

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	1
I. MITIGATION OF PENALTY	1
II. CHANGE OR CLARIFICATION OF CHARGE ELEMENTS AND DISTINCTIONS IN CASE LAW	2
III. DUE PROCESS AND WHISTLEBLOWER REPRISAL DEFENSES.....	3
A. DUE PROCESS DEFENSES.....	3
B. WHISTLEBLOWER REPRISAL CLAIMS	4
IV. LEGISLATIVE, REGULATORY, AND EXECUTIVE ORDER CHANGES.....	4
A. WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION ENHANCEMENT ACT OF 2012.....	4
B. DR. CHRIS KIRKPATRICK WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION ACT OF 2017.....	9
C. ALL CIRCUIT REVIEW ACT (2018)	9
D. THE VETERANS ADMINISTRATION ACCOUNTABILITY AND WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION ACT OF 2017	10
E. PRESIDENT TRUMP'S EXECUTIVE ORDER 13839.....	12
F. OPM REGULATIONS IMPLEMENTING EO 13839	18
1. 5 CFR Part 315.803(a)	18
a. Background	18
b. Text of the New Regulation	18
2. 5 CFR Part 432.....	19
a. Background	19
b. Specific Changes in Regulations.....	19
c. Text of the New Regulations.....	21
3. 5 CFR Part 752, Subpart A—Discipline of Supervisors Based on Retaliation Against Whistleblowers	23
a. Background	23
b. Specific Changes in Sections 752.101–104.....	24
c. Text of the New Regulations.....	25
4. 5 CFR Part 752, Subpart B—Regulatory Requirements for Suspension for 14 Days or Less	28
a. Background	28
b. Specific Changes in Regulations.....	29
c. Text of the New Regulations.....	30
5. 5 CFR Part 752, Subpart D—Regulatory Requirements for Removal, Suspension for More Than 14 Days, Reduction in Grade or Pay, or Furlough for 30 Days or Less	32
a. Background	32
b. Specific Changes in the Regulations	32
c. Text of the New Regulations.....	34
6. Subpart F—Regulatory Requirements for Taking Adverse Actions Under the Senior Executive Service	36
a. Background	36
b. Specific Changes in the Regulations	36
c. Text of the New Regulations.....	37

G. EXECUTIVE ORDER CREATING NEW SCHEDULE F	40
1. The Impact.....	40
2. The Process.....	40
3. The Standards.....	41
4. Miscellaneous Provisions.....	41
5. Subsequent Action by OPM	41
6. Litigation	42
CHAPTER 1: OVERVIEW	43
CHAPTER 2: THE CIVIL SERVICE REFORM ACT: WHERE DID IT COME FROM AND WHAT DOES IT DO	45
I. MERIT SYSTEMS PROTECTION BOARD (MSPB).....	46
II. FEDERAL LABOR RELATIONS AUTHORITY (FLRA)	47
III. GRIEVANCE-ARBITRATION	48
IV. OFFICE OF PERSONNEL MANAGEMENT (OPM).....	49
V. OFFICE OF SPECIAL COUNSEL (OSC).....	49
VI. EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION (EEOC).....	50
CHAPTER 3: ADVERSE ACTIONS—THE STATUTORY AND REGULATORY REQUIREMENTS.....	53
I. CONDUCT OR PERFORMANCE?	53
II. NONDISCIPLINARY ACTIONS UNDER CHAPTER 75	53
III. ADVERSE ACTIONS: DEFINED AND DISTINGUISHED	54
A. THE “BOLLING CRITERIA”	55
IV. ADVERSE ACTIONS: THE LEGAL AND REGULATORY FRAMEWORK.....	55
V. ADVERSE ACTIONS: THE STATUTORY OUTLINE	56
VI. ADVERSE ACTIONS: GOVERNMENT-WIDE REGULATIONS	57
VII. ADVERSE ACTIONS: THE CONSTITUTIONAL RESTRICTIONS	58
VIII. COVERED ACTIONS AND EMPLOYEES.....	65
A. COVERED EMPLOYEES.....	66
B. THE ELECTION OF REMEDIES FOR COVERED BARGAINING UNIT EMPLOYEES	72
C. EMPLOYEES WITHOUT APPEAL RIGHTS	73
D. POSSIBLE CHALLENGES BY EMPLOYEES WHO LACK ORDINARY MSPB APPEAL RIGHTS	76
E. APPEALABLE ACTIONS TO THE MSPB AND EXCLUSIONS.....	77
1. MSPB-Covered Actions and Definitions.....	79
a. Removals	79
b. Suspensions for More Than 14 Days.....	79
(i) A Troublesome Issue: Is it One Appealable Suspension or Two or More Unappealable Suspensions.....	80
(ii) The Long Suspension	80
c. Reduction in Grade or Pay.....	81
d. Furlough	81
e. Constructive Adverse Actions: MSPB-Covered Actions in Disguise— Some Threshold Concerns	83
(i) Constructive Removals	86

(ii)	Constructive Suspensions	93
(iii)	Enforced Leave Suspensions	96
(iv)	Constructive Demotions	98
f.	Indefinite Suspensions	100
(i)	Notice Considerations.....	101
(ii)	Other Factors.....	102
(iii)	The Three Covered Situations.....	102
(iv)	Indefinite Suspensions Based on Pending Criminal Charges.....	102
F.	OTHER APPEAL ROUTES.....	105
IX.	THE PROOF REQUIREMENTS OF AN ADVERSE ACTION: CHARGE; NEXUS; PENALTY	106
A.	THE REASON FOR THE ADVERSE ACTION	106
B.	NEXUS.....	107
C.	PENALTY REASONABLENESS.....	116
X.	AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES.....	121
A.	HARMFUL PROCEDURAL ERROR	121
B.	PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICES	123
1.	Prohibited Discrimination.....	125
2.	Whistleblower Reprisal.....	134

CHAPTER 4: ADVERSE ACTIONS—THE AGENCY’S ADMINISTRATIVE PROCESS 143

I.	THE FUNDAMENTALS OF THE ADVERSE ACTION PROCESS.....	144
A.	INVESTIGATION: FACT-FINDING DRIVES EVERYTHING.....	147
1.	Agency Informal Investigations.....	147
2.	Management Inquiries and Administrative Investigations.....	148
3.	Privacy Act Restraints on Agency Investigations.....	149
4.	Agency Warnings and the Duty to Cooperate and Respond in an Agency Investigation; Some Situations Require Specific Care	151
5.	Right to Representation in Inquiry or Investigation.....	157
a.	Right to Representation in IG Investigations.....	158
6.	Workplace Searches	159
7.	Reporting Requirements and False Statements in Inquiries or Investigations.....	161
B.	CHARGES: THE MOST IMPORTANT THING	161
1.	Cause as Will Promote Service Efficiency Is the Sole “Statutory Charge” ..	162
2.	The Three Parts of a Charge.....	162
a.	The Label	163
b.	The Elements.....	163
c.	The Specification	163
3.	Structuring the Charge	164
4.	The Rules of Charging.....	164
5.	Notice: The Statutory Requirement	165
6.	The Golden Rule: The Rule Against Splitting	167
a.	Distinguishing Between Charges and Factual Narrative.....	167
7.	The Three Kinds of Charges.....	168
a.	The Specific Label Charge	168

b.	The Generic Charge	168
c.	The Narrative Charge	169
d.	Narrative and General Charges v. Specific Label Charges	170
8.	The Use of Alternative, Easier-to-Prove Charges.....	171
9.	A Few Key Charges.....	171
10.	The Complexity of Charging Revisited: Words Matter	176
11.	Keys to Picking the Right Charge	177
12.	Charge Framing Snafus: 11 Deadly Sins.....	178
C.	THE PROPOSAL: THE MOST IMPORTANT DOCUMENT.....	178
1.	Thirty Days Advance Notice; Seven Days to Respond	179
a.	Collapsing the Notice Period Under the Crime Provision	180
(i)	Reasonable Cause	180
b.	Indefinite Suspensions and the Crime Provision	181
2.	Status During Notice Period.....	182
3.	Content and Substance of the Proposal Notice	184
a.	The Specific Reasons and the Adequacy of Notice	184
b.	Amendments of the Proposal	186
c.	Nexus in the Proposal	186
d.	Penalty in the Proposal.....	186
e.	Material Relied Upon and the Proposal Notice.....	189
f.	Oral or Written Response	191
g.	Proposal Checklist	191
4.	Role of the Proposing Official	192
D.	RESPONSE PHASE: THE MOST IMPORTANT ENTITLEMENT.....	192
1.	The Operation of the Reply Process	195
a.	The Reply Official.....	195
b.	Scope of the Reply	197
(i)	Record of the Response.....	197
c.	Additional or Supplemental Investigation.....	197
E.	THE FINAL DECISION	199
1.	The Importance of the Final Decision.....	199
2.	The Regulatory Requirements.....	199
3.	The Final Decision and the Agency Charge(s).....	201
a.	The Final Decision and Lesser-Included Offenses	204
b.	The Final Decision and Prior Misconduct	204
c.	Amendment or Rescission	205
4.	The Final Decision and the Agency Penalty	206
a.	Penalty Advocacy and the Final Decision.....	210
(i)	The Essential Factors.....	211
(ii)	<i>Douglas</i> Factor Worksheet.....	213
b.	A Few Penalty Cases	214
5.	The Deciding Official.....	215
a.	Too Much Deciding Official Involvement	216
b.	<i>Ex parte</i> Contacts	217
c.	The Danger in Changing the Deciding Official.....	219
6.	Other Mistakes	221
F.	THE SHORT SUSPENSION.....	222

CHAPTER 5: PERFORMANCE-BASED ACTIONS 227

- I. CHAPTER 43 AND 5 CFR, PART 432—THE IMPORTANT TERMS AND DEFINITIONS 228
- II. EMPLOYEES COVERED 230
- III. PROCEDURAL RIGHTS..... 230
- IV. THE SUBSTANTIVE RIGHTS (OR WHAT THE AGENCY MUST PROVE IN A CHAPTER 43 ACTION)..... 233
 - A. WHETHER OPM APPROVED THE AGENCY’S PERFORMANCE APPRAISAL SYSTEM..... 234
 - B. WHETHER THE AGENCY COMMUNICATED TO THE APPELLANT THE PERFORMANCE STANDARDS AND CRITICAL ELEMENTS OF THE POSITION 237
 - C. WHETHER THE APPELLANT’S PERFORMANCE STANDARDS ARE VALID UNDER 5 USC 4302(B)(1) 238
 - 1. Objective Standards 239
 - a. The Nature of the Job..... 240
 - b. The Level at Which a Standard Is Written..... 240
 - c. The Problem With “Backwards” Standards..... 241
 - d. “Fleshing Out” Standards That Are Inadequately Written 242
 - 2. Realistic Standards..... 245
 - a. Absolute Standards 245
 - b. Unattainable Standards 247
 - D. WHETHER THE AGENCY WARNED THE APPELLANT OF THE INADEQUACIES OF HIS OR HER PERFORMANCE DURING THE APPRAISAL PERIOD AND GAVE HIM OR HER A REASONABLE OPPORTUNITY TO DEMONSTRATE ACCEPTABLE PERFORMANCE..... 251
 - E. WHETHER THE APPELLANT’S PERFORMANCE REMAINED UNACCEPTABLE IN ONE OR MORE OF THE CRITICAL ELEMENTS FOR WHICH HE OF SHE WAS PROVIDED AN OPPORTUNITY TO DEMONSTRATE ACCEPTABLE PERFORMANCE 255
 - 1. Reliance on Subelements..... 255
 - 2. Reliance on Evidence Outside the PIP and the Roller Coaster Employee 256
 - 3. Evidentiary Considerations..... 258
- V. SPECIAL PROCEDURES FOR VETERANS ADMINISTRATION EMPLOYEES (NON-SES)..... 260
- VI. SPECIAL PROCEDURES FOR SES EMPLOYEES (NON-VA) 262
- VII. AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES 263
- VIII. CHAPTER 43 OR CHAPTER 75? 265
- IX. SES EMPLOYEES 270
- X. SES EMPLOYEES AND THE VETERANS ADMINISTRATION 274

**CHAPTER 6: PERFORMANCE-BASED ACTIONS:
THE AGENCY’S ADMINISTRATIVE PROCESS 275**

- I. A PERFORMANCE APPRAISAL SYSTEM APPROVED BY OPM 275
- II. ESTABLISHMENT OF PERFORMANCE STANDARDS AND CRITICAL ELEMENTS AND COMMUNICATION OF THOSE TO THE EMPLOYEE 276

A.	EMPLOYEE PARTICIPATION.....	276
B.	ESTABLISHMENT OF STANDARDS.....	278
III.	COMMUNICATION OF PERFORMANCE STANDARDS TO EMPLOYEES.....	280
IV.	THE AGENCY HAS WARNED THE APPELLANT OF THE INADEQUACIES OF HIS PERFORMANCE DURING THE APPRAISAL PERIOD AND GIVEN THE EMPLOYEE A REASONABLE OPPORTUNITY TO DEMONSTRATE ACCEPTABLE PERFORMANCE.....	281
A.	CHAPTER 75 VERSUS CHAPTER 43.....	281
B.	NOTIFICATION OF UNACCEPTABLE PERFORMANCE.....	284
C.	THE PIP ITSELF.....	285
V.	ISSUANCE OF A PROPOSAL, THE EMPLOYEE'S REPLY AND THE AGENCY DECISION.....	287
A.	THE PROPOSAL.....	288
B.	THE EMPLOYEE'S REPLY.....	289
C.	AGENCY DECISION.....	290
VI.	THE POST-DECISION PROCESS.....	290
APPENDIX: TABLE OF CONTENTS.....		291
APPENDIX 1: SAMPLE OPPORTUNITY NOTICE—EXAMPLE ONE.....		293
APPENDIX 2: SAMPLE OPPORTUNITY NOTICE—EXAMPLE TWO.....		297
APPENDIX 3: SAMPLE PROPOSAL NOTICE.....		303
APPENDIX 4: SAMPLE DECISION NOTICE.....		307
APPENDIX 5: 5 CFR PART 752—ADVERSE ACTIONS.....		311
APPENDIX 6: 5 CFR PART 432—PERFORMANCE BASED REDUCTION IN GRADE AND REMOVAL ACTIONS.....		325
APPENDIX 7: 5 USC 7121, 7511, 7521, 7701–7703.....		335
APPENDIX 8: 85 FEDERAL REGISTER 65940–65988.....		359
TABLE OF CASES.....		463