	1015
9.	Appeal Lost in Mail	1022
10.	Facsimile Problems	1024
11.	Electronic Filing Problem	1024
12.	Problem Caused by Adjudicators; Misdirected Appeal.....	1025
a.	MSPB	1025
b.	EEOC; Agency EEO Processes	1025
c.	OPM	1025
13.	Uncertainty as to Outcome of a Related Case; Pending Settlement Negotiations or Investigation; Case Taken to Court.....	1027
a.	Grievances.....	1027
b.	Mediation Request.....	1028
14.	Inadequate Representation.....	1028
a.	Delay Not Excused	1029
b.	Delay Excused; Counsel’s Delay Balanced Against Appellant’s Best Efforts; Retirement Cases	1030
c.	Delay Excused; Obstruction or Misrepresentation by Counsel.....	1033
d.	Delay Excused; Inconsequential Delay by Representative	1037
15.	Other Problems.....	1037
G.	TIME FOR RAISING NEW APPELLATE ISSUES AND CLAIMS.....	1038
1.	Issues and Defenses	1038
a.	Liberal Construction of Pleadings; Issues Raised at Hearing	1038
b.	EEO Affirmative Defenses	1039
2.	Additional Appealable Action	1039
H.	MOOT, WITHDRAWN, AND WAIVED APPEALS.....	1039
1.	Mootness of Appeal	1039
a.	Cancellation of Action Appealed	1041
b.	Restoration of <i>Status Quo Ante</i> ; Enforcement Petition.....	1042
c.	Initiation of New Action Based on Events Leading to Canceled Action	1050
d.	Procedure Followed if Action Not Completely Rescinded.....	1050
e.	Procedure Following Remand to Judge.....	1051
f.	Settlement Independent of MSPB Appeal	1052
g.	Complete Relief Through Other Means; Stay of Pending Litigation	1062
h.	Collateral Issues Following Rescission of Action; Claims for Attorney Fees or General Damages; Interest	1062
i.	EEO Allegation; Claim for Compensatory Damages	1063
j.	Whistleblower Protection Act: Claims for Damages, Other Relief	1066
k.	Uniformed Services Employment and Reemployment Rights Act	1072
l.	Criminal Conviction	1073
m.	Consecutive Adverse Actions.....	1073
n.	OPM Rescinds Reconsideration or Final Decision; Overpayment Recovery; Withdrawal of or Additional Retirement Application; Disputed Retirement Calculations.....	1074
o.	Administrative Law Judge Complaint.....	1081
p.	Other Problems	1081
2.	Effect of Retirement on Appealable Action.....	1081

a.	Effect of Cleansing Personnel File When Removal Is Accompanied by Retirement; Effect of Claim for Damages	1090
b.	Resignation or Retirement Before Termination	1094
c.	Reduction in Force Appeal	1094
d.	Prior Law; Disability Retirement	1095
3.	Withdrawal of Appeal	1096
a.	Withdrawal to Pursue EEO Complaint; Withdrawal of EEO Claim	1099
b.	Withdrawal to Pursue Collective Bargaining Contract Grievance Procedure	1101
c.	Confusion Between Necessity for Withdrawal of Appeal, Continuance, and Withdrawal of Appeal Without Prejudice to Refile	1102
d.	Unauthorized Act of Representative	1103
e.	Duress; Misrepresentation; Incompetence	1106
f.	Mistake	1109
g.	Misleading or Incomplete Information From Judge	1109
h.	Attempts to Refile, Reinstate, or Reopen Withdrawn Appeals	1112
4.	Dismissal Without Prejudice to Refile ("DWOP")	1116
a.	Reasons for DWOP	1121
b.	Pending Criminal Proceeding; Indefinite Suspension	1121
c.	Procedures for Obtaining Dismissal; Refiling	1123
d.	Refiling Date	1123
e.	Effect of PFR	1126
f.	Agency-Initiated Request; Prior Practice	1126
g.	Dismissal Initiated by Judge or MSPB	1127
5.	Delay in Refiling After DWOP	1128
a.	Retirement Appeal	1133
b.	Imperfect Attempt to Refile; Confusion Caused by Judge	1134
c.	Late Refiling; Independent Right of Appeal	1135
6.	Waiver of Appeal Through Last Chance or Other Preappeal Agreement	1135
a.	Jurisdictional Analysis	1138
b.	Public Policy; Appeal Preclusion; Consideration; Conflict With Regulation	1147
c.	Ambiguous Term; Failure to Waive Future Appeal Rights	1149
d.	Due Process Considerations; Notice	1153
e.	Last Chance Agreement Superseded by Independent Adverse Action	1154
f.	Lack of Authority of Representative to Enter Agreement	1155
g.	Agreement to Accept Demotion, Suspension	1156
h.	Bad Faith, Coercion, Lack of Mental Capacity	1157
i.	Illegal or Punitive Term	1162
j.	Jurisdictional Prerequisite: LCA Compliance or Breach	1163
k.	Burden of Proof	1164
l.	Hearing Entitlement	1167
m.	Condition Unrelated to Underlying Action; Ambiguous Condition; Condition Described in Notice of LCA Violation	1170
n.	Discrimination, Reprisal	1176
o.	Claim Collateral to Breach of Agreement	1177
p.	Duration of Agreement	1177
7.	Personnel Action Resulting From Settlement Not Constituting Last Chance Agreement	1177
8.	Settlement Reached During Board Appeal	1179
II.	FORMAT AND PRELIMINARY PROCESSING OF APPEAL	1180
A.	ESSENTIAL INFORMATION	1180
B.	FORMAT	1181
1.	Interpretation of Appeal	1181
2.	Signature	1183
3.	Appeal Filed Through Representative	1183
4.	"John Doe" Appeal: Protecting Appellant's Privacy	1184
5.	Agency-Initiated Retirement Appeal	1186
6.	Class Action, Consolidated Appeals, and Joinder; Bifurcated Appeals	1187
a.	Consolidation	1187
b.	Joinder; Compulsory Joinder	1189
c.	Class Action	1191
d.	Bifurcated Appeals	1193
7.	Substitution; Survival of Claim	1193

a. IRA Case.....	1195
C. INTERVENTION.....	1195
1. Intervention of Right: OPM, OSC	1196
a. OPM.....	1196
b. OSC	1197
2. Permissive Intervention	1198
3. Rights of Intervenor.....	1200
4. <i>Amicus Curiae</i>	1200
D. STEPS TAKEN AFTER APPEAL IS FILED.....	1201
1. Acknowledgment of Appeal	1203
a. Philippines Retirement Appeal.....	1203
2. Amendment of Appeal.....	1204
3. Service of Pleadings	1204
4. Deficient Appeal	1204
5. Affirmative Defense Order; Requirement of Specific Allegations.....	1206
E. AGENCY RESPONSE TO APPEAL.....	1207
1. Narrative Response to Appeal	1208
2. Motion to Dismiss Appeal.....	1209
3. Delay in Appeal Response.....	1209
4. Designation of Agency Representative.....	1209
F. JURISDICTIONAL ISSUES.....	1210
1. Nonfrivolous Jurisdictional Allegation	1213
2. Judge Must Ensure Jurisdictional Issues Are Identified; <i>Burgess</i> Notice	1214
3. Agency Representative’s Responsibilities	1218
4. Hearing on Jurisdictional Issue	1218
G. REPRESENTATIVES.....	1219
1. Right to Representation.....	1220
a. Inadequate Representation	1222
b. Service on Representative.....	1223
2. Disqualification of Representative; State Disciplinary Rules	1223
a. Conflicts	1225
b. Representative as Witness.....	1228
H. <i>PRO SE</i> AND INADEQUATELY REPRESENTED PARTIES	1228
1. <i>Pro Se</i> Appellant.....	1228
2. Assistance to Mentally Incompetent Appellant; <i>French</i> Procedure	1229
I. <i>EX PARTE</i> COMMUNICATIONS	1233
1. What They Are	1234
2. How <i>Ex Parte</i> Communications Are Treated	1237
III. INTERLOCUTORY APPEALS.....	1237
A. INTERLOCUTORY APPEAL PROCEDURE.....	1237
1. Regulation.....	1238
2. Application of Regulation	1240
a. Rulings on Bias and Intervention.....	1241
b. Direct Appeal to MSPB.....	1242
3. Stay of Proceeding.....	1242

CHAPTER 3: DISCOVERY; SANCTIONS 1245

I. DISCOVERY.....	1245
A. OVERVIEW	1245
1. Regulatory Structure.....	1246
2. Preliminary Steps.....	1249
a. Initial Disclosures.....	1250
3. Limitations	1250
a. Jurisdictional or Timeliness Issue.....	1251
4. Motion to Compel.....	1252
5. Federal Rules.....	1254
a. Federal Rules of General Application	1255
6. Discovery Devices	1256
a. Interrogatories.....	1256
b. Document Request.....	1257

c.	Request for Admissions.....	1258
d.	Deposition.....	1259
e.	Medical, Psychiatric Examinations	1262
f.	Motion for More Definite Statement of Appeal.....	1263
7.	Discovery From Nonparties.....	1264
B.	STRATEGIC CONSIDERATIONS	1264
1.	Burden.....	1265
a.	Effect of EEO, Reprisal Allegations.....	1265
b.	Discovery During Pendency of Criminal Proceedings	1266
2.	Privileged Information	1266
a.	<i>In Camera</i> Inspection.....	1267
b.	Law Enforcement Privilege	1268
c.	OSC File; Executive and Investigative Privileges	1269
d.	OPM Suitability File.....	1270
e.	Agency Investigative File.....	1270
f.	Attorney-Client Privilege	1271
g.	Attorney Work Product Privilege	1275
h.	Agency Deliberative Process Privilege.....	1278
i.	Statutory Confidentiality Limitations.....	1280
3.	Privacy Act	1280
4.	Failure to Use Discovery.....	1282
5.	Informal Discovery; Control by Agencies of Employees' Time	1284
6.	Protective Order.....	1285
C.	ENTRY OF DISCOVERY MATERIAL INTO RECORD	1286
D.	SUBPOENAS	1287
1.	When a Subpoena Is Used	1287
2.	Obtaining, Serving Subpoena	1287
a.	Witnesses Outside United States	1289
3.	Challenge; Enforcement	1289
4.	Witness Fees; Travel Allowances	1290
E.	REVIEW OF DISCOVERY RULINGS.....	1291
1.	Rulings on Disputes.....	1291
a.	Synopsis of Testimony	1291
b.	Relevance, Overbread Request	1291
c.	Mitigation; Disparate Treatment	1292
d.	Deposition of Agency Head.....	1293
e.	Electronic Records.....	1293
f.	Inspection Rather Than Production of Documents.....	1294
g.	OSC Case.....	1295
2.	Effect of Denial of Discovery	1295
a.	Due Process Considerations	1297
b.	Preservation of Issue	1299
II.	SANCTIONS.....	1300
A.	FAILURE TO RESPOND TO APPEAL	1303
1.	Default Judgment.....	1303
B.	FAILURE TO PROSECUTE APPEAL	1304
1.	Dismissal Warranted.....	1305
a.	Failure to Provide Basis for Appeal.....	1307
b.	Failure to Designate Representative.....	1307
c.	Failure to Comply With Judge's Order.....	1307
2.	Dismissal Unwarranted	1309
a.	Failure to Attend Hearing.....	1310
b.	Inadvertent or Isolated Failure to Obey Judge's Orders	1310
c.	Mental Impairment.....	1313
d.	Late Appeal.....	1313
C.	FAILURE TO COOPERATE IN DISCOVERY	1313
1.	Sanction Against Agency	1314
a.	Material in Control of Third Party.....	1317
2.	Sanction Against Appellant.....	1317
D.	FAILURE TO FOLLOW PREHEARING OR HEARING PROCEDURES.....	1320

1. Sanction Against Appellant; Prejudice to Agency.....	1321
2. Sanction Against Agency	1322

CHAPTER 4: HEARING..... 1325

I. HEARING.....	1325
A. RIGHT TO HEARING	1325
1. <i>De Novo</i> Hearing.....	1326
a. Role of Intervenor.....	1327
2. Jurisdictional Hearing; Documentary Evidence.....	1327
a. Timeliness Issue.....	1331
b. No Material Disputed Facts.....	1331
3. Counsel	1333
4. Control by Judge	1333
a. Hearing at Initiative of Judge.....	1335
5. Official Time; Resources Available to Appellant.....	1336
B. WAIVER OF HEARING.....	1336
1. Inability to Travel to Hearing Site	1339
2. Failure to Request Hearing	1340
a. Remands; New Law.....	1341
3. Untimely Hearing Request.....	1341
a. Effect of Amendment of Appeal	1342
b. Failure to Receive Hearing Notice.....	1342
4. Withdrawal of Hearing Request.....	1344
a. Postponement Denied	1344
b. Events Beyond Appellant’s Control.....	1345
c. Informed Waiver.....	1345
5. Strategic Considerations—Intentional Waiver	1345
6. Adjudication After Waiver, Failure to Attend Hearing.....	1345
7. Adjudication Without Hearing; Responses to Evidentiary Submissions	1346
C. POSTPONEMENT OF HEARING.....	1350
1. Timing of Hearing	1351
2. Policy on Continuances.....	1351
a. Dismissal Without Prejudice to Refile.....	1352
b. Case Suspension	1352
3. Continuance Procedure	1353
a. Request; Form of Sworn Statement.....	1354
b. Failure to Make Request.....	1354
c. Status of Pending Motion.....	1354
d. Proceeding After Denial of Motion	1355
4. Good Cause Requirement	1355
a. Need to Prepare	1355
b. Awaiting Outcome of Another Case.....	1355
c. Unavailability of Representative; New Representative.....	1355
(i) Case Proceeds to Hearing	1358
d. Medical Condition of Appellant	1358
e. Pending Criminal Proceeding; Indefinite Suspension.....	1359
f. Incarceration	1362
g. Military Service.....	1363
h. Missing or Unavailable Witness.....	1363
i. Change in Hearing Location.....	1364
5. Continuance Denial—Review Standard	1364
D. VENUE OF HEARING.....	1365
1. Change of Venue	1365
a. Cost to Appellant.....	1367
2. Requesting a Change of Venue.....	1367
3. Venue Determination Review Standard	1367
E. HEARING PRELIMINARIES.....	1367
1. Change, Resignation, or Death of Judge	1368
2. Interaction With Judge.....	1368
3. Prehearing Submission	1368
4. Prehearing Conference	1369

a.	Stipulations.....	1372
b.	Waiver or Withdrawal of Affirmative Defense	1373
c.	Dismissal of Charge	1373
5.	Memorandum or Order Summarizing Conference.....	1373
a.	Preservation of Objection; Incomplete Summary.....	1374
b.	Treatment of EEO and Other Affirmative Defenses; Waiver; Summary Judgment.....	1377
F.	CONDUCT OF HEARING; RESPONSIBILITIES OF JUDGE	1382
1.	Hearing Error: Measure of Damage	1382
a.	Timing of Submission of Pleadings.....	1383
b.	Timing of Initial Decision	1383
2.	Control and Exclusion of Representative or Participant.....	1384
3.	Maintaining Order.....	1385
a.	Exclusion From Hearing Room of an Individual Whose Presence May Intimidate a Witness	1386
b.	Security Arrangement	1386
4.	Witness Control; Sequestration.....	1387
5.	Conduct of Questioning	1389
a.	Multiple Representatives.....	1390
6.	Permitting Record Development	1390
a.	Videoconference, Telephone Hearing.....	1391
b.	Bifurcated Hearing	1395
c.	Hearing Subpoena	1397
7.	Ensuring Record Development; <i>Pro Se</i> Appellant; EEO File	1397
a.	Annuity Appeal	1399
b.	Duty of Judge to Inform an Appellant of Governing Law; <i>Pro Se</i> Appellant; Liberal Construction of Pleadings....	1401
c.	Raising Issue <i>Sua Sponte</i>	1402
d.	Preserving Review Right Through Objection	1404
8.	Media Coverage.....	1404
9.	Public Hearing; Closing Hearing.....	1405
10.	Timing of Hearing	1406
11.	Hearing Accommodation for Disabled Appellant; Interpreter	1406
12.	Allocation of Burden of Proof	1408
13.	Opening Statement.....	1408
14.	Closing Argument, Brief.....	1408
G.	PREVENTION OF INTERFERENCE WITH MSPB PROCEEDINGS	1409
1.	Protective Order.....	1409
2.	Protective Order for Appellant	1410
3.	Interference With Witness, Representative	1412
a.	Agency Restriction on Appearance of Employee as Witness	1415
H.	POSTHEARING ACTIVITIES	1416
1.	Closing Record	1416
a.	Ensuring Notice of Record Closing.....	1417
b.	Clarifying Scope of Record; Off-The-Record Discussions.....	1418
c.	Timing of Evidentiary Submissions, Responses.....	1418
d.	Effect of Closing Record	1420
2.	Regional Authority After Initial Decision	1420
a.	Judge's Request to Reopen Record to Correct Error	1421
II.	HEARING RECORD	1421
A.	RIGHT TO AND NECESSITY FOR A RECORD OR TRANSCRIPT	1421
1.	Current MSPB Practice.....	1422
2.	Past Treatment of Transcript.....	1423
3.	Past Internal MSPB Guidance on Transcript.....	1423
4.	Federal Circuit Commentary on Transcript	1423
a.	Arbitration Hearing.....	1424
5.	Use of Recording	1424
B.	PROBLEMS CONCERNING TRANSCRIPT AND RECORD	1425
1.	Off-The-Record Discussion	1425
2.	Hearing Recording Omission; Transcript Error.....	1425
3.	Correction of Transcript	1427
4.	Unofficial Transcript.....	1427
III.	MOTION PRACTICE.....	1428
A.	USE OF MOTIONS.....	1429

1.	Dispositive Motion.....	1430
a.	Motion to Dismiss Filed Before Hearing.....	1430
b.	Motion to Dismiss Filed During Hearing.....	1431
c.	Summary Judgment.....	1432
B.	FORM AND TIMING OF MOTIONS.....	1437
IV.	WITNESSES.....	1438
A.	WITNESS REQUEST.....	1438
1.	Obligation to Permit Relevant Testimony.....	1438
a.	Competence to Testify.....	1438
b.	Appellant.....	1439
c.	Decisionmaker.....	1439
d.	Agency Head.....	1439
2.	Obligation to Request Witness.....	1440
a.	Witness List.....	1441
b.	Rebuttal Witness.....	1442
3.	Repetitious Testimony.....	1443
4.	Offer of Proof.....	1443
5.	Compelling Witness Attendance.....	1443
a.	Appellant.....	1444
b.	Others; Former Employee; Subpoena.....	1444
6.	Duty Status of Federal Employee Witness; Pay, Travel, Per Diem.....	1444
a.	Official Time.....	1445
7.	Protecting Record; Missing Witness.....	1446
a.	Preservation of Objection.....	1446
8.	Judge May Call Witness.....	1447
9.	Obtaining Testimony by Alternate Means.....	1447
10.	Right of Witness to Representation.....	1447
a.	Self-Incrimination.....	1447
11.	Witness Denial—Review Standard.....	1447
B.	EXAMINATION OF WITNESSES.....	1449
1.	Control of Questioning.....	1450
a.	Questioning by Judge.....	1450
b.	Leading Questions.....	1451
c.	Production of Witness Statement, Document Relied on During Testimony.....	1452
d.	Taking Witness Out of Order.....	1453
V.	DISQUALIFICATION OF JUDGE.....	1453
A.	PRESUMPTION OF HONESTY AND IMPARTIALITY.....	1453
1.	Competence of Judge.....	1455
B.	TREATMENT OF BIAS ALLEGATIONS.....	1455
1.	Procedure; Documenting Record; Sworn Statement.....	1457
2.	Extrajudicial Source of Bias.....	1459
3.	Treatment of Bias Allegation by Judge, Board.....	1460
4.	Specific Bias Allegations.....	1460
a.	Relationship With Party or Witness.....	1460
b.	Relationship With Counsel.....	1463
c.	Improper Communication.....	1464
d.	Examination of Witness.....	1465
e.	Remarks About Counsel, Party, Merits, Settlement; Remarks During Hearing; <i>Ex Parte</i> Communication.....	1465
f.	Prior Ruling Against Party.....	1469
g.	Erroneous Ruling.....	1470
h.	Incorrect Factual Conclusion.....	1470
i.	Hasty or Late Decision.....	1470
5.	Change in Judge Without Finding of Bias.....	1471
CHAPTER 5: EVIDENCE.....		1475
I.	FUNDAMENTALS.....	1475
A.	RELEVANCE, MATERIALITY, AND FAIRNESS.....	1475
1.	Informal Adjudication.....	1475
2.	Relevance and Materiality.....	1475
a.	<i>De Novo</i> Review.....	1476
b.	Conditional Admission of Evidence.....	1476

3.	Protecting the Record.....	1476
a.	Offer of Proof.....	1476
4.	Fairness in Development of Evidence.....	1476
a.	Erroneous Exclusion of Evidence.....	1476
b.	Erroneous Admission of Evidence.....	1477
c.	Manipulation or Redaction of Evidence.....	1477
B.	NATURE OF CHARGES.....	1478
1.	Evidentiary Value of Charge.....	1478
a.	Response to Charge.....	1479
C.	HEARSAY.....	1480
1.	<i>Borninkhof</i>	1481
2.	Judicial Interpretations.....	1484
3.	5 USC 2302(b)(2): Investigative Statement.....	1484
II.	EVALUATION OF EVIDENCE.....	1485
A.	DOCUMENTS.....	1485
1.	Response to Appeal.....	1485
2.	Medical Report, Records.....	1485
3.	Notes of Witness; Memorandum of Conversation.....	1486
4.	Time and Attendance Record.....	1487
5.	Business Record.....	1487
6.	Procedure for Introducing Document; Demonstrative Evidence.....	1488
7.	Authentication Requirement.....	1489
a.	Handwriting.....	1489
b.	Significance of Signature.....	1489
c.	Copy; Photograph.....	1490
B.	PHYSICAL EVIDENCE.....	1490
1.	Custody and Control.....	1490
2.	Use at Hearing.....	1490
C.	ADMISSIONS.....	1490
1.	Probative Value.....	1491
a.	Repudiated or Recanted Admission.....	1492
2.	Settlement Offer.....	1493
3.	Subsequent Remedial Measures.....	1494
D.	CIRCUMSTANTIAL AND SECONDARY EVIDENCE.....	1494
1.	Common Possession/Multiple Causation.....	1495
2.	Contemporaneous Statement.....	1496
3.	Flight or Evasion.....	1496
4.	Statistics.....	1496
E.	OPINION AND IMPEACHMENT EVIDENCE.....	1496
1.	Physical Condition.....	1497
2.	Character.....	1497
a.	Past Misconduct.....	1498
b.	Arrest, Conviction.....	1499
c.	Reputation.....	1500
d.	Habit.....	1500
3.	Evidence in Disability Annuity Appeal; <i>Chavez</i> ; Post-Separation Evidence.....	1500
F.	REGULATION; LAW.....	1507
G.	EVIDENCE FROM OTHER MSPB HEARING; OTHER JUDICIAL PROCEEDING.....	1507
H.	RECURRENT EVIDENTIARY PROBLEMS.....	1507
1.	Polygraph.....	1507
2.	Unsworn Written Statements.....	1508
a.	No Hearing.....	1510
b.	Hearing Held.....	1510
3.	Sworn Written Statement; Form of Attestation; Affidavit.....	1511
4.	Deposition.....	1514
5.	Investigation Reports.....	1514
6.	Recordings.....	1517
a.	Video.....	1517
b.	Audio.....	1517
7.	Transcript of Prior Testimony.....	1517
8.	Expert Witness; Medical Evidence.....	1517

a. Medical Expert Opinion	1519
b. Other Experts	1522
9. Statements of Representative, Party	1523
10. Hearing Department or Demeanor	1523
11. Testimony of Child	1524
12. Interpretation of Collective Bargaining Contract	1524
13. Newspaper Article	1524
14. Drug Test	1524
III. SUBSTITUTES FOR DIRECT EVIDENCE	1528
A. OFFICIAL NOTICE	1528
1. Regulations	1529
a. Federal Personnel Manual; Agency Handbook, Publication	1529
2. Related Board Case Records	1530
B. ADVERSE INFERENCES AND PRESUMPTIONS	1530
1. Silence	1530
2. Negative Inferences; Omitted Witnesses, Documents	1532
a. Destruction or Loss of Evidence; Spoliation	1533
b. Negative Evidence	1536
3. Presumption	1536
a. Delivery of Mail, Other Documents	1537
C. STIPULATIONS	1541
1. Issues of Fact and Law	1542
2. Stipulations Directed by Judge	1542
D. PREVIOUS DETERMINATIONS OF DISPUTED FACTS, ISSUES, CLAIMS: <i>RES JUDICATA</i> , COLLATERAL ESTOPPEL, AND LAW OF THE CASE—THE DOCTRINES	1543
1. <i>Res Judicata</i>	1544
a. Identity of Prior Cause of Action and Issues	1548
b. Identity of Parties; Privity	1549
c. Complete Relief Available	1550
d. Jurisdictional Issue	1551
e. Settlement	1553
f. Withdrawal of Appeal	1554
g. <i>Res Judicata</i> Raised <i>Sua Sponte</i> by MSPB; Waiver of Defense	1555
2. Collateral Estoppel	1556
a. Error in Law; Change in Law	1560
b. Proof of a Prior Adjudication	1561
c. Privity; Appellant as a Party to Prior Case	1561
d. Privity of Agencies	1562
e. Identity of Prior Issue; Ability Earlier to Raise an Issue	1563
f. Jurisdictional, Timeliness Issues	1564
g. Decision of Another Tribunal; Effect of State Law	1567
h. Collateral Estoppel Raised <i>Sua Sponte</i> by MSPB	1569
3. Judicial Estoppel	1569
4. Law of the Case; Mandate Rule	1571
5. <i>Stare Decisis</i>	1576
E. <i>RES JUDICATA</i> AND COLLATERAL ESTOPPEL—THE DOCTRINES APPLIED	1576
1. Criminal Conviction	1577
2. Pleas to Criminal Charges	1579
a. Guilty Plea	1579
b. <i>Nolo Contendere</i> and <i>Alford</i> Pleas	1581
c. Pretrial Diversion	1584
d. Conviction, Misconduct Distinguished	1585
3. Acquittal; Reversal of Criminal Conviction	1585
4. Successive MSPB Cases	1586
a. Dismissal for Adjudicatory Efficiency	1587
b. WIGI/Removal	1588
c. Successive RIFs	1588
d. Whistleblowing Prohibited Personnel Practice Complaint or Appeal	1588
e. USERRA Claims	1595
f. Suitability Determination	1596
g. Regulation Review	1596

h.	Prior Action Reversed for Lack of Due Process.....	1596
5.	Other Proceedings.....	1597
a.	Credentialing Committee.....	1597
b.	Union Trial Board.....	1598
c.	Labor Arbitration Awards.....	1598
d.	OPM Annuity Determination.....	1601
e.	Unemployment Compensation Award.....	1603
f.	OWCP Finding; Social Security Determination.....	1605
g.	EEOC Decision.....	1606
h.	Comptroller General or GAO Decision.....	1606
i.	Judicial Determination.....	1608
6.	Potential Exceptions to Application of Collateral Estoppel, <i>Res Judicata</i>	1609
a.	Pendency of an Appeal; District Court Case.....	1609
b.	Fairness of Adjudication; New Evidence.....	1609
c.	Fraud; Misrepresentation.....	1610
d.	Change in Law.....	1611
IV.	EXCLUSION OF EVIDENCE.....	1611
A.	PROCEDURES.....	1612
1.	Objection, Motions to Strike or <i>in Limine</i>	1612
2.	Witness Exclusion.....	1612
a.	Proposing Official.....	1613
B.	CONSTITUTIONAL AND STATUTORY CHALLENGES.....	1613
1.	Search.....	1613
a.	Wiretap.....	1618
b.	Recording.....	1618
c.	Drug Testing.....	1618
2.	Interrogation.....	1623
a.	Misconduct of Investigator.....	1623
b.	Compelled Testimony; <i>Kalkines</i> Warning.....	1623
c.	Right to Silence, Counsel.....	1627
d.	Denial of Union Representation.....	1628
C.	OTHER BASES FOR EXCLUSION OF EVIDENCE.....	1629
1.	Claims of Privilege.....	1630
a.	Alcoholism Treatment Records.....	1630
b.	Other Medical Records.....	1630
c.	Privacy; Attorney-Client Communication.....	1630
2.	Conference With Union Representative.....	1630
3.	Failure to Follow MSPB Procedure.....	1630

CHAPTER 6: INITIAL DECISION 1631

I.	INITIAL DECISION.....	1631
A.	INITIAL DECISION FORMAT.....	1631
1.	Minimum Requirements.....	1631
a.	Bench Decision.....	1633
b.	Notice of Right to Review.....	1634
B.	REQUIRED ANALYSIS.....	1635
1.	Incomplete Analysis; Failure to Mention All Evidence.....	1636
a.	Incorrect Adjudication Standard.....	1639
b.	Issue Not Raised in Appeal.....	1639
c.	<i>Dictum</i> ; Reasonable Construction.....	1639
2.	Timeliness and Jurisdictional Issues.....	1639
3.	Adverse Action, Performance Case.....	1639
4.	Annuity Appeal.....	1640
5.	EEO, Prohibited Personnel Practice Issue.....	1640
a.	Nondispositive EEO, Prohibited Personnel Practice Issue.....	1642
6.	Consolidated Appeals.....	1644
7.	Attorney Fees Decision.....	1644
C.	CREDIBILITY FINDINGS.....	1644
1.	Necessary Findings.....	1644
a.	Weight of Evidence Equally Balanced.....	1645
2.	Factors Considered; <i>Hillen</i>	1646

a. Some Testimony Discredited.....	1648
b. Alibi Defense	1649
c. Inconsistencies; Denials; Memory Lapse; Failure to Provide Statement.....	1649
d. Contemporaneous Notation, Statement; <i>Post Hoc</i> Explanation.....	1650
e. Self-Serving Testimony; Bias; Criminal Conviction; Past Misconduct	1650
f. Uncontradicted Testimony.....	1651
g. Implausible, Inherently Improbable, Imprecise Testimony	1651
3. Telephonic Hearing	1652
4. Determination Made Without Hearing	1652

CHAPTER 7: PETITION FOR REVIEW..... 1653

I. PETITION FOR REVIEW; RECONSIDERATION	1653
A. PFR PROCESS	1653
1. Statutory and Regulatory Structure	1654
a. Internal Board Guidance	1656
2. Board Treatment of PFR, Reopening Request.....	1658
a. Enforcement Issue.....	1659
3. Reply to PFR Response	1659
4. Cross-PFR.....	1660
a. Conditional Cross-PFR	1661
5. Effect of Judicial Review on PFR.....	1661
6. Effect of EEOC Review on PFR.....	1662
7. Who May Obtain Review	1662
a. OPM	1662
b. OSC	1663
c. Others; Intervenors	1663
d. Substituted Party.....	1663
8. Grounds for PFR.....	1663
a. Evidentiary Disputes.....	1664
b. Ineffective Counsel	1665
c. Frivolous PFR; Sanction	1666
d. Challenges to Settlement.....	1666
9. Time for Filing.....	1667
10. Service.....	1667
11. MSPB Processing	1668
a. Tied Vote; Lack of Quorum	1670
b. Decision Effective Upon Issuance by Clerk	1670
c. Joinder.....	1670
12. Failure to Prosecute; Failure to Respond.....	1671
a. Withdrawal of PFR	1671
b. Dismissal Without Prejudice	1672
13. PFR Settlement Program	1672
14. Entry of Settlement Agreement Into Record.....	1673
15. MSPB Final Decision	1673
a. Short Form Order.....	1673
16. Authority to Reopen and Reconsider	1675
a. Jurisdictional Issue.....	1678
b. Due Diligence	1679
c. Reversal of Criminal Conviction	1683
d. Change in Law	1683
e. Fraud	1685
f. Retirement Appeal.....	1687
g. Effect of Judicial Review on Petition to Reopen.....	1688
h. Reopening in Lieu of Excusing Untimely or Defective PFR.....	1689
i. Clear Legal Error; Manifest Injustice.....	1690
j. Discovery of Additional Legal Argument.....	1690
k. Correction of Case Processing Error.....	1690
l. Incorrect Interpretation of Charges.....	1691
B. INTERIM RELIEF	1691
1. Effective Date of Interim Relief.....	1694
2. Effect of Remand or Supplemental Initial Decision on Interim Relief.....	1694

3.	Obligation to Return Employee to Work and Pay; Undue Disruption	1695
a.	Undue Disruption Determination	1698
b.	Undue Disruption Notice.....	1699
c.	Implicit Disruption Determination; Strong Overriding Interest	1701
d.	Removal from Workplace or Adverse Action During Interim Relief Period	1706
e.	Return to Work With Changed Duties.....	1707
f.	Restoration Followed by Appellant’s Inability to Work.....	1708
g.	Pay Entitlement; Overtime; Allowances	1708
h.	Deductibility of Interim Earnings or Severance Pay.....	1710
i.	Prior “Bad Faith” Implementation Standard	1711
4.	Department of Veterans Affairs; 38 USC 714.....	1711
5.	Dismissal of PFR for Failure to Provide Interim Relief.....	1712
a.	Remedy for Inadequate Interim Relief.....	1713
b.	Motion to Dismiss PFR for Lack of Proper Interim Relief.....	1714
c.	Discriminatory Application of Interim Relief	1715
d.	Effect of Jurisdictional Issue	1715
6.	PFR Not Mooted by Overbroad Interim Relief.....	1716
7.	Certification and Proof of Interim Relief	1717
a.	Evidence of Interim Relief.....	1718
b.	Technical Error; Supplemental Evidence of Interim Relief.....	1720
c.	Delay in Payment Following Certification or <i>Prima Facie</i> Evidence of Interim Relief.....	1722
d.	Withdrawal of Interim Relief.....	1722
8.	Factors Limiting or Warranting Denial of Interim Relief.....	1723
a.	OWCP Benefits.....	1723
b.	Retirement	1724
c.	Restriction on Extension of Appointment; Funding From Federal Grants.....	1725
d.	Waiver, Settlement of Interim Relief; Employment Status Change.....	1726
9.	Special Situations	1727
a.	Retirement Appeals.....	1728
b.	Within-Grade Increase Appeal.....	1728
c.	Suitability Appeal	1728
d.	VEOA Appeal	1729
e.	Mitigation of Removal to Demotion.....	1729
f.	Mitigation of Removal to Suspension.....	1729
g.	Mitigation of Demotion to Suspension.....	1730
h.	Mitigation or Cancellation of Suspension	1730
i.	Enforced Leave Concluded by Date of Initial Decision	1730
j.	Adjustment of Date of Employee’s Return to Duty	1730
k.	Unified Penalty Involving Reassignment.....	1731
C.	REVIEW OF FACTUAL AND CREDIBILITY FINDINGS	1731
1.	Factual Findings; “Special Deference”	1732
a.	Decision Based on Affidavits, Documents.....	1736
b.	Telephonic, Videoconference Hearing.....	1737
2.	Omitted Findings	1737
3.	Unnecessary Findings.....	1738
4.	Issue of Mental Competence During Appeal Adjudication.....	1739
D.	REVIEW OF NEW EVIDENCE	1739
1.	What Constitutes Evidence.....	1742
2.	What Evidence Is New	1742
a.	Previously Available.....	1743
b.	Issue First Raised by Judge.....	1744
c.	Claim of Surprise.....	1744
d.	Due Diligence	1745
e.	Issue of Timeliness of Appeal or Other Submission	1747
f.	Issue of Jurisdiction; Exhaustion of Remedies	1749
g.	Evidence From Another MSPB Case.....	1752
3.	Materiality of New Evidence.....	1752
a.	Impeachment, Rebuttal Evidence	1753
b.	Corroborative Evidence.....	1756
c.	Disparate Treatment	1757
d.	OPM, SSA, OWCP, VA Determination; Evidence of Medical, Mental Condition	1758

e.	Adjudication of Past Discipline.....	1759
f.	Reversal of Criminal Conviction	1759
E.	REVIEW OF NEW LAW	1760
F.	REVIEW OF NEW ISSUES OR ISSUES NOT RAISED WITH JUDGE.....	1761
1.	General Rule.....	1761
a.	Jurisdictional Issue.....	1763
b.	Order Directing Payment in Violation of Federal Statute.....	1764
2.	Determining if Issue or Argument Was Raised Below.....	1764
a.	Annuity.....	1765
b.	Statutory, Constitutional Interpretation.....	1765
c.	Timeliness of Appeal	1765
d.	Discrimination	1765
e.	Waiver of Issue.....	1766
G.	TIMELINESS OF PFR.....	1766
1.	Request for Extension of Time	1767
2.	Date and Place of Filing	1768
a.	Deficient but Timely PFR.....	1768
3.	Filing by Facsimile	1768
a.	Misguided Facsimile.....	1769
4.	Filing by Commercial Delivery.....	1770
5.	Filing by Hand.....	1770
6.	Filing by Mail.....	1770
a.	Proof of Mailing; Postmark; Mailbox Rule	1772
b.	PFR Lost in Mail	1775
7.	Electronic Filing.....	1776
8.	Procedure on Late Submission.....	1778
a.	Affidavit or Sworn Statement Required.....	1779
b.	Strict Application	1780
c.	Retirement Appeal.....	1782
9.	Justification for Late Filing; Length of Delay, Other Factors	1782
a.	Electronic Filing Problem.....	1784
b.	Mailroom Delay in Posting PFR	1787
c.	Foreign Mail Problem.....	1787
d.	Office Equipment, Technology, Email, Related Problems	1787
e.	Merits	1788
f.	Physical or Mental Condition of Appellant or Counsel.....	1788
g.	Ignorance of Law; Late Discovery of Legal Defense; Subsequent MSPB or Court Decision in Another Case.....	1795
h.	Problem With Settlement	1797
i.	Misinterpretation, Ignorance of MSPB Regulation, Instruction.....	1798
j.	Incorrect Information From MSPB, Others	1800
k.	Incomplete Notice of Right to File PFR.....	1801
l.	Delayed Receipt, Misrouting of Initial Decision, PFR; Constructive Receipt	1802
m.	Failure to Receive Initial Decision; E-Filer.....	1804
(i)	Responsibility to Notify Board of Physical or Email Address Change	1807
n.	Effect of Judge's Remand to Agency for Redetermination.....	1809
o.	Withdrawal, Absence of Representative; <i>Pro Se</i>	1809
p.	Inability to Obtain Representation.....	1810
q.	Unexcused Delay or Neglect of Representative.....	1810
r.	Excused Neglect of Representative; Diligence of Appellant.....	1813
s.	Attempt to Obtain Congressional Assistance	1816
t.	Pending Review by Another Adjudicator	1816
u.	Awaiting Transcript, Other Document.....	1817
v.	Delay in Internal Decisionmaking	1818
w.	Military Service.....	1818
x.	Fear of Prosecution; Agency Misrepresentation	1819
y.	New Evidence	1819
z.	Language Difficulties	1820
aa.	Other Problems.....	1820
10.	Filing PFR With Wrong Agency or MSPB Office	1823
a.	Mixed-Case Appeals.....	1823
b.	Other Misdirected Filings	1823

11. Case or PFR Misfiled in Court	1825
H. FORMAT AND SUBSTANCE OF PFR; REPLY; RESPONSE TO REPLY	1825
1. Allowable Submissions; Length, Format.....	1826
a. Erroneous Designation of Pleading	1827
b. Error in Formal Requirements	1827
c. <i>Pro Se</i> Form PFR.....	1828
2. Signature, Designation of Representative Required	1829
3. Specific and Supported Objection.....	1830
a. Factual Error.....	1830
b. Adjudicatory Error	1830
4. Response to PFR.....	1831
5. Reply to Response.....	1831
6. Supplemental Authority	1832
7. Lack of Transcript.....	1832
I. MOOTNESS OF PFR.....	1832
1. Cancellation of Adverse Action; Agency Compliance With Initial Decision	1833
a. Effect of Appellant's PFR; No Agency PFR Filed	1833
2. Settlement; Vacatur of Initial Decision	1834
3. Regulation Review Proceeding	1834
4. Retirement Appeal.....	1835
5. Disqualification of Representative	1835
J. PROCEDURE ON REMAND	1835
1. Determining Whether Remand Is Necessary	1835
a. Board Obtains Evidence During PFR	1835
2. Evidence, Findings From First Hearing	1836
a. Effect of MSPB Order Vacating Initial Decision	1838
3. Remand for Further Discovery	1838
4. Remand for More Evidence	1838
a. Subsequent PFR.....	1838
5. Entry of Interlocutory or Interim Relief on Remand	1838
6. Remand for Compliance	1839
K. OPM RECONSIDERATION REQUESTS	1839
1. Governing Statute and Regulation.....	1839
2. Substantial Impact on Law	1841
a. Decisions Before 1990.....	1843
3. Limited to Facts, Issues of Record.....	1844
4. Timing of Request; Arbitration Award	1844
5. Mootness.....	1844
6. EEO Issue	1844
L. STAY REQUESTS	1845
1. Requested by OPM	1846
a. Request for Supreme Court Review.....	1849
2. Requested by Agency.....	1849
a. Stay of Enforcement Proceeding	1851
3. Requested By or For Individual	1852
a. OSC Disciplinary Case	1853
b. Other OSC Litigation	1855
M. REVIEW OF ARBITRATION AWARDS.....	1855
1. Award Subject to Review.....	1861
a. Governing Statute and Regulation; Time for Review	1862
b. EEO Allegation.....	1863
c. Remand for Resolution of EEO Issue.....	1868
d. Attorney Fees Claim.....	1869
2. MSPB Review Procedure	1870
a. Time to Seek Review; Notice of Review Rights	1871
3. Proper Appellant Before MSPB.....	1874
4. Method, Scope of MSPB Review	1874
a. Issue Preclusion.....	1878
b. Collective Bargaining Contract Exclusivity.....	1878
c. Allegation of Bias, Unfair Hearing.....	1879
d. Enforcement of Award Reviewed by MSPB.....	1879

5. Standard of Review.....	1880
a. Penalty, Time-Served Suspension; Remedy.....	1884
b. Procedures; Timeliness of Grievance.....	1892
c. EEO Issue.....	1895
6. Postal Service Employees.....	1896
a. Effect of Arbitration Award on Board Appeal.....	1898

VOLUME II

CHAPTER 8: ADVERSE ACTIONS 1905

I. ADVERSE ACTIONS DEFINED.....	1905
A. CANCELOATION OF APPOINTMENT, PROMOTION.....	1905
1. Appointment.....	1906
a. Entry on Duty; Action by Appointing Authority; Reliance; SF-50.....	1910
b. Citizenship.....	1911
c. Nepotism.....	1913
d. Selective Service Registration.....	1913
e. Political Influence.....	1915
f. Withdrawal of Offer to Extend Term Appointment.....	1916
2. Promotion, Pay Increase.....	1916
3. Regularization of Appointment by OPM.....	1929
B. CONSTRUCTIVE ADVERSE ACTION.....	1929
1. Jurisdictional Showing.....	1932
a. Specific Allegations Control.....	1941
b. Totality of Circumstances.....	1944
c. Judge to Inform Appellant of Jurisdictional Requirements.....	1946
d. Jurisdictional Analysis in Untimely Appeal.....	1947
e. Collateral Attack on Settlement Agreement, Waiver of Appeal Rights.....	1947
f. Allegation of Discrimination.....	1949
2. Overview of Constructive Adverse Action Appeals.....	1952
a. Timing of Events.....	1953
3. Involuntary Downgrading.....	1955
a. Hearing.....	1955
b. Deceit; Misrepresentation.....	1956
c. Action Threatened or Taken Without Good Cause.....	1963
d. Time Pressure.....	1965
e. Improper Reassignment.....	1965
f. Withdrawal of Request for Downgrading.....	1966
g. Unauthentic Request for Downgrading.....	1966
h. Discrimination; Intolerable Working Conditions.....	1966
i. External Problems.....	1970
j. Correction of Administrative Error.....	1971
4. Involuntary Resignation.....	1972
a. Hearing.....	1976
b. Deceit; Misrepresentation.....	1977
c. Action Threatened or Taken Without Good Cause.....	1982
d. Time Pressure.....	1985
e. Improper Reassignment.....	1989
f. Withdrawal of Request to Resign.....	1989
g. Irrevocable Resignation; VSIP.....	1992
h. Unauthentic, Ambiguous or Conditional Resignation.....	1993
i. Ineffective Resignation.....	1994
j. Mental Disability.....	1995
k. Intolerable Working Conditions.....	1996
l. Whistleblowing Reprisal.....	2006
m. Discriminatory Working Conditions.....	2008
n. Failure to Accommodate Disability; Medical Conditions.....	2011
o. Denial of Leave.....	2014
p. External Problems.....	2015
q. Probationer.....	2015

r.	Technical Error	2015
5.	Involuntary Retirement	2016
a.	Hearing.....	2017
b.	Deceit; Misrepresentation	2019
(i)	Correction of Benefit; Placement in Wrong Retirement System.....	2031
c.	Action Threatened or Taken Without Good Cause	2032
d.	Time Pressure	2034
e.	Involuntary Reassignment	2036
f.	Withdrawal of Request to Retire	2038
g.	Irrevocable Retirement; VSIP	2039
h.	Intolerable Working Conditions	2043
i.	Whistleblowing Reprisal	2052
j.	Discriminatory Working Conditions	2056
k.	Failure to Accommodate Disability	2060
l.	Discriminatory Conduct Causes Disability	2074
m.	Denial of Leave	2075
n.	Mental Disability	2076
o.	External Problems	2076
p.	Agency-Initiated Retirement.....	2076
q.	Discontinued Service Retirement.....	2076
r.	Mandatory Retirement	2078
s.	Employing Agency as Party to Appeal Against OPM.....	2078
6.	Constructive Demotion Through Reassignment; <i>Russell</i>	2079
a.	Planned Management Action	2083
b.	Position Must Be Upgraded	2085
c.	Identity of Duties	2088
d.	Qualification for Higher-Graded Position	2088
e.	Jurisdictional Analysis; Hearing.....	2089
f.	Evidence of Classification Error	2089
g.	EEO Allegation	2089
h.	Timeliness of Appeal	2089
7.	Involuntary Transfer.....	2090
C.	ENFORCED LEAVE; CONSTRUCTIVE SUSPENSION.....	2091
1.	Jurisdictional Analysis; Burden of Proof.....	2095
a.	Hearing.....	2097
b.	EEO Allegation	2098
c.	Effect of Receipt of OWCP Benefit	2098
d.	Disputed Restoration Right	2100
2.	Requirement for Adverse Action Procedure.....	2101
a.	Leave Status Voluntarily Assumed; Failure to Provide Medical Documentation, Perform Available Work	2104
b.	Process Due to Employee	2108
c.	Evaluation of Leave Enforced Following Notice to Employee	2108
d.	Disability Accommodation	2109
e.	Retirement Application; LWOP	2113
3.	Employee AWOL	2113
4.	Employee Blocked From Working Because of Employer's Concern About Fitness; Fitness Examination Requirement	2115
a.	Employee on LWOP	2124
5.	Light and Limited Duty; Medical Restriction.....	2125
a.	Historical Development of Light Duty Analysis.....	2129
b.	Collective Bargaining Contract.....	2134
c.	Disability Accommodation	2138
d.	EEO Settlement	2142
e.	Termination of Light Duty	2143
f.	Postal Service National and Other Collective Bargaining Contracts.....	2145
g.	Furlough	2146
6.	Work Release.....	2146
7.	Bar Order Preventing Entry to Workplace; Related AWOL Charge	2146
8.	Temporary Absence Resulting From Intolerable Working Conditions	2149
D.	INDEFINITE SUSPENSION.....	2153
1.	Use	2153

2.	Procedure; Duration	2156
a.	Criminal Proceedings	2158
b.	Clearance Suspension.....	2162
c.	Due Process	2163
d.	Regulatory Error.....	2165
3.	Criminal Activity	2166
a.	Indictment; Filing of Information; Referral for Prosecution	2168
b.	Investigation Accompanied by Other Circumstances.....	2170
c.	Arrest.....	2172
d.	Nexus; Alternative to Suspension.....	2179
4.	Security Clearance or Other Investigation	2182
a.	Due Process: Separation of Officials Denying Access and Deciding Suspension; Change in Basis for Clearance Suspension.....	2187
b.	Alternatives to Clearance-Related Suspension.....	2203
c.	Discrimination; Accommodation for Disability; Medical Issues; Whistleblowing	2209
5.	Inquiry Into Other Issues	2210
a.	Indefinite Prolongation of Suspension.....	2215
6.	Remedy.....	2219
a.	Action Following Termination of Criminal Proceeding.....	2223
II.	SERVICE EFFICIENCY; CAUSE PROMOTING SERVICE EFFICIENCY	2224
A.	BURDEN OF PROOF	2226
1.	Charges	2226
2.	Affirmative Defenses.....	2227
3.	Preponderance of Evidence	2227
a.	Uniformity of Standard.....	2228
b.	Department of Veterans Affairs; 38 USC 714	2229
b.	Violation of Criminal Statute	2229
c.	Intent.....	2229
d.	Suspicion; Belief.....	2230
4.	<i>Prima Facie</i> Case.....	2230
5.	Presumptions.....	2230
B.	PERSONAL FAULT	2231
1.	Adverse Action to Address Action Involving Another Employee	2231
a.	EEO Complaint.....	2231
b.	Merit Promotion Grievance	2231
2.	Action Directed by Arbitrator	2231
3.	Correction of Administrative Error	2232
4.	<i>Respondeat Superior</i> ; Supervisors and Managers	2232
C.	ADVERSE ACTION RELATED TO DISABILITY	2234
1.	Medical Standard; <i>Douglas</i> Factors; Accommodation	2235
2.	Medical Impairment.....	2236
3.	Agency-Initiated Retirement.....	2237
a.	Assistance in Securing Counsel.....	2240
b.	Prior Law: Reasonable Cause to Believe	2241
4.	Evaluation of Physical Impairment	2242
a.	Evidence of Recovery Between Date of Removal and MSPB Decision.....	2245
5.	Effect of Removal for Inability to Work on OPM Disability Annuity Determination.....	2247
a.	Rebuttable Presumption of Annuity Entitlement.....	2247
6.	Effect of Grant of Disability Retirement Application on Action Based on Inability to Perform Duties	2255
7.	Allegation of Disability Discrimination; Lack of Reasonable Accommodation	2257
III.	SPECIAL CLASSES OF EMPLOYEES	2259
A.	SENIOR EXECUTIVE SERVICE	2259
1.	Mitigation of Disciplinary Action.....	2265
2.	Performance Case	2265
a.	Informal Hearing.....	2266
3.	Department of Veterans Affairs.....	2267
a.	2014 Legislation	2268
B.	ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES.....	2273
1.	Scope of MSPB Review	2277
a.	Good Cause	2277
b.	Penalty Determination	2282

c. Affirmative Defenses	2283
d. Disability; Accommodation	2285
2. Cause for Discipline	2286
a. Insubordination	2288
b. Performance	2289
c. Failure to Follow Performance-Related Directive	2293
d. Remarks to Litigant; Comments in Decision; Conduct of Hearing	2296
e. Prolonged Absence; Irregular Attendance	2297
f. Other Misconduct	2298
g. Medical Issues	2301
h. Effective Date of Action Sustained by Board	2301
3. Constructive Action Against Judge: <i>Tunik</i>	2302
a. Forced Retirement	2310
b. Enforced Leave	2310
c. Pre- <i>Tunik</i> Decisions; Judicial Independence	2311
4. Furlough; RIF	2319
5. Settlement of Complaint	2322
6. Voluntary Dismissal of Complaint; Mootness	2322

CHAPTER 9: NEXUS2323

I. CONCEPT OF NEXUS	2323
A. <i>MERRITT</i> AND PRESUMPTIONS OF NEXUS; OFF-DUTY CONDUCT	2324
1. General Approach Toward Proof	2327
a. Actual or Potential Publicity, Notoriety	2327
b. Potential for Future Harm	2328
c. Investigative Exertion	2328
B. SPECIFIC NEXUS DETERMINATIONS	2328
1. Arrest	2329
2. Violent Off-Duty Misconduct	2330
a. Shooting; Killing	2330
b. Assault; Threat	2332
3. Violent Conduct on Agency Premises	2333
4. Off-Duty Drug Offense	2333
a. Drug Activity Involving Agency Time or Facilities	2336
5. Off-Duty Alcohol-Related Offense	2337
a. Off-Duty Activity Involving Agency Premises	2338
6. Sexual Misconduct	2338
7. Fraud and Theft; Other Integrity Offenses	2350
a. Off-Duty Offense	2350
b. Preemployment Offense	2352
c. On-Duty or Job-Related Offense	2352
8. Gambling	2352
9. Failure to Pay Debt	2353
10. Grievance Meeting	2355
11. Conduct Contrary to Agency Mission	2355
a. Real Estate Activity—DHUD	2355
b. Employee's Tax Problem—IRS, Other Agencies; Responsibility for Errors of Others	2356
c. Law Enforcement Officer; <i>Giglio</i> Impairment	2361
d. Driver	2367
e. Strike-Related Conduct	2367
12. AWOL Removal After Criminal Conviction	2367

CHAPTER 10: PENALTY DETERMINATION2369

I. PENALTIES	2369
A. GENERAL CONSIDERATIONS	2369
1. <i>Douglas</i> Standards; Decision to Reflect Mitigating Factors or MSPB Imposes Maximum Reasonable Penalty	2371
a. Consideration of Mitigating Factors	2373
b. Proposal to List Aggravating Factors; Treatment of Warnings; Due Process Considerations	2374
c. Exemplary Penalty	2376
d. Exaggeration of Charge	2377
2. Articulation of Relevant Factors	2377

a.	By Agency; Decision Notice	2377
b.	By MSPB	2379
3.	Not All Charges Sustained; Maximum Reasonable Penalty	2380
a.	Remand to Agency for Redetermination of Penalty	2385
4.	All Charges but Not All Specifications Sustained; Partial Specification Sustained	2387
5.	Charge Sustained That Was Not Brought	2388
6.	Factors Not Considered Mitigating	2389
a.	Disability Discrimination; Impairment	2389
b.	Discriminatory Environment	2389
c.	Prohibited Personnel Practice	2389
d.	Offer of Settlement	2389
7.	When Mitigation Must Be Raised	2390
8.	OSC Disciplinary Case	2390
9.	Impact of Mitigation by Demotion on Labor Agreement Requirement	2390
10.	Effect Of OPM Reconsideration Request	2391
11.	Veterans Administration Cases Under 38 USC 714	2391
B.	SPECIFIC MITIGATING OR AGGRAVATING FACTORS	2392
1.	Potential for Rehabilitation	2392
a.	Deference to Higher Level Management Assessment	2393
b.	Forward-Looking Analysis	2393
c.	Performance Action	2394
d.	Notice of Rule or Policy	2394
e.	Temporary Condition; Stress; Alcoholism	2396
f.	Long Service	2396
g.	Intervening Good Performance; Misconduct Subsequent to Charge Leading to Adverse Action	2397
h.	Post-Removal Conduct or Evidence of Rehabilitation	2398
i.	Contrition or Remorse; Admission of Misconduct	2399
j.	Denial of Misconduct; Vigorous Defense	2401
k.	Repeated Misconduct; Last Chance Agreement	2401
2.	Psychological Problem; Illness or Treatment; Stress	2402
3.	Performance, Evaluations	2408
4.	Intent	2410
5.	Notoriety	2410
6.	Position of Trust; Fiduciary Duty; Loss of Trust	2410
7.	Progressive Discipline	2413
8.	Penalty Table; Classification of Offense	2415
9.	Disparate; Comparable Penalties; <i>Singh</i>	2418
a.	Duty of Agency to Inquire Into Comparable Offenses and Penalties	2424
b.	Degree of Consistency Required	2425
c.	Substantial Similarity of Offenses; Totality of Circumstances	2425
d.	Proximity in Time	2431
e.	Same Work Unit; Evolving Case Law: Earlier Decisions of <i>Woebcke</i> ; <i>Lewis</i>	2431
f.	Positions of Similar Levels of Trust and Responsibility	2440
g.	Selective Prosecution	2442
h.	Settlement	2442
i.	Comparable Arbitration Awards; Other MSPB Decisions	2445
j.	Effect of Criminal Sentence	2447
k.	Assertion of Discrimination	2447
l.	Post-Removal Comparability Analysis	2447
10.	Mandatory Penalty	2448
11.	Failure to Maintain Condition of Employment	2451
12.	Staleness of Charge	2451
13.	Agency Bad Faith, Provocation, Manipulation; Improper Pressure on Appellant; Entrapment	2452
14.	Condonation	2453
15.	Favorable Attitude of Coworkers; Supervisor	2454
16.	Severity of Misconduct	2454
a.	Sequential Disciplinary Proposals	2454
b.	Multiplicity and Merger of Charges	2454
c.	Zero Tolerance Policy	2455
17.	Employee Job Level	2457
a.	Ineffectiveness as Supervisor; Demotion	2457

b. Reassignment	2458
C. AGENCY CONSIDERATION OF PAST DISCIPLINE	2459
1. Notice Requirement	2461
a. Failure to Include Past Discipline in Proposal: Due Process	2462
2. Proof, Rebuttal of Past Discipline.....	2463
a. Availability of Challenge to Past Discipline	2463
b. Clearly Erroneous.....	2463
c. Reprisal.....	2464
d. Pending Challenge to Past Discipline	2465
e. Past Discipline Reversed After Initial Decision.....	2467
f. Discipline Imposed After Appealed Adverse Action	2467
g. Past Discipline Time-Barred	2467
h. Past Discipline Resolved by Settlement	2469
i. Dissimilar Offense.....	2469
j. Nondisciplinary Sanction	2470

CHAPTER 11: SUBSTANTIVE OFFENSES.....2473

I. STATUS	2473
A. ABSENCE.....	2473
1. Impact on Service Efficiency; Proof	2473
a. Assigned Post of Duty; Travel Requirement	2476
2. Approved and Disapproved Absence; Available Sick Leave.....	2476
a. Abuse of Leave	2478
b. Loafing; Wasting Time.....	2478
c. Excessive Leave, LWOP, Absences Beyond Employee's Control; Failure to Maintain a Regular Work Schedule; OWCP Coverage.....	2478
(i) Historical Application of <i>Cook</i> and Related Decisions.....	2483
d. Unscheduled but Approved Absence Following Failure to Follow Procedure to Request Leave	2490
e. Disability	2493
3. Tardiness.....	2494
4. Leave-Requesting, Leave-Reporting Requirement.....	2494
a. Leave Restriction Notice	2499
b. Justification for Leave; Medical Certification Requirement; Merger of Charges	2499
c. Other Certification or Documentation Requirement	2501
d. Disability Accommodation	2501
5. Proof of AWOL; Telework Status; Leave Request	2501
6. Evidence of Illness First Submitted to MSPB	2504
a. FMLA	2506
7. LWOP; Other Leave Arrangement; Compensable Injury; Disability Accommodation	2506
a. Executive Order 5396; Wounded Warriors Federal Leave Act; Disabled Veteran.....	2510
b. Advanced Sick Leave.....	2511
c. Donated Leave.....	2511
8. Family Leave.....	2511
a. FMLA Request, Agency Compliance; Medical Documentation	2517
b. Constructive Request.....	2525
c. Belated Submission of Request, Documentation	2529
d. Abuse of Family Leave	2530
9. Worker's Compensation Issue.....	2531
a. Determining Whether Removal Is Based on Reason Unrelated to OWCP Entitlement.....	2532
b. Leave-Reporting Requirement	2534
c. No Foreseeable End to Absence; Absence When Compensation Ends	2534
10. Leave Status Pending Disability Retirement	2537
11. Incarceration; Work-Release Program.....	2537
12. Cancellation or Conversion of Approved Leave.....	2538
13. Absence Caused by Fear for Safety.....	2538
14. Military Leave.....	2539
15. Religious Leave	2540
16. Jury Duty	2540
17. Problem Following Reinstatement Through MSPB Order	2540
18. Agency Abuse of Discretion	2540
a. Ambiguous Leave Policy or Directive.....	2541

b.	Condonation of AWOL.....	2541
c.	Leave Status Caused by Agency's Wrongful Action.....	2541
19.	Aggravating Factors.....	2542
a.	Prolonged AWOL.....	2542
b.	Frequent AWOL.....	2542
c.	Unreliable Attendance.....	2542
20.	Mitigating Factors.....	2543
a.	Short, Infrequent AWOL.....	2544
b.	Longer AWOL.....	2545
B.	REFUSAL TO ACCEPT REASSIGNMENT.....	2546
1.	General Rule.....	2547
a.	SES Employee.....	2553
2.	Inconvenience or Health Problem.....	2554
3.	Agency Burden of Proof; Legitimate Reason for Reassignment.....	2555
a.	Mobility Agreement; Condition of Employment.....	2558
b.	Return From Overseas Assignment.....	2559
4.	Misconduct Following Improper Reassignment.....	2559
5.	Application of RIF Procedures; Procedural Errors.....	2559
C.	FAILURE TO MAINTAIN OR OBTAIN CONDITION OF POSITION.....	2559
1.	License, Certification.....	2560
a.	Lawyer.....	2560
b.	Driver.....	2560
c.	Others.....	2561
d.	Medical Certification, Credential, or Standard.....	2563
e.	Law Enforcement.....	2563
f.	Certification by Military Authority.....	2564
2.	Failure to Complete Training Course; Validity of Examination.....	2564
a.	Air Traffic Controller.....	2564
b.	Other Positions.....	2566
3.	Lack of or Loss of Minimum Qualification; Position Requirement.....	2569
a.	Indian Child Protection and Family Violence Prevention Act.....	2570
b.	Lautenberg Amendment.....	2572
c.	Removal From Reserve Status.....	2574
d.	Access to Agency Computer, Network.....	2579
e.	Failure to Exercise or Obtain Return Right From Overseas Employment.....	2580
4.	Security Clearance Revocation; Sensitive Position.....	2581
a.	Clearance Process.....	2582
b.	Agency Clearance Proceeding.....	2582
c.	Review of Agency Determination; <i>Egan</i> ; Constitutional Due Process.....	2587
d.	Decision to Require a Clearance; Whether Clearance Required as Employment Condition.....	2594
e.	Reassignment to Nonsensitive Position; Mitigation.....	2599
f.	EEO Issue; Whistleblower Reprisal; Disparate Treatment; USERRA.....	2601
g.	Regulatory Infraction During Revocation Process.....	2604
h.	Suspension, Removal Under 5 USC 7532.....	2611
i.	Suitability Determination, Security Clearance Distinguished.....	2612
j.	Sensitive Duties Not Requiring a Clearance: <i>Conyers</i>	2612
k.	Decisions Postdating <i>Conyers</i>	2632
l.	Requirement Similar to Security Clearance; Public Trust Position.....	2635
m.	TSA Sensitive Security Information.....	2637
n.	Retirement Issue Related to Removal for Loss of Clearance.....	2639
5.	Lack of Suitability for Continued Employment.....	2639
6.	Mitigation.....	2641
D.	CONFLICTS OF INTEREST; APPARENT CONFLICTS.....	2641
1.	Conflicts; Improper Business Dealings.....	2642
2.	Apparent Conflicts.....	2644
3.	Use of Government Office for Private Gain.....	2644
4.	Nonpublic Information.....	2646
a.	Nondisclosure Agreements.....	2647
5.	Transaction With Another; Gift; Bribe; Honorarium; Loan.....	2648
a.	Transaction With Patron, Vendor, Inmate.....	2648
b.	Transaction With Supervisor; Subordinate.....	2649

c.	Compensation for Government Service From Another Source.....	2649
6.	Acting as Agent or Attorney Against Government.....	2650
E.	OUTSIDE EMPLOYMENT.....	2650
1.	Personal Work on Government Time.....	2650
a.	Reporting, Approval Requirements.....	2650
b.	Employment in Violation of Agency Restriction; Outside Practice of Law.....	2651
F.	SPECIAL CATEGORIES OF EMPLOYEES.....	2651
1.	Guard, Correctional Officer, Police, Investigator, Security Official.....	2651
2.	Immigration Officer.....	2652
3.	Ship Employee.....	2652
4.	Supervisor.....	2652
G.	STRIKES.....	2653
1.	Charge of Striking.....	2653
2.	Basis for Removal.....	2653
3.	Proof of Participation.....	2653
4.	Refuting Participation.....	2654
5.	Fear for Personal Safety.....	2654
a.	Insufficient Threat.....	2655
b.	Duress, Coercion Established.....	2655
6.	Association With Strikers.....	2655
7.	Influence of Political Leader.....	2655
8.	Penalty.....	2655
9.	Other Issues.....	2655
II.	RELATIONSHIPS.....	2655
A.	INSUBORDINATION AND SIMILAR MISCONDUCT.....	2655
1.	Refusal or Failure to Perform Work.....	2657
a.	Proof of Intent.....	2657
2.	Failure to Follow Instruction.....	2658
3.	Failure to Follow Policy, Regulation.....	2660
4.	Disruptiveness; Lack of Cooperation.....	2661
5.	Recording of Conversation.....	2662
6.	Cumulative Insubordination.....	2662
7.	Dispute Over Position Responsibilities.....	2662
a.	Difficulty Following Reinstatement.....	2663
b.	Breach of Settlement Agreement.....	2664
8.	Insolence, Abusive Language.....	2664
a.	Abuse of Coworker, Subordinate.....	2664
b.	Abuse of Supervisor; Disrespectful or Coarse Language.....	2665
c.	Disagreement Over Instruction, Program.....	2668
9.	Misuse of Dispute Resolution Procedure.....	2668
a.	EEO Process.....	2668
b.	Congressional Communication.....	2669
c.	Grievance Proceeding.....	2669
d.	Supervisor.....	2670
e.	Interference With Employee Grievance.....	2671
10.	Refusal to Take Fitness Examination.....	2671
a.	Properly Ordered.....	2672
b.	Improperly Ordered.....	2673
11.	Failure to Provide Medical Information; Position Requirement.....	2676
12.	Refusal to Submit to Search or Drug Test.....	2679
13.	Problems During Investigations: Lack of Cooperation; Interference; Self-Incrimination.....	2682
14.	Administrative Law Judge; Judicial Independence.....	2691
15.	Defenses.....	2691
a.	Inability to Comply.....	2692
b.	Unclear Order; Unknown Policy.....	2692
c.	Constitutional, Similar Challenge.....	2692
d.	Improper Directive; Command Influence.....	2693
e.	Federal Labor Law Policy; Collective Bargaining Contract.....	2697
f.	Fear for Safety or Other Harm.....	2698
16.	Mitigating Factors.....	2701
B.	SEXUAL MISCONDUCT.....	2702

1.	Sexual Harassment; Inappropriate Behavior	2703
a.	Past Significance of Psychological Harm.....	2709
b.	Charge Based on Agency Regulation or Standard of Conduct Not Tied to Title VII	2715
c.	Physical Contact.....	2720
d.	Offensive Remarks; Photos.....	2723
e.	Consensual Conduct Affecting Workplace.....	2728
f.	Same-Sex Misconduct	2729
2.	Misconduct Toward Agency Client, Affiliate.....	2730
3.	Misconduct Toward Child.....	2730
4.	Penalties for Sexual Misconduct.....	2730
a.	Demotion, Suspension	2730
b.	Removal	2730
5.	Defenses	2731
C.	CONDUCT HARMING OTHERS; CRIMINAL VIOLATIONS	2732
1.	Threat; Inappropriate Conduct.....	2733
a.	Metz Test	2734
b.	Reaction of Others to Threat	2737
c.	Threat Through Another; Rumor.....	2739
d.	Conditional Threat.....	2740
e.	Statement to Therapist; EEO or EAP Counselor; Accommodation Specialist.....	2742
f.	Statement to Union Representative	2745
g.	Threat Against a Coworker.....	2747
h.	Threat Against a Supervisor.....	2747
i.	Threat Against Others.....	2748
j.	Thought of Violence	2748
k.	Inappropriate or Disruptive Statement Not Charged as Threat	2749
l.	Mitigation.....	2752
2.	Assault.....	2753
a.	Against Coworker	2753
b.	Against Supervisor.....	2753
c.	Against Subordinate.....	2753
d.	Against Others.....	2754
e.	Defenses	2754
f.	Mitigation; Aggravation	2755
3.	Fighting; Self Defense; Provocation.....	2757
4.	Gambling.....	2758
5.	Threat of Legal Action, Whistleblowing, or Publicity	2758
6.	Lawsuit.....	2759
7.	Discourtesy; Related Problems.....	2760
a.	Profanity.....	2761
8.	Improper Conduct Toward Patient, Ward, Others	2761
9.	Invidious Discrimination; Offensive Remark or Conduct; Preferential Treatment; Reprisal	2764
a.	Nepotism; Hiring of Friend.....	2768
D.	ACTION AGAINST SUPERVISOR FOR WHISTLEBLOWING REPRISAL, OTHER PROHIBITED PRACTICES.....	2770
E.	CRITICAL STATEMENTS	2774
1.	Constitutional Framework Applied in Federal Sector.....	2781
a.	Private Speech	2784
2.	Criticism of Agency or Its Personnel.....	2785
a.	Constitutional Analysis.....	2785
b.	Prohibited Personnel Practice Analysis	2787
c.	Defamation; Related Conduct	2789
d.	Congressional Communication.....	2790
e.	Political Activity and Speech	2791
f.	Concept of Loyalty	2793
3.	Internal Criticism	2794
a.	Constitutional Analysis.....	2794
b.	Managerial Disagreement.....	2795
c.	Administrative Law Judge; Judicial Independence.....	2795
d.	Criticism, False Statement About Coworker, Subordinate, Supervisor	2795
III.	INTEGRITY.....	2798
A.	FALSIFICATION AND MISREPRESENTATION	2798

1.	Proof of Fraud; Falsification	2801
a.	Neglect or Mistake	2805
b.	Perjury.....	2808
c.	Failure to Correct Report of Another	2809
d.	Reliance on Advice of Counsel or Other Individual	2809
e.	Cumulative False Statements.....	2810
2.	Employment Application; Security Questionnaire; Lack of Candor.....	2810
a.	Criminal Record.....	2814
b.	Education; Experience	2815
c.	Pre-Employment Medical Inquiry.....	2817
3.	Compensation Claim; Voucher.....	2819
a.	Overtime.....	2819
b.	Travel Voucher, Related Documentation.....	2820
c.	OWCP Claim.....	2822
d.	Unemployment Compensation	2823
e.	Disability or Leave Claim.....	2823
f.	Pay and Allowances Claim.....	2824
4.	Records of Time, Attendance, Work, and Pay; Negligence	2824
5.	Medical Certificate	2827
6.	Alteration, Failure to Preserve Documentation and Evidence.....	2828
7.	Investigative Misrepresentation; “Exculpatory No”	2828
8.	Lack of Candor.....	2830
9.	Failure to Report Misconduct	2834
10.	Disclosure Statement.....	2835
11.	Mitigating, Exculpatory Factors	2835
a.	Time, Attendance, Travel Record.....	2837
b.	Medical Certificate	2838
c.	Request for Medical Information; ADA	2838
d.	Employment Application.....	2839
B.	REMOVAL, MISUSE OF PROPERTY	2841
1.	Service Efficiency.....	2841
2.	Burden of Proof.....	2841
a.	Conversion	2842
b.	Unauthorized Possession or Removal of Property; Theft.....	2842
c.	Unauthorized Use.....	2844
d.	Common Possession	2844
e.	Evidence of Intent: Theft and Unauthorized Possession.....	2844
3.	Petty Theft.....	2845
a.	Shoplifting	2847
b.	Significance of Custody and Control of Property.....	2848
4.	Government Vehicle.....	2850
a.	Deviation From Assigned Route; Minor Personal Use; Public Service Exception	2855
b.	Nonstatutory Vehicle Misuse Charge; Impaired Driver.....	2856
5.	Unauthorized Use, Theft, or Destruction of Specific Property	2856
a.	Computer; Internet	2856
b.	Photocopier; Facsimile.....	2858
c.	Telephone.....	2859
d.	Government Credit Card.....	2859
e.	Government Services or Funds	2860
f.	Government Records; Official Information; Privacy Act; Tax Information; PII; Information Compiled for Use by Attorney	2861
g.	Black Marketing; Diversion of Property.....	2877
h.	Obstruction, Theft, or Mistreatment of Mail	2877
i.	Misuse of Official Mail, Delivery Service	2878
j.	Concealment of Theft	2878
k.	Mitigating Factors	2878
IV.	DRUGS AND ALCOHOL.....	2880
A.	DRUG AND ALCOHOL OFFENSES	2880
1.	Drug Possession, Use, Distribution	2881
a.	Possession or Use	2881
b.	Sale or Distribution	2884

c. Safe Harbor Provision.....	2884
2. Alcohol.....	2886
3. Mitigation.....	2887
V. PERFORMANCE.....	2890
A. PERFORMANCE AS BASIS FOR ADVERSE ACTION.....	2891
1. Performance Evaluations.....	2892
2. Performance Standards.....	2893
a. <i>Ad Hoc</i> Measure.....	2893
b. Assigned Standard.....	2896
c. Measurement of Work Error.....	2897
3. Responsibility for Work Error.....	2897
4. Mitigating Factors; Choice of Penalty.....	2897
a. Comparative Performance.....	2898
b. New Duties.....	2899
c. Detail, Special Assignment.....	2900
d. Progressive Discipline.....	2900
e. Lack of Training.....	2901
f. Lack of Improvement Period.....	2901
g. Demotion or Reassignment.....	2902
h. Suspension.....	2903
5. Performance-Based Actions Against VA Employees Under 38 USC 714.....	2903
B. NEGLIGENCE AND SIMILAR CHARGES.....	2905
1. Endangerment of Employees.....	2907
2. Public Safety Risk.....	2908
3. Destruction or Loss of Property.....	2909
4. Medical Error.....	2909
5. Mishandling or Improper Possession of Weapon.....	2909
6. Inattention to Duty; Sleeping on Job.....	2910
7. Failure to Follow Procedure.....	2910
a. Submission of Inaccurate Information.....	2911
8. Excessive Expenditure; Waste.....	2911
C. MEDICAL INABILITY TO PERFORM.....	2911
1. Specific Medical Or Physical Standard.....	2921
2. Penalty Analysis.....	2923
3. Disability Accommodation Analysis.....	2924
4. Recovery From Disability.....	2925

CHAPTER 12: PERFORMANCE CASES2929

I. UNACCEPTABLE PERFORMANCE CASES.....	2929
A. STATUTORY AND REGULATORY PROVISIONS: EMPLOYEE AND AGENCY COVERAGE.....	2931
1. OPM Regulations.....	2932
B. OVERVIEW OF PERFORMANCE ACTIONS.....	2934
1. Merit Pay Employee.....	2935
C. OPM APPROVAL OF APPRAISAL SYSTEM.....	2936
1. Change in Appraisal System.....	2937
2. Flexibility Permitted by Appraisal System; Skeletal Plans.....	2941
3. Extent of OPM Review; Subordinate Organization Within Agency.....	2941
4. Change Directed by OPM.....	2943
D. CRITICAL ELEMENTS.....	2943
E. PERFORMANCE STANDARD CRITERIA.....	2943
1. Substantive Right.....	2945
a. Identification of Critical Element.....	2945
2. Scope of Review.....	2946
a. Deference to Agency Management.....	2946
3. Objectivity.....	2948
a. Timeliness of Work.....	2951
b. Draft; Intermediate Work Product; Revisions or Rewrites.....	2952
c. Personal Characteristic: Initiative, Reliability.....	2952
4. Standards Development; Employee Involvement.....	2952
5. <i>Wilson and Jackson</i> ; Negative or "Backwards" Standard.....	2953
6. Communication of Standard.....	2957

7.	Change in Standard.....	2957
8.	Augmentation of Standard; Subjective Standard; Supervisory Instructions.....	2958
9.	PIP to Establish, Refine Standard	2961
10.	Specific Occupations.....	2964
	a. Clerical Employee, Secretary	2965
	b. Voucher Examiner	2966
	c. Inspector.....	2966
	d. Social Security Claims Representative	2966
	e. Employee Relations, Human Relations Specialist	2967
	f. Trade Analyst.....	2967
	g. Medical Technologist; Nurse; Physician.....	2967
	h. Scientist.....	2968
	i. Tradesperson.....	2968
	j. IT Specialist	2969
	k. Supervisory Supply Technician.....	2969
	l. Engineer.....	2969
	m. Lawyer	2969
	n. Paralegal	2969
	o. Management Analyst.....	2970
	p. Realty Specialist	2970
	q. Others	2970
11.	Numeric Standard.....	2970
12.	Multiple Components.....	2972
13.	Classification, Significance of Error	2974
14.	Relation of Standards in Element	2974
15.	Absolute Standard; <i>Guillebeau</i>	2975
	a. Law Before <i>Guillebeau</i>	2979
	b. Standard to Be Viewed as a Whole	2981
	c. Modification of Absolute Standard.....	2981
	d. Standard That Enumerates Tasks	2981
	e. Level of Performance That May Be Exceeded.....	2982
16.	Unreasonable Standard	2982
17.	Levels of Performance	2984
	a. Five-Tier Appraisal System; Marginal, Minimally Successful, or “Needs Improvement” Level of Performance.....	2984
	b. Multiple Appraisal Levels Derived From Ratings for Critical Elements	2988
	c. Two-Level; Pass/Fail Appraisal System.....	2990
F.	OPPORTUNITY TO IMPROVE; PERFORMANCE IMPROVEMENT PERIOD (“PIP”)	2991
	1. Prerequisite of Unacceptable Performance; Pre-PIP Performance; <i>Santos</i>	2992
	2. Opportunity Period Requirements	2994
	a. Order, Burden of Proof.....	2995
	b. Control Over Work.....	2995
	c. Assistance to Employee.....	2995
	d. Necessity for Specific Warning.....	2998
	e. Statement of Expectations; Job Responsibilities Not Described in PIP	2998
	f. Impossibility of Improvement; Unreasonable Expectations.....	2999
	g. New Standards	3000
	h. Harmful Error Rule.....	3000
	3. Time Allowed for Improvement.....	3001
	a. One-Year Maximum for Evaluation; Pre-PIP Performance	3003
	b. Post-PIP Performance; Roller Coaster Employees	3005
	c. PIP Extension.....	3008
	d. Performance During Detail.....	3008
G.	PROCEDURE	3009
	1. Chapter 43 and 75 Actions Distinguished.....	3009
	a. Executive Order 13,839; Executive Order 14,003	3010
	2. Department of Veterans Affairs.....	3011
	3. Failure to Use Chapter 43	3012
	a. <i>Lovshin</i> ; Combined Action Under Chapters 75 and 43	3013
	b. Conversion of Action.....	3014
	4. Limitations on Use of Chapter 43.....	3018
	5. Proposal, Decision Letter	3019

a.	Requirement of Concurrence.....	3019
b.	Unstated Charge.....	3019
c.	Necessity for Specific Instances.....	3019
d.	Notice Period.....	3021
H.	NECESSARY PROOF: SUBSTANTIAL EVIDENCE.....	3021
1.	Test Defined; Scope of Review	3021
2.	Weight, Quality of Substantial Evidence.....	3022
a.	Charges, Work Papers.....	3023
b.	Effect of Prior Performance Evaluation; Rating Issued in Error	3024
c.	Statistics; Sampling Method.....	3025
d.	Other Documentation; Testimony.....	3026
I.	DEFENSES.....	3027
1.	Propriety and Comparison of Performance Standards.....	3027
2.	Comparison of Employees' Performance.....	3027
3.	Adequacy of PIP; Lack of Control of Work; Agency Bad Faith	3028
4.	Training	3030
5.	Discrimination; Disparate Treatment; Disability and Accommodation	3031
6.	Reprisal.....	3036
7.	Collective Bargaining Contract	3037
J.	PRECLUSION OF MITIGATION	3037
II.	WITHIN-GRADE INCREASE DENIALS.....	3038
A.	BASIS FOR APPEAL	3040
B.	WHEN JURISDICTION ATTACHES.....	3040
1.	Effect of Collective Bargaining Contract.....	3046
a.	EEO Allegation	3046
b.	Allegation of Other Prohibited Personnel Practice	3047
C.	BURDEN OF PROOF	3048
1.	Proof of Poor Performance	3048
a.	Role of Performance Standards.....	3048
2.	Substantial Evidence Controls.....	3049
a.	What Constitutes Evidence	3049
D.	DEFENSES.....	3049
1.	Error in ALOC Procedure	3049
a.	Linkage of ALOC and Appraisal System	3050
b.	Waiting Period	3051
c.	Lack of ALOC Determination	3051
d.	Vague ALOC Determination	3052
2.	Reconsideration Errors	3052
a.	Employee Denied Information	3052
b.	Reconsideration Summary Lacking.....	3052
c.	Reconsideration Decision Level	3052
d.	Late Reconsideration Decision	3052
3.	Circumstances of Employee.....	3052
a.	Unfair Work Burden.....	3052
b.	Illness or Disability	3052
c.	Comparative Work Production	3053
d.	Lack of Training	3053

CHAPTER 13: REDUCTIONS IN FORCE.....3055

I.	RIF PROCESS	3055
A.	NATURE OF RIF	3055
1.	Statutory Provisions	3056
2.	OPM Regulations, Guidance.....	3057
a.	Validity of RIF Statute, Regulations	3059
3.	Furlough	3059
a.	Exemptions.....	3071
b.	Emergency Furlough.....	3073
c.	Part-Time, Light Duty Status; Intermittent Appointment; Work Schedule Adjustment.....	3073
d.	Discovery in Furlough Appeal.....	3075
B.	ACTIONS APPEALABLE AS RIF; MSPB JURISDICTION.....	3076
1.	Regulatory Structure.....	3077

2.	Jurisdictional Effect of Collective Bargaining Contract	3077
3.	Types of Appointees.....	3078
	a. Temporary.....	3078
	b. Probationer.....	3078
	c. Demonstration Project.....	3078
	d. Postal Service Non-Preference Eligible.....	3081
	e. Part-Time.....	3082
	f. Senior Executive Service.....	3083
	g. Agencies With Independent Statutory Personnel Authority.....	3086
4.	Possible RIF.....	3087
5.	Action to Avoid RIF.....	3087
	a. Transfer to Another Agency.....	3087
	b. Resignation.....	3087
	c. Retirement.....	3088
	d. Detail.....	3088
	e. Reassignment Without Regard to RIF.....	3088
	(i) Representative Rate.....	3089
	f. Reassignment During or Following RIF.....	3091
	g. Reassignment With Pay Reduction in Anticipation of RIF.....	3091
	(i) Postal Reorganizations: 1990s.....	3092
	(ii) Postal Reorganizations: 2000 Onward.....	3099
	(iii) Other Agencies.....	3104
6.	Grade and Pay Retention; Pay Rate Change; Demotion.....	3107
7.	Classification Issue.....	3108
	a. Erosion of Duties.....	3110
	b. Intentional Changes in Duties.....	3111
8.	Transfer of Function.....	3112
	a. Identification of Positions for Transfer.....	3114
	b. Employee Who Declines to Move.....	3117
C.	COMPETITIVE AREA.....	3117
	1. Defined.....	3117
	2. Criteria.....	3117
	3. Assignment Across Competitive Area.....	3118
	4. Challenge to Competitive Area.....	3118
	a. Burden of Proof.....	3118
	b. Organizational Structure; One-Person RIF.....	3118
	c. Geographical Structure; Local Commuting Area.....	3121
D.	COMPETITIVE LEVEL.....	3121
	1. Defined.....	3122
	2. Challenge to Competitive Level.....	3123
	a. Primacy of Position Description.....	3124
	b. Testimony Concerning Duties.....	3127
	c. Loss of Productivity; Undue Interruption.....	3128
	d. Collective Bargaining Contract.....	3129
	e. Challenge to Performance Appraisal.....	3129
	3. Particular Groups of Employees.....	3131
	a. Developmental/Trainee.....	3131
	b. Temporary.....	3131
	c. Part-Time.....	3131
	d. VA Health Care Professional.....	3131
	e. Bureau of Indian Affairs; Indian Health Service.....	3135
	4. Impact of Competitive Error Level.....	3135
	a. Impact of Error.....	3135
	b. Right to Hearing.....	3136
	c. Substantive Review.....	3136
II.	ASSIGNMENT AND RELATED RIGHTS.....	3136
	A. REGULATORY AND OPERATIONAL BASIS.....	3136
	1. Veteran, Other Preferences.....	3139
	2. Appointment Qualifying for Assignment Right.....	3140
	a. Excepted Service.....	3140
	b. Detail.....	3141

c. Intergovernmental Personnel Act	3141
d. Part-Time/Full-Time.....	3141
3. Position Subject to Displacement.....	3141
a. Supervisory.....	3141
b. Temporary.....	3141
4. Filling of Vacancies.....	3141
5. Assessment of Qualifications	3144
a. Updating Qualifications	3146
b. Qualifications of Displacing Employee.....	3147
c. Merit Promotion Issue.....	3147
d. Undue Interruption.....	3147
6. Representative Rate	3148
7. Amendment of RIF Notice; Change in Position Offer.....	3149
B. BUMPING.....	3150
C. RETREAT	3153
1. Prior Rule	3153
2. Method of Analysis.....	3153
3. Burden of Proof.....	3156
D. REEMPLOYMENT RIGHTS	3156
1. Reemployment Priority List Before RIF Effective Date	3168
2. Remedy in Reemployment Priority List Appeal	3169
3. Transitional Assistance	3170
III. RIF CHALLENGES.....	3170
A. BURDEN OF PROOF.....	3171
1. Agency Responsibility	3171
2. Agency's <i>Prima Facie</i> Case.....	3171
3. Qualifications; Assignment Right	3171
4. Classification Dispute	3172
B. <i>BONA FIDE</i> RIF: <i>LOSURE</i>	3173
1. Substantive Rights, Harmful Error.....	3173
2. RIF as Adverse Action.....	3176
3. Challenge to Reorganization	3179
a. Reorganization Defined; Single Position RIF	3179
b. Managerial Discretion.....	3180
c. Funding Decision.....	3180
d. Redistribution of Duties	3182
e. Planning for Future Events.....	3183
f. Comparative Qualifications as a Factor in Selection of Positions for RIF.....	3183
g. Contribution to Agency Mission; Funding of Individual Position.....	3184
h. Contracting Out Challenge	3185
i. Sham, Paperwork Reorganization: Old, New Position Identical; Delayed Reorganization	3185
j. Merit Promotion, Hiring, Placement During RIF.....	3188
k. Events Preceding, Subsequent to RIF.....	3188
C. DISCRIMINATION DEFENSES	3189
1. Age	3194
2. Religion.....	3195
D. PROCEDURAL ISSUES.....	3195
1. Internal Procedures	3195
2. Timing of Job Offer; Timing of Release of Employees.....	3195
3. Correction of Retention Standing Error	3195
4. Adequacy of RIF Notice.....	3195
CHAPTER 14: HARMFUL ERROR.....	3199
I. STATUTORY STANDARD	3199
A. HARMFUL ERROR DEFINED.....	3199
1. <i>Parker</i>	3201
2. Might Have/Would Have Analysis.....	3201
B. HARMFUL ERROR APPLIED	3202
1. Mixing Harmful Error and Other Doctrines.....	3202
a. Mitigation of Penalty.....	3202
b. Prohibited Personnel Practice.....	3203

2.	Statutory, Regulatory Violation; Action Not in Accordance With Law	3203
a.	Unfair Labor Practice	3205
b.	Privacy Act; Disclosure of Confidential Information	3207
c.	Constitution.....	3208
d.	Invalid, Conflicting Regulation	3208
3.	Collective Bargaining Contract Violation.....	3209
a.	Disputed Coverage	3211
b.	Impact of Arbitration Award.....	3212
c.	Employment Contract	3212
4.	Problem With Representation	3212
a.	Cautionary Notes to Counsel	3212
5.	Treatment of Affirmative Defense if Action Is Set Aside as Erroneous.....	3213
II.	ERROR IN PRELIMINARY PROCEDURES.....	3213
A.	AGENCY INVESTIGATION	3213
1.	Due Process.....	3214
2.	Right to Counsel; Union Representative.....	3214
3.	Entrapment	3217
4.	Agency Predecisional Hearing	3217
5.	Security Clearance Investigation	3218
B.	STALE CHARGES; LACHES	3218
1.	General Rule.....	3218
2.	Agency Regulation; Collective Bargaining Contract	3221
3.	Performance Case	3221
C.	ESTOPPEL; DOUBLE JEOPARDY	3221
1.	Estoppel.....	3221
2.	Double Jeopardy.....	3222
a.	Reinitiation of a Proposal After an Adverse Action Is Canceled.....	3230
b.	Action Initiated After Earlier Action Invalidated for Procedural Reason.....	3231
c.	Consecutive Adverse Actions.....	3231
d.	Action Following Acquittal	3232
III.	ERRORS IN PROPOSAL NOTICE AND REPLY PROCESS.....	3232
A.	BASIC RIGHTS	3232
1.	Predecision Proposal Not Mandated in Some Cases When Due Process Is Provided Following Decision	3235
2.	Right to Counsel	3237
B.	PROPOSAL NOTICE.....	3237
1.	Purpose, Sufficiency of Notice; Due Process	3237
a.	Supporting Evidence.....	3240
b.	Technical Deficiencies.....	3242
c.	Failure to Provide Notice of Appeal or Statutory Right.....	3242
d.	Error in Date.....	3242
e.	Other Minor Error	3243
f.	Assessing Sufficiency of Charge.....	3244
2.	Specific Charge; Only Conduct Described	3248
a.	Conduct Postdating Proposal	3253
b.	Amendment	3253
3.	Framing of Charge	3253
a.	General Charge; Charge Label; Detailed Narrative; <i>Otero</i> and <i>Cross</i>	3253
b.	Variation Between Stated Charge and Supporting Narrative or Specification; <i>Nazelrod</i> and <i>Lachance</i>	3257
c.	Splitting of Charge	3263
d.	Independent Elements of Single Charge.....	3265
e.	Multiple Specifications Supporting a Single Charge.....	3269
f.	Lesser Included Offense.....	3272
4.	Past Discipline; Performance Record; Aggravating Factors	3272
5.	Citation of Standards of Conduct.....	3273
6.	Charge Tied to Penalty Table Classification	3273
7.	Criminal Charge	3274
8.	Mixing Chapters 43 and 75.....	3274
9.	Cumulative Charges; Merger of Charges.....	3274
10.	Charge of Unbecoming or Improper or Unprofessional Conduct.....	3277
C.	INADEQUATE REPLY AND NOTICE PERIOD	3279
1.	Calculation.....	3279

2.	Not Less Than Seven Days for Reply	3279
3.	30-Day Advance Notice of Action	3282
4.	Service of Notice.....	3283
D.	SHORTENED NOTICE PERIOD; CRIME PROVISION	3286
1.	Procedure to Invoke Shortened Notice.....	3286
2.	Reasonable Belief of Crime	3287
a.	Arrest, Warrant.....	3289
b.	Conduct Caused by Mental Impairment.....	3290
3.	Emergency Suspension for Reason Other Than Reasonable Belief of Crime	3290
4.	Indefinite Suspension.....	3291
E.	FAILURE TO PROVIDE EVIDENCE FILE, OTHER INFORMATION.....	3291
1.	Loss or Destruction of Evidence	3294
F.	ORAL AND WRITTEN REPLIES.....	3294
1.	Proof of Harm; Failure to Consider a Reply; Due Process.....	3297
a.	Investigation of Information Provided by Employee.....	3303
b.	Criminal Proceeding Pending	3304
2.	Waiver of Reply Right.....	3304
a.	Extension Request.....	3305
3.	Decisionmaker, Reply Officer	3308
4.	Right to Confrontation	3309
5.	Right to Information.....	3309
6.	Inadequate Representation.....	3309
G.	AGENCY DECISIONAL PROCEDURES; <i>EX PARTE</i> COMMUNICATIONS.....	3310
1.	Early Law From Courts.....	3310
2.	<i>Sullivan</i> ; Adverse External Influences.....	3313
3.	<i>Stone</i> ; Broadened Due Process Test; Clarifying or Cumulative Information.....	3315
a.	Reinitiation of Action Following Due Process Reversal	3324
4.	Early Law From MSPB.....	3324
5.	Deciding Official Consults Witness, Advisor; Information Not Disclosed to Employee	3326
a.	Information From Witness.....	3327
b.	Impact of 5 USC 2302(b)(2)	3328
c.	Report, Investigation.....	3328
d.	Advisor.....	3329
e.	Past Discipline as Rebuttal to Mitigation	3329
f.	Multiple Charges.....	3329
6.	Proposing and Deciding Official Confer; Same Proposing and Deciding Official.....	3331
7.	Information Pertaining to Aggravation or Mitigation of Penalty; <i>Ward</i> ; Confirmatory Information	3332
a.	Mitigating Information	3346
b.	Cumulative Information.....	3348
c.	Potential Publicity, Notoriety, Other Harm.....	3349
d.	Information or Documents in Evidence File Not Referenced in Proposal.....	3352
e.	Information Provided or Known to Deciding Official Before Reply Process Begins.....	3353
f.	Evaluation of Information Presented During Reply	3354
g.	Penalty Table, Standards of Conduct.....	3356
h.	Performance Cases.....	3359
i.	<i>Giglio</i> Impairment.....	3361
j.	Harmful Error Analysis Before <i>Ward</i>	3363
8.	Predisposition to Take Adverse Action; Offer to Permit Resignation; Involvement in Proceedings Leading to Proposed Adverse Action.....	3363
a.	Biased Proposing Official.....	3368
b.	Malicious Initiation of Action	3368
c.	Deciding Official Who Is Biased, Whose Decision Is Directed, Who Lacks Discretion	3369
9.	Involvement of OSC.....	3372
10.	Changes in Proposing, Deciding Official	3372
11.	Lack of Authority	3376
a.	Deciding Official	3376
b.	Proposing Official	3378
12.	Pending Retirement Application.....	3378
13.	Specificity of Decision Letter.....	3378
a.	No Decision Letter.....	3378
b.	Inconsistent Decisions.....	3379

c. Retroactive Decision.....	3379
d. Notice of Appeal Rights.....	3379
14. Delayed Decision.....	3380

CHAPTER 15: DISCRIMINATION3381

I. DISCRIMINATION ISSUES RAISED IN BOARD APPEALS.....	3381
A. PROCEDURES IN MIXED CASES.....	3382
1. Multiple Agency Review Processes.....	3383
2. Multiple Filing Options; Pleading Requirements; Timing of MSPB Appeal.....	3385
a. Withdrawal or Abandonment of EEO Allegation.....	3386
b. Authority of Judge to Strike Frivolous EEO Allegation; Summary Judgment.....	3386
3. Jurisdictional Problems With EEO Complaints.....	3390
a. Filing Dates.....	3390
b. Timeliness of EEO Complaint.....	3391
c. EEO Class Action.....	3395
d. EEO Complaint Withdrawn.....	3397
e. What Constitutes a Complaint.....	3398
f. Coextensive Issues; Scope of Complaint.....	3398
g. Premature Appeal.....	3399
h. VA Employees' Appeals From Actions Under 38 USC 714.....	3399
4. Duty of Judge to Resolve Issues and Inform Appellant of Elements of Proof.....	3401
5. Jurisdiction Over Appealable Action; Constructive Adverse Action.....	3402
a. Notice of EEOC Processing Rights Following Mixed-Case Jurisdictional Dismissal.....	3404
b. Probationer.....	3404
c. Restoration Appeal Involving Employee Partially Recovered From Compensable Injury.....	3405
6. Election of Remedies.....	3405
a. Election Through Collective Bargaining Contract Grievance.....	3405
b. Election Between EEO and Direct MSPB Appeal; Treatment of EEO Complaint.....	3408
c. Effect of Subject Matter of Preexisting Complaint on Subsequent Appeal; Complaint Involving Proposed Action.....	3409
7. MSPB Remand; EEOC Remand.....	3410
8. Strategic Considerations.....	3413
B. BURDEN OF PROOF.....	3413
1. <i>Prima Facie</i> Case.....	3415
2. Analysis Following <i>Prima Facie</i> Case.....	3418
a. Analysis of Motivation, Pretext.....	3421
b. Mixed Motives; Proof That Action Would Have Been Taken Without Discriminatory Motive.....	3423
c. Element of Intent; Employer Error.....	3430
d. Significance of Agency's Proof of Charges.....	3431
e. Significance of Agency's Failure to Prove Charge.....	3432
f. Comparable Employees; Disparate Treatment.....	3433
3. Retirement Cases: Application by OPM of Statutory Requirements.....	3440
C. EVIDENCE.....	3441
1. Direct Evidence; Evidence Considered as a Whole; Comparators; Taint of Agency Official; Cat's Paw.....	3441
2. Circumstantial Evidence; Pretext; Presumption.....	3445
3. Disparate Impact.....	3447
4. Disparate Treatment; "But For" Analysis.....	3448
5. Statistics.....	3450
6. Supervisory Practices; Remarks.....	3451
D. FORMS OF DISCRIMINATION.....	3452
1. Race.....	3452
2. Age.....	3454
3. Religion.....	3459
a. Mask Requirement.....	3461
4. Marital Status.....	3462
5. Pregnancy.....	3462
6. Sex; Sexual Orientation; Equal Pay Act.....	3463
E. REPRISAL.....	3463
1. Convincing Mosaic; Evidence Considered as a Whole; Comparators.....	3475
2. Collateral Personnel Action of Evidentiary Weight in an EEO Affirmative Defense.....	3479
3. Taint of Reprisal by Lower Level Official; Cat's Paw.....	3480

4. Opposition to Discriminatory Practices	3481
II. REHABILITATION ACT: DISABLING CONDITIONS	3482
A. REGULATORY STRUCTURE.....	3483
1. Reprisal Under ADA.....	3488
B. <i>PRIMA FACIE</i> CASE; ACCOMMODATION REQUIREMENTS	3488
1. Accommodation Must be Requested	3492
2. Individual Regarded or Perceived as Disabled	3492
3. Individual Associated With Disabled Person	3499
4. Substantial Limitation of Major Life Activity	3499
a. Life Activity of Working	3501
5. Order and Burden of Proof.....	3505
a. Disparate Treatment.....	3514
b. Mixed Motive, “But For” Analysis.....	3515
6. Causal Connection.....	3518
7. Transitory or Temporary Disability	3520
a. Corrected or Mitigated Condition	3522
8. Limitation on General Employability	3523
a. Allergy.....	3525
b. Stress Disorder.....	3527
c. Other Mental Disability; Proof of Disability.....	3532
9. Conditions Not Protected by Rehabilitation Act	3533
a. Gambling Compulsion	3533
b. Sexual Disorder	3533
c. Pregnancy	3533
10. Qualified Disabled Employee.....	3534
a. Dangerousness; Risk Assessment; Direct Threat	3536
b. Lack of Medical Release.....	3542
11. Agency Knowledge of Disability.....	3542
a. When Disability Claim or Defense Must Be Raised.....	3542
12. Suggesting Nonapparent Accommodation; Duty of Reasonable Inquiry	3545
a. Interactive Process; Medical Documentation.....	3547
b. Agency Delay	3550
C. ACCOMMODATION THROUGH JOB RESTRUCTURING, ASSISTANCE	3550
1. Light Duty and Job Modification.....	3550
a. Lifting Requirements.....	3555
b. Postal Service Collective Bargaining Contracts	3557
c. Inappropriate Job Modification; Increased Job Burden	3557
2. Provision of, Modification to, Job Equipment.....	3558
3. Alteration of Work Schedule, Worksite; Leave; Telework.....	3560
4. Alteration of Training Requirement.....	3571
D. ACCOMMODATION THROUGH REASSIGNMENT	3572
1. <i>Ignacio</i>	3574
2. Evaluation of Reassignment Effort.....	3576
a. Reassignments Across Organizational Lines	3582
3. Collective Bargaining Contract	3588
4. Agency Regulation	3588
5. Restoration From Compensable Injury	3589
6. Demotion; Promotion.....	3589
E. ACCOMMODATION THROUGH MEANS OTHER THAN JOB MODIFICATION OR REASSIGNMENT.....	3591
1. Modification of Agency Policy, Facility.....	3591
2. Job Training; Change in Supervision.....	3592
3. Referral for Counseling.....	3595
F. AGENCY DEFENSES	3595
1. Disqualifying Misconduct	3595
2. Undue Hardship.....	3597
a. Unreasonable Accommodation	3600
b. Restrictions in Collective Bargaining Contract	3602
3. Lack of Qualification for Position.....	3603
a. Failure to Provide Evidence of Fitness for Position With Medical Standard	3604
4. Receipt of Disability Annuity.....	3605
5. Rebuttal	3606

6. Restriction on Remedy	3606
G. ALCOHOLISM AND SUBSTANCE ABUSE.....	3606
1. Necessity for Accommodation: <i>Ruzek</i>	3608
a. Suitability.....	3609
b. Postal Service Employee	3610
2. Notice of Disability.....	3610
a. Agency Request for Information.....	3610
3. Proof of Disease	3611
4. Causal Connection: Misconduct Caused by Disease	3612
a. Alcohol or Drug Use on Job.....	3616
b. Revocation of Driver's License	3616
c. Possession of Drugs.....	3617
d. Misappropriation or Theft of Drugs	3617
e. Misappropriation of Funds.....	3617
5. Qualified Disabled Employee; <i>Hougens</i> and Disqualifying Conduct.....	3618
a. Current Substance Abuser	3621
b. Disqualifying Misconduct: Removal Appropriate.....	3623
c. Less Serious Conduct: Concurrent Rehabilitation, Discipline.....	3627
6. Firm Choice, Last Chance Agreement.....	3629
a. Requirement of Collective Bargaining Contract, Agency Regulation	3631
7. Failed Rehabilitation Attempt	3633
8. Undue Hardship.....	3636
III. AVENUES OF FURTHER REVIEW OF EEO DEFENSES	3636
A. EEOC.....	3637
B. SPECIAL PANEL.....	3638
C. EFFECT OF DISTRICT COURT REVIEW	3645

VOLUME III

CHAPTER 16: PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICES.....3649

I. OVERVIEW.....	3649
A. SIGNIFICANCE OF DISCOVERY.....	3651
II. TYPES OF PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICES	3652
A. WHISTLEBLOWING REPRISAL.....	3654
1. Whistleblower Protection Enhancement Act of 2012.....	3656
2. Statutory Definitions Control; Multiple Disclosures, Personnel Actions	3658
a. "Gross" Waste or Mismanagement	3659
b. Violation of Law, Rule, or Regulation.....	3667
c. Abuse of Authority	3675
d. Threat to Public Health and Safety.....	3681
e. Disclosure of Censorship Related to Research, Analysis, or Technical Information.....	3709
3. Form of Whistleblowing.....	3709
a. Disclosure of Harm or Wrongdoing; Potential Harm; "Real and Immediate"	3709
b. Complaint to Wrongdoer.....	3710
c. Disclosure to Someone Who Cannot Directly Remedy Problem	3713
d. Minor Personal Grievance	3715
e. Internal, Policy Disagreement	3715
f. Disclosure Made During Normal Course of Duties.....	3721
g. Normal Duties Not Including Investigation and Disclosure of Wrongdoing	3736
h. Required Report Under Office of Government Ethics Rules, E.O. 12675	3737
i. Communication Indirectly Involving Government; Private Wrongdoing.....	3738
j. Communication to News Media; Congress	3742
k. Disclosure in Court.....	3742
l. Complaint, Testimony to Inspector General, OSC, Internal Investigative Unit; 5 USC 2302(b)(9)(c).....	3744
m. Disclosure of Information Already Known or Public.....	3746
n. Sequential Allegations.....	3749
4. Whistleblowing No Shield Against Misconduct.....	3749
a. Abusive Whistleblower; Robust Language; Chain of Command.....	3750
5. Personnel Treated as Whistleblowers.....	3753
a. Individual Perceived as Whistleblower; Disclosure Made on Behalf of Another Person	3753

b.	Threatened Disclosure.....	3759
c.	Whistleblower's Aide, Associate.....	3760
d.	Individual Serving as Conduit of Information; Internal Disclosure.....	3761
e.	Former Employee.....	3761
f.	Contractor Employee.....	3762
6.	Protected Disclosure: Reasonableness.....	3764
a.	"Reasonably Believes"; False Statement.....	3764
b.	Motivation of Whistleblower.....	3771
c.	Information Developed After Disclosure.....	3772
d.	Belief Shared by Other Employees; Disinterested Observer.....	3772
e.	Response of Agency to Disclosure.....	3773
f.	Expertise of Whistleblower.....	3773
g.	Specificity of Disclosure.....	3775
h.	Presumed Agency Good Faith; "Irrefragable Proof" Standard.....	3777
7.	Dispute Concerning Coverage of Disclosure Under 2302(b)(8) or 2302(b)(9).....	3780
8.	Disclosures Not Protected or Covered by Whistleblower Law.....	3784
a.	Disclosure Prohibited by Law; Regulation Incorporating Statutory Provision; E.O. 13,526.....	3784
b.	EEO Complaint, Allegations.....	3794
c.	Other Appeals, Charges, FECA Claims, Grievances, and Complaints.....	3802
9.	Disclosures in Multiple Forums.....	3806
B.	PROHIBITED PRACTICES OTHER THAN WHISTLEBLOWING REPRISAL.....	3809
1.	Discrimination Proscribed by Civil Rights Laws; 5 USC 2302(b)(1)(A).....	3809
a.	Sexual Harassment.....	3809
2.	Improper Personnel Recommendation; 5 USC 2302(b)(2).....	3810
3.	Obstruction of Competition; 5 USC 2302(b)(4).....	3810
4.	Influencing Employment Decision; 5 USC 2302(b)(5).....	3811
5.	Improper Preference, Promotion; 5 USC 2302(b)(6).....	3811
6.	5 USC 2302(b)(9); Appeal Rights; Grievance, Complaint; Union Activity; Refusal to Obey Unlawful Order.....	3814
a.	Refusal, Failure to Obey an Order.....	3822
b.	Union Activity Under WPEA.....	3823
c.	WPEA: Exercise of, Testimony or Assistance in, Appeal, Complaint, or Grievance.....	3824
7.	Discrimination Unrelated to Job Performance; 5 USC 2302(b)(10).....	3827
8.	Discrimination Against Veteran; 5 USC 2302(b)(11).....	3829
9.	Violation of Merit System Principle; 5 USC 2302(b)(12).....	3830
a.	Failure to Provide Effective Training; 5 USC 2301(b)(7); Training for Government Personnel on Whistleblowing Protections.....	3833
10.	Nondisclosure Agreement; Gag Order; 5 USC 2302(b)(13).....	3834
11.	Accessing Medical Record of an Employee or Applicant; 5 USC 2302(b)(14).....	3835
12.	Refusal to Violate Law, Regulation, or Rule.....	3835
III.	INDIVIDUAL RIGHT OF ACTION.....	3837
A.	STATUTORY AND REGULATORY REQUIREMENTS AND LIMITATIONS.....	3839
1.	Filing a Complaint With OSC.....	3845
a.	OSC Deferral Policy on EEO Charge.....	3847
b.	Proceeding to Compel OSC Action.....	3847
c.	IRA Appeal Against OSC.....	3850
2.	Time for Initiating IRA Appeal With OSC and MSPB.....	3851
a.	Laches in Filing OSC Complaint.....	3852
b.	Case That May Be Either Initiated With OSC or Appealed Directly to MSPB.....	3854
c.	Jurisdiction Limitations of an IRA Rather Than an Adverse Action Appeal.....	3855
d.	Premature Appeal Following Resort to OSC.....	3855
e.	Belated Receipt of OSC Closeout Notice.....	3856
f.	Calculation of Appeal Period; Late IRA Appeal; Waiver.....	3857
g.	Equitable Tolling.....	3859
h.	OSC Reopening.....	3862
B.	JURISDICTIONAL ISSUES.....	3865
1.	Exhaustion of Remedies; Amendment of Appeal.....	3866
2.	Election and Preclusion of Remedies; Managers and Supervisors; Notice of Rights.....	3870
a.	Grievance or MSPB Appeal.....	3872
b.	IRA Appeal, Direct Appeal of Otherwise Appealable Action Distinguished; Issue Preclusion.....	3876
c.	EEO Complaint.....	3880
3.	Rusin Model: Nonfrivolous Allegations Establish Jurisdiction; <i>Hessami</i>	3880

a.	Nonfrivolous Allegations Based on Written Record; Required Specificity	3886
4.	Jurisdictional Analysis Before <i>Rusin</i>	3889
5.	Hearing	3890
6.	Variations in Order of Proof; Necessity to Develop Evidence, Consider Entire Record; <i>Whitmore</i>	3891
7.	Collateral Jurisdiction Over EEO Claim Presented in IRA Appeal Not Involving Otherwise Appealable Action.....	3901
8.	Limited Jurisdiction Over Merits Determination, Collateral Prohibited Personnel Practice, Constitutional, Discrimination, and Harmful Error Claims in Otherwise Appealable Action Initiated Through OSC as IRA.....	3901
9.	Status of Particular Agencies and Employees.....	3904
a.	Postal Service	3904
b.	Department of Veterans Affairs Title 38 Employee	3906
c.	Department of Veterans Affairs; 38 USC 714	3910
d.	National Guard Technician; 2017 NDAA	3910
e.	Federal Bureau of Investigation	3914
f.	Judicial Branch.....	3917
g.	Federal Reserve Board	3917
h.	NAF Employee	3918
i.	Independent Counsel	3920
j.	Office of Special Counsel	3920
k.	Federal Aviation Administration	3920
l.	Transportation Security Agency	3920
m.	Intelligence, Counterintelligence Agencies; Foreign National.....	3923
n.	Government Corporation	3926
o.	Other Entities	3926
p.	Experts and Consultants; Personnel Appointed Outside Title 5.....	3927
q.	Lawyer	3929
r.	Former Employee	3929
s.	Inspector General Office	3930
t.	Employee of Agency Other Than Agency Charged With Reprisal	3930
u.	Private Sector Employee; Applicant for Employment	3932
v.	Uniformed Service	3933
w.	Administrator of Federal Benefits.....	3935
x.	Schedule F Employees; Policy Positions.....	3935
10.	Retroactivity of 1989 Whistleblower Amendments; Continuing Violation	3935
C.	PLEADING REQUIREMENTS.....	3936
1.	Duty of Judge to Inform Appellant of Jurisdictional Requirements.....	3936
2.	Specificity of Underlying Disclosure; Labeling of Disclosure Not Required	3938
3.	Pleading to OSC	3942
a.	Classification or Labeling of Disclosure Not Required	3951
b.	Curative Filing With OSC	3955
c.	Proof of Scope of Complaint Made to OSC; Post-Complaint Submission.....	3955
d.	Information First Submitted With PFR	3959
e.	Serial Complaints to OSC	3960
f.	OSC Closeout Letter.....	3960
4.	Pleading to MSPB	3961
D.	COVERED AND EXCLUDED PERSONNEL ACTIONS.....	3963
1.	Threatened Personnel Action	3963
a.	Proposed Action	3967
b.	Action Arising During Compliance Proceedings.....	3968
2.	Failure to Take Personnel Action.....	3968
3.	Performance Appraisal, Rating; Evaluation of Qualifications or Abilities	3970
4.	Awards and Acts Preliminary to Awards	3971
5.	Denial of Within-Grade Increase	3972
6.	Promotion, Appointment.....	3972
7.	Decision Concerning Leave; Change in Duties; Idling; Overtime; Harassment	3973
a.	Degree of Significance of Change of Duties, Responsibilities, or Working Conditions; <i>Skarada</i>	3975
b.	Hostile Environment.....	3979
c.	Performance Standards, Requirements.....	3983
8.	Reprimand; Admonition; Counseling; Performance Warning; Performance Improvement Period	3983
9.	Suspension	3989
10.	Probationary Termination	3989
11.	Reemployed Annuitant.....	3989

12. Failure to Renew Appointment; Failure to Reinstate.....	3990
13. Reassignment, Transfer, and Detail.....	3990
14. Mental Fitness Examination or Testing.....	3992
15. Other Investigations.....	3993
16. Security Clearance Suspension, Revocation; Other Certification.....	3997
17. Training.....	4002
18. Defamatory Statement; Tort; Arrest; False Allegation; Blacklisting.....	4003
19. Reduction in Force.....	4004
20. Classification Issue.....	4005
21. Constructive Adverse Action.....	4005
22. Action Affecting Private Sector Employment Opportunity.....	4009
23. Other Action.....	4010
E. REMEDIES.....	4011
1. Transfer.....	4013
IV. CASES BROUGHT BY OSC.....	4014
A. STATUTORY BASES.....	4014
1. Corrective Action Petition; Stay.....	4014
2. Disciplinary Complaint.....	4016
3. Board Authority in Disciplinary, Corrective Action Case.....	4017
4. Judicial or Administrative Finding of Discrimination by Federal Employee; 5 USC 1216(a)(5).....	4017
5. Hatch Act; FOIA Violation.....	4017
B. OSC OPERATIONS.....	4021
1. Organizational Structure.....	4021
2. Disclosures to OSC.....	4021
3. MSPB Referral to OSC.....	4022
C. RIGHT TO COUNSEL IN OSC INVESTIGATION.....	4022
D. OSC DISCIPLINARY ACTION.....	4024
1. Limits on Prosecutorial Authority.....	4024
a. Employee Who Takes or Recommends Personnel Action.....	4025
b. Prior Resort to Agency-Employer for Disciplinary Action.....	4026
2. OSC Complaint.....	4026
3. Rights of Employee, Respondent.....	4027
4. OSC Subpoena; Discovery Procedures.....	4028
5. Hearing by Administrative Law Judge; MSPB Review.....	4028
6. Disciplinary Penalty.....	4028
E. OSC CORRECTIVE ACTION PETITION.....	4033
1. Regulatory Provisions.....	4035
F. LITIGATION WITH OSC.....	4036
1. Purpose of MSPB Hearing.....	4036
a. Obtaining Records.....	4036
b. Evidence From Other Investigation.....	4036
c. Dismissal of OSC Action.....	4036
2. Settlement.....	4037
V. BURDEN OF PROOF IN REPRISAL CASE.....	4037
A. ANALYSIS UNDER WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION ACT.....	4038
1. Analysis Required by Judge; Affirmative Defense; IRA Appeal.....	4038
2. Statutory, Regulatory Provisions.....	4038
3. Contributing Factor Analysis.....	4039
a. Order of Proof.....	4041
b. <i>Per Se</i> Timing/Knowledge Test.....	4042
c. Evidence Other Than Timing.....	4048
d. Knowledge by Agency Manager of Appellant's Whistleblowing; Constructive Knowledge; Cat's Paw; Secondary Evidence of Agency Reprisal.....	4052
e. Disclosure After Personnel Action; Action Contemplated and in Preparation.....	4060
f. Settlement Offer.....	4062
g. Significance of Retaliatory Investigation; Appellant Initiates Investigation; <i>Marano</i>	4062
h. Charge Arising Out of Conduct During Retaliatory Investigation.....	4071
i. OSC Corrective Action Case.....	4074
j. Otherwise Appealable Action.....	4074
4. Agency's Clear and Convincing Evidence; <i>Carr</i> Factors.....	4075
a. Evolution of "Clear and Convincing" Evidentiary Standard Before Whistleblower Protection Act.....	4094

b.	Constructive Adverse Action.....	4095
c.	Nondisciplinary Cases: Nonselection; Nonpromotion; Reassignments; Changes in Duties.....	4095
5.	Evidence of Reprisal.....	4098
a.	Strength of Agency’s Case; Probationer; Term Employee; Reemployed Annuitant.....	4099
b.	Strength of Motive to Retaliate; Harm to Agency Reputation.....	4105
c.	Comparator Employees.....	4107
d.	Preliminary Reprisal Leading to Personnel Action.....	4113
e.	Shifting or Belated Explanations for Agency Action.....	4114
B.	ANALYSIS FOR PROHIBITED PRACTICES NOT COVERED BY WPA, WPEA; VIOLATIONS OF 5 USC 2302(B)(9).....	4114
1.	<i>Mt. Healthy</i>	4117
2.	Importance of Untainted Deciding Official.....	4120
3.	Timing of Action.....	4122
4.	Severity of Charged Misconduct.....	4123
5.	Discipline Related to Refusal of Reassignment.....	4124
6.	Reprisal Against Individual Involved in Union Activity.....	4124
7.	Performance Case.....	4129
8.	OSC and Agency Disciplinary Case Against Individual Charged With Reprisal.....	4130
a.	Analysis by Agency Deciding Official.....	4136
C.	DEPARTMENT OF VETERANS AFFAIRS.....	4137
VI.	STAYS OF PERSONNEL ACTIONS.....	4137
A.	STAY THROUGH INDIVIDUAL APPEAL.....	4138
1.	Basis for Stay Sought by Appellant.....	4139
a.	Intervention by OPM.....	4142
2.	Scope of Stay.....	4142
3.	MSPB Review of Judge’s Stay Decision.....	4142
B.	STAY THROUGH OSC PROCEEDING.....	4142
1.	Statutory, Regulatory Provisions.....	4145
2.	Initial Stay.....	4147
a.	Potential for Disruption by Employee’s Return to Workplace.....	4149
b.	Obtaining Clarification of Stay Order.....	4149
3.	Extension of Stay.....	4149
a.	Indefinite Stay.....	4153
4.	Proof Supporting Stay Application.....	4153
5.	Nature of Relief.....	4153
a.	Hostile Environment; Protective Order.....	4155
b.	Restraint on Employee Communication With OSC, Congress.....	4158
6.	Termination of Stay.....	4159
7.	Relation of Stay and Appeal Proceedings.....	4160
8.	Use of Stay to Protect Other Proceeding.....	4160
a.	EEO Case.....	4160
b.	Union Rights Under Statute.....	4160
9.	Effect of Prior Settlement Agreement.....	4161
10.	Employees Covered by Stay.....	4161
a.	SES.....	4161
b.	Presidential Appointee; Policymaker.....	4161
c.	At Will Employee; Reemployed Annuitant.....	4161
d.	Former Agency Employee.....	4161
C.	DEPARTMENT OF VETERANS AFFAIRS.....	4161

CHAPTER 17: RETIREMENT4163

I.	RETIREMENT.....	4163
A.	OVERVIEW OF PRINCIPAL RETIREMENT SYSTEMS.....	4164
1.	Background and History.....	4165
2.	Conversions.....	4167
B.	FEDERAL EMPLOYMENT.....	4168
1.	Effect of Reemployment.....	4170
C.	COVERED AND CREDITABLE SERVICE.....	4170
1.	Service Requirements.....	4173
2.	When-Actually-Employed; Seasonal Employee; Leave Without Pay; Part-Time.....	4175
3.	Indefinite Appointment.....	4176
4.	Temporary Employment.....	4177

5.	Personal Service Contract	4178
6.	Nonappropriated Fund	4184
7.	Others	4184
8.	Effect of Military Service; Deposit for Military Service	4184
	a. National Guard, Other Uniformed Service	4202
	(i) Abandonment of Civilian Career for Military Service	4204
9.	Period of Receipt of OWCP Benefits	4208
10.	Sick Leave Credit.....	4210
D.	DISABILITY RETIREMENT	4210
	1. Statutory, Regulatory Standards.....	4211
	a. Concept of Disability	4214
	b. Cause of Disability	4216
	c. Medical Condition Postdating Disability Retirement	4216
	2. Disability Incurred While in Federal Service	4216
	a. Preexisting Condition	4217
	3. Position Last Occupied.....	4217
	a. Qualifying Position.....	4218
	4. Disability Must Continue at Least One Year.....	4218
	a. Possible Future Disability.....	4220
	5. Situational or Transitory Condition; Hostile Environment; Subsequent Work History.....	4220
	a. Workplace Stressor May Be Sufficient.....	4222
	b. Workplace Stressor May Be Insufficient	4222
	c. Alcoholism or Drug Addiction; Inability to Control Condition.....	4224
	6. Partial Disability Does Not Qualify	4224
	7. New Condition Raised With Judge or in PFR; Condition That Should Have Been Considered by OPM.....	4225
	a. Evidence of Progression of Disease Presented in PFR.....	4226
	8. Reassignment in Lieu of Disability Retirement	4226
	a. Adequacy of Position Offered Through Reassignment	4226
	b. Permanent Light Duty Position	4229
	c. Postal Service: Different Craft.....	4232
	d. OWCP Position Suitability Determination	4235
	9. Effect of Disability Accommodation on Annuity Entitlement.....	4236
	a. Conflicting Agency Evidence Concerning Accommodation	4236
	10. Necessity for Cessation of Pay or Separation From Federal Service	4237
	11. One Year for Disability Retirement Application.....	4237
	a. Waiver; Tolling; Separation for Medical Reason: Notice Not Provided	4239
	b. Waiver; Mental Incompetence.....	4243
	c. Technical Constructions Concerning Filing Date: Method of Filing; Filing With Former Agency.....	4247
	12. Agency-Initiated Disability Retirement Application.....	4249
	a. Service Credit Requirement.....	4252
	13. Application After Employee's Death.....	4252
	14. Bar to Concurrent Receipt of Disability Retirement, OWCP Benefit.....	4252
	15. Withdrawal of Disability Retirement Application	4252
	16. Evidence of Disability.....	4254
	a. Scope of Board Review; <i>Chavez</i>	4255
	b. Significance of Position Description, Qualification Requirements	4259
	c. Objective Medical Evidence	4259
	d. Content of Medical Report.....	4260
	e. Lack of Evidence of Precise Medical Causation Not Determinative	4260
	f. <i>Mullins-Howard</i> : Disability Established Without Unduly Detailed Medical Causation Analysis	4263
	g. Subjective Evidence.....	4268
	h. Testimony of Supervisor; Performance Appraisal.....	4268
	i. Hearsay.....	4269
	j. Absence; Use of Leave	4269
	k. Post-Separation Medical Evidence.....	4269
	l. Medical Condition Not Presented to OPM	4271
	m. Removal for Physical Inability to Perform; <i>Bruner</i> ; Settlement.....	4272
	n. Loss of Military Status	4278
	o. OWCP Determination	4278
	p. Social Security Administration Determination	4279
	q. VA Disability Rating.....	4281

r.	Security Clearance Determination	4282
s.	Agency Medical Disqualification	4283
t.	Removal for Misconduct	4283
17.	Refusal to Undergo Diagnostic or Other Procedure, Treatment	4284
a.	Possible Improvement Through Future Surgery or Treatment	4285
18.	Specific Conditions	4286
19.	Earnings Recovery	4286
a.	Current Rate of Pay	4288
b.	Basic Pay; Cost of Living Adjustment	4289
c.	Bonus	4290
d.	Miscellaneous Income	4291
e.	Business Expense	4291
f.	Pension Contribution	4291
20.	Decline of Earnings	4291
a.	Discontinued Service Annuity Upon Recovery of Earning Capacity	4291
21.	Conversion From Disability to Optional Retirement	4292
22.	Conversion From Optional to Disability Retirement	4292
23.	Rescission of Disability Retirement Grant	4292
24.	Recovery From Disability: Burden of Proof	4293
a.	Restoration of Annuity	4294
25.	Calculation of Annuity	4295
26.	Loss of Annuity for Certain Offenses	4296
E.	DEATH BENEFITS; LUMP SUM PAYMENTS	4298
1.	Submission of Designation	4305
a.	Signature Requirement	4307
2.	Child Who Qualifies to Receive Annuity or Lump Sum Payment	4308
3.	Other Distributions	4309
a.	Slayer Statute	4309
4.	Time for Application	4310
F.	SURVIVOR ANNUITIES	4310
1.	Eligibility of Employee for Retirement as Condition to Annuity	4313
2.	Application for Annuity	4314
3.	Time, Method of Election	4314
a.	Effect of Remarriage After Retirement	4316
b.	Notice to Annuitant of Necessity to Notify OPM of Remarriage to Secure Annuity	4316
c.	Delay in Notice to OPM of Annuity Election	4317
d.	Lack of Proper Notice From OPM Concerning Annuity Election	4318
e.	Incorrect Information From Employing Agency Concerning Annuity Election	4330
f.	Annuity Election Form; Signature; Submission	4332
g.	Effect of Mental Incompetence on Timeliness of Election	4334
h.	Authority to Act on Behalf of Incompetent Employee to Create Annuity	4335
i.	Employee Mentally Incompetent to Make Adverse Election; Fraud	4336
j.	Community Property Interests	4338
4.	State Law Defines Marital Status; Common Law Marriage; Qualifying Widow	4340
a.	Current Spouse; Duration of Marriage; Widow: Issue of Marriage; Children	4341
b.	Accidental Death	4342
c.	Putative Spouse	4342
5.	Calculation	4344
a.	Survivor Annuity Based on Disability Annuity	4344
b.	Health Benefits	4346
c.	Social Security Benefit Offset—CSRS	4346
d.	Social Security Benefit—FERS	4347
6.	Consent of Spouse to Waiver of Survivor Annuity	4348
a.	Consent by Current Spouse to Discontinue Survivor Annuity	4355
b.	Attempt to Modify Amount of Spousal Survivor Annuity	4356
c.	Consent by Current Spouse for Former Spouse Annuity	4357
7.	Marriage of at Least Nine Months; Parent of Issue by Marriage; Exceptions	4357
8.	Survivor Annuity for Child Incapable of Self-Support	4358
a.	Children in School	4365
G.	DISCONTINUED SERVICE ANNUITY	4366
H.	LAW ENFORCEMENT RETIREMENT	4375

1.	Process of Determining and Appealing LEO Status.....	4376
2.	Agency Head Determination; Timeliness of Request for LEO Status.....	4378
3.	Substantive Criteria for LEO Determination	4387
a.	Customs and Border Patrol Officers.....	4400
b.	Decisions Before 2000.....	4402
4.	Evidence Considered	4406
5.	Supervisory Credit	4410
6.	Military Service.....	4412
7.	Effect of Disability Retirement.....	4413
I.	FIREFIGHTER RETIREMENT	4414
J.	AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLER RETIREMENT.....	4422
K.	OTHER ANNUITY INTERESTS	4422
1.	Deferred Annuity.....	4422
2.	FERS Minimum Retirement Age Annuity.....	4423
3.	Supplemental, Redetermined Annuity	4424
4.	Alternative Form of Annuity.....	4428
5.	Voluntary Early Retirement Authority; Retirement Incentive	4431
L.	APPORTIONMENT OF ANNUITY BY COURT ORDER.....	4433
1.	Lifetime Annuity	4433
2.	Former Spouse Survivor Annuity	4434
a.	Intent to Create Former Spouse Survivor Annuity or Other Benefit.....	4436
b.	Reduction in Lifetime Annuity.....	4438
c.	Apportionment of Supplemental Annuity.....	4439
d.	Wording of Decree	4441
e.	Ambiguous Provision in Divorce Decree; Extrinsic Evidence; Rules of Construction	4443
3.	Challenge to Court Order Affecting Annuity Interest.....	4447
a.	Qualifying Court Order.....	4448
4.	Amendment to Court Order Affecting Former Spouse Annuity; Construction of Annuity Interest Following Ineffective Amendment.....	4459
5.	Bifurcated Decree.....	4470
6.	Spouse Equity Act of 1984 as Amended.....	4474
M.	ANNUITY CALCULATION ISSUES.....	4475
1.	Estoppel as Basis to Create, Continue, or Adjust Benefit or Overpayment	4476
2.	Refund.....	4478
3.	Redeposit	4486
a.	Personal Service Agreement	4489
4.	High Three Salary Calculation: Basic Pay; Lump Sum Back Pay Settlement.....	4490
5.	Onset of Disability Annuity Payment.....	4493
6.	VA Medical Professional; VA Benefit Reduction for Military Retirement Pay	4496
7.	Annuity Reduction for VA Employees Removed for Certain Performance or Misconduct.....	4496
8.	Law Enforcement Enhanced Annuity Rate	4497
9.	Minimum, Maximum Annuity	4497
10.	Annuity Allotment	4497
11.	Impact of Receipt of Medicare Benefits, Social Security on CSRS, FERS.....	4497
12.	Deposit for Creditable Service; Annuity Supplement.....	4500
13.	Interest	4501
14.	Taxes.....	4501
15.	Cost of Living Adjustment for Reinstated Annuity	4502
16.	Diversion of Annuity Payment.....	4503
17.	Reemployed Annuitant.....	4503
18.	Individual Retirement Record.....	4503
19.	Excess Deductions	4506
20.	Reconstructing Employment Record.....	4506
N.	OVERPAYMENTS.....	4506
1.	Proving Debt; Evidence Supporting Waiver; OPM Records	4507
2.	Basis for Waiver	4508
a.	Annuitant Without Fault and Recovery Against Equity and Good Conscience	4510
b.	Knowledge of Overpayment; Set-Aside Rule	4512
c.	OPM Fault in Creating Overpayment	4514
d.	Unconscionability of Recovery; Recovery Delay.....	4514

e. Financial Hardship.....	4520
f. Ordinary and Necessary Living Expenses; Future Events.....	4521
g. Assets Available to Satisfy Overpayment; Income/Expense Margin.....	4522
h. Detrimental Reliance; Set Aside Rule	4523
i. Adjustment of Repayment Schedule; Length of Recovery	4527
j. Calculation of Overpayment; Interest.....	4528
k. Recovery Schedule Adjustment When There Is No Annuity Entitlement	4529
l. Collection From Survivor for Debt of Original Annuitant	4529
m. Insurance Issue Related to Overpayment.....	4532
O. OFFSETS; DEBT COLLECTION FROM ANNUITY	4534

CHAPTER 18: RESTORATION RIGHTS4541

I. RESTORATION RIGHTS UPON RECOVERY FROM OCCUPATIONAL INJURY OR ILLNESS.....	4541
A. SEPARATION OR FURLOUGH MUST RESULT FROM COMPENSABLE INJURY	4544
1. Separation for Reason Other Than Result of Injury or Illness.....	4547
a. Factual Determination on Cause of Separation	4553
b. Termination When OWCP Determination Supports Employee's Refusal to Return to Work.....	4555
c. AWOL Covered by Period of Compensation.....	4558
d. Effect of Resignation	4558
e. Separation by Settlement Agreement.....	4559
B. SIGNIFICANCE OF OWCP DETERMINATION; RECEIPT OF COMPENSATION	4559
1. Requirement of Medical Examination	4563
C. MEANING OF "RECOVERY"	4564
1. Fully Recovered Within a Year	4565
2. Fully Recovered After a Year	4567
a. Priority Consideration: Necessity for Position to Be Filled by Another Person.....	4570
b. Geographic Extent of Consideration	4572
c. Method, Duration of Priority Consideration	4572
3. Partially Recovered	4573
a. Geographic Extent of Consideration: Local Commuting Area.....	4580
b. Arbitrary or Capricious Restoration Effort	4583
c. Accommodation Requirement; Disability Discrimination.....	4586
d. Postal Service Rules; <i>Latham</i> ; <i>Cronin</i>	4588
e. Discontinuation of Modified Assignment	4603
4. Physically Disqualified Employee.....	4603
a. Geographic Extent of Consideration	4605
D. PARTICULAR GROUPS OF EMPLOYEES.....	4605
1. Probationer.....	4606
2. Reemployed Annuitant.....	4606
3. Postal Service.....	4607
4. Nonappropriated Fund	4610
E. WHEN RESTORATION IS TO OCCUR	4610
1. Light Duty	4612
2. Effect of Disability Retirement.....	4612
F. TIME TO APPLY FOR RESTORATION	4614
1. Form of Restoration Request	4615
G. REMEDY.....	4616
1. Same or Equivalent Position	4617
a. Return to <i>Status Quo</i>	4617
b. Interim Promotion.....	4618
2. Regraded Position.....	4619
3. Seniority Inapplicable.....	4619
4. Priority Placement Program	4619
5. Benefits Upon Restoration	4621
H. MSPB APPEAL RIGHTS.....	4627
1. Time for Appeal.....	4627
a. Lack of Notice of Appeal Rights	4627
b. Settlement	4628
2. Burden of Proof; Jurisdictional Allegations	4628

CHAPTER 19: ATTORNEY FEES.....4631

I. ENTITLEMENT STANDARDS4631

A. STATUTORY AND REGULATORY BASIS FOR FEES4631

1. Use of Counsel; Licensure.....4632

2. Governing Statutes and Regulation4635

a. Civil Rights Statutes4636

b. Whistleblower Protection Act4637

3. Jurisdiction Over Action Under Appeal4637

4. Miscellaneous Appeals.....4637

a. Regulation Review Proceeding4637

b. Retirement Appeal.....4637

c. OSC Case: Prohibited Personnel Practice and Hatch Act Litigation4638

d. Sanction.....4648

B. PREVAILING PARTY STATUS4648

1. Mitigation.....4651

2. Other Relief.....4651

3. Must Prevail Through MSPB Procedures.....4653

a. Mixed-Motive Determination4653

4. Cancellation of Action Appealed.....4654

a. Enforcement Proceeding Mooted by Agency Action.....4660

5. Settlement4663

a. Prevailing Party Status Through Settlement.....4663

b. Relief Through Settlement Must Be Related to MSPB Appeal.....4665

c. Interest of Justice Criteria4666

d. Jurisdiction to Accept and Enforce Settlement Providing for Fees or Supporting Fee Motion4666

C. INTEREST OF JUSTICE: AN OVERVIEW4671

1. *Allen* Criteria4671

a. Financial Hardship.....4672

2. Preservation of Claims Supporting Entitlement; Significance of Final Merits Decision4672

a. Overlapping Fee Entitlement Standards.....4672

3. Statutory Examples Not Exclusive.....4673

D. BAD FAITH4673

1. Malicious Action; Inadequate Inquiry.....4674

2. Disparate Treatment.....4674

3. Action Reversed but Some Charges Sustained4674

4. Unreasonable Litigation Tactics; Failure to Settle.....4674

a. Frivolous PFR.....4674

5. Enforcement.....4675

E. CLEARLY WITHOUT MERIT OR WHOLLY UNFOUNDED4675

1. Failure to Adhere to Legal Precedent.....4675

2. Inadequate Initial Inquiry Into Facts4676

3. Lack of Legitimate Basis for Agency Action.....4676

a. Development of Dispositive Information During Appeal.....4677

4. Mitigation.....4677

5. Factual Dispute4677

6. Performance Appeal4679

7. Retirement Appeal.....4679

a. Legal Error by OPM4682

b. Incorrect Advice From OPM.....4683

c. Issue of Mental Incompetence4683

F. KNEW OR SHOULD HAVE KNOWN4685

1. Lack of Reasonable Inquiry.....4686

2. Disregard of Legal Precedent.....4687

3. Regulatory Error.....4687

4. Reduction in Force.....4687

5. Performance-Based Action.....4688

6. Mitigation.....4688

a. Not All Charges Sustained.....4693

7. Negligent Presentation of Case.....4694

8. Decision of Another Tribunal4694

9. Retirement Appeal.....4694

a.	Failure of OPM to Evaluate Evidence Available During Reconsideration Process; Hearing Evidence.....	4694
b.	Legal Error by OPM	4697
10.	Settlement	4697
G.	GROSS PROCEDURAL ERROR.....	4698
1.	Denial of Advance Notice or Appeal Rights	4700
a.	Involuntary or Constructive Adverse Action	4702
b.	Enforced Leave	4702
c.	Indefinite or Emergency Suspension	4703
2.	Mitigation.....	4703
3.	Performance-Based Action.....	4704
4.	Reduction in Force.....	4704
H.	SUBSTANTIALLY INNOCENT.....	4704
1.	<i>Yorkshire</i>	4706
2.	MSPB Treatment of <i>Yorkshire</i>	4707
3.	Appellant Who Ensnarers Agency	4709
4.	Mitigation: <i>Boese, VanFossen</i>	4709
a.	Factually Close Case.....	4712
b.	Prior Law	4713
5.	Performance-Based Appeal; Medical Inability to Perform	4714
6.	Other Legal Error	4714
I.	OTHER AUTHORITY FOR FEE AWARDS	4714
1.	Back Pay Act	4714
a.	Postal Service Employee	4715
2.	Equal Access to Justice Act	4716
a.	Administrative Law Judge Case	4719
b.	Basis for Compensating Court Time	4720
c.	Prevailing Party	4721
d.	Substantial Justification	4726
e.	Bad Faith; Common Fund	4730
f.	Basis for Awarding MSPB Time.....	4731
g.	Hourly Rate; <i>Pro Bono</i> or Contingent Representation; COLA; Expenses.....	4731
h.	Procedure; Time for Filing; Application.....	4733
i.	Application to MSPB Cases	4734
3.	Civil Rights Case.....	4735
a.	Result Achieved.....	4738
4.	Prohibited Personnel Practice Case	4738
5.	USERRA; VEOA	4739
6.	Other Bases for Fee Claims; Equitable Assessment of Fee	4741
II.	PROCEDURES FOR OBTAINING FEES	4741
A.	HOW FEES ARE INCURRED	4741
1.	Attorney-Client Relationship; Fee Payment.....	4741
a.	Law Clerk, Paraprofessional; <i>Pro Se</i> Appellant.....	4742
2.	Union Counsel.....	4743
a.	Demise of Cost-Plus Formula	4743
b.	History of Cost-Plus Rule.....	4746
c.	Repayment of Fees to Union Required.....	4747
3.	Federally Employed Attorney	4748
4.	Public Interest Organization.....	4748
B.	COMPENSABLE SERVICES.....	4748
1.	Work Performed Before Final Adverse Action or Other Decision	4748
2.	Research	4751
3.	Discovery.....	4751
4.	Settlement, Mediation.....	4751
5.	PFR.....	4751
6.	OPM Reconsideration Petition	4752
7.	Time in Court	4753
a.	Appropriate Charge for Court Time	4756
b.	Practice Notes	4757
8.	Preparation of Fee Motion	4757
9.	Defense of Fee Motion	4757
10.	Enforcement Proceeding.....	4758

11. Related Proceeding	4763
a. MSPB	4764
b. Grievance.....	4765
c. Privacy Act.....	4765
d. Unemployment Compensation	4765
e. Criminal Case	4765
f. EEO Complaint.....	4766
g. Media Contact; Congressional Activity.....	4768
12. Anticipated Time; Supplemental Petition	4768
13. Unsuccessful Claim, Issue, or Defense; Limited Success	4768
a. <i>Hensley</i>	4768
b. Mitigation.....	4775
c. Tangentially Related Issue	4777
d. Clearly Separate Claim.....	4777
e. Unsuccessful EEO Claim	4777
f. Unsuccessful Whistleblower Claim	4779
C. REASONABLENESS OF FEES.....	4779
1. Hourly Rate.....	4780
a. Evidence of Reasonableness; Fee Agreement; Result Achieved	4781
b. Initial Decision in Another Appeal; Decision of Another Tribunal	4789
c. Settlement	4789
d. Out-Of-Town Counsel	4789
e. Travel Time	4790
2. Contingency Arrangement, Enhancement; <i>City of Burlington</i>	4790
a. Early Treatment by MSPB of Contingent Adjustments	4793
b. Enhancement for Payment Delay; Interest.....	4794
c. Enhancement for Quality Work	4796
d. Enhancement for Wear and Tear	4798
e. Traditional Contingency Agreement; Fee Cap.....	4798
f. Flat Fee Arrangement	4799
3. <i>Laffey Matrix</i>	4800
4. Below Market Rate.....	4805
5. Reasonableness of Time Invested	4808
a. Responsibility of Judge	4809
b. Articulated Analysis Required.....	4811
c. Notice to Counsel of Defect in Fee Motion	4813
d. Expertise and Diligence of Counsel; Likely Outcome.....	4813
e. Record Review	4813
f. Time at Hearing.....	4815
g. PFR	4815
h. <i>Amicus Brief</i>	4815
i. Time Preparing Attorney Fees Motion.....	4816
j. Consolidated Appeals.....	4816
k. Multiple Counsel; Duplicative Work.....	4816
l. Clerical, Secretarial Work.....	4818
6. Examples of Fee Awards	4819
a. Rates.....	4819
b. Amounts	4820
D. COSTS AND EXPENSES.....	4820
1. Transcript.....	4822
2. Photocopy; Electronic Production	4822
3. Travel.....	4822
4. Secretarial Expense.....	4822
5. Postage; Courier.....	4822
6. Fee for Expert, Consultant.....	4822
7. Investigator	4823
8. Accounting Expense	4823
9. Telephone or Facsimile.....	4823
10. Electronic Research	4824
11. Taxes.....	4824
12. EEO, Whistleblower Protection Act, USERRA, and VEOA Cases; Broader Coverage.....	4824

13. Direct Recovery of Costs by Appellants	4825
E. FEE MOTION	4827
1. Who May File.....	4828
2. Time and Place of Filing	4829
a. Premature Motion	4829
b. Timing of Agency Response	4830
c. Late Motion.....	4830
3. Motion Must Be Complete When Filed.....	4834
a. Incomplete Motion	4834
4. Developing Evidence to Support Motion	4835
a. Hearing Concerning Fee Entitlement in Settled Appeal.....	4835
b. Hearing and Discovery Concerning Reasonableness.....	4836
5. Format of Motion	4836
a. What to Include.....	4837
b. Fee Agreement.....	4837
c. Itemization of Time	4838
d. Retrospective Reconstruction of Time.....	4839
6. Supplemental or Corrected Motion	4840
7. Unopposed, Moot, or Settled Motion.....	4840
8. Service of Motion	4840
9. Opposition to Motion	4841
10. Initial Decision on Motion.....	4841
a. Obligation of Judge to Ensure Due Process.....	4841
b. Requirements of Addendum Initial Decision	4841
c. Initial Decision Controls Basis for Fee Determination	4842
d. Change in Judge.....	4843
e. Hourly Rate Analysis	4843
11. Waiver of Fee Through Settlement Agreement.....	4844
a. Effect of Settlement on Claims of Multiple Counsel	4845
12. Settlement of Fee Claim.....	4845
13. Payment of Fee to Counsel and Client.....	4847
a. Payment to Counsel.....	4847
b. Repayment of Fee by Counsel to Client	4847
14. PFR of Fee Decision	4848
a. Interim Fee	4848
b. Time Spent on PFR	4848

CHAPTER 20: SETTLEMENT4851

I. SETTLEMENT.....	4851
A. SETTLEMENT PROCEDURES; ELEMENTS OF SETTLEMENTS.....	4851
1. Regulatory Process	4853
a. Settlement Resources; Mediation Appeals Program	4854
2. Minimum Requirements.....	4855
a. Hatch Act Case.....	4855
3. Filing, Acceptance of Settlement for Enforcement	4856
a. Intent That Agreement Be Subject to MSPB Enforcement Authority	4856
b. Unfiled Settlement.....	4859
c. Oral Advice of Settlement	4859
d. Specific Oral Settlement Agreement Entered Into Record	4862
e. Distinguishing Oral Agreement and Ongoing or Incomplete Negotiation	4866
f. Oral Agreement to Be Followed by Written Agreement	4869
g. Appellant's Understanding of Agreement	4871
h. Settlement After Initial Decision.....	4871
4. Jurisdiction to Accept Settlement: <i>Delorme</i>	4872
a. Prior Law	4873
b. Settlement Arising From Disputed Last Chance Agreement.....	4877
5. Flexibility, Scope of Settlement.....	4878
a. Incomplete Settlement; Omitted Terms.....	4878
b. Regulatory Limitations	4880
6. Conditional Settlement; Lapsed Offer; Implicit Term	4880
7. Settlement Requiring Specific Action by Judge	4883

8.	Integration or “Zipper” Clause	4884
9.	Modification, Amendment of Agreement.....	4887
10.	Waiver of Statutory Right; Release	4888
a.	Unemployment Compensation	4889
b.	Workers’ Compensation	4890
c.	Older Workers’ Benefit Protection Act.....	4891
d.	RIF Benefit	4900
e.	Limitation on Right to Seek Future Federal Employment	4900
11.	Retirement Benefit.....	4900
12.	Settlement Provision Affecting Other Agencies	4901
13.	OSC Case	4902
B.	SETTING ASIDE A SETTLEMENT	4902
1.	Agreement Challenged as Invalid; Use of PFR.....	4903
2.	Timing of PFR.....	4905
3.	Bases for Setting Aside a Settlement	4907
a.	Threat of Unwarranted Action; Duress	4908
b.	Hardship.....	4911
c.	Disappointment; Confusion	4911
d.	Lack of Understanding	4912
e.	Mental Incapacity; Stress	4912
f.	Time Pressure	4915
g.	Coercion or Bias by Judge	4916
h.	Coercion by Counsel or Union Representative; Lack of Signature by Counsel	4920
i.	Error or Lack of Authority of Appellant’s Counsel or Union Representative—Agreement Sustained.....	4923
j.	Error or Lack of Authority of Appellant’s Counsel or Union Representative— <i>Bona Fide</i> Challenge to Agreement.....	4926
k.	Error or Lack of Authority of Government Counsel.....	4930
l.	Fraud; Misrepresentation; Bad Faith; Merit of Underlying Action.....	4931
m.	Mutual, Unilateral Mistake	4937
n.	Lack of Mutual Assent.....	4944
o.	Lack of Consideration	4947
p.	Incorrect Information From Agency Concerning Retirement Eligibility.....	4948
q.	Provision Unlawful or Contrary to Public Policy.....	4948
r.	Change in Law	4954
4.	Partial Invalidity	4954
5.	Unfiled Settlement Agreement; Preappeal Settlement	4955
6.	Collateral Attack on Settlement Through New Appeal	4958
7.	Breach of Settlement: Election Between Rescission or Enforcement.....	4958
a.	Agency May Rescind	4959
b.	Restoration of Consideration Received; “Tender Back”	4960
c.	Enforcement Petition to Rescind Settlement; Late PFR Raising Enforcement Issue	4962

CHAPTER 21: REMEDIES.....4965

I.	APPELLATE REMEDIES	4965
A.	REMEDIAL AUTHORITY	4965
1.	Statutory Basis for Remedial Authority	4965
2.	OPM Regulation.....	4965
3.	Collateral Result of Restoration Order; Action Related to Case Under Appeal	4965
a.	Effect on Remedial Order of Decision of Another Tribunal	4970
b.	Reversal of Criminal Conviction	4971
B.	BACK PAY AND RELATED REMEDIES.....	4971
1.	Necessary Findings.....	4972
2.	Pay Entitlement: Ready, Willing, and Able to Work	4972
a.	Effect of Disability Retirement	4978
3.	Maximum Recovery Period.....	4979
a.	Liability for Event Preceding Adverse Action	4979
4.	Method of Payment.....	4979
5.	Method of Calculation.....	4980
6.	Reinstatement With No or Limited Pay; Time-Served or Other Suspension; Shortened Notice Period	4980
a.	After Acquired Evidence	4982
7.	Loss of Security Clearance.....	4982

8.	Bonus or Award; Differential; Relocation Expense	4983
9.	Premium, Overtime, Holiday Pay	4984
a.	Overtime for Postal Service Employee	4989
10.	Interest—Back Pay Act	4990
a.	Interest—Postal Service Employee	4994
11.	Insurance Benefit	4995
12.	Retirement, TSP Contribution or Loan	4995
13.	Leave Account; FMLA; Military Leave	5000
14.	Leave Restoration for MSPB, Related Proceedings; Compensatory Time; Official Time	5003
15.	Interim Promotion; WIGI; Pay Increase	5006
16.	Applicant for Employment	5010
17.	Federal Aviation Administration Employee	5010
C.	DUTY TO MITIGATE BACK PAY THROUGH INTERIM EMPLOYMENT	5010
1.	Employee Other Than Postal Service	5010
2.	Postal Service Employee	5011
D.	DEDUCTIONS FROM BACK PAY	5013
1.	Retirement, TSP Contribution	5014
2.	Debt to Retirement Fund	5015
3.	Annuity Entitlement or Adjustment	5015
4.	Union Dues; Insurance; Medicare	5015
5.	Taxes; Increased Taxes	5021
6.	Unemployment, OWCP, Workers' Compensation	5022
7.	Interim Earnings; Job Search, Relocation Cost; Replacement Earnings; Retirement Income; Fraudulent Earnings Information	5026
8.	Other Deductions	5029
E.	RETRAINING	5029
F.	REEMPLOYMENT RIGHT	5029
G.	PURGING OF RECORDS; MODIFICATION OF DOCUMENTATION, PERFORMANCE APPRAISAL	5030
1.	Coding of Personnel Document	5033
2.	Adjustment to AWOL Charge	5033
H.	DAMAGES; REGULATION GOVERNING RECOVERY	5035
1.	Availability of Compensatory Damages	5038
2.	Awards of Compensatory Damages—Civil Rights Acts	5043
a.	Effect of Receipt of FECA and Insurance Benefits on Recovery of Compensatory Damages	5052
b.	Pecuniary Damages	5054
3.	Consequential Damages and Costs—Whistleblower Case	5054
4.	Compensatory Damages—Whistleblower Case	5064
5.	Damages Under VEOA, USERRA	5069
6.	Monetary Relief for Prohibited Personnel Practices Not Covered by WPA or EEO Law	5071
7.	Punitive Damages	5074
8.	Taxation of Damages, Attorney Fees	5074
I.	NONTRADITIONAL REMEDIES	5076
1.	Waiver of Debt	5076
2.	Apology; Evidence Destruction	5076
3.	Protection Against Intervening Event	5076
a.	Protection Against Future Event	5077
4.	Front Pay	5077
5.	Equitable Relief; Other Remedies	5077

CHAPTER 22: ENFORCEMENT5081

I.	ENFORCEMENT	5081
A.	ENFORCEMENT OF MSPB DECISION	5081
1.	Authority to Order Compliance; Sanctions	5082
a.	Sanction Against Agency	5083
2.	Authority to Award Back Pay or Monetary Remedy	5084
a.	Mootness	5086
b.	Burden of Proof; Proof of Compliance	5087
3.	Enforcement Procedure	5088
a.	Enforcement Petition Regulation, Guidance	5089
b.	Time for Initiating Enforcement	5091
c.	Agency Request for Extension of Time	5094

d.	Duty to Supply Information; Accounting.....	5095
e.	Unclear or Impossible Compliance	5097
f.	Evidence of Compliance; Statement of Intent; Representative’s Statement; Reargument of Merits.....	5097
g.	Hearing.....	5099
h.	Discovery	5099
i.	Referral to Comptroller General	5101
j.	Multiple Enforcement Petitions; <i>Res Judicata</i>	5101
k.	Analysis by Judge	5102
l.	Evidence Supplied After Decision of Judge	5102
m.	MSPB Review of Initial Decision on Enforcement Petition	5103
4.	Allegation of Reprisal, Bad Faith, Discrimination, or Harassment.....	5105
a.	Discipline Related to Agency Noncompliance	5106
b.	Performance Appraisal Dispute	5107
c.	Remedy Limited to “Forward-Looking Relief”; But-For Analysis.....	5107
5.	Back Pay Dispute	5108
a.	Delay in Payment.....	5110
b.	Damages.....	5110
6.	Reinstatement to Same Position; <i>Status Quo Ante</i> Remedy.....	5111
a.	Medical Limitation	5115
b.	Effect of Retirement.....	5116
c.	Obligation Under Collective Bargaining Contract.....	5117
d.	Other Post-Reinstatement Action; Medical Certification Requirement.....	5117
e.	Postal Service Reorganization.....	5118
f.	Security Clearance Problem.....	5119
g.	Demotion	5121
h.	Term or Temporary Appointment.....	5129
i.	Seniority Adjustment	5131
j.	Pay System Change.....	5131
k.	Insurance	5131
l.	Other Working Conditions	5132
7.	Compelling Reason for Reassignment; Detail; Different Duties.....	5133
a.	Replacement Employee	5133
b.	Placement on Administrative Leave Pending Subsequent Removal Attempt.....	5134
c.	Intervening Abolition of Position	5134
d.	Detail or Other Variation of Permanent Position.....	5136
e.	Intervening Adverse Action.....	5137
f.	Reasons Related to Original Action.....	5138
g.	Overriding Interest.....	5138
8.	Reinstatement With Accommodation for Disability.....	5146
9.	Lack of Authority to Enforce Compliance.....	5150
10.	Sovereign Immunity Issue.....	5150
B.	ENFORCEMENT AND INTERPRETATION OF SETTLEMENT AGREEMENTS	5150
1.	Scope of Enforcement Authority.....	5153
a.	Only Filed Settlement May Be Enforced; Settlement Enforceable in Different Forum	5153
b.	Allegation of Discrimination; Whistleblowing Reprisal	5154
c.	Damages.....	5156
2.	Agency Enforcement Initiative.....	5156
a.	Appellant’s Agreement to Resign or to Take Other Action; Agency Self Help	5158
b.	Agreement Not to Reapply for Employment With Agency	5158
c.	Agreement to Withdraw EEOC Case or Other Litigation	5159
3.	Agreement That Appellant First Notify Agency of Noncompliance Allegation.....	5160
a.	Agreement That Parties Attempt to Adjust Disputes Concerning Settlement	5160
4.	Election Between Enforcement and Rescission; Pleading in Alternative.....	5161
a.	Modification of Settlement Provision	5162
5.	Role of MSPB Regional or Field Office.....	5163
a.	Treatment of Enforcement Issue; Evidence on PFR.....	5163
6.	Time for Compliance if None Set in Settlement Agreement.....	5163
7.	Time for Initiating Enforcement.....	5165
a.	Reasonableness of Timing of Enforcement; Laches Defense	5170
8.	Burden of Proof.....	5173
a.	Evidence Required	5176

9. Mutual Breach; “Clean Hands”	5177
10. Interpretation and Application of Settlement: Legal Principles.....	5178
a. Materiality of Breach	5179
b. Good Faith Required; Bad Faith.....	5186
11. Interpretation of Agreement: External Law; Extrinsic or Parol Evidence; Ambiguous Term; History of Performance; Hearing	5190
a. Back Pay, Other Obligation; Omitted Term.....	5196
b. Amendment to Agreement; Counterproposal	5198
12. Specific Settlement Provisions	5198
a. Term of Art	5199
b. Obligation to Reinstate or Restore to Duty; Precondition to Restoration.....	5199
c. Agreement to Reassign; Work Schedule Change; Light Duty Position; Duration of Agency’s Commitment	5201
d. Employee May Be Terminated or Will Resign or Retire on Specified Condition; Agreement Not to Reapply.....	5204
e. Promotion, Placement Consideration; Priority Consideration	5206
f. Agreement to Provide Affirmative, Neutral, or Controlled Reference	5210
g. “Clean Record” or “Clean Paper”; Expungement or Withdrawal of Record; Implicit Requirement; NDAA; Executive Order 13,839; Executive Order 14,003	5218
h. Nondisclosure or Confidentiality Clause.....	5235
i. “Need to Know” Exception to Confidentiality Clause	5242
j. Whistleblower Protection Enhancement Act Provision.....	5247
k. Waiver of Protection of Confidentiality or Affirmative Reference Provision	5247
l. Adjustment of Performance Appraisal, Documentation.....	5248
m. Agreement to Provide Assistance to Employee	5250
n. Agreement to “Cancel” Action; Back Pay, Interest, Damages, or Other Entitlement; Bonus or Award; Lump Sum Provision.....	5250
o. Annuity Issues.....	5255
p. Unemployment Compensation	5260
13. Debt Recoupment	5260
14. Settlement Reached in Another Tribunal	5261
15. Settlement Involving Action of Third Party	5262
16. Enforcement Only Through EEO Procedures	5262
17. Privacy Act Issue	5262
18. Provision That Violates Collective Bargaining Contract.....	5262
19. Unlawful Provision	5263
20. Damages Unavailable for Breach of Clause Requiring Affirmative Reference, Other Violations.....	5264
21. Reprisal or Harassment	5265
a. Foreclosure of Future Discipline or Other Agency Action for Past Conduct.....	5269

CHAPTER 23: JUDICIAL REVIEW.....5273

I. OVERVIEW OF APPELLATE PROCESS	5273
A. NATURE OF REVIEW	5273
1. Final Decision.....	5273
a. Denial of Request for Reopening.....	5276
b. Collateral MSPB Order.....	5279
c. Decision Remanding Case to Judge	5280
2. Statutory Basis for Review.....	5281
3. Whistleblower Cases	5283
a. Whistleblower Reprisal: Circuits Other Than Federal Circuit	5283
4. Proper Parties in Court; Standing; Mootness	5284
a. Proper Respondent in Court.....	5285
b. OSC Disciplinary Case	5289
c. Arbitration Award.....	5290
5. <i>Amicus</i> Submission	5292
6. Government Appellate Review Request; Cross-Appeal.....	5292
a. Review Request by OPM	5293
b. Discrimination Issue	5294
7. Federal Circuit.....	5295
a. Nonprecedential Decision.....	5296
b. Summary Affirmation	5298
c. Court Practice	5298
d. Counsel Authorized to Appear in Appeal; Federal Circuit Admission	5302

e.	Pro Se Appeal.....	5302
f.	Appointment of Counsel.....	5303
g.	Stay Pending Court Review.....	5303
8.	Record and Issues Below.....	5303
a.	Appendix.....	5305
b.	New and Material Evidence.....	5305
B.	SCOPE OF REVIEW.....	5306
1.	Arbitrary and Capricious.....	5306
2.	Issues of Law, Jurisdiction; Constitutional Issues.....	5307
a.	Decisional Rationale Omitted by MSPB; Departure From Precedent.....	5308
3.	Procedural Error by MSPB.....	5311
a.	Ruling on Witnesses and Evidence.....	5311
b.	Ruling on Discovery.....	5312
c.	Timeliness of MSPB Filing.....	5314
4.	Substantial Evidence; Factual Dispute.....	5314
a.	Credibility.....	5319
b.	Nexus.....	5323
5.	Agency Rule of Conduct.....	5323
6.	Penalty Determination.....	5323
a.	Penalty Table.....	5326
b.	Not All Charges Sustained.....	5326
c.	Application of <i>Douglas</i> Mitigating Factors.....	5328
d.	Performance Action.....	5329
7.	Reduction in Force.....	5329
8.	Retirement Appeals.....	5329
a.	Disability Retirement.....	5331
b.	Optional Retirement.....	5338
C.	DEFERENCE; INTERPRETATION OF STATUTES, REGULATIONS, LABOR AND OTHER CONTRACTS.....	5339
1.	Agency Statutory Interpretation.....	5339
a.	Regulation Applying Statute; Agency Interpretation of Regulation.....	5341
2.	Agency Handbook, Instruction.....	5346
3.	MSPB Decision.....	5348
4.	Principles of Statutory and Regulatory Interpretation.....	5348
a.	Language Controls.....	5349
b.	Consideration of Statutory Scheme.....	5352
c.	Avoidance of Absurd Consequences.....	5353
d.	Statements of Legislators.....	5354
e.	Amendment; Failure to Amend.....	5354
f.	Retroactivity.....	5354
g.	Change in Law.....	5359
5.	Interpretation of Collective Bargaining Contract.....	5360
6.	Settlement; Last Chance Agreement.....	5361
D.	DISCRIMINATION ISSUES.....	5363
1.	Review of Board Decisions That Include EEO Defenses or Both EEO and Whistleblower Reprisal Defenses.....	5367
2.	Reprisal.....	5370
a.	Individual Right of Action.....	5371
3.	Jurisdictional Issue; Constructive Adverse Action; <i>Perry</i>	5372
4.	Timeliness, Procedural Issue; <i>Kloeckner</i>	5380
5.	Attorney Fees Award, Application.....	5385
6.	Transfer To and From District Courts.....	5386
7.	District Court Review.....	5387
a.	Time for District Court Review; Tolling or Estoppel.....	5390
b.	Effect of Waiver of EEO Claim.....	5391
c.	Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies.....	5391
d.	Summary Adjudication of EEO Issues; Disposition of Civil Service Issues.....	5394
e.	Scope of Review.....	5396
f.	Compliance With District Court Decision.....	5397
8.	Discharge of Probationer.....	5397
E.	REVIEW OF ARBITRATION AWARDS.....	5399
1.	Mixed Case.....	5402
2.	Time for Seeking Review.....	5408

3.	Decisional Standards for Arbitrator	5409
a.	Arbitrability.....	5413
b.	Bargaining History	5415
c.	Past Practice.....	5415
d.	<i>Functus Officio</i> ; Interim Award	5417
4.	Attorney Fees Award.....	5417
5.	Review Sought by OPM.....	5418
6.	Award Involving Department of Veterans Affairs Title 38 Employee	5419
7.	Award Involving Nonappropriated Fund Instrumentality Employee.....	5420
8.	Award Reviewed by Federal Labor Relations Authority.....	5421
F.	VEOA, USERRA CLAIMS.....	5421
II.	PREREQUISITES FOR JUDICIAL REVIEW	5422
A.	TIME FOR INITIATING JUDICIAL REVIEW.....	5422
1.	Equitable Tolling.....	5426
B.	EXHAUSTION OF MSPB ADMINISTRATIVE REMEDIES	5430
1.	Issue Must Be Raised With MSPB	5431
a.	Exception to Exhaustion Requirement	5432
2.	Necessity for PFR to MSPB.....	5434
a.	Challenge to Settlement.....	5436
3.	Ripeness for Judicial Review	5437
a.	Denial of IRA Stay	5438
III.	JUDICIAL REMEDIAL AUTHORITY	5439
A.	AUTHORITY TO REMAND	5439
1.	Remand to Effect Settlement.....	5440
2.	Judicial Control of MSPB Procedures	5440
3.	Mandamus.....	5441
B.	AUTHORITY TO TRANSFER.....	5442
C.	SANCTIONS	5442
1.	Examples of Sanctionable Conduct	5444
IV.	JUDICIAL RELIEF OUTSIDE REFORM ACT	5446
A.	PARTIES TO SUIT	5451
1.	Sovereign Immunity.....	5451
2.	Absolute Immunity.....	5451
3.	Qualified Immunity.....	5451
a.	Action Against Union.....	5451
B.	SUITS BASED ON STATUTE AND CONSTITUTION.....	5451
1.	Administrative Procedure Act.....	5452
a.	Use of APA	5452
b.	Scope of Review; Preclusive Effect of Reform Act.....	5453
c.	Scope of Relief	5457
2.	Privacy Act	5457
a.	Scope of Act.....	5458
b.	Enforcement of Act.....	5458
c.	Use of Privacy Act.....	5458
d.	Position Classification	5459
3.	Mandamus Act	5460
a.	Position Classification	5460
4.	Tucker Act	5463
a.	Position Classification	5469
b.	Overtime Pay Claim	5470
c.	Environmental Differential, Hazard Pay, Travel Pay	5471
d.	Claims Concerning Tenure, Contract Employment, Promotion, and Bonuses.....	5473
e.	Whistleblower Reprisal Claim	5478
f.	Claims Based on Constitution.....	5480
g.	EEO Settlement	5481
h.	MSPB Settlement.....	5487
5.	Federal Tort Claims Act.....	5489
6.	Back Pay Act	5491
a.	Implied Preclusion Under CSRA	5493
b.	Promotion Claim.....	5494
7.	Family Medical Leave Act.....	5495

8. Overtime, Pay Statutes	5496
9. Unfair Labor Practice.....	5497
10. Constitution	5498
a. Property Interest.....	5499
b. Liberty Interest; Name Clearing Hearing	5500
(i) Termination of Probationer.....	5501
c. First Amendment.....	5503
11. Injunction Action.....	5504
C. ACTIONS FOR DAMAGES AGAINST INDIVIDUALS AND GOVERNMENT; <i>BIVENS</i>	5511
1. Preclusion in Circuit Courts.....	5516
a. D.C. Circuit.....	5516
b. First Circuit	5518
c. Second Circuit.....	5518
d. Third Circuit	5519
e. Fourth Circuit	5519
f. Fifth Circuit.....	5519
g. Sixth Circuit.....	5520
h. Seventh Circuit	5521
i. Eighth Circuit.....	5521
j. Ninth Circuit	5522
k. Tenth Circuit	5523
l. Eleventh Circuit	5524
2. Claims Based on State Law; Westfall Act; Federal Tort Claims Act; Defamation; Tort Action Arising From Assault; No FEAR Act; Religious Freedom Restoration Act; FECA.....	5524

CHAPTER 24: RESEARCH, REFERENCE MATERIALS, AND FORMS.....5533

I. RESEARCH AND REFERENCES.....	5533
II. FORMS.....	5534

BIBLIOGRAPHY5555

TABLE OF CASES5563

INDEX5735