

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION AND NEW DEVELOPMENTS	1
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. NEW CASE LAW	1
A. ALL-CIRCUIT REVIEW	1
B. ATTORNEY FEES	2
C. COMPENSATORY AND CONSEQUENTIAL DAMAGES	2
D. CLEAR AND CONVINCING EVIDENCE	3
E. CONTRIBUTING FACTOR	5
F. ELECTION	6
G. EXHAUSTION	6
H. JURISDICTION	6
I. NONFRIVOLOUS ALLEGATIONS	7
J. PERCEIVED CLAIMS	7
K. PERSONNEL ACTIONS	8
L. PROTECTED DISCLOSURES	8
M. SECTION 5 USC 2302(B)(9)(A)(I) CLAIMS	9
III. NEW LEGISLATION	11
IV. OTHER CURRENT DEVELOPMENTS	11
CHAPTER 2: OVERVIEW	13
I. INITIAL EFFORTS TO PROTECT FEDERAL EMPLOYEES	13
II. THE CSRA	13
III. THE WPA OF 1989	14
IV. THE 1994 AMENDMENTS	16
V. WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION ENHANCEMENT ACT OF 2012 (WPEA)	17
VI. THE NO FEAR ACT	20
VII. MORE RECENT LEGISLATION	20
VIII. OTHER STATUTES PROVIDING WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION	21
IX. USEFUL MSPB AND OSC REPORTS ON WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION	21
X. HOW THIS BOOK IS ORGANIZED	21
CHAPTER 3: OSC OPERATIONS	23
I. OSC RESPONSIBILITIES AND JURISDICTION	23
II. COMPLAINTS, DISCLOSURES, AND REFERRALS TO OSC	25
A. PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICE COMPLAINTS	25
B. REFERRALS FROM MSPB	33
C. OSC <i>SUA SPONTE</i>	34
III. PROCESSING PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICE COMPLAINTS (E.G., REPRISAL FOR WHISTLEBLOWING)	34
A. THE OSC STATUTORY FRAMEWORK FOR PROCESSING AND INVESTIGATING PPP COMPLAINTS	34
B. OSC'S FRAMEWORK FOR PROCESSING AND INVESTIGATING PPP COMPLAINTS	35
1. The Complaint, Investigatory Process and IRAs	38
2. ADR, Mediation	39
3. Investigating Prohibited Personnel Practice Complaints	40
a. Initial IPD Contacts	42
(i) OSC-54	42
(ii) Initial Assessment	43
(iii) Initial Discussion and Confidentiality	43
(iv) Initial Agency Contact and Agency Liaisons	44
b. The OSC Investigation and the Complainant: What to Do; What to Anticipate	46
c. The OSC Investigation and the Agency: What to Do; What to Anticipate	46
d. Agency Preparation for IPD Investigation	47
e. IPD Interviews of Agency Witnesses	47
f. Subject and Adverse Witness Interviews	51
g. Subject and Witness Rights in OSC Investigations	51

h.	Closing the Investigation	51
(i)	The Preliminary Determination	51
i.	The IPD Decision to Go Forward.....	52
C.	WHISTLEBLOWER DISCLOSURES TO OSC	52
1.	Processing Whistleblower Disclosures	58
CHAPTER 4: OSC AND THE MSPB—CORRECTIVE AND DISCIPLINARY ACTIONS		67
I.	CORRECTIVE, DISCIPLINARY AND OTHER OSC ACTION GENERALLY	67
A.	CORRECTIVE ACTIONS.....	68
B.	DISCIPLINARY ACTIONS.....	74
1.	When the Agency Takes Disciplinary Action	74
2.	Requirements, Procedures, and Process for a Disciplinary Action	75
a.	The Complaint.....	75
b.	The Rights and Entitlements of the Charged Official and the Answer	76
3.	Sanctions Against the Charged Official	77
4.	Discovery.....	77
5.	OSC’s Burden of Proof.....	78
a.	Element One: Authority of the Charged Official	79
b.	Element Two: Whether the Aggrieved Employee Made a Protected Disclosure	79
c.	Element Three: Charged Official’s Misuse of Authority	79
d.	Element Four: Nexus	80
6.	The Penalty.....	80
II.	OSC DISCIPLINARY AND AGENCY ADVERSE ACTIONS IN WHISTLEBLOWER REPRISAL CASES	82
III.	OSC REPORTS	82
CHAPTER 5: MSPB PROCESSING OF INDIVIDUALS’ REPRISAL AND OTHER PROTECTED ACTIVITY CLAIMS—OAS AND IRAS		85
I.	IRAS AND OAS	85
II.	SOME HISTORY	85
III.	THE OAA	86
IV.	THE IRA	86
A.	COVERED EMPLOYEES AND AGENCIES.....	87
B.	COVERED PERSONNEL ACTIONS.....	88
1.	Stays	89
2.	Time and Exhaustion	89
3.	No Front-End Time Requirement.....	90
4.	Premature IRAs	90
C.	THE CONTENTS OF THE OSC COMPLAINT	90
1.	The Adequate Basis Rule	90
D.	SOME UNIQUE ASPECTS OF AN IRA ACTION AT THE MSPB	91
1.	The Content of the IRA Appeal.....	92
2.	Appellant’s Jurisdictional Burden and the Pure IRA: Nonfrivolous Allegations.....	93
E.	THE MERITS HEARING	95
CHAPTER 6: WHISTLEBLOWER REPRISAL CLAIMS AND THE ELECTION OF A REMEDY		97
I.	AN ELECTION MUST BE KNOWING AND INFORMED	97
II.	A VALID ELECTION WILL LIMIT THE APPELLANT TO CERTAIN ISSUES	98
III.	HOW IS IT DETERMINED AS TO WHICH PROCESS IS ELECTED.....	98
IV.	WHAT ABOUT THE ADMINISTRATIVE GRIEVANCE PROCESS?	98
V.	THE NATURE OF THE PERSONNEL ACTION AND NOT WHETHER THE TERM “REPRISAL” OR “PROHIBITED PERSONNEL ACTION” IS USED DETERMINES WHETHER AN ELECTION HAS BEEN MADE.....	98
CHAPTER 7: STAYS		99
I.	STATUTORY AND REGULATORY GUIDANCE FOR INDIVIDUAL-APPELLANT STAYS	100
II.	A CLOSER SUBSTANTIVE LOOK AT APPELLANT STAY REQUESTS.....	103
A.	WHO MAY REQUEST A STAY	103
B.	WHEN TO FILE.....	104

C.	WHERE TO FILE.....	105
D.	HOW TO FILE.....	105
E.	WHAT TO FILE: THE GROUNDS FOR A STAY.....	106
F.	THE AGENCY RESPONSE.....	106
G.	STAY RULINGS: THE PROCEDURAL REQUIREMENTS.....	107
H.	STAY RULINGS: THE MERITS; GROUNDS FOR A STAY; THE ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK.....	107
I.	STAY DURATION; INTERIM COMPLIANCE.....	111
J.	CHALLENGING A STAY: BOARD REVIEW.....	111
III.	OSC STAY REQUESTS.....	114
A.	STATUTORY AND REGULATORY GUIDANCE FOR OSC STAYS.....	114
B.	OSC STAY REQUESTS: SUM AND SUBSTANCE.....	118
C.	THE INITIAL STAY.....	118
D.	STAY EXTENSIONS; AGENCY OPPORTUNITY TO COMMENT.....	120
E.	OSC STAY ACTIVITY.....	121
F.	THE ADVOCACY AND TACTICS IN STAY LITIGATION.....	132
IV.	THE VA ACCOUNTABILITY AND WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION ACT OF 2017: HOLDS, STAYS.....	133

CHAPTER 8: ELEMENTS OF A REPRISAL CLAIM MADE BY EMPLOYEES OR APPLICANTS — A PRIMER.....141

I.	IRAS AND OAAS.....	141
II.	COVERED IRA EMPLOYEES OR APPLICANTS.....	142
III.	THE COMMON ELEMENTS—PROTECTED DISCLOSURE, RETALIATORY RESULT.....	143
A.	ELEMENT (1)—A PROTECTED DISCLOSURE UNDER (B)(8) OR PROTECTED ACTIVITY UNDER (B)(9).....	145
1.	5 USC 2302(b)(8).....	145
2.	5 USC 2302(b)(9).....	146
B.	ELEMENT (2)—THE CONNECTION BETWEEN THE DISCLOSURE OR PROTECTED ACTIVITY AND THE PERSONNEL ACTION.....	147
IV.	IRA FILING REQUIREMENTS AND EXHAUSTION—ELEMENTS (3) AND (4).....	150
A.	CASES ABOUT EXHAUSTION AND FILING.....	150
V.	AGENCY BURDEN—“CLEAR AND CONVINCING EVIDENCE”.....	152

CHAPTER 9: A CLOSER LOOK AT THE ELEMENTS: PROTECTED DISCLOSURES AND PROTECTED ACTIVITY153

I.	THE FIRST ELEMENT—A PROTECTED DISCLOSURE.....	154
A.	CATEGORIES OF WHISTLEBLOWING.....	154
B.	NON FRIVOLOUS ALLEGATIONS.....	155
II.	THE REASONABLE BELIEF STANDARD.....	156
A.	ALLEGATIONS MUST BE DETAILED AND SPECIFIC.....	157
B.	FAILURE TO SEEK CLARIFICATION.....	158
C.	BELIEF SHARED BY OTHER EMPLOYEES.....	158
D.	EMPLOYEE’S RELIANCE ON REPORTS OF THOSE WHO ARE IN A POSITION TO KNOW.....	159
E.	EXPERTISE OR PERSONAL KNOWLEDGE OF WHISTLEBLOWER.....	159
1.	Cases Involving the Whistleblower’s Expertise or Personal Knowledge.....	159
F.	RESPONSE BY AGENCY TO DISCLOSURE.....	160
G.	RELIANCE ON HEARSAY OR RUMOR.....	160
H.	A SPECULATIVE BELIEF.....	160
I.	SPECIFIC CONDITION OF THE EMPLOYEE.....	160
J.	KNOWLEDGE AT TIME OF DISCLOSURE.....	161
K.	MOTIVATION IS NOT RELEVANT.....	161
III.	THE CATEGORIES OF WRONGDOING.....	162
A.	ANY VIOLATION OF ANY LAW, RULE, OR REGULATION.....	162
1.	Cases Involving “Violation of Any Law, Rule or Regulation” Claims.....	163
B.	ABUSE OF AUTHORITY.....	166
1.	Cases That Have Ruled on the “Abuse of Authority” Standard.....	167
C.	GROSS MISMANAGEMENT OR GROSS WASTE OF FUNDS.....	170
1.	Two Separate Categories but Substantial Similarities.....	170
2.	Debatable Differences Exception.....	171
3.	Recent Debatable Differences Cases Following the WPEA.....	172
4.	Gross Waste of Funds and Gross Mismanagement Cases.....	175

D.	A SUBSTANTIAL AND SPECIFIC DANGER TO PUBLIC HEALTH OR SAFETY	177
1.	Cases Involving “Substantial and Specific Danger to Public Health or Safety” Disclosures	180
2.	Cases in Which Appellants Were Not Successful in Proving a Reasonable Belief as to a Substantial and Specific Danger to Public Health or Safety Claim	181
IV.	PROTECTION WITHOUT A DISCLOSURE.....	182
A.	PERCEIVED WHISTLEBLOWER.....	182
B.	ASSOCIATION WITH A WHISTLEBLOWER	183

CHAPTER 10: WHEN A DISCLOSURE IS NOT A DISCLOSURE185

I.	PROHIBITED BY LAW OR EXECUTIVE ORDER.....	185
II.	DISCLOSURES OF INFORMATION IN THE “NORMAL COURSE OF DUTIES”	187

**CHAPTER 11: OTHER ASPECTS OF A PRIMA FACIE CASE:
A PERSONNEL ACTION AND A CONTRIBUTING FACTOR189**

I.	WHETHER THE AGENCY, BASED ON A PROTECTED DISCLOSURE, TOOK, FAILED TO TAKE, OR THREATENED TO TAKE A PERSONNEL ACTION.....	190
A.	A PERSONNEL ACTION	190
B.	CASES INVOLVING PERSONNEL ACTIONS	192
1.	The Broader Categories of Personnel Actions: 5 USC 2302(a)(2)(A)(ix) and (xii).....	192
a.	Cases Involving “Decisions Concerning Pay, Benefits, or Awards, or Concerning Education or Training if the Education or Training May Reasonably Be Expected to Lead to an Appointment, Promotion, Performance Evaluation, or Other Action Described”—5 USC 2302(a)(2)(A)(ix)	192
b.	Cases Involving “Any Other Significant Change in Duties, Responsibilities, or Working Conditions”—5 USC 2302(a)(2)(A)(xii)	192
2.	Other Cases Involving Actions Qualifying as “Personnel Actions”	193
3.	Other Cases Involving Actions Not Qualifying as “Personnel Actions”	195
C.	THE NEWEST “PERSONNEL ACTION”: NONDISCLOSURE REQUIREMENTS	196
D.	SECURITY CLEARANCE ACTIONS NOT COVERED AS PERSONNEL ACTIONS.....	196
E.	FAILURE TO TAKE A PERSONNEL ACTION	196
F.	THREATENING TO TAKE A PERSONNEL ACTION.....	197
G.	CONTRIBUTING FACTOR (WHETHER THE PERSONNEL ACTION WAS “BASED ON” A PROTECTED DISCLOSURE)	198
1.	Knowledge/Timing Test	200
a.	Timing	200
(i)	Cases in Which the Timing Standard Was Met.....	200
(ii)	Cases in Which the Timing Standard Was Not Met	201
b.	Knowledge	202
2.	Other Ways to Prove a Contributing Factor	203

**CHAPTER 12: THE AGENCY’S BURDEN: IT WOULD HAVE TAKEN THE ACTION
IN THE ABSENCE OF WHISTLEBLOWING OR PROTECTED ACTIVITY205**

I.	CLEAR AND CONVINCING EVIDENCE	205
A.	THE CARR FACTORS, BRIEFLY.....	205
B.	ANALYZING THE AGENCY’S BURDEN: <i>WHITMORE</i>	205
II.	THE CARR FACTORS ANALYSIS	207
A.	CARR FACTOR ONE: THE STRENGTH OF THE AGENCY’S EVIDENCE IN SUPPORT OF ITS PERSONNEL ACTION....	207
B.	CARR FACTOR TWO: THE EXISTENCE AND STRENGTH OF ANY MOTIVE TO RETALIATE ON THE PART OF THE AGENCY OFFICIALS WHO WERE INVOLVED IN THE DECISION	208
1.	Cases Illustrating Considerations in Determining Motive.....	208
C.	CARR FACTOR THREE: ANY EVIDENCE THAT THE AGENCY TAKES SIMILAR ACTIONS AGAINST EMPLOYEES WHO ARE NOT WHISTLEBLOWERS, BUT WHO ARE OTHERWISE SIMILARLY SITUATED	209
III.	CASES INVOLVING CLEAR AND CONVINCING DETERMINATION	210

CHAPTER 13: REMEDIES, DAMAGES, AND RELIEF219

I.	CORRECTIVE ACTION, IN GENERAL.....	219
II.	TRANSFER PREFERENCE	220
III.	ATTORNEY FEES	221
IV.	MAKE WHOLE RELIEF	225

V.	COMPENSATORY AND CONSEQUENTIAL DAMAGES.....	226
A.	PROCESS, PROCEDURE.....	232
B.	BOARD CASE LAW ON CONSEQUENTIAL DAMAGES.....	233
VI.	INTERIM RELIEF.....	241

CHAPTER 14: ADMINISTRATIVE AND JUDICIAL REVIEW245

I.	PETITIONS FOR REVIEW.....	247
II.	JUDICIAL REVIEW.....	250
A.	REVIEW OF IRAS OR OAAS.....	251
B.	REVIEW OF MSPB DECISIONS ON OSC DISCIPLINARY AND CORRECTIVE ACTIONS.....	252
1.	Disciplinary Actions.....	252
2.	Corrective Actions.....	252
III.	REVIEW OF AN ARBITRATOR’S DECISION ON A WHISTLEBLOWER REPRISAL OR PROTECTED ACTIVITY CLAIM.....	252

**CHAPTER 15: INTELLIGENCE COMMUNITY WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTIONS:
FROM THE 1998 ICWPA TO THE PRESIDENTIAL POLICY DIRECTIVE
(PPD)-19253**

I.	STATUTORY EXCLUSIONS.....	253
II.	THE MODEST EXCEPTION.....	253
III.	THE HISTORY AND SCOPE OF INTELLIGENCE COMMUNITY COVERAGE.....	254
A.	INTELLIGENCE COMMUNITY WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION ACT (ICWPA) OF 1998.....	254
B.	INTELLIGENCE AUTHORIZATION ACT (IAA) FOR FISCAL YEAR 2010 (50 USC 3033).....	254
C.	PRESIDENTIAL POLICY DIRECTIVE (PPD)-19.....	255
1.	The Important Definitions.....	255
a.	Covered Employees and “Intelligence Community Element”.....	255
b.	Personnel Action.....	256
c.	Protected Disclosure.....	256
2.	Prohibited Retaliation in the Intelligence Community.....	256
3.	Prohibited Retaliation Affecting Eligibility for Access to Classified Information.....	256
4.	IG External Review Panel.....	257
5.	Issuance of Policies and Procedures and Notice to Employees.....	257
6.	Review of Regulations Implementing 5 USC 2303.....	258
7.	General Provisions.....	258
D.	TITLE VI OF THE INTELLIGENCE AUTHORIZATION ACT (IAA) FOR FISCAL YEAR 2014 AND BEYOND.....	258

APPENDIX: TABLE OF CONTENTS259

APPENDIX 1: 5 USC 1201–1222261

APPENDIX 2: 5 USC 2301–2304283

APPENDIX 3: 5 USC 7501–7543301

APPENDIX 4: 5 USC 7701–7703313

APPENDIX 5: 5 CFR 1201321

APPENDIX 6: 5 CFR 1209.....369

APPENDIX 7: 5 CFR 1800–1850375

APPENDIX 8: WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION ENHANCEMENT ACT OF 2012.....397

APPENDIX 9: PRESIDENTIAL POLICY DIRECTIVE – PPD-19409

APPENDIX 10: DR. CHRIS KIRKPATRICK WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION ACT OF 2017 ..417

APPENDIX 11: OSC FORM 14425

TABLE OF CASES.....475