

# SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

## VOLUME I

PREFACE .....	i
CHAPTER 1: MSPB STRUCTURE AND JURISDICTION.....	1
CHAPTER 2: APPEAL AND DISCOVERY.....	793
CHAPTER 3: HEARING.....	1205
CHAPTER 4: EVIDENCE.....	1335
CHAPTER 5: INITIAL DECISION AND PETITION FOR REVIEW.....	1487
CHAPTER 6: ADVERSE ACTIONS .....	1741
CHAPTER 7: NEXUS AND MITIGATION .....	2129
CHAPTER 8: SUBSTANTIVE OFFENSES.....	2261

## VOLUME II

CHAPTER 9: PERFORMANCE CASES .....	2679
CHAPTER 10: REDUCTIONS IN FORCE.....	2789
CHAPTER 11: HARMFUL ERROR.....	2931
CHAPTER 12: DISCRIMINATION .....	3095
CHAPTER 13: PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICES.....	3349
CHAPTER 14: RETIREMENT AND RESTORATION RIGHTS.....	3781
CHAPTER 15: ATTORNEY FEES.....	4203
CHAPTER 16: SETTLEMENT, REMEDIES, AND ENFORCEMENT .....	4407
CHAPTER 17: JUDICIAL REVIEW.....	4799
CHAPTER 18: RESEARCH, REFERENCE MATERIALS, AND FORMS.....	5017
BIBLIOGRAPHY .....	5039
TABLE OF CASES .....	5047
INDEX .....	5197



# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## VOLUME I

PREFACE .....	i
CHAPTER 1: MSPB STRUCTURE AND JURISDICTION.....	1
I. REFORM ACT.....	1
A. CAPSULE HISTORY .....	1
B. OFFICE OF SPECIAL COUNSEL .....	3
II. MSPB ORGANIZATION AND ADMINISTRATIVE OPERATION.....	4
A. IMPARTIAL ADJUDICATION .....	5
1. <i>De Novo</i> Review of Agency Actions .....	6
a. Deference to OPM Regulations .....	7
b. Consideration of Agency Regulations .....	8
2. Prohibition Against Advisory Opinion; Internal Guidance; Request for Advisory Opinion .....	8
B. ORGANIZATION .....	9
1. Clerk .....	11
2. Office of Appeals Counsel .....	11
C. ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGES .....	14
1. Delegations of Authority .....	14
a. Administrative Law Judges Adjudicating Specialized Cases .....	15
b. <i>Judges' Handbook</i> ; Internal Guidance.....	15
2. Qualifications, Performance Standards for Administrative Judge.....	15
a. Judges' Position Description, Performance Standards .....	15
b. Regional Director (Chief Administrative Judge) Position Description and SES Performance Plan.....	17
3. Regulatory Responsibilities of Judge.....	18
a. Waiver of Procedural Regulations .....	18
4. Quality Review .....	19
D. BOARD DECISIONS; PRECEDENTIAL SIGNIFICANCE .....	19
1. Nonprecedential Final Orders.....	20
2. Arbitration Award.....	21
E. CASES OF PARTICULAR SIGNIFICANCE .....	21
1. Sensitive, Public Interest Appeal .....	21
2. Referral to OPM, OSC .....	21
F. MSPB RECORDS .....	21
1. Gaining Access; Review Procedure .....	25
2. Precluding Access .....	25
a. Redaction of Initial Decision .....	25
b. Sealing of Record or Files .....	25
c. Attempt to Preclude Publication of Decision.....	28
d. Expungement of Record .....	29
e. Classified Information .....	29
G. RULEMAKING PETITIONS.....	30
H. RESPONSIBILITY OF PARTIES IN MSPB CASES .....	30
III. JURISDICTIONAL OVERVIEW .....	30
A. SOURCES OF JURISDICTION .....	32
1. Original Jurisdiction Cases.....	33
2. Jurisdiction Through Agency Regulation .....	33
3. Appealable Actions .....	33
a. Adverse Action .....	34
b. Performance-Based Action .....	35
c. Demonstration Project .....	35
B. PRELIMINARY APPELLATE JURISDICTIONAL ANALYSIS .....	36
1. Lack of Jurisdiction; Failure to State a Claim .....	37
IV. EMPLOYEES WHO MAY APPEAL; APPEALABLE ISSUES .....	38
A. NATURE OF CIVIL SERVICE APPOINTMENTS .....	39
B. CONCEPTS COMMON TO DEFINITION OF "EMPLOYEE" FOR COMPETITIVE AND EXCEPTED SERVICE .....	40

1.	Current Continuous Service .....	40
a.	Break in Service .....	41
b.	Service During Detail or in Acting Position.....	45
2.	Not Serving a Probationary or Trial Period Under an Initial Appointment.....	46
3.	Counting Service Time in a Prior Position or Appointment; <i>McCormick</i> .....	46
a.	Time in Nonpermanent Appointment as a Component of Current Continuous Service.....	53
C.	COMPETITIVE SERVICE EMPLOYEES .....	58
1.	Other Than a Temporary Appointment Limited to One Year or Less.....	60
D.	EXCEPTED SERVICE EMPLOYEES.....	62
1.	1990 Civil Service Due Process Amendments; Nonpreference Eligible Employees.....	62
a.	Excepted Service Employees Excluded From Due Process Amendments.....	63
2.	Preference Eligible Status.....	69
a.	Documentation.....	74
b.	Disabled Veteran.....	75
c.	Derivative Preference Eligible Status.....	75
3.	Effect of Grievance Settlement; Collective Bargaining Contract .....	77
4.	Period of Non-Pay Status.....	77
5.	Same or Similar Position .....	78
a.	Factual Dispute Concerning Similarity of Positions .....	84
b.	In an Executive Agency .....	87
6.	Appointment Pending Conversion to Competitive Service .....	91
E.	DETERMINATION OF PROBATION .....	94
1.	Probationary Classification Problems.....	94
a.	Appointment From Register .....	94
b.	Transfer .....	96
c.	Temporary Appointment Pending Establishment of a Register (TAPER).....	97
d.	Career Reinstatement .....	97
2.	Calculating Year of Service.....	99
a.	Incorrect Determination of End of First Year of Employment .....	101
b.	Effective Time and Date of Inexplicit Termination Notice .....	105
c.	Significance of SF-50; Unclear Appointment Date.....	105
d.	WAE Appointment .....	106
e.	Military Service.....	106
3.	Tacking of Prior Service: Competitive Service Probation.....	108
a.	Same Agency .....	114
b.	Same Line of Work.....	114
4.	Agreement to Serve Probationary Period; Waiver of Preexisting Appeal Right .....	117
5.	Imposition of Probation Following Break in Service .....	120
6.	Representation by Agency That Probation Is Not Required; Equitable Estoppel .....	120
a.	Lack of Notice of Probationary Period .....	121
b.	Creation of Probationary Period Not Required by Statute or Regulation .....	121
F.	APPEAL RIGHTS OF PROBATIONER.....	123
1.	Appeal of Probationary Termination.....	124
a.	Actions Other Than Termination.....	125
2.	Classification of Probationers and Their Appeals .....	126
a.	Competitive Service Term Appointee; Trial Period.....	126
b.	Probationary Supervisor .....	127
3.	Jurisdictional Issue; Right to Hearing.....	131
a.	Effect of Collective Bargaining Agreement; Agency Regulation.....	133
b.	Other Contract.....	133
c.	Harmful Error Analysis; <i>Stephen</i> .....	133
d.	Relation to Suitability Determination .....	135
4.	Preappointment Conditions .....	139
a.	Harmful Error Analysis: Lack of Proper Advance Notice, Other Procedural Error .....	139
b.	Entitlement to Hearing.....	144
c.	Measure of Substantive Review .....	145
5.	Postappointment Reasons.....	145
a.	Pre- and Postappointment Distinctions.....	145
6.	Defective or Untimely Termination Notice .....	151
a.	Termination by Unauthorized Official.....	152
7.	Discrimination and Partisan Politics.....	153

a.	Nonfrivolous Allegations .....	153
b.	Partisan Political Reason .....	155
c.	Marital Status .....	157
d.	Other Discrimination .....	164
8.	Constitutional Claim .....	164
9.	Involuntary Resignation.....	166
G.	LOSS OF APPEAL RIGHTS BY CHANGE IN POSITION.....	166
1.	Movement Between Positions in Same Agency; Lack of Notice of Requirement of Probation.....	166
a.	Movement to Position Through Settlement Agreement .....	174
2.	Movement From One Agency to Another; Transfer; Lack of Notice of Requirement of Probation .....	174
H.	TEMPORARY AND TERM APPOINTMENTS .....	177
1.	Competitive Service Temporary, Term Appointees .....	180
2.	Excepted Service Preference Eligible Temporary Appointees .....	186
3.	Excepted Service Nonpreference Eligible Temporary Appointees.....	186
4.	Particular Temporary or Irregular Schedule Appointments.....	186
a.	TAPER .....	186
b.	Seasonal; On-Call .....	186
c.	Intermittent .....	190
d.	Full-Time/Part-Time.....	191
e.	Postal Service Light Duty.....	192
f.	Indefinite Appointment .....	192
g.	Federal Career Intern Program .....	192
h.	Student Temporary Employment Program; Student Career Experience Program .....	198
5.	Jurisdictional Effect of Lapse of Term or Temporary Appointment .....	199
6.	Appeal Right if Termination Occurs Before End of Expiration of Limited Appointment.....	201
I.	PARTICULAR APPOINTMENTS.....	202
1.	Nonappropriated Fund .....	202
2.	Veterans Readjustment Act .....	203
3.	Reemployed Annuitant.....	207
a.	Exceptions.....	210
4.	Senior Executive Service.....	211
5.	Administrative Law Judge.....	211
6.	Disabled Employee.....	211
7.	Employees in Confidential, Policy-Making, Policy-Determining Positions; Presidential Appointee.....	215
a.	White House, Executive Office of the President Employees .....	218
8.	Alien; Noncitizen .....	218
9.	Students.....	219
10.	Judicial Branch .....	220
11.	Government Corporation.....	222
12.	Postal Service .....	222
a.	One Year of Qualifying Service; Current Continuous Service in Same or Similar Position .....	226
b.	Postal Supervisors, Managers .....	232
c.	Postal Personnel Officials, Confidential Employees .....	237
d.	Postal Service Employees Who Lack Preference Eligibility, Have No Negotiated Grievance Procedures, and Who Are Neither Managers nor Personnelists .....	242
13.	Contractors.....	244
14.	Others.....	245
J.	AGENCIES WITH SPECIALIZED PERSONNEL SYSTEMS: MSPB JURISDICTIONAL EXCLUSIONS AND MODIFICATIONS ....	246
1.	Department of Homeland Security .....	246
a.	Human Resources Management System's Rise and Demise .....	246
b.	Transportation Security Agency: Screeners; Other Employees .....	246
(i)	Probationer .....	249
(ii)	Other TSA Employees.....	250
c.	RIF.....	254
2.	Federal Aviation Administration.....	254
a.	2012 Legislation Restoring Back Pay Authority as a Component of MSPB Jurisdiction .....	256
b.	2000 Legislation Restoring MSPB Jurisdiction; Back Pay Issues .....	257
c.	1996 Legislation Removing MSPB Jurisdiction.....	264
3.	Department of Defense National Security Personnel System .....	264
4.	District of Columbia .....	265
5.	Central Intelligence Agency; Defense Department Intelligence; Other Intelligence or Security Agencies.....	265

6.	Federal Bureau of Investigation .....	267
7.	Canal Zone.....	267
8.	National Archives .....	267
9.	National Guard Technicians.....	267
10.	Tennessee Valley Authority Employees.....	269
11.	Library of Congress; GAO; Congressional Employees .....	269
a.	Ramspeck Act .....	269
12.	Smithsonian Institution .....	270
13.	Bureau of Indian Affairs.....	270
14.	MSPB Employees .....	270
15.	Department of Veterans Affairs.....	270
a.	USERRA Coverage.....	276
b.	Actions Against Healthcare Professionals Not Involving Professional Conduct or Competence.....	276
(i)	Involuntary Retirement, Resignation.....	277
c.	Veterans Canteen Service .....	280
16.	Agriculture: Stabilization and Conservation Service; Cooperative Extension Services .....	282
17.	Department of Defense Education Activity.....	282
18.	Office of Independent Counsel.....	283
19.	Foreign Service.....	283
20.	World Bank .....	284
K.	NATURE OF PERSONNEL ACTION APPEALED.....	284
1.	Possible Adverse Action; Proposal .....	285
2.	Suspension .....	285
a.	Paper Suspension .....	285
b.	Consolidation of Short Suspensions.....	286
c.	Calculating Duration of Suspension .....	287
d.	Erroneous Imposition of Suspension Exceeding 14 Days .....	288
e.	Indefinite Suspension .....	288
3.	Position Change; Nonselection.....	289
a.	Rank Reduction .....	290
b.	Nonselection .....	290
c.	Loss of Promotion or Earnings Opportunities; Change in Work Schedule .....	292
d.	Disciplinary Reassignment; Unified Penalties .....	294
4.	Pay and Benefits; Classification; Debt; Leave .....	295
a.	Classification .....	296
b.	Pay System Conversion; Grade Reduction .....	297
c.	Correction of Pay, Grade .....	301
d.	Reduction in Pay; Locality Pay Issue; Pay System Change; Failure to Obtain Pay Increase.....	307
e.	Misrepresentation Concerning Pay Rates .....	312
f.	Termination of Premium Pay; Bonus; LEAPA; Seniority, Overtime Adjustments .....	313
g.	Retirement Credit, Contributions, and Incentives; Individual Retirement Record.....	318
h.	Debt Collection, Recoupment: Agency, OPM Involvement .....	319
i.	Leave Dispute; Administrative Leave; Notice, Investigation Leave .....	322
j.	Pay and Compensation Claims: Role of OPM .....	326
5.	Severance Pay.....	327
6.	Promotion Claim .....	327
a.	Termination of Temporary Promotion .....	328
b.	Lower Graded Position Through Return Right—Overseas Employee .....	329
7.	Back Pay Dispute .....	330
a.	Retirement Payment .....	330
8.	Resignation.....	330
a.	Abandonment of Position .....	330
9.	Mandatory Retirement .....	331
10.	OWCP Benefits .....	332
11.	Insurance Programs.....	333
12.	Requests for Reinstatement: Non-Military Personnel.....	339
a.	Failure to Rehire .....	340
b.	Reinstatement Rights—Occupational Illness or Injury; Others.....	340
13.	Performance Standard; Rating; PIP .....	341
14.	Prohibited Personnel Practices; Allegations of Discrimination .....	341
15.	Merit System Principles Violations .....	344

16. Constitutional Violation .....	345
17. Miscellaneous Issues .....	348
L. EFFECT OF COLLECTIVE BARGAINING AGREEMENT GRIEVANCE OR RELATED PROCEDURES; 5 USC 7121 .....	349
1. Postal Service Employees .....	353
a. Effect of EEO Allegation or EEO Complaint .....	354
2. Administrative Grievance System .....	354
3. Statutory Grievance System; Foreign Service Grievance Board .....	355
4. Employee Choice: Adverse Action; Performance Case .....	355
5. Collective Bargaining Contract Exclusivity .....	355
a. Appeal Right With EEO Allegation .....	357
b. USERRA Claim .....	360
c. RIF .....	363
d. Acceptable Level of Competence Determination; Within-Grade Increase .....	365
6. Problems Arising From Choice of Collective Bargaining Contract Procedure .....	365
a. Incorrect or Inadequate Advice From Agency .....	365
b. Dispute Over Bargaining Unit Status or Arbitrability; Ineffective Elections; Cross-Filing; Withdrawal of Grievance .....	367
c. Defunct Union .....	369
d. Union Action on Behalf of Employee .....	371
e. What Constitutes Filing of Grievance .....	374
f. Premature Elections .....	374
g. Belated Grievance .....	375
h. Failure to Obtain Arbitration Hearing .....	376
7. Indefinite Suspension .....	378
8. Appeal Right With Arbitration Award; Employees of Agencies Other Than Postal Service .....	379
9. Unfair Labor Practice Charge .....	380
M. GRADE AND PAY RETENTION .....	382
1. <i>Atwell</i> .....	384
a. Restoration Action .....	386
2. Absence of Retention; Benefits Declined .....	386
3. Appeal of RIF; Classification .....	387
4. Termination of Pay Retention .....	389
V. APPEAL RIGHTS BASED ON MILITARY SERVICE AND VETERANS PREFERENCE .....	389
A. REGULATIONS GOVERNING USERRA, VEOA CLAIMS .....	394
B. JUDGE'S RESPONSIBILITY .....	396
C. HEARING ENTITLEMENT; BOARD DISPOSITION .....	397
D. EXCLUSIVITY OF VEOA OR USERRA APPEAL; JOINDER OF CLAIMS .....	401
E. UNIFORMED SERVICE EMPLOYMENT AND REEMPLOYMENT RIGHTS ACT .....	401
1. USERRA Statutory Structure .....	406
a. Related EEO Violation; Prohibited Personnel Practice Allegation .....	411
b. Affirmative Defense .....	414
2. Time for USERRA Appeal .....	414
a. Laches .....	416
b. Waiver of Right to Appeal .....	417
3. Permissive Exhaustion of Labor Department Remedy .....	418
4. Liberal Pleading Standard .....	421
a. Nonfrivolous Jurisdictional Allegations .....	426
b. Summary Disposition of Claim .....	427
5. Burden of Proof .....	427
a. Analysis of Alleged Discrimination or Reprisal Based on Military Service .....	432
b. Reprisal Against the Exercise of USERRA Rights .....	436
c. Circumstantial Evidence; Statistics .....	437
d. Discrimination Motivated by Lower-Level Supervisor; Cat's Paw .....	440
e. Disability Incurred While in Military Service .....	442
f. Disparate Impact Theory Inapplicable .....	443
6. Recovery Period .....	445
a. Nonretroactive Substantive Application .....	447
b. Vietnam Era Veterans' Readjustment Assistance Act of 1974 .....	450
7. Covered Personnel; Agencies .....	451
a. Contractor Employee .....	456
b. Relatives of Service Members .....	458



8.	Military Restoration Rights .....	458
a.	National Guard Return Rights; 38 USC 2024(d) .....	462
b.	Length of Service Before Loss of Restoration Right .....	467
c.	Conditions of Discharge From Military Service .....	467
d.	Effect of Release From Service for Disability.....	468
e.	Delay in Requesting Restoration Following Military Service.....	471
f.	Elimination of Position Through RIF .....	472
9.	Other Personnel Action, Benefits .....	473
a.	Dismissal From Employment; Demotion; Abandonment of Civilian Career .....	473
b.	Constructive Adverse Action .....	479
c.	Suspension .....	479
d.	Failure to Appoint.....	479
e.	Failure to Consider Employee for Vacant Positions; Nonpromotion; Manipulation or Abolition of Positions.....	485
f.	Denial of Priority Consideration .....	488
g.	Performance Appraisal .....	488
h.	Noncompetitive Promotion; Bid Assignment; Escalator Principle; Interim Promotion.....	489
i.	Reassignment .....	496
j.	Retirement Benefits .....	497
k.	Education Benefits .....	497
l.	Military Leave; <i>Butterbaugh</i> .....	498
m.	Charge to Leave .....	506
n.	Harassment; Hostile Working Environment.....	506
o.	Change in Employment Status; Reemployment; Benefits Following Restoration to Duty.....	510
p.	Ready Reserve Status .....	518
F.	VETERANS EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITIES ACT .....	518
1.	Statutory Structure .....	521
a.	Burden of Proof .....	522
b.	Related EEO Violation, Prohibited Personnel Practice, Other Challenges.....	523
2.	Covered Personnel.....	524
a.	Assignment to Training .....	526
b.	Disabled Veteran.....	528
3.	Student, Intern Recruitment Programs .....	528
a.	Federal Career Intern Program .....	528
b.	Outstanding Scholar Program .....	537
c.	Pathways, Recent Graduates Program .....	543
4.	Particular Agencies; Positions.....	549
a.	Postal Service .....	549
b.	Foreign Service.....	550
c.	Nonappropriated Fund .....	552
d.	Public Health Service.....	553
e.	Statutory Exclusions .....	553
f.	VA Medical Professionals .....	553
g.	FAA, TSA Employees .....	554
h.	National Guard Technicians .....	556
i.	Title 10 Intelligence Position .....	556
5.	Definition of Agency .....	557
6.	Time for VEOA Appeal .....	559
7.	Mandatory Exhaustion of DOL Remedy; Time for Complaint.....	560
a.	Specificity Required for DOL Complaint .....	564
b.	Equitable Tolling of DOL Time Limit; Waiver of Administrative Exhaustion Requirement.....	565
c.	Effect of Settlement Reached by DOL.....	576
d.	Termination of Proceedings to Pursue Case in Court.....	576
8.	Liberal Pleading Standard.....	577
9.	Basis for Veterans Preference .....	579
a.	Excepted Service Position; "Positive Factor"; Attorneys.....	581
10.	Application of Veterans Preference to Appointment Process.....	595
a.	Necessity for Application.....	596
b.	Appointment Through Reinstatement.....	597
c.	Impact of Collective Bargaining Agreement .....	597
d.	Background Investigation .....	599
e.	Failure to Provide Proper Veterans Preference.....	599



f.	Use of Improper Appointment Authority.....	601
g.	Manipulation of Appointments; Cancellation of Vacancy.....	602
h.	Geographic Extent of Competition.....	611
i.	Category Rating System.....	611
j.	Rule of Three.....	614
11.	Qualifications for Position; Exclusion From Consideration; Consideration of Experience.....	616
a.	Education.....	626
b.	Time-In-Grade.....	627
c.	Medical Fitness.....	629
d.	Age Limit on Appointment.....	629
e.	Consideration for Position but Nonselection; Limitation on Consideration Imposed by the Applicant.....	634
f.	Improper Assessment of Qualifications.....	636
12.	Appointment and Promotion Processes Challenges.....	638
a.	Competitive Appointment Procedures; Exceptions to Competitive Requirements.....	638
b.	Merit Promotion With Internal Candidates Only; Reassignment; Reinstatement.....	643
c.	Merit Promotion, Open to External Candidates; Canceled Announcement; "Right to Compete" Claim.....	645
d.	Position Announced Under Both Open Competition and Merit Promotion Procedures.....	655
e.	Veterans Readjustment Authority Appointment.....	660
13.	Remedial Structure; Reconstruction of Selection Process; Removal of Selectee.....	662
a.	Passover.....	674
b.	Mootness; Review of Agency-Initiated Reconstruction Effort.....	679
14.	Damages, Performance Award.....	680
15.	Disciplinary Case.....	685
16.	Reassignment; Transfer.....	685
17.	Retirement Benefit.....	687
18.	Other Benefits.....	687
VI.	SUITABILITY DETERMINATION.....	687
A.	APPELLATE PROCEDURES.....	692
B.	APPLICATION TO COMPETITIVE SERVICE APPOINTEES.....	693
1.	Employees Serving in Probationary or Trial Periods.....	694
C.	SUITABILITY DETERMINATIONS BY AGENCIES OPERATING UNDER AUTHORITY DELEGATED BY OPM.....	694
1.	Evidence of Material, Intentional False Statement, or Deception or Fraud.....	696
2.	Constructive Suitability Determination.....	698
3.	Nonselection for Position; Constructive Suitability Determination Under Delegated Authority.....	699
a.	Decisions Under OPM Regulations Predating 2008.....	705
4.	Impact of 2008 OPM Suitability Regulations.....	711
D.	ADJUDICATION STANDARDS.....	712
1.	Mitigation; EEO Defenses.....	715
2.	Disparate Treatment.....	715
3.	Rehabilitation.....	716
E.	EVIDENCE.....	716
1.	Collateral Estoppel; <i>Res Judicata</i> .....	718
F.	BASES FOR SUITABILITY DETERMINATIONS.....	719
1.	Falsification of Employment Document.....	719
2.	Drug Involvement.....	720
3.	Post-Appointment Conduct.....	720
4.	Criminal or Dishonest Conduct.....	723
5.	Other Problems.....	724
G.	REMEDIES.....	724
1.	Mootness.....	726
H.	RELATION OF SUITABILITY AND PASSOVER DETERMINATIONS.....	726
I.	RELATION OF OPM-DIRECTED SUITABILITY REMOVAL AND ADVERSE ACTION APPEAL RIGHTS, MITIGATION ANALYSIS; <i>AGUZIE</i> .....	728
VII.	OPM REGULATION REVIEW; CHALLENGES TO AGENCY IMPLEMENTATION OF OPM REGULATIONS; CHALLENGES TO OPM EMPLOYMENT PRACTICES.....	738
A.	REGULATION AND REGULATION IMPLEMENTATION REVIEW PROCEDURES.....	738
1.	General Criteria for Regulation Review and Regulation Implementation Review.....	739
a.	Distinction Between Regulation Review, Implementation Review.....	743
2.	Pleading Requirements; Scope of Review.....	743
a.	Discretionary Review; Likelihood of Success.....	745
b.	Likelihood of Harm.....	745

c.	Likelihood Issues Will Be Addressed in a Different MSPB Appeal or a Different Forum.....	745
d.	Standing; “Interested Person” .....	747
e.	Covered Personnel Action.....	747
3.	Examples of Regulation Review .....	748
a.	Administrative Law Judge Examination Authority .....	748
b.	SES Reassignment, Work Schedule .....	748
c.	Administration of Leave .....	749
d.	OPM Qualification Standards.....	749
e.	Scope of Administrative Grievance Procedure .....	750
f.	Other Issues .....	751
4.	Examples of Regulation Implementation Review.....	752
a.	SES Performance Appraisal Dispute .....	753
B.	EMPLOYMENT PRACTICE CHALLENGES .....	755
1.	Time and Place for Filing Appeal .....	760
2.	Agency Misapplication of Valid OPM Requirement; Agency Employment Practices; Nonselections .....	761
3.	Standing to Raise Challenge .....	765
4.	General Characteristics of Tests Rather Than Individual Examination Results.....	767
5.	Failure to Hire.....	767
6.	Scope of Competition.....	768
7.	Position Qualification Standard; Educational Requirement .....	769
8.	Medical and Physical Qualification Requirements.....	775
9.	OPM Involvement in Agency Selection .....	776
10.	Selection and Examination Practices for Administrative Law Judges.....	779
a.	Rule of Three.....	785
11.	Passover Determination .....	787
12.	Time-In-Grade Restriction.....	788
13.	Eligibility Rating and Suitability Determination .....	790
14.	Failure to Promote .....	790
15.	Remedy .....	790
VIII.	CHALLENGES TO ADVERSE PERSONNEL RECORDS NOTATIONS.....	790

## CHAPTER 2: APPEAL AND DISCOVERY ..... 793

I.	INITIATING AN APPEAL.....	793
A.	RULES AND PRACTICES OF GENERAL APPLICATION GOVERNING APPEALS .....	793
1.	Dates of Filing .....	793
2.	Service of Pleadings .....	793
3.	Filing Regulation; Electronic Filing; Technical Difficulties.....	794
4.	MSPB Processing of Appeal .....	799
B.	TIME FOR FILING APPEAL .....	800
1.	Treatment of Timeliness Issues .....	801
2.	Jurisdiction or Timeliness as Alternate Bases for Dismissal of Appeal .....	802
3.	Time to Appeal; Regulatory Provisions; Computation of Time.....	804
a.	Allegations of Discrimination—Mixed Case.....	805
b.	Effect of Collective Bargaining Contract Grievance Procedure .....	805
c.	Computation of Time .....	806
d.	Technical Constructions.....	806
e.	Request for Extension of Time to Appeal .....	807
4.	Suspension Appeals.....	807
a.	Indefinite Suspension; Enforced Leave.....	808
5.	Individual Right of Action Appeals .....	811
6.	USERRA Appeal.....	812
7.	Negative OPM Reconsideration Decision Appeal .....	812
a.	Failure to Seek Timely Reconsideration; Requests to Extend Time to Request Reconsideration .....	815
b.	Board Appeal With Belated Receipt of Reconsideration Request.....	821
c.	Relation Between Scope of Reconsideration Request and Appeal.....	821
d.	Failure of OPM to Act on Reconsideration Request; Failure of OPM to Advise of Reconsideration Right .....	821
e.	Overpayment Determinations .....	826
8.	Law Enforcement Officer Retirement Credit Appeal.....	827
C.	METHOD AND PLACE OF FILING .....	828
1.	Method of Filing .....	829
a.	Mail.....	829

b.	Significance of Postmark: Presumptive Filing Date.....	829
c.	Significance of Actual Mailing Date; Mailstream Rule: Actual Filing Date .....	829
d.	Commercial Delivery .....	830
e.	Facsimile .....	830
f.	Personal Delivery .....	830
g.	Electronic Filing.....	831
2.	Irregular and Misdirected Filings.....	831
a.	Appeal To or From Congressional Office.....	831
b.	Misfiled Mixed Case Appeal .....	832
c.	Non-Mixed Appeal Filed With Employing Agency .....	834
d.	Appeal Misdirected Within MSPB, to OPM, or to OSC .....	834
e.	Incomplete Appeal .....	835
D.	PREMATURE APPEALS .....	835
1.	Abeyance Arrangement.....	836
2.	Premature Appeal That Ripens Into Appealable Action During Regional Adjudication or During PFR .....	837
3.	Retirement Appeal.....	838
4.	Mixed and Whistleblowing Cases; Actions Initiated in Court .....	840
E.	TIMELINESS OF APPEALS .....	841
1.	Judge’s Responsibility to Provide Notice Concerning a Timeliness Issue .....	842
a.	Mental or Physical Illness; <i>Lacy</i> Notice .....	844
b.	Duty of Appellant to Produce Evidence Concerning Timeliness .....	846
c.	Duty of Agency and Judge to Produce and Develop Evidence Concerning Timeliness .....	847
2.	Waiver; <i>Alonzo</i> .....	849
a.	Prejudice to Respondent; <i>Laches</i> .....	850
b.	Current Law on Waiver; Multifactor Analysis .....	851
c.	Historical Position on Waiver.....	856
d.	Retirement Appeals .....	858
3.	Application for Waiver .....	859
a.	Hearing Entitlement on a Timeliness Issue .....	860
b.	Due Diligence .....	863
4.	Collective Bargaining Contract Stay Provision; Postal Service Employee; Agency-Initiated Stay.....	863
F.	JUSTIFICATION FOR LATE FILING .....	865
1.	Sickness or Hospitalization.....	865
a.	Supporting Evidence.....	866
b.	Mental Impairment.....	866
c.	Effect of Continuing Mental Disorder on Filing Deadline.....	868
2.	Substitute Employment, Travel, or Other Activities.....	870
3.	Military Service.....	871
4.	Incarceration; Criminal Proceeding .....	873
5.	Need to Obtain Documentation.....	874
6.	Need to Obtain Counsel .....	874
7.	Unfamiliarity With MSPB Procedures and Law; Ambiguous Agency Communications .....	875
a.	Language Difficulties .....	876
b.	Miscalculation of Time for Appeal .....	876
8.	Obligation to Provide Notice of Appeal Rights .....	877
a.	Failure to Provide Notice.....	878
b.	Belated Receipt of Adverse Action Decision.....	883
c.	Constructive Receipt of Decision Notice.....	884
d.	Proof Concerning Delivery of Notice of Appeal Right .....	886
e.	Notice of Appeal Right to Appellant’s Representative.....	886
f.	Appellant’s Responsibility When Decision Notice or Information About Appeal Rights Is Not Received .....	887
g.	Constructive Adverse Action; Notice if Agency Learns of Employee’s Protest.....	888
h.	Constructive Adverse Action Without Notice of Employee’s Protest to Agency .....	891
(i)	<i>Jones, Krizman</i> and Beyond.....	897
i.	Adverse Action or Performance-Based Appeal Arising From Last Chance or Other Settlement Agreement .....	901
j.	Lack of Notice Concerning Restoration and Reemployment Appeal Rights .....	904
k.	Enforced Leave .....	907
l.	Agency on Notice but Fails to Provide Appeal Rights; Secondary Information Concerning Appeal Rights .....	908
m.	Prior or Subsequent Notice of Filing Deadline .....	909
n.	Agency Misrepresentation.....	910
o.	Threats by Agency Personnel.....	911

p.	Mixed Case Notice Problems .....	911
q.	Problem With or Delayed Receipt of Domestic, Certified, or International Mail, or Commercial Delivery; Address Change .....	913
9.	Appeal Lost in the Mail.....	920
10.	Facsimile Problems .....	921
11.	Electronic Filing Problem .....	922
12.	Problem Caused by Adjudicators; Misdirected Appeal.....	922
a.	MSPB .....	922
b.	EEOC .....	922
c.	OPM .....	923
13.	Uncertainty as to Outcome of a Related Case; Pending Settlement Negotiations or Investigation; Case Taken to Court.....	924
a.	Grievances.....	925
14.	Inadequate Representation.....	925
a.	Delay Not Excused .....	926
b.	Delay Excused; Counsel's Delay Balanced Against Appellant's Best Efforts; Retirement Cases .....	927
c.	Delay Excused; Obstruction or Misrepresentation by Counsel.....	929
d.	Delay Excused; Inconsequential Delay by Representative .....	933
15.	Other Problems .....	934
G.	TIME FOR RAISING NEW APPELLATE ISSUES AND CLAIMS.....	934
1.	Issues and Defenses .....	934
a.	Liberal Construction of Pleadings; Issues Raised at Hearing .....	935
b.	EEO Affirmative Defenses .....	935
2.	Additional Appealable Action .....	935
H.	MOOT, WITHDRAWN, AND WAIVED APPEALS.....	936
1.	Mootness of Appeal .....	936
a.	Cancellation of Action Appealed.....	937
b.	Restoration of <i>Status Quo Ante</i> .....	938
c.	Initiation of New Action Based on Events Leading to Canceled Action .....	946
d.	Procedure Followed if Action Not Completely Rescinded.....	946
e.	Procedure Following Remand to Judge.....	947
f.	Settlement Independent of MSPB Appeal .....	947
g.	Complete Relief Through Other Means; Stay of Pending Litigation.....	957
h.	Collateral Issues Following Rescission of Action; Claims for Counsel Fees or General Damages; Interest.....	958
i.	EEO Allegation; Claim for Compensatory Damages .....	958
j.	Whistleblower Protection Act: Claims for Damages, Other Relief .....	961
k.	Uniformed Services Employment and Reemployment Rights Act .....	967
l.	Resignation or Retirement Before Termination .....	969
m.	Criminal Conviction .....	969
n.	Consecutive Adverse Actions.....	969
o.	OPM Rescinds Reconsideration or Final Decision; Overpayment Recovery; Withdrawal of or Additional Retirement Application.....	970
p.	Administrative Law Judge Complaint.....	976
q.	Other Problems .....	976
2.	Effect of Retirement on Appealable Action.....	976
a.	Effect of Cleansing Personnel File When Removal Is Accompanied by Retirement; Effect of Claim for Damages .....	983
b.	Reduction in Force Appeal.....	987
c.	Prior Law; Disability Retirement.....	989
3.	Withdrawal of Appeal.....	990
a.	Withdrawal to Pursue EEO Complaint; Withdrawal of EEO Claim .....	992
b.	Withdrawal to Pursue a Collective Bargaining Contract Grievance Procedure.....	994
c.	Confusion Between Necessity for Withdrawal of Appeal, Continuance, and Withdrawal of Appeal Without Prejudice to Refile .....	995
d.	Unauthorized Act of Representative .....	996
e.	Duress; Misrepresentation; Incompetence .....	999
f.	Mistake .....	1002
g.	Misleading or Incomplete Information From Judge.....	1002
h.	Attempts to Refile, Reinstate, or Reopen Withdrawn Appeals.....	1005
4.	Dismissal Without Prejudice to Refile ("DWOP").....	1009
a.	Reasons for DWOP .....	1013

b.	Pending Criminal Proceeding; Indefinite Suspension.....	1014
c.	Procedures for Obtaining Dismissal; Refiling .....	1016
d.	Refiling Date.....	1016
e.	Effect of PFR .....	1019
f.	Agency-Initiated Request; Prior Practice.....	1019
g.	Dismissal Initiated by Judge or MSPB.....	1020
5.	Delay in Refiling After DWOP.....	1021
a.	Retirement Appeals.....	1025
b.	Imperfect Attempt to Refile; Confusion Caused by Judge.....	1026
c.	Late Refiling; Independent Right of Appeal .....	1027
6.	Waiver of Appeal Through Last Chance or Other Preappeal Agreement.....	1027
a.	Jurisdictional Analysis.....	1030
b.	Public Policy; Appeal Preclusion; Consideration; Conflict With Regulation .....	1038
c.	Ambiguous Term; Failure to Waive Future Appeal Right.....	1040
d.	Due Process Considerations; Notice.....	1044
e.	Last Chance Agreement Superseded by Independent Adverse Action.....	1045
f.	Lack of Authority of Representative to Enter Agreement.....	1047
g.	Agreement to Accept Demotion, Suspension .....	1047
h.	Bad Faith, Coercion, Lack of Mental Capacity.....	1048
i.	Illegal or Punitive Term .....	1053
j.	Jurisdictional Prerequisite: LCA Compliance or Breach .....	1054
k.	Burden of Proof.....	1056
l.	Hearing Entitlement.....	1058
m.	Condition Unrelated to Underlying Action; Ambiguous Condition; Condition Described in Notice of LCA Violation.....	1061
n.	Discrimination, Reprisal .....	1067
o.	Claim Collateral to Breach of Agreement.....	1068
p.	Duration of Agreement .....	1068
7.	Personnel Action Resulting From Settlement Not Constituting Last Chance Agreement .....	1068
8.	Settlement Reached During Board Appeal .....	1070
II.	FORMAT AND PRELIMINARY PROCESSING OF APPEAL.....	1071
A.	ESSENTIAL INFORMATION.....	1071
B.	FORMAT.....	1072
1.	Interpretation of Appeal.....	1072
2.	Signature .....	1073
3.	Appeal Filed Through Representative .....	1074
4.	“John Doe” Appeal: Protecting Appellant’s Privacy.....	1074
5.	Agency-Initiated Retirement Appeal .....	1077
6.	Class Action, Consolidated Appeals, and Joinder; Bifurcated Appeals.....	1077
a.	Consolidation .....	1077
b.	Joinder; Compulsory Joinder .....	1080
c.	Class Action .....	1082
d.	Bifurcated Appeals.....	1083
7.	Substitution; Survival of Claim .....	1083
a.	IRA Case.....	1085
C.	INTERVENTION.....	1085
1.	Intervention of Right: OPM, OSC .....	1086
a.	OPM .....	1087
b.	OSC .....	1088
2.	Permissive Intervention .....	1088
3.	Rights of Intervenor.....	1091
4.	<i>Amicus Curiae</i> .....	1091
D.	STEPS TAKEN AFTER APPEAL IS FILED .....	1091
1.	Acknowledgment of Appeal.....	1093
a.	Philippines Retirement Appeal .....	1094
2.	Amendment of Appeal.....	1094
3.	Service of Pleadings .....	1094
4.	Deficient Appeal.....	1095
5.	Affirmative Defense Order; Requirement of Specific Allegations.....	1096
E.	AGENCY RESPONSE TO APPEAL.....	1097
1.	Narrative Response to Appeal .....	1098

2.	Motion to Dismiss Appeal.....	1099
3.	Delay in Appeal Response.....	1099
4.	Designation of Agency Representative.....	1100
F.	APPEALS INVOLVING JURISDICTIONAL ISSUES.....	1100
1.	Nonfrivolous Jurisdictional Allegation .....	1103
2.	Judge Must Ensure Jurisdictional Issues Are Identified; <i>Burgess</i> Notice .....	1105
3.	Agency Representative’s Responsibilities .....	1108
4.	Hearing on Jurisdictional Issue .....	1109
G.	REPRESENTATIVES.....	1109
1.	Right to Representation.....	1110
a.	Inadequate Representation .....	1112
b.	Service on Representative.....	1113
2.	Disqualification of Representative; State Disciplinary Rules .....	1113
a.	Conflicts .....	1114
b.	Representative as Witness.....	1117
c.	Disciplinary Rules, Proceedings.....	1117
H.	<i>PRO SE</i> AND INADEQUATELY REPRESENTED PARTIES .....	1118
1.	<i>Pro Se</i> Appellant .....	1118
2.	Assistance to Mentally Incompetent Appellant; <i>French</i> Procedure .....	1119
I.	<i>EX PARTE</i> COMMUNICATIONS .....	1123
1.	What They Are .....	1124
2.	How <i>Ex Parte</i> Communications Are Treated .....	1126
III.	INTERLOCUTORY APPEALS .....	1126
A.	INTERLOCUTORY APPEAL PROCEDURE.....	1126
1.	Regulation.....	1127
2.	Application of Regulation .....	1129
a.	Rulings on Bias and Intervention.....	1130
b.	Direct Appeal to MSPB.....	1131
3.	Stay of Proceeding.....	1131
IV.	DISCOVERY .....	1131
A.	AN OVERVIEW OF DISCOVERY PROCEDURES .....	1132
1.	Regulatory Structure.....	1133
2.	Preliminary Steps in Discovery .....	1136
a.	Initial Disclosures.....	1137
3.	Discovery Limitations .....	1137
a.	Jurisdictional or Timeliness Issue .....	1137
4.	Motion to Compel.....	1138
5.	Federal Rules .....	1141
a.	Federal Rules of General Application .....	1141
6.	Interrogatories.....	1143
7.	Deposition .....	1144
8.	Other Discovery Devices .....	1146
a.	Document Request .....	1146
b.	Request for Admission.....	1147
c.	Medical, Psychiatric Examinations .....	1148
d.	Motion for More Definite Statement of Appeal .....	1150
9.	Discovery From Nonparties .....	1150
B.	STRATEGIC CONSIDERATIONS IN DISCOVERY .....	1150
1.	Burden .....	1151
a.	Effect of EEO, Reprisal Allegations.....	1151
b.	Discovery During Pendency of Criminal Proceedings .....	1152
2.	Privileged Information .....	1152
a.	<i>In Camera</i> Inspection .....	1153
b.	Law Enforcement Privilege .....	1154
c.	OSC File; Executive and Investigative Privileges .....	1155
d.	OPM Suitability File.....	1156
e.	Agency Investigative File .....	1156
f.	Attorney-Client Privilege .....	1157
g.	Attorney Work Product Privilege .....	1162
h.	Agency Deliberative Process Privilege.....	1164
i.	Statutory Confidentiality Limitations.....	1166



3. Privacy Act .....	1166
4. Failure to Use Discovery.....	1168
5. Informal Discovery; Control by Agencies of Employees' Time .....	1170
6. Protective Order .....	1171
C. ENTRY OF DISCOVERY MATERIAL INTO RECORD .....	1171
D. SUBPOENAS .....	1172
1. When a Subpoena Is Used .....	1173
2. Obtaining, Serving Subpoena .....	1173
a. Witnesses Outside the United States .....	1174
3. Challenge; Enforcement .....	1175
4. Witness Fees; Travel Allowances .....	1176
E. REVIEW OF DISCOVERY RULINGS .....	1176
1. Effect of Denial of Discovery .....	1177
a. Preservation of Issue .....	1179
2. Rulings on Discovery Disputes.....	1180
a. Synopsis of Testimony .....	1180
b. Relevance, Overbread Request .....	1180
c. Mitigation; Disparate Treatment .....	1181
d. Deposition of Agency Head.....	1182
e. Electronic Records.....	1182
f. Inspection Rather Than Production of Documents.....	1183
3. Discovery in OSC Case.....	1183
V. SANCTIONS .....	1184
A. FAILURE TO RESPOND TO APPEAL .....	1186
1. Default Judgment.....	1186
B. FAILURE TO PROSECUTE APPEAL .....	1187
1. Dismissal Warranted .....	1188
a. Failure to Provide Basis for Appeal .....	1189
b. Failure to Designate Representative.....	1189
c. Failure to Comply With Judge's Order.....	1190
2. Dismissal Unwarranted .....	1192
a. Failure to Attend Hearing.....	1193
b. Inadvertent or Isolated Failure to Obey Orders.....	1193
c. Late Appeal.....	1195
C. FAILURE TO COOPERATE IN DISCOVERY .....	1195
1. Sanction Against Agency .....	1196
a. Material in Control of Third Party.....	1199
2. Sanction Against Appellant.....	1199
D. FAILURE TO FOLLOW PREHEARING OR HEARING PROCEDURES .....	1202
1. Sanction Against Appellant; Prejudice to Agency.....	1202
2. Sanction Against Agency .....	1203

## CHAPTER 3: HEARING..... 1205

I. HEARING.....	1205
A. RIGHT TO HEARING .....	1205
1. <i>De Novo</i> Hearing.....	1206
a. Role of Intervenor .....	1206
2. Jurisdictional Hearing; Documentary Evidence.....	1206
a. Timeliness Issue .....	1210
b. No Material Disputed Facts .....	1210
3. Counsel .....	1212
4. Control by Judge .....	1212
5. Official Time; Resources Available to Appellant .....	1215
B. WAIVER OF HEARING .....	1215
1. Inability to Travel to Hearing Site .....	1218
2. Failure to Request Hearing .....	1219
a. Remands; New Law.....	1220
3. Untimely Hearing Request.....	1220
a. Effect of Amendment of Appeal .....	1221
4. Withdrawal of Hearing Request.....	1221
a. Failure to Receive Hearing Notice.....	1222



b. Postponement Denied .....	1223
c. Events Beyond Appellant’s Control.....	1224
5. Strategic Considerations—Intentional Waiver .....	1224
6. Adjudication After Waiver, Failure to Attend Hearing.....	1224
7. Adjudication Without Hearing; Responses to Evidentiary Submissions .....	1225
C. POSTPONEMENT OF HEARING .....	1229
1. Timing of Hearing .....	1229
2. Policy on Continuances .....	1230
a. Dismissal Without Prejudice to Refile .....	1231
b. Case Suspension .....	1231
3. Continuance Procedure .....	1231
a. Request; Form of Sworn Statement .....	1232
b. Failure to Make Request.....	1233
c. Status of Pending Motion.....	1233
d. Proceeding After Denial of Motion .....	1233
4. Good Cause Requirement.....	1233
a. Need to Prepare .....	1233
b. Awaiting Outcome of Another Case.....	1234
c. Unavailability of Representative; New Representative .....	1234
(i) Case Proceeds to Hearing .....	1237
d. Medical Condition of Appellant.....	1237
e. Pending Criminal Proceeding; Indefinite Suspension.....	1238
f. Incarceration .....	1240
g. Military Service .....	1242
h. Missing or Unavailable Witness .....	1242
i. Change in Hearing Location.....	1242
5. Continuance Denial—Review Standard .....	1242
D. VENUE OF HEARING.....	1243
1. Change of Venue .....	1244
a. Cost to Appellant .....	1245
2. Requesting a Change of Venue.....	1245
3. Venue Determination Review Standard .....	1245
E. HEARING FUNDAMENTALS .....	1246
1. Change, Resignation, or Death of Judge .....	1246
2. Interaction With Judge.....	1246
3. Prehearing Submission .....	1247
4. Prehearing Conference .....	1247
a. Stipulations.....	1250
b. Waiver or Withdrawal of Affirmative Defense .....	1251
c. Dismissal of Charge .....	1251
5. Memorandum or Order Summarizing Conference.....	1251
a. Preservation of Objection; Incomplete Summary.....	1252
b. Treatment of EEO and Other Affirmative Defenses; Summary Judgment.....	1254
F. CONDUCT OF HEARING; RESPONSIBILITIES OF JUDGE .....	1256
1. Hearing Error: Measure of Damage .....	1257
a. Timing of Submission of Pleadings .....	1258
b. Timing of Initial Decision .....	1258
2. Control and Exclusion of Representative or Participant.....	1258
3. Maintaining Order.....	1260
a. Exclusion From Hearing Room of an Individual Whose Presence May Intimidate a Witness .....	1260
b. Security Arrangement .....	1260
4. Witness Control; Sequestration.....	1261
5. Conduct of Questioning .....	1263
a. Multiple Representatives.....	1264
6. Permitting Record Development .....	1264
a. Videoconference, Telephone Hearing.....	1265
b. Bifurcated Hearing .....	1269
c. Hearing Subpoena.....	1271
7. Ensuring Record Development; <i>Pro Se</i> Appellant; EEO File .....	1271
a. Annuity Appeal .....	1274
b. Duty of Judge to Inform an Appellant of Governing Law; <i>Pro Se</i> Appellant; Liberal Construction of Pleadings....	1275

8. Raising Issue <i>Sua Sponte</i> .....	1276
9. Preserving Review Right Through Objection.....	1278
10. Media Coverage.....	1278
11. Public Hearing; Closing the Hearing .....	1279
12. Timing of Hearing .....	1280
13. Hearing Accommodation for Disabled Appellant; Interpreter .....	1280
14. Allocation of Burden of Proof .....	1282
15. Opening Statement.....	1282
16. Closing Argument, Brief.....	1282
G. PREVENTION OF INTERFERENCE WITH MSPB PROCEEDINGS .....	1283
1. Protective Order.....	1283
2. Protective Order for Appellant .....	1284
3. Interference With Witness, Representative, Appellant .....	1285
a. Agency Restriction on Appearance of Employee as Witness .....	1289
H. POSTHEARING ACTIVITIES .....	1290
1. Closing Record .....	1290
a. Ensuring Notice of Record Closing .....	1291
b. Clarifying Scope of Record; Off-The-Record Discussions .....	1292
c. Timing of Evidentiary Submissions, Responses.....	1292
d. Effect of Closing Record .....	1293
2. Regional Authority After Initial Decision .....	1294
a. Judge’s Request to Reopen Record to Correct Error .....	1294
II. MOTION PRACTICE .....	1294
A. USE OF MOTIONS.....	1295
1. Dispositive Motion .....	1297
a. Motion to Dismiss Filed Before Hearing.....	1297
b. Motion to Dismiss Filed During Hearing.....	1297
c. Summary Judgment.....	1298
B. FORM AND TIMING OF MOTIONS.....	1303
III. WITNESSES .....	1304
A. WITNESS REQUEST .....	1304
1. Obligation to Permit Relevant Testimony .....	1305
a. Competence to Testify .....	1305
b. Appellant .....	1305
c. Decisionmaker.....	1305
d. Agency Head .....	1305
2. Obligation to Request Witness .....	1306
a. Witness List .....	1307
b. Rebuttal Witness.....	1308
3. Repetitious Testimony .....	1309
4. Offer of Proof .....	1309
5. Compelling Witness Attendance .....	1309
a. Appellant.....	1310
b. Others; Former Employee; Subpoena.....	1310
6. Duty Status of Federal Employee Witness; Pay, Travel, Per Diem .....	1310
a. Official Time .....	1311
7. Protecting Record; Missing Witness .....	1312
a. Preservation of Objection.....	1312
8. Judge May Call Witness.....	1313
9. Obtaining Testimony by Alternate Means.....	1313
10. Right of Witness to Representation .....	1313
a. Self-Incrimination .....	1313
11. Witness Denial—Review Standard .....	1313
B. EXAMINATION OF WITNESSES .....	1315
1. Control of Questioning by Judge .....	1315
a. Questioning by Judge.....	1316
b. Leading Questions .....	1316
c. Production of Witness Statement, Document Relied on During Testimony .....	1317
d. Taking Witness Out of Order .....	1318
IV. DISQUALIFICATION OF JUDGE .....	1318
A. PRESUMPTION OF HONESTY AND IMPARTIALITY .....	1319

1. Competence of Judge .....	1320
B. TREATMENT OF BIAS ALLEGATIONS.....	1321
1. Procedure; Documenting Record.....	1323
2. Extrajudicial Source of Bias.....	1325
3. Treatment of Bias Allegation by Judge, Board.....	1325
4. Specific Bias Allegations .....	1326
a. Relationship With Party or Witness .....	1326
b. Relationship With Counsel .....	1326
c. Improper Communication .....	1327
d. Examination of Witness.....	1327
e. Remarks About Counsel, Party, Merits, Settlement; <i>Ex Parte</i> Communication.....	1327
f. Prior Ruling Against Party.....	1331
g. Erroneous Ruling .....	1332
h. Incorrect Factual Conclusion.....	1332
i. Hasty or Late Decision .....	1332
j. Change in Judge Without Finding of Bias .....	1333

## CHAPTER 4: EVIDENCE..... 1335

I. FUNDAMENTALS .....	1335
A. RELEVANCE, MATERIALITY, AND FAIRNESS .....	1335
1. Informal Adjudication .....	1335
2. Relevance and Materiality .....	1335
a. <i>De Novo</i> Review .....	1336
b. Conditional Admission of Evidence.....	1336
3. Record.....	1336
a. Offer of Proof.....	1336
4. Fairness in Development of Evidence.....	1336
a. Erroneous Exclusion of Evidence .....	1336
b. Erroneous Admission of Evidence.....	1337
c. Manipulation or Redaction of Evidence.....	1337
B. NATURE OF CHARGES .....	1338
1. Evidentiary Value of Charge .....	1338
a. Response to Charge .....	1339
C. HEARSAY .....	1340
1. <i>Borninkhof</i> .....	1341
2. Judicial Interpretations .....	1343
3. 5 USC 2302(b)(2): Investigative Statement .....	1344
II. EVALUATION OF EVIDENCE .....	1344
A. DOCUMENTS .....	1344
1. Response to Appeal .....	1345
2. Medical Report, Records.....	1345
3. Notes of Witness; Memorandum of Conversation .....	1346
4. Time and Attendance Record .....	1346
5. Business Record .....	1346
6. Regulation; Law .....	1347
7. Evidence From Other MSPB Hearing; Other Judicial Proceeding.....	1347
8. Procedure for Introducing Document; Demonstrative Evidence .....	1347
9. Authentication Requirement .....	1349
a. Handwriting .....	1349
b. Significance of Signature .....	1349
c. Copy; Photograph .....	1349
B. PHYSICAL EVIDENCE.....	1349
1. Custody and Control .....	1349
2. Use at Hearing .....	1350
C. ADMISSIONS .....	1350
1. Probative Value .....	1350
a. Repudiated or Recanted Admission .....	1351
2. Settlement Offer.....	1352
D. CIRCUMSTANTIAL AND SECONDARY EVIDENCE .....	1353
1. Common Possession/Multiple Causation.....	1355
2. Contemporaneous Statement.....	1355

3.	Flight or Evasion .....	1356
4.	Statistics.....	1356
E.	OPINION AND IMPEACHMENT EVIDENCE .....	1356
1.	Physical Condition .....	1356
2.	Character.....	1356
a.	Past Misconduct .....	1358
b.	Arrest, Conviction.....	1359
c.	Reputation .....	1359
d.	Habit .....	1359
3.	Hearing Deportment or Demeanor .....	1360
4.	Evidence in Disability Annuity Appeal; <i>Chavez</i> ; Post-Separation Evidence .....	1360
F.	RECURRENT EVIDENTIARY PROBLEMS.....	1367
1.	Polygraph.....	1367
2.	Unsworn Written Statements.....	1368
a.	No Hearing.....	1369
b.	Hearing Held .....	1369
c.	Sworn Written Statement; Form of Attestation .....	1370
d.	Deposition .....	1372
3.	Investigation Reports.....	1373
4.	Recordings.....	1375
a.	Video .....	1375
b.	Audio .....	1375
5.	Transcript of Prior Testimony .....	1375
6.	Expert Witness; Medical Evidence .....	1376
a.	Medical Expert Opinion .....	1378
b.	Other Experts.....	1380
7.	Statements of Representative, Party.....	1380
8.	Testimony of Child .....	1381
9.	Interpretation of Collective Bargaining Agreement.....	1381
10.	Newspaper Article .....	1381
11.	Drug Test .....	1381
III.	SUBSTITUTES FOR DIRECT EVIDENCE .....	1386
A.	OFFICIAL NOTICE .....	1386
1.	Regulations.....	1386
a.	Federal Personnel Manual; Agency Handbook, Publication .....	1387
2.	Related Board Case Records.....	1387
B.	ADVERSE INFERENCES AND PRESUMPTIONS .....	1387
1.	Silence .....	1387
2.	Negative Inferences.....	1389
a.	Destruction or Loss of Evidence.....	1390
b.	Negative Evidence .....	1393
3.	Presumption.....	1393
a.	Delivery of Mail, Other Documents .....	1393
C.	STIPULATIONS .....	1397
1.	Issues of Fact and Law .....	1398
2.	Stipulations Directed by Judge .....	1399
D.	<i>RES JUDICATA</i> , COLLATERAL ESTOPPEL, AND LAW OF THE CASE—THE DOCTRINES.....	1399
1.	Elements of <i>Res Judicata</i> .....	1400
a.	Identity of Prior Cause of Action and Issues .....	1404
b.	Identity of Parties; Privity .....	1405
c.	Complete Relief Available .....	1406
d.	Jurisdictional Issue .....	1407
e.	Settlement .....	1409
f.	Withdrawal of Appeal .....	1410
g.	<i>Res Judicata</i> Raised <i>Sua Sponte</i> by MSPB; Waiver of Defense .....	1411
2.	Collateral Estoppel.....	1412
a.	Error in Law; Change in Law .....	1415
b.	Proof of a Prior Adjudication .....	1416
c.	Privity; Appellant as a Party to Prior Case .....	1416
d.	Privity of Agencies .....	1417
e.	Identity of Prior Issue .....	1417

f.	Jurisdictional, Timeliness Issues .....	1418
g.	Decision of Another Tribunal .....	1421
h.	Collateral Estoppel Raised <i>Sua Sponte</i> by MSPB .....	1422
3.	Judicial Estoppel .....	1423
4.	Law of the Case; Mandate Rule .....	1425
5.	<i>Stare Decisis</i> .....	1428
E.	<i>RES JUDICATA</i> AND COLLATERAL ESTOPPEL—THE DOCTRINES APPLIED .....	1429
1.	Criminal Conviction .....	1429
2.	Pleas to Criminal Charges.....	1432
a.	Guilty Plea .....	1432
b.	<i>Nolo Contendere</i> and <i>Alford</i> Pleas .....	1434
c.	Pretrial Diversion .....	1437
d.	Conviction, Misconduct Distinguished .....	1438
3.	Acquittal; Reversal of Criminal Conviction.....	1438
4.	Successive MSPB Cases .....	1439
a.	Dismissal for Adjudicatory Efficiency .....	1440
b.	WIGI/Removal .....	1440
c.	Successive RIFs .....	1440
d.	Whistleblowing Prohibited Personnel Practice Complaint or Appeal.....	1440
e.	USERRA Claims .....	1447
f.	Suitability Determination .....	1448
g.	Regulation Review .....	1448
h.	Prior Action Reversed for Lack of Due Process.....	1448
5.	Other Proceedings.....	1449
a.	Credentialing Committee .....	1449
b.	Union Trial Board .....	1450
c.	Labor Arbitration Awards .....	1450
d.	OPM Annuity Determination .....	1453
e.	Unemployment Compensation Award .....	1455
f.	OWCP Finding; Social Security Determination .....	1456
g.	EEOC Decision.....	1457
h.	Comptroller General or GAO Decision .....	1458
i.	Judicial Determination .....	1460
6.	Exceptions to Application of Collateral Estoppel, <i>Res Judicata</i> .....	1461
a.	Pendency of an Appeal .....	1461
b.	Fairness of Adjudication; New Evidence .....	1461
c.	Fraud; Misrepresentation .....	1461
d.	Change in Law .....	1463
IV.	EXCLUSION OF EVIDENCE .....	1463
A.	PROCEDURES.....	1463
1.	Objection, Motions to Strike or <i>in Limine</i> .....	1463
2.	Witness Exclusion .....	1463
a.	Proposing Official.....	1464
B.	CONSTITUTIONAL AND STATUTORY CHALLENGES .....	1465
1.	Search.....	1465
a.	Wiretap.....	1469
b.	Recording .....	1469
c.	Drug Testing .....	1470
2.	Interrogation.....	1474
a.	Misconduct of Investigator .....	1474
b.	Compelled Testimony; <i>Kalkines</i> Warning .....	1474
c.	Right to Silence, Counsel .....	1477
d.	Denial of Union Representation.....	1478
C.	OTHER BASES FOR EXCLUSION OF EVIDENCE .....	1479
1.	Claims of Privilege.....	1479
a.	Alcoholism Treatment Records.....	1479
b.	Other Medical Records .....	1480
c.	Privacy; Attorney-Client Communication .....	1480
2.	Failure to Follow MSPB Procedure .....	1480
V.	HEARING RECORD .....	1480
A.	RIGHT TO AND NECESSITY FOR A RECORD OR TRANSCRIPT .....	1480

1. Current MSPB Practice.....	1481
2. Past Treatment of Transcript.....	1482
3. Past Internal MSPB Guidance on Transcript.....	1482
4. Federal Circuit Commentary on Transcript.....	1483
a. Arbitration Hearing .....	1483
5. Use of Recording .....	1483
B. PROBLEMS CONCERNING TRANSCRIPT AND RECORD.....	1484
1. Off-The-Record Discussion .....	1484
2. Hearing Recording Omission; Transcript Error.....	1484
3. Correction of Transcript .....	1485
4. Unofficial Transcript.....	1486

## CHAPTER 5: INITIAL DECISION AND PETITION FOR REVIEW..... 1487

I. INITIAL DECISION.....	1487
A. INITIAL DECISION FORMAT .....	1487
1. Minimum Requirements.....	1487
a. Bench Decision .....	1489
b. Notice of Right to Review .....	1490
2. Appeal Dismissed by Consent; Mootness of Initial Decision.....	1491
B. REQUIRED ANALYSIS .....	1491
1. Incomplete Analysis .....	1492
a. Incorrect Adjudication Standard.....	1494
b. Issue Not Raised In Appeal.....	1494
2. Timeliness and Jurisdictional Issues .....	1494
3. Adverse Action, Performance Case .....	1495
4. Annuity Appeal .....	1495
5. EEO, Prohibited Personnel Practice Issue .....	1496
a. Nondispositive EEO, Prohibited Personnel Practice Issue.....	1497
6. Consolidated Appeals .....	1499
7. Counsel Fee Decision .....	1499
C. CREDIBILITY FINDINGS .....	1499
1. Necessary Findings .....	1499
a. Weight of Evidence Equally Balanced .....	1500
2. Factors Considered; <i>Hillen</i> .....	1500
a. Some Testimony Discredited .....	1503
b. Alibi Defense .....	1503
c. Inconsistencies; Denials; Memory Lapse; Failure to Provide Statement .....	1503
d. Contemporaneous Notation, Statement; <i>Post Hoc</i> Explanation.....	1504
e. Self-Serving Testimony; Bias; Criminal Conviction; Past Misconduct .....	1505
f. Uncontradicted Testimony.....	1506
g. Implausible, Inherently Improbable, Imprecise Testimony .....	1506
h. Telephonic Hearing.....	1506
i. Determination Made Without Hearing.....	1507
II. PETITION FOR REVIEW; RECONSIDERATION .....	1507
A. PFR PROCESS .....	1507
1. Statutory and Regulatory Structure .....	1508
a. Internal Board Guidance .....	1510
2. Board Treatment of PFR, Reopening Request.....	1511
a. Enforcement Issue.....	1513
3. Reply to PFR Response .....	1513
4. Cross-PFR.....	1513
a. Conditional Cross-PFR .....	1514
5. Effect of Judicial Review on PFR .....	1514
6. Effect of EEOC Review on PFR .....	1515
7. Who May Obtain Review .....	1515
a. OPM .....	1515
b. OSC .....	1516
c. Others; Intervenors .....	1516
8. Grounds for PFR .....	1516
a. Evidentiary Disputes .....	1517
b. Ineffective Counsel .....	1517

c.	Fivolous PFR; Sanction .....	1519
d.	Challenges to Settlement .....	1519
9.	Time for Filing.....	1519
10.	Service .....	1520
11.	MSPB Processing .....	1521
a.	Tied Vote; Lack of Quorum .....	1522
b.	Decision Effective Upon Issuance by Clerk .....	1523
c.	Joinder .....	1523
12.	Failure to Prosecute; Failure to Respond.....	1523
a.	Withdrawal of PFR.....	1524
b.	Dismissal Without Prejudice .....	1524
13.	PFR Settlement Program .....	1524
14.	MSPB Final Decision .....	1525
a.	Short Form Order.....	1525
15.	Authority to Reopen and Reconsider .....	1526
a.	Jurisdictional Issue.....	1529
b.	Due Diligence .....	1530
c.	Reversal of Criminal Conviction .....	1534
d.	Change in Law .....	1535
e.	Fraud .....	1537
f.	Retirement Appeal .....	1538
g.	Effect of Judicial Review on Petition to Reopen.....	1539
h.	Reopening in Lieu of Excusing Untimely or Defective PFR .....	1540
i.	Clear Legal Error; Manifest Injustice.....	1541
j.	Discovery of Additional Legal Argument.....	1541
k.	Correction of Case Processing Error .....	1541
16.	Entry of Settlement Agreement Into Record.....	1542
B.	INTERIM RELIEF .....	1542
1.	Effective Date of Interim Relief.....	1545
2.	Effect of Remand or Supplemental Initial Decision on Interim Relief.....	1546
3.	Obligation to Return Employee to Work and Pay; Undue Disruption.....	1546
a.	Undue Disruption Determination .....	1549
b.	Undue Disruption Notice .....	1550
c.	Implicit Disruption Determination; Strong Overriding Interest .....	1552
d.	Removal From Workplace or Adverse Action During Interim Relief Period .....	1556
e.	Return to Work With Changed Duties.....	1556
f.	Restoration Followed by Appellant’s Inability to Work.....	1557
g.	Pay Entitlement; Overtime; Allowances .....	1557
h.	Deductibility of Interim Earnings or Severance Pay .....	1560
i.	Prior “Bad Faith” Implementation Standard .....	1560
4.	Dismissal of PFR for Failure to Provide Interim Relief .....	1560
a.	Remedy for Inadequate Interim Relief .....	1562
b.	Motion to Dismiss PFR for Lack of Proper Interim Relief .....	1562
c.	Discriminatory Application of Interim Relief .....	1563
d.	PFR Not Mooted by Overbroad Interim Relief .....	1564
e.	Effect of Jurisdictional Issue .....	1565
5.	Certification and Proof of Interim Relief .....	1565
a.	Evidence of Interim Relief .....	1566
b.	Technical Error; Supplemental Evidence of Interim Relief .....	1569
c.	Delay in Payment Following Certification or <i>Prima Facie</i> Evidence of Interim Relief.....	1570
d.	Withdrawal of Interim Relief .....	1570
6.	Factors Limiting or Warranting Denial of Interim Relief .....	1571
a.	OWCP Benefits .....	1571
b.	Retirement .....	1572
c.	Restriction on Extension of Appointment .....	1573
d.	Waiver, Settlement of Interim Relief; Employment Status Change .....	1573
7.	Special Situations .....	1575
a.	Retirement Appeals .....	1575
b.	Within-Grade Increase Appeal .....	1576
c.	Suitability Appeal .....	1576
d.	VEOA Appeal.....	1576



e.	Mitigation of Removal to Demotion .....	1576
f.	Mitigation of Removal to Suspension .....	1577
g.	Demotion Mitigated to Suspension .....	1577
h.	Mitigation or Cancellation of Suspension .....	1577
i.	Enforced Leave Concluded by the Date of the Initial Decision.....	1578
j.	Unified Penalty Involving Reassignment .....	1578
C.	REVIEW OF FACTUAL AND CREDIBILITY FINDINGS .....	1578
1.	Factual Findings; “Special Deference” .....	1579
a.	Decision Based on Affidavits, Documents .....	1583
b.	Telephonic, Videoconference Hearing .....	1583
2.	Omitted Findings .....	1584
3.	Unnecessary Findings .....	1585
4.	Issue of Mental Competence During Appeal Adjudication .....	1585
D.	REVIEW OF NEW EVIDENCE .....	1586
1.	What Constitutes Evidence .....	1589
2.	What Evidence Is New .....	1589
a.	Previously Available .....	1589
b.	Issue First Raised by Judge .....	1590
c.	Claim of Surprise .....	1591
d.	Due Diligence .....	1591
e.	Issue of Timeliness of Appeal or Other Submission.....	1594
f.	Issue of Jurisdiction; Exhaustion of Remedies .....	1595
g.	Evidence From Another MSPB Case .....	1597
3.	Materiality of New Evidence .....	1598
a.	Impeachment, Rebuttal Evidence .....	1598
b.	Corroborative Evidence .....	1602
c.	Disparate Treatment .....	1602
d.	OPM, SSA, OWCP, VA Determination; Evidence of Medical, Mental Condition .....	1603
e.	Adjudication of Past Discipline.....	1604
f.	Reversal of Criminal Conviction .....	1604
E.	REVIEW OF NEW LAW .....	1605
F.	REVIEW OF NEW ISSUES OR ISSUES NOT RAISED WITH JUDGE .....	1606
1.	General Rule.....	1606
a.	Jurisdictional Issue .....	1607
b.	Order Directing Payment in Violation of Federal Statute.....	1608
2.	Determining if Issue or Argument Was Raised Below .....	1608
a.	Annuity .....	1609
b.	Penalty .....	1609
c.	Statutory, Constitutional Interpretation .....	1609
d.	Timeliness of Appeal .....	1609
e.	Discrimination .....	1609
f.	Waiver of Issue .....	1610
G.	TIMELINESS OF PFR .....	1610
1.	Request for Extension of Time .....	1611
2.	Date and Place of Filing .....	1612
a.	Deficient but Timely PFR.....	1612
3.	Filing by Facsimile .....	1612
a.	Misguided Facsimile .....	1613
4.	Filing by Commercial Delivery.....	1614
5.	Filing by Hand.....	1614
6.	Filing by Mail.....	1614
a.	Proof of Mailing; Postmark; Letterbox Rule.....	1616
b.	PFR Lost in the Mail.....	1618
7.	Electronic Filing.....	1620
8.	Procedure on Late Submission.....	1621
a.	Affidavit or Sworn Statement Required .....	1622
b.	Strict Application .....	1623
c.	Retirement Appeal.....	1625
9.	Justification for Late Filing .....	1625
a.	Electronic Filing Problem.....	1626
b.	Mailroom Delay in Posting PFR .....	1629

c.	Foreign Mail Problem.....	1629
d.	Office Equipment, Technology, E-Filing Mishap, Related Problems.....	1629
e.	Merits.....	1630
f.	Physical or Mental Condition of Appellant or Counsel.....	1630
g.	Ignorance of Law; Late Discovery of Legal Defense; Subsequent MSPB Decision in Another Case.....	1637
h.	Problem With Settlement.....	1639
i.	Misinterpretation, Ignorance of MSPB Regulation, Instruction.....	1640
j.	Incorrect Information From MSPB, Others.....	1642
k.	Incomplete Notice of Right to File PFR.....	1642
l.	Delayed Receipt, Misrouting of Initial Decision, PFR; Constructive Receipt.....	1643
m.	Failure to Receive Initial Decision; E-Filer.....	1645
(i)	Responsibility to Notify Board of Physical or Email Address Change.....	1649
n.	Effect of Judge's Remand to Agency for Redetermination.....	1651
o.	Withdrawal, Absence of Representative.....	1651
p.	Inability to Obtain Representation.....	1651
q.	Unexcused Delay or Neglect of Representative.....	1652
r.	Excused Neglect of Representative; Diligence of Appellant.....	1655
s.	Attempt to Obtain Congressional Assistance.....	1657
t.	Pending Review by Another Adjudicator.....	1658
u.	Awaiting Transcript, Other Document.....	1659
v.	Delay in Internal Decisionmaking.....	1660
w.	Military Service.....	1660
x.	Fear of Prosecution; Agency Misrepresentation.....	1660
y.	Language Difficulties.....	1661
z.	Other Problems.....	1661
10.	Filing PFR With Wrong Agency or MSPB Office.....	1663
a.	Mixed Case Appeals.....	1663
b.	Other Misdirected Filings.....	1664
11.	Case or PFR Misfiled in Court.....	1666
H.	FORMAT AND SUBSTANCE OF PFR; REPLY; RESPONSE TO REPLY.....	1666
1.	Allowable Submissions; Length, Format.....	1667
a.	Erroneous Designation of Pleading.....	1668
b.	Error in Formal Requirements.....	1668
c.	<i>Pro Se</i> Form PFR.....	1669
2.	Signature, Designation of Representative Required.....	1670
3.	Specific and Supported Objection.....	1671
a.	Factual Error.....	1671
b.	Adjudicatory Error.....	1671
4.	Response to PFR.....	1672
5.	Reply to Response.....	1672
6.	Supplemental Authority.....	1673
7.	Lack of Transcript.....	1673
I.	MOOTNESS OF PFR.....	1673
1.	Cancellation of Adverse Action; Agency Compliance With Initial Decision.....	1673
a.	Effect of Appellant's PFR; No Agency PFR Filed.....	1674
2.	Settlement; Vacatur of Initial Decision.....	1674
3.	Regulation Review Proceeding.....	1675
4.	Retirement Appeal.....	1675
5.	Disqualification of Representative.....	1675
J.	PROCEDURE ON REMAND.....	1675
1.	Determining Whether a Remand Is Necessary.....	1675
a.	Board Obtains Evidence During PFR.....	1676
2.	Evidence, Findings From First Hearing.....	1676
a.	Effect of MSPB Order Vacating Initial Decision.....	1678
3.	Remand for Further Discovery.....	1678
4.	Remand for More Evidence.....	1678
a.	Subsequent PFR.....	1678
b.	Entry of Interlocutory or Interim Relief on Remand.....	1679
5.	Remand for Compliance.....	1679
K.	OPM RECONSIDERATION REQUESTS.....	1679
1.	Governing Statute and Regulation.....	1679

2.	Substantial Impact on Law .....	1681
a.	Decisions Before 1990.....	1683
3.	Limited to Facts, Issues of Record .....	1684
4.	Timing of Request; Arbitration Award .....	1684
5.	Mootness .....	1684
6.	EEO Discrimination Decision .....	1684
L.	STAY REQUESTS .....	1685
1.	Requested by OPM .....	1686
a.	Request for Supreme Court Review .....	1688
2.	Requested by Agency .....	1689
a.	Stay of Enforcement Proceeding .....	1691
3.	Requested by or for Individual .....	1691
a.	Special Counsel Disciplinary Case .....	1693
b.	Other OSC Litigation .....	1694
M.	REVIEW OF ARBITRATION AWARDS .....	1694
1.	Award Subject to Review .....	1700
a.	Governing Statute and Regulation; Time for Review .....	1701
b.	EEO Allegation.....	1702
c.	Compensatory Damages Claim; Remand .....	1707
d.	Other Prohibited Personnel Practice Issue; Remand .....	1707
e.	Counsel Fee Claim .....	1708
2.	Proper Appellant Before MSPB .....	1708
3.	Method, Scope of MSPB Review .....	1708
a.	Issue Preclusion .....	1711
b.	Collective Bargaining Contract Exclusivity.....	1712
c.	Allegation of Bias, Unfair Hearing .....	1712
d.	Enforcement of Award Reviewed by MSPB.....	1713
4.	Standard of Review .....	1714
a.	Penalty, Time-Served Suspension; Remedy .....	1717
b.	Procedures; Timeliness of Grievance .....	1724
c.	EEO Issue .....	1728
5.	MSPB Review Procedure.....	1729
a.	Time to Seek Review.....	1730
6.	Postal Service Employees.....	1732
a.	Effect of Arbitration Award on Board Appeal.....	1735

## CHAPTER 6: ADVERSE ACTIONS ..... 1741

I.	ADVERSE ACTIONS DEFINED .....	1741
A.	CANCELATION OF APPOINTMENT, PROMOTION .....	1741
1.	Appointment .....	1742
a.	Entry on Duty; Action by Appointing Authority; Reliance .....	1745
b.	Citizenship.....	1745
c.	Nepotism.....	1747
d.	Selective Service Registration.....	1747
e.	Withdrawal of Offer to Extend Term Appointment.....	1749
2.	Promotion, Pay Increase .....	1750
B.	TERMINATION BY ADVERSE ACTION OF APPOINTMENT SECURED BY FRAUD; OPM SUITABILITY ACTION.....	1762
C.	CONSTRUCTIVE ADVERSE ACTION .....	1763
1.	Jurisdictional Showing .....	1765
a.	Specific Allegations Control .....	1774
b.	Totality of Circumstances .....	1777
c.	Judge to Inform Appellant of Jurisdictional Requirements.....	1779
d.	Jurisdictional Analysis in Untimely Appeal .....	1780
e.	Collateral Attack on Settlement Agreement, Waiver of Appeal Right.....	1780
f.	Allegation of Discrimination .....	1782
2.	Overview of Constructive Adverse Action Appeals .....	1785
a.	Timing of Events .....	1786
3.	Involuntary Downgrading .....	1787
a.	Hearing.....	1788
b.	Deceit; Misrepresentation .....	1788
c.	Action Threatened Without Good Cause .....	1796

d.	Time Pressure .....	1797
e.	Improper Reassignment .....	1798
f.	Withdrawal of Request for Downgrading .....	1798
g.	Unauthentic Request for Downgrading .....	1798
h.	Discrimination; Intolerable Working Conditions .....	1798
i.	External Problems .....	1802
j.	Correction of Administrative Error .....	1803
4.	Involuntary Resignation.....	1804
a.	Hearing.....	1808
b.	Deceit; Misrepresentation .....	1809
c.	Action Threatened Without Good Cause .....	1814
d.	Time Pressure .....	1816
e.	Improper Reassignment .....	1820
f.	Withdrawal of Request to Resign.....	1820
g.	Irrevocable Resignation; VSIP.....	1822
h.	Unauthentic, Ambiguous or Conditional Resignation .....	1823
i.	Ineffective Resignation .....	1824
j.	Mental Disability.....	1825
k.	Intolerable Working Conditions .....	1826
l.	Whistleblowing Reprisal .....	1834
m.	Discriminatory Working Conditions .....	1835
n.	Failure to Accommodate Disability .....	1839
o.	Denial of Leave .....	1841
p.	External Problems .....	1842
q.	Probationer .....	1843
r.	Technical Error .....	1843
5.	Involuntary Retirement.....	1843
a.	Hearing .....	1844
b.	Deceit; Misrepresentation .....	1846
(i)	Correction of Benefit; Placement in Wrong Retirement System .....	1858
c.	Action Threatened Without Good Cause .....	1859
d.	Time Pressure .....	1861
e.	Involuntary Reassignment .....	1862
f.	Withdrawal of Request to Retire .....	1864
g.	Irrevocable Retirement; VSIP .....	1866
h.	Intolerable Working Conditions .....	1869
i.	Whistleblowing Reprisal .....	1877
j.	Discriminatory Working Conditions .....	1881
k.	Failure to Accommodate Disability .....	1885
l.	Discriminatory Conduct Causes Disability .....	1897
m.	Denial of Leave .....	1898
n.	Mental Disability.....	1899
o.	Agency-Initiated Retirement .....	1899
p.	Discontinued Service Retirement .....	1899
q.	Mandatory Retirement .....	1901
r.	Employing Agency as Party to Appeal Against OPM.....	1901
6.	Constructive Demotion Through Reassignment; <i>Russell</i> .....	1902
a.	Planned Management Action .....	1906
b.	Position Must Be Upgraded .....	1908
c.	Identity of Duties.....	1910
d.	Qualification for Higher-Graded Position .....	1911
e.	Jurisdictional Analysis; Hearing .....	1911
f.	Evidence of Classification Error .....	1912
g.	EEO Allegation .....	1912
h.	Timeliness of Appeal.....	1912
7.	Involuntary Transfer .....	1913
D.	ENFORCED LEAVE; CONSTRUCTIVE SUSPENSION .....	1914
1.	Jurisdictional Analysis; Burden of Proof .....	1917
a.	Hearing.....	1919
b.	EEO Allegation .....	1920
c.	Effect of Receipt of OWCP Benefit.....	1921

d.	Disputed Restoration Right .....	1922
2.	Requirement for Adverse Action Procedure.....	1923
a.	Leave Status Voluntarily Assumed; Failure to Provide Medical Documentation, Perform Available Work.....	1926
b.	Process Due to Employee .....	1929
c.	Evaluation of Leave Enforced Following Notice to Employee .....	1930
d.	Disability Accommodation .....	1930
3.	Employee AWOL .....	1934
4.	Employee Blocked From Working Because of Employer's Concern About Fitness.....	1935
a.	Employee on LWOP .....	1942
5.	Light and Limited Duty; Medical Restriction.....	1942
a.	Historical Development of Light Duty Analysis.....	1946
b.	Collective Bargaining Agreement .....	1951
c.	Disability Accommodation .....	1955
d.	EEO Settlement .....	1959
e.	Termination of Light Duty.....	1960
f.	Postal Service National and Other Collective Bargaining Agreements .....	1962
g.	Furlough .....	1963
6.	Work Release.....	1963
7.	Bar Order Preventing Entry to Workplace .....	1963
8.	Temporary Absence Resulting From Intolerable Working Conditions .....	1965
E.	INDEFINITE SUSPENSION.....	1968
1.	Use .....	1969
2.	Procedure; Duration .....	1972
a.	Due Process .....	1978
b.	Regulatory Error.....	1981
3.	Criminal Activity .....	1982
a.	Indictment; Filing of Information; Referral for Prosecution .....	1983
b.	Investigation Accompanied by Other Circumstances.....	1985
c.	Arrest .....	1987
4.	Nexus.....	1994
5.	Security Clearance or Other Investigation .....	1997
a.	Due Process: Separation of Officials Denying Access and Deciding Suspension; Change in Basis for Clearance Suspension.....	2002
b.	Indefinite Prolongation of Suspension.....	2017
c.	Alternatives to Suspension .....	2019
d.	Discrimination; Accommodation for Disability; Medical Issues; Whistleblowing .....	2025
6.	Inquiry Into Other Issues .....	2026
7.	Remedy .....	2031
a.	Action Following Termination of Criminal Proceeding.....	2036
II.	SERVICE EFFICIENCY .....	2036
A.	BURDEN OF PROOF .....	2038
1.	Charges.....	2039
2.	Affirmative Defenses.....	2039
3.	Preponderance of Evidence .....	2040
a.	Uniformity of Standard .....	2041
b.	Violation of Criminal Statute .....	2041
c.	Intent .....	2041
d.	Suspicion; Belief.....	2042
4.	<i>Prima Facie</i> Case .....	2042
5.	Presumption.....	2042
B.	PERSONAL FAULT .....	2042
1.	Adverse Action to Address Action Involving Another Employee .....	2042
a.	EEO Complaint .....	2043
b.	Merit Promotion Grievance .....	2043
2.	Action Directed by Arbitrator .....	2043
3.	Correction of Administrative Error .....	2043
4.	<i>Respondeat Superior</i> .....	2043
C.	ADVERSE ACTION RELATED TO DISABILITY .....	2046
1.	Medical Standard .....	2047
2.	Medical Impairment .....	2048
a.	Permissible Action; Mitigation.....	2049

3.	Agency-Initiated Retirement.....	2049
a.	Assistance in Securing Counsel.....	2052
b.	Prior Law: Reasonable Cause to Believe.....	2053
4.	Evaluation of Physical Impairment.....	2054
a.	Evidence of Recovery Between Date of Removal and MSPB Decision.....	2057
5.	Effect of Removal for Inability to Work on OPM Disability Annuity Determination.....	2059
a.	Rebuttable Presumption of Annuity Entitlement.....	2059
6.	Effect of Grant of Disability Retirement Application on Action Based on Inability to Perform Duties.....	2067
7.	Allegation of Disability Discrimination; Lack of Reasonable Accommodation.....	2069
III.	SPECIAL CLASSES OF EMPLOYEES.....	2070
A.	SENIOR EXECUTIVE SERVICE.....	2070
1.	Mitigation of Disciplinary Action.....	2076
2.	Performance Case.....	2076
3.	Department of Veterans Affairs.....	2077
a.	2014 Legislation.....	2077
B.	ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES.....	2083
1.	Scope of MSPB Review.....	2086
a.	Good Cause.....	2086
b.	Penalty Determination.....	2091
c.	Affirmative Defenses.....	2092
2.	Cause for Discipline.....	2093
a.	Insubordination.....	2094
b.	Performance.....	2095
c.	Failure to Follow Performance-Related Directive.....	2099
d.	Remarks to Litigant; Comments in Decision; Conduct of Hearing.....	2102
e.	Prolonged Absence; Irregular Attendance.....	2103
f.	Other Misconduct.....	2104
3.	Constructive Action Against Judge: <i>Tunik</i> .....	2107
a.	Forced Retirement.....	2114
b.	Enforced Leave.....	2115
c.	Pre- <i>Tunik</i> Decisions; Judicial Independence.....	2115
4.	Furlough; RIF.....	2123
5.	Settlement of Complaint.....	2126
6.	Voluntary Dismissal of Complaint.....	2127

## CHAPTER 7: NEXUS AND MITIGATION .....2129

I.	CONCEPT OF NEXUS.....	2129
A.	MERRITT AND PRESUMPTIONS OF NEXUS; OFF-DUTY CONDUCT.....	2129
1.	General Approach Toward Proof.....	2131
a.	Actual or Potential Publicity, Notoriety.....	2132
b.	Potential for Future Harm.....	2133
c.	Investigative Exertion.....	2133
B.	SPECIFIC NEXUS DETERMINATIONS.....	2133
1.	Arrest.....	2134
2.	Violent Off-Duty Misconduct.....	2134
a.	Shooting; Killing.....	2134
b.	Assault; Threat.....	2136
3.	Violent Conduct on Agency Premises.....	2137
4.	Off-Duty Drug Offense.....	2137
a.	Drug Activity Involving Agency Time or Facilities.....	2141
5.	Off-Duty Alcohol-Related Offense.....	2141
a.	Off-Duty Activity Involving Agency Premises.....	2142
6.	Sexual Misconduct.....	2142
7.	Fraud and Theft.....	2154
a.	Off-Duty Offense.....	2154
b.	Preemployment Offense.....	2156
c.	On-Duty or Job-Related Offense.....	2156
8.	Gambling.....	2157
9.	Failure to Pay Debt.....	2157
10.	Grievance Meeting.....	2160
11.	Conduct Contrary to Agency Mission.....	2160



a.	Real Estate Activity—DHUD .....	2160
b.	Employee's Tax Problem—IRS, Other Agencies; Responsibility for Errors of Others .....	2160
c.	Law Enforcement Officer; <i>Giglio</i> Impairment .....	2165
d.	Driver.....	2170
e.	Strike-Related Conduct .....	2170
12.	AWOL Removal After Criminal Conviction.....	2170
II.	MITIGATION OR AGGRAVATION OF PENALTIES .....	2170
A.	GENERAL CONSIDERATIONS .....	2171
1.	<i>Douglas</i> Standards; Decision to Reflect Mitigating Factors or MSPB Imposes Maximum Reasonable Penalty .....	2173
a.	Consideration of Mitigating Factors .....	2174
b.	Proposal to List Aggravating Factors; Treatment of Warnings; Due Process Considerations .....	2175
c.	Exemplary Penalty.....	2177
d.	Exaggeration of Charge .....	2177
2.	Articulation of Relevant Factors.....	2178
a.	By Agency; Decision Notice .....	2178
b.	By MSPB .....	2179
3.	Not All Charges Sustained; Maximum Reasonable Penalty .....	2180
a.	Remand to Agency for Redetermination of Penalty .....	2185
4.	All Charges but Not All Specifications Sustained; Partial Specification Sustained.....	2187
5.	Charge Sustained That Was Not Brought .....	2188
6.	Factors Not Considered Mitigating.....	2188
a.	Disability Discrimination; Impairment.....	2188
b.	Discriminatory Environment .....	2189
c.	Prohibited Personnel Practice.....	2189
d.	Offer of Settlement .....	2189
7.	When Mitigation Must Be Raised .....	2189
8.	Special Counsel Disciplinary Case.....	2190
9.	Impact of Mitigation by Demotion on Labor Agreement Requirement .....	2190
B.	SPECIFIC MITIGATING OR AGGRAVATING FACTORS .....	2190
1.	Potential for Rehabilitation .....	2190
a.	Deference to Higher Level Management Assessment.....	2191
b.	Forward-Looking Analysis.....	2191
c.	Performance Action .....	2191
d.	Notice of Rule or Policy .....	2192
e.	Temporary Condition; Stress; Alcoholism .....	2193
f.	Long Service .....	2194
g.	Intervening Good Performance; Misconduct Subsequent to Charge Leading to Adverse Action .....	2194
h.	Post-Removal Conduct or Evidence of Rehabilitation .....	2195
i.	Contrition or Remorse; Admission of Misconduct .....	2197
j.	Denial of Misconduct; Vigorous Defense .....	2198
k.	Repeated Misconduct; Last Chance Agreement.....	2199
2.	Psychological Problem; Illness or Treatment; Stress .....	2199
3.	Performance, Evaluations.....	2205
4.	Intent .....	2206
a.	Notoriety.....	2206
b.	Position of Trust; Fiduciary Duty; Loss of Trust .....	2206
5.	Progressive Discipline .....	2209
a.	Table of Penalties; Classification of Offense .....	2210
6.	Disparate; Comparable Penalties .....	2213
a.	Duty of Agency to Inquire Into Comparable Offenses and Penalties.....	2217
b.	Degree of Consistency Required .....	2218
c.	Substantial Similarity of Offenses; Totality of Circumstances .....	2218
d.	Proximity in Time .....	2223
e.	Same Work Unit; Evolving Case Law: <i>Woebcke</i> ; <i>Lewis</i> .....	2224
f.	Positions of Similar Levels of Trust and Responsibility .....	2232
g.	Selective Prosecution.....	2234
h.	Settlement .....	2234
i.	Comparable Arbitration Awards; Other MSPB Decisions .....	2237
j.	Effect of Criminal Sentence .....	2237
k.	Assertion of Discrimination .....	2238
l.	Post-Removal Comparability Analysis .....	2238



7. Mandatory Penalty .....	2239
8. Staleness of Charge .....	2242
9. Agency Bad Faith, Provocation, Manipulation; Improper Pressure on Appellant; Entrapment .....	2242
10. Condonation .....	2243
11. Favorable Attitude of Coworker; Supervisor .....	2243
12. Severity of Misconduct .....	2244
a. Sequential Disciplinary Proposals .....	2244
b. Multiplicity and Merger of Charges .....	2244
c. Zero Tolerance Policy .....	2244
13. Employee Job Level.....	2246
a. Ineffectiveness as Supervisor; Demotion .....	2247
b. Reassignment .....	2248
C. AGENCY CONSIDERATION OF PAST DISCIPLINE .....	2249
1. Notice Requirement .....	2251
a. Failure to Include Past Discipline in Proposal: Due Process .....	2251
2. Proof, Rebuttal of Past Discipline .....	2252
a. Availability of Challenge to Past Discipline.....	2253
b. Clearly Erroneous .....	2253
c. Reprisal .....	2254
d. Pending Challenge to Past Discipline .....	2255
e. Past Discipline Reversed After Initial Decision .....	2256
f. Discipline Imposed After the Appealed Adverse Action.....	2257
g. Past Discipline Time-Barred .....	2257
h. Dissimilar Offense.....	2258
i. Nondisciplinary Sanction .....	2259
D. JUDICIAL REVIEW OF PENALTY, ADMINISTRATIVE RECONSIDERATION .....	2260
1. General Rule.....	2260
2. Agency Table of Penalties .....	2260
3. Application of Relevant <i>Douglas</i> Factors .....	2260
4. Effect of OPM Reconsideration Request .....	2260

## CHAPTER 8: SUBSTANTIVE OFFENSES.....2261

I. STATUS .....	2261
A. ABSENCE .....	2261
1. Impact on Service Efficiency .....	2261
a. Assigned Post of Duty; Travel Requirement.....	2263
2. Approved and Disapproved Absence.....	2263
a. Abuse of Leave .....	2265
b. Loafing; Wasting Time.....	2265
c. Excessive Leave, LWOP, Absences Beyond Employee's Control; Failure to Maintain a Regular Work Schedule; OWCP Coverage .....	2265
(i) Historical Application of <i>Cook</i> and Related Decisions.....	2269
d. Unscheduled but Approved Absence Following Failure to Follow Procedure to Request Leave .....	2276
e. Disability .....	2279
3. Tardiness.....	2280
4. Leave-Requesting, Leave-Reporting Requirement .....	2280
a. Leave Restriction Notice .....	2284
b. Medical Certification Requirement .....	2285
c. Other Certification or Documentation Requirement .....	2286
d. Disability Accommodation .....	2286
5. Proof of AWOL; Telework Status; Leave Request.....	2286
6. Agency Abuse of Discretion.....	2288
a. Ambiguous Leave Policy or Directive .....	2289
b. Condonation of AWOL .....	2289
c. Jury Duty.....	2289
7. Evidence of Illness First Submitted to MSPB .....	2289
a. FMLA .....	2291
8. LWOP; Other Leave Arrangement; Compensable Injury; Disability Accommodation .....	2291
a. Executive Order 5396; Disabled Veteran .....	2295
b. Advanced Sick Leave .....	2295
c. Donated Leave.....	2296

9.	Family Leave.....	2296
a.	FMLA Request, Agency Compliance; Medical Documentation .....	2301
b.	Constructive Request.....	2309
c.	Belated Submission of Request, Documentation .....	2313
d.	Abuse of Family Leave .....	2314
10.	Worker's Compensation Issue.....	2314
a.	Determining Whether Removal Is Based on Reason Unrelated to OWCP Entitlement.....	2316
b.	Leave-Reporting Requirement .....	2317
c.	No Foreseeable End to Absence; Absence When Compensation Ends .....	2318
11.	Leave Status Pending Disability Retirement .....	2320
12.	Incarceration; Work-Release Program.....	2320
13.	Cancelation or Conversion of Approved Leave .....	2322
14.	Absence Caused by Fear for Safety .....	2322
15.	Military Leave.....	2322
16.	Religious Leave .....	2323
17.	Problem Following Reinstatement Through MSPB Order .....	2323
18.	Aggravating Factors .....	2323
a.	Prolonged AWOL .....	2323
b.	Frequent AWOL .....	2324
c.	Unreliable Attendance.....	2324
19.	Mitigating Factors.....	2324
a.	Short, Infrequent AWOL .....	2325
b.	Longer AWOL .....	2326
c.	Leave Status Caused by Agency's Wrongful Action.....	2327
B.	REFUSAL TO ACCEPT REASSIGNMENT .....	2328
1.	General Rule.....	2329
a.	SES Employee .....	2334
2.	Inconvenience or Health Problem .....	2336
3.	Agency Burden of Proof; Legitimate Reason for Reassignment .....	2336
a.	Mobility Agreement; Condition of Employment .....	2340
b.	Return From Overseas Assignment .....	2341
4.	Misconduct Following Improper Reassignment.....	2341
5.	Application of RIF Procedures; Procedural Errors .....	2341
C.	FAILURE TO MAINTAIN OR OBTAIN CONDITION OF POSITION .....	2341
1.	License, Certification .....	2341
a.	Lawyer .....	2341
b.	Driver.....	2342
c.	Others.....	2343
d.	Medical Certification or Standard.....	2343
e.	Certification by Military Authority.....	2343
2.	Loss of Credential.....	2344
3.	Failure to Complete Training Course; Validity of Examination .....	2344
a.	Air Traffic Controller .....	2344
b.	Other Positions.....	2347
4.	Lack of or Loss of Minimum Qualification; Position Requirement .....	2349
a.	Indian Child Protection and Family Violence Prevention Act .....	2350
b.	Lautenberg Amendment .....	2352
c.	Removal From Reserve Status.....	2355
d.	Access to Agency Computer, Network .....	2359
5.	Security Clearance Revocation; Sensitive Position .....	2360
a.	Clearance Process .....	2360
b.	Agency Clearance Proceeding.....	2361
c.	Review of Agency Determination; <i>Egan</i> ; Constitutional Due Process .....	2365
d.	Decision to Require a Clearance; Whether Clearance Required as Employment Condition .....	2372
e.	Reassignment to Nonsensitive Position; Mitigation .....	2376
f.	EEO Issue; Whistleblower Reprisal; Disparate Treatment; USERRA .....	2378
g.	Regulatory Infraction During Revocation Process.....	2380
h.	Suspension, Removal Under 5 USC 7532.....	2387
i.	Suitability Determination, Security Clearance Distinguished.....	2388
j.	Sensitive Duties Not Requiring a Clearance: <i>Conyers</i> .....	2388
k.	Decisions Postdating <i>Conyers</i> .....	2408

l.	Requirement Similar to Security Clearance; Public Trust Position .....	2411
m.	TSA Sensitive Security Information.....	2413
n.	Retirement Issue Related to Removal for Loss of Clearance.....	2415
6.	Lack of Suitability for Continued Employment .....	2415
D.	CONFLICTS OF INTEREST; APPARENT CONFLICTS.....	2416
1.	Conflicts; Improper Business Dealings .....	2417
2.	Apparent Conflicts.....	2419
3.	Use of Government Office for Private Gain.....	2420
4.	Agency Internal Information.....	2421
a.	Nondisclosure Agreements .....	2421
5.	Transaction With Another; Gift; Bribe; Honorarium; Loan .....	2422
a.	Transaction With Patron, Vendor, Inmate .....	2422
b.	Transaction With Supervisor .....	2424
c.	Compensation for Government Service From Another Source.....	2424
6.	Acting as Agent or Attorney Against Government.....	2424
E.	OUTSIDE EMPLOYMENT .....	2424
1.	Personal Work on Government Time .....	2424
a.	Reporting, Approval Requirements.....	2424
b.	Employment in Violation of Agency Restriction; Outside Practice of Law .....	2425
F.	SPECIAL CATEGORIES OF EMPLOYEES .....	2425
1.	Guard, Correctional Officer, Police, Investigator, Security Official.....	2425
2.	Immigration Officer .....	2426
3.	Ship Employee.....	2426
4.	Supervisor .....	2426
G.	STRIKES.....	2427
1.	Charge of Striking .....	2427
2.	Basis for Removal .....	2427
3.	Proof of Participation .....	2427
4.	Refuting Participation.....	2428
5.	Fear for Personal Safety .....	2428
a.	Insufficient Threat.....	2429
b.	Duress, Coercion Established .....	2429
6.	Association With Strikers .....	2429
7.	Influence of Political Leader .....	2429
8.	Penalty.....	2429
9.	Other Issues.....	2429
II.	RELATIONSHIPS.....	2429
A.	INSUBORDINATION .....	2429
1.	Refusal or Failure to Perform Work .....	2431
a.	Proof of Intent.....	2431
2.	Failure to Follow Instruction .....	2432
3.	Failure to Follow Policy, Regulation .....	2434
4.	Disruptiveness; Lack of Cooperation.....	2435
5.	Recording of Conversation .....	2435
6.	Cumulative Insubordination .....	2435
7.	Dispute Over Position Responsibilities .....	2436
a.	Difficulty Following Reinstatement .....	2437
b.	Breach of Settlement Agreement.....	2437
8.	Insolence, Abusive Language.....	2437
a.	Abuse of Coworker, Subordinate .....	2438
b.	Abuse of Supervisor; Disrespectful or Coarse Language.....	2439
c.	Disagreement Over Instruction, Program .....	2441
9.	Misuse of Dispute Resolution Procedure .....	2441
a.	EEO Process.....	2441
b.	Congressional Communication.....	2442
c.	Grievance Proceeding.....	2442
d.	Supervisor .....	2443
e.	Interference With Employee Grievance.....	2443
10.	Refusal to Take Fitness Examination.....	2444
a.	Properly Ordered .....	2445
b.	Improperly Ordered.....	2445

11. Failure to Provide Medical Information; Position Requirement .....	2449
12. Refusal to Submit to Search or Drug Test .....	2451
13. Problems During Investigations: Lack of Cooperation; Interference; Self-Incrimination .....	2454
14. Administrative Law Judge; Judicial Independence .....	2463
15. Defenses .....	2463
a. Inability to Comply .....	2463
b. Unclear Order; Unknown Policy .....	2463
c. Constitutional, Similar Challenge .....	2464
d. Improper Directive; Command Influence .....	2464
e. Federal Labor Law Policy; Collective Bargaining Contract .....	2469
f. Fear for Safety or Other Harm .....	2470
16. Mitigating Factors .....	2472
B. SEXUAL MISCONDUCT.....	2473
1. Sexual Harassment; Inappropriate Behavior .....	2474
a. Past Significance of Psychological Harm .....	2480
b. Charge Based on Agency Regulation or Standard of Conduct Not Tied to Title VII .....	2486
c. Physical Contact .....	2491
d. Offensive Remarks; Photos.....	2494
e. Consensual Conduct Affecting Workplace .....	2499
f. Homosexual Conduct .....	2500
2. Misconduct Toward Agency Client, Affiliate.....	2500
3. Misconduct Toward Child.....	2500
4. Penalties for Sexual Misconduct .....	2501
a. Demotion, Suspension .....	2501
b. Removal .....	2501
5. Defenses .....	2502
C. CONDUCT HARMING OTHERS; CRIMINAL VIOLATIONS .....	2503
1. Threat; Inappropriate Conduct.....	2503
a. Metz Test .....	2505
b. Reaction of Others to Threat .....	2507
c. Threat Through Another; Rumor .....	2509
d. Conditional Threat .....	2511
e. Statement to Therapist; EAP Counselor.....	2513
f. Statement to Union Representative .....	2515
g. Threat Against a Coworker .....	2517
h. Threat Against a Supervisor .....	2517
i. Threat Against Others .....	2518
j. Thought of Violence .....	2518
k. Inappropriate or Disruptive Statement Not Charged as Threat .....	2519
l. Mitigation.....	2521
2. Assault .....	2522
a. Against Coworker .....	2522
b. Against Supervisor .....	2522
c. Against Subordinate .....	2523
d. Against Others .....	2523
e. Defenses .....	2523
f. Mitigation; Aggravation .....	2524
3. Fighting; Self Defense.....	2526
4. Gambling.....	2527
5. Threat of Legal Action, Whistleblowing, or Publicity .....	2527
6. Lawsuit .....	2529
7. Discourtesy; Related Problems.....	2529
a. Profanity.....	2530
8. Improper Conduct Toward Patient, Ward, Others .....	2531
9. Invidious Discrimination; Offensive Remark; Preferential Treatment; Reprisal .....	2533
a. Action Against Supervisor for Whistleblowing Reprisal, Other Prohibited Personnel Practices .....	2537
b. Nepotism; Hiring of Friend .....	2540
D. CRITICAL STATEMENTS .....	2542
1. Constitutional Framework Applied in Federal Sector .....	2550
a. Private Speech .....	2552
2. Criticism of Agency or Its Personnel .....	2553

a.	Constitutional Analysis .....	2553
b.	Prohibited Personnel Practice Analysis .....	2555
c.	Defamation.....	2557
d.	Congressional Communication.....	2558
e.	Political Activity and Speech .....	2559
f.	Concept of Loyalty .....	2561
3.	Internal Criticism .....	2562
a.	Constitutional Analysis.....	2562
b.	Managerial Disagreement .....	2563
c.	Administrative Law Judge; Judicial Independence.....	2563
d.	Criticism, False Statement About Coworker, Subordinate, Supervisor .....	2563
III.	INTEGRITY.....	2566
A.	FALSIFICATION AND MISREPRESENTATION .....	2566
1.	Proof of Fraud; Falsification .....	2569
a.	Neglect or Mistake .....	2573
b.	Perjury.....	2576
c.	Failure to Correct Report of Another .....	2576
d.	Reliance on Advice of Counsel or Other Individual .....	2576
e.	Cumulative False Statements.....	2577
2.	Employment Application; Security Questionnaire; Lack of Candor .....	2577
a.	Criminal Record.....	2581
b.	Education; Experience .....	2582
c.	Pre-Employment Medical Inquiry.....	2584
3.	Compensation Claim; Voucher .....	2586
a.	Overtime .....	2586
b.	Travel Voucher, Related Documentation.....	2587
c.	OWCP Claim.....	2589
d.	Unemployment Compensation .....	2590
e.	Disability or Leave Claim .....	2591
f.	Pay and Allowances Claim.....	2591
4.	Records of Time, Attendance, Work, and Pay; Negligence .....	2591
5.	Medical Certificate .....	2594
6.	Alteration, Failure to Preserve Documentation and Evidence .....	2594
7.	Investigative Misrepresentation; "Exculpatory No" .....	2594
8.	Lack of Candor.....	2596
9.	Failure to Report Misconduct .....	2600
10.	Disclosure Statement.....	2601
11.	Mitigating Factors .....	2601
a.	Time, Attendance, Travel Record.....	2603
b.	Medical Certificate .....	2603
c.	Employment Application .....	2604
B.	REMOVAL, MISUSE OF PROPERTY .....	2605
1.	Service Efficiency .....	2605
2.	Burden of Proof .....	2605
a.	Conversion .....	2606
b.	Unauthorized Possession or Removal of Property; Theft .....	2607
c.	Unauthorized Use.....	2608
d.	Common Possession .....	2608
e.	Evidence of Intent: Theft and Unauthorized Possession.....	2608
3.	Petty Theft.....	2610
a.	Shoplifting .....	2611
b.	Significance of Custody and Control of Property .....	2611
4.	Government Vehicle.....	2614
a.	Deviation From Assigned Route; Minor Personal Use; Public Service Exception .....	2619
b.	Nonstatutory Vehicle Misuse Charge; Impaired Driver.....	2619
5.	Unauthorized Use, Theft, or Destruction of Specific Property .....	2620
a.	Computer; Internet.....	2620
b.	Photocopier; Facsimile.....	2622
c.	Telephone.....	2622
d.	Government Credit Card.....	2622
e.	Government Services or Funds .....	2623

f.	Government Records; Official Information; Privacy Act .....	2624
g.	Black Marketing; Diversion of Property .....	2638
h.	Obstruction, Theft, or Mistreatment of Mail .....	2639
i.	Misuse of Official Mail, Delivery Service .....	2640
j.	Concealment of Theft .....	2640
k.	Mitigating Factors .....	2640
IV.	MEDICAL.....	2642
A.	DRUG AND ALCOHOL OFFENSES .....	2642
1.	Drug Possession, Use, Distribution .....	2643
a.	Possession or Use .....	2643
b.	Sale or Distribution .....	2646
c.	Safe Harbor Provision .....	2646
d.	Mitigation.....	2648
2.	Alcohol.....	2651
V.	PERFORMANCE.....	2652
A.	POOR PERFORMANCE REQUIRES CORRECTION .....	2652
1.	Performance Evaluations.....	2652
2.	Performance Standards .....	2653
a.	<i>Ad Hoc</i> Measure .....	2653
b.	Assigned Standard.....	2655
c.	Measurement of Work Error.....	2656
3.	Responsibility for Work Error.....	2656
4.	Medical Inability to Perform.....	2657
a.	Specific Medical or Physical Standard.....	2665
b.	Penalty Analysis.....	2665
c.	Disability Accommodation Analysis .....	2666
d.	Recovery From Disability .....	2666
5.	Mitigating Factors; Choice of Penalty .....	2668
a.	Comparative Performance .....	2670
b.	New Duties .....	2670
c.	Detail, Special Assignment .....	2672
d.	Progressive Discipline .....	2672
e.	Lack of Training .....	2672
f.	Lack of Improvement Period .....	2672
g.	Demotion or Reassignment.....	2673
h.	Suspension .....	2674
B.	NEGLIGENCE .....	2674
1.	Endangerment of Employee .....	2675
2.	Public Safety Risk.....	2675
3.	Destruction or Loss of Property .....	2676
4.	Medical Error .....	2676
5.	Mishandling or Improper Possession of Weapon .....	2676
6.	Inattention to Duty; Sleeping on Job .....	2677
7.	Failure to Follow Procedure .....	2677
8.	Excessive Expenditure; Waste .....	2677

## VOLUME II

### CHAPTER 9: PERFORMANCE CASES .....2679

I.	UNACCEPTABLE PERFORMANCE CASES .....	2679
A.	STATUTORY AND REGULATORY PROVISIONS: EMPLOYEE AND AGENCY COVERAGE .....	2680
1.	OPM Regulations .....	2682
B.	OVERVIEW OF PERFORMANCE ACTIONS .....	2683
1.	Merit Pay Employee .....	2684
C.	OPM APPROVAL OF APPRAISAL SYSTEM.....	2684
1.	Change in Appraisal System.....	2685
2.	Flexibility Permitted by Appraisal System.....	2689
3.	Extent of OPM Review; Subordinate Organization Within Agency.....	2689
4.	Change Directed by OPM.....	2691
D.	PERFORMANCE STANDARD CRITERIA .....	2691
1.	Substantive Right .....	2692



2.	Scope of Review .....	2693
a.	Deference to Agency Management .....	2693
3.	Objectivity .....	2695
a.	Timeliness of Work .....	2697
b.	Draft; Intermediate Work Product .....	2698
c.	Personal Characteristic: Initiative, Reliability .....	2698
4.	<i>Wilson and Jackson</i> ; Negative or “Backwards” Standard.....	2698
5.	Communication of Standard.....	2702
6.	Augmentation of Standard.....	2702
7.	PIP to Establish, Refine Standard .....	2704
8.	Specific Occupations .....	2706
a.	Clerical Employee, Secretary .....	2706
b.	Voucher Examiner .....	2708
c.	Inspector.....	2708
d.	Social Security Claims Representative .....	2708
e.	Employee Relations, Human Relations Specialist .....	2709
f.	Trade Analyst.....	2709
g.	Medical Technologist; Nurse.....	2709
h.	Scientist .....	2710
i.	Tradesperson .....	2710
j.	IT Specialist .....	2710
k.	Supervisory Supply Technician .....	2711
l.	Engineer .....	2711
m.	Lawyer .....	2711
n.	Paralegal .....	2711
o.	Management Analyst .....	2711
p.	Realty Specialist .....	2712
q.	Others .....	2712
9.	Numeric Standard .....	2712
10.	Multiple Components.....	2714
11.	Classification, Significance of Error .....	2716
12.	Relation of Standards in Element .....	2716
13.	Absolute Standard; <i>Guillebeau</i> .....	2717
a.	Law Before <i>Guillebeau</i> .....	2721
b.	Standard to Be Viewed as a Whole.....	2722
c.	Modification of Absolute Standard .....	2722
d.	Standard That Enumerates Tasks .....	2723
e.	Level of Performance That May Be Exceeded .....	2724
14.	Unreasonable Standard .....	2724
15.	Levels of Performance .....	2725
a.	Five-Tier Appraisal System; Marginal, Minimally Successful, or “Needs Improvement” Level of Performance .....	2726
b.	Multiple Appraisal Levels Derived From Ratings for Critical Elements .....	2730
c.	Two-Level; Pass/Fail Appraisal System .....	2731
16.	Standards Development; Employee Involvement .....	2732
17.	Change in Standard.....	2733
a.	Through PIP .....	2734
E.	OPPORTUNITY TO IMPROVE .....	2735
1.	Prerequisite of Unacceptable Performance .....	2735
a.	Agency Need Not Prove Pre-PIP Unacceptable Performance .....	2736
2.	Opportunity Period Requirements .....	2737
a.	Order, Burden of Proof .....	2738
b.	Control Over Work .....	2738
c.	Assistance to Employee.....	2738
d.	Necessity for Specific Warning .....	2740
e.	Statement of Expectations; Job Responsibilities Not Described in PIP .....	2740
f.	Impossibility of Improvement; Unreasonable Expectations.....	2741
g.	Harmful Error Rule.....	2742
3.	Time Allowed for Improvement.....	2742
a.	One-Year Maximum for Evaluation; Pre-PIP Performance .....	2744
b.	Post-PIP Performance; Roller Coaster Employees .....	2746
c.	PIP Extension.....	2749



d.	Performance During Detail .....	2750
F.	PROCEDURE .....	2750
1.	Chapter 43 and 75 Actions Distinguished.....	2751
a.	Executive Order 13,839.....	2751
2.	Failure to Use Chapter 43 .....	2752
a.	<i>Lovshin</i> .....	2752
b.	Conversion of Action .....	2753
c.	Limitations on Use of Chapter 43 .....	2757
3.	Proposal, Decision Letter .....	2757
a.	Requirement of Concurrence.....	2758
b.	Unstated Charge .....	2758
c.	Necessity for Specific Instances.....	2758
d.	Notice Period .....	2760
G.	NECESSARY PROOF: SUBSTANTIAL EVIDENCE .....	2760
1.	Test Defined; Scope of Review .....	2760
2.	Weight, Quality of Substantial Evidence .....	2761
a.	Charges, Work Papers.....	2762
b.	Effect of Prior Performance Evaluation; Rating Issued in Error .....	2763
c.	Statistics; Sampling Method.....	2763
d.	Other Documentation; Testimony.....	2765
H.	DEFENSES .....	2765
1.	Propriety and Comparison of Performance Standards .....	2766
2.	Comparison of Employees' Performance.....	2766
3.	Adequacy of PIP; Lack of Control of Work; Agency Bad Faith .....	2766
4.	Training .....	2768
5.	Discrimination; Disparate Treatment .....	2769
6.	Reprisal.....	2773
7.	Collective Bargaining Agreement .....	2773
I.	PRECLUSION OF MITIGATION .....	2774
II.	WITHIN-GRADE INCREASE DENIALS .....	2774
A.	BASIS FOR APPEAL .....	2776
B.	WHEN JURISDICTION ATTACHES.....	2777
1.	Effect of Collective Bargaining Agreement .....	2782
C.	BURDEN OF PROOF .....	2783
1.	Proof of Poor Performance .....	2783
a.	Role of Performance Standards.....	2784
2.	Substantial Evidence Controls.....	2784
a.	What Constitutes Evidence.....	2785
D.	DEFENSES .....	2785
1.	Error in ALOC Procedure .....	2785
a.	Linkage of ALOC and Appraisal System .....	2785
b.	Waiting Period .....	2786
c.	Lack of ALOC Determination.....	2787
d.	Vague ALOC Determination .....	2787
2.	Reconsideration Errors.....	2787
a.	Employee Denied Information .....	2787
b.	Reconsideration Summary Lacking .....	2787
c.	Reconsideration Decision Level .....	2787
d.	Late Reconsideration Decision .....	2788
3.	Circumstances of Employee .....	2788
a.	Unfair Work Burden .....	2788
b.	Illness or Disability .....	2788
c.	Comparative Work Production .....	2788
d.	Lack of Training .....	2788

## CHAPTER 10: REDUCTIONS IN FORCE.....2789

I.	RIF PROCESS .....	2789
A.	NATURE OF RIF .....	2789
1.	Statutory Provisions .....	2790
2.	OPM Regulations, Guidance.....	2791
a.	Validity of RIF Statute, Regulations .....	2793

3.	Furlough .....	2793
a.	Exemptions .....	2805
b.	Emergency Furlough .....	2806
c.	Part-Time, Light Duty Status; Intermittent Appointment; Work Schedule Adjustment.....	2807
d.	Discovery in Furlough Appeal.....	2808
B.	ACTIONS APPEALABLE AS RIF; MSPB JURISDICTION .....	2810
1.	Regulatory Structure.....	2810
2.	Jurisdictional Effect of Collective Bargaining Agreement.....	2811
3.	Types of Appointees.....	2811
a.	Temporary .....	2811
b.	Probationer.....	2812
c.	Demonstration Project .....	2812
d.	Postal Service Non-Preference Eligible .....	2815
e.	Part-Time.....	2816
f.	Senior Executive Service .....	2816
g.	Agencies With Independent Statutory Personnel Authority.....	2819
4.	Possible RIF.....	2820
5.	Action to Avoid RIF .....	2820
a.	Transfer to Another Agency .....	2821
b.	Resignation .....	2821
c.	Retirement .....	2821
d.	Detail.....	2821
e.	Reassignment Without Regard to RIF .....	2822
(i)	Representative Rate.....	2823
f.	Reassignment During or Following RIF.....	2824
g.	Reassignment With Pay Reduction in Anticipation of RIF .....	2825
(i)	Postal Reorganizations: 1990s.....	2825
(ii)	Postal Reorganizations: 2000 Onward.....	2833
(iii)	Other Agencies.....	2838
6.	Grade and Pay Retention; Pay Rate Change; Demotion .....	2841
7.	Classification Issue .....	2841
a.	Erosion of Duties.....	2843
b.	Intentional Changes in Duties .....	2845
8.	Transfer of Function.....	2845
a.	Identification of Positions for Transfer .....	2847
b.	Employee Who Declines to Move.....	2850
C.	COMPETITIVE AREA.....	2850
1.	Defined .....	2850
2.	Criteria .....	2851
3.	Assignment Across Competitive Area .....	2851
4.	Challenge to Competitive Area .....	2851
a.	Burden of Proof .....	2851
b.	Organizational Structure; One-Person RIF.....	2851
c.	Geographical Structure; Local Commuting Area .....	2854
D.	COMPETITIVE LEVEL .....	2855
1.	Defined .....	2855
2.	Challenge to Competitive Level .....	2857
a.	Primacy of Position Description .....	2858
b.	Testimony Concerning Duties .....	2860
c.	Loss of Productivity; Undue Interruption .....	2861
d.	Collective Bargaining Agreement .....	2862
e.	Challenge to Performance Appraisal .....	2863
3.	Particular Groups of Employees .....	2864
a.	Developmental/Trainee .....	2864
b.	Temporary.....	2865
c.	Part-Time .....	2865
d.	VA Health Care Professional.....	2865
e.	Bureau of Indian Affairs; Indian Health Service .....	2868
4.	Scope of MSPB Review .....	2868
a.	Impact of Error.....	2868
b.	Right to Hearing .....	2869

c. Substantive Review.....	2869
II. ASSIGNMENT AND RELATED RIGHTS .....	2870
A. REGULATORY AND OPERATIONAL BASIS .....	2870
1. Veteran, Other Preferences.....	2872
2. Appointment Qualifying for Assignment Right .....	2874
a. Excepted Service.....	2874
b. Detail.....	2874
c. Intergovernmental Personnel Act .....	2874
d. Part-Time/Full-Time .....	2874
3. Position Subject to Displacement.....	2874
a. Supervisory .....	2874
b. Temporary.....	2874
4. Filling of Vacancies.....	2874
5. Assessment of Qualifications.....	2877
a. Updating Qualifications.....	2880
b. Qualifications of Displacing Employee .....	2880
c. Merit Promotion Issue.....	2880
d. Undue Interruption .....	2881
6. Representative Rate .....	2882
7. Amendment of RIF Notice; Change in Position Offer.....	2883
B. BUMPING.....	2884
C. RETREAT .....	2886
1. Prior Rule .....	2887
2. Method of Analysis .....	2887
3. Burden of Proof .....	2889
D. REEMPLOYMENT RIGHTS .....	2889
1. Reemployment Priority List Right Before RIF Effective Date .....	2901
2. Remedy in Reemployment Priority List Appeal .....	2903
3. Transitional Assistance .....	2903
III. RIF CHALLENGES.....	2904
A. BURDEN OF PROOF.....	2904
1. Agency Responsibility .....	2904
2. <i>Prima Facie</i> Case.....	2905
3. Qualifications; Assignment Right .....	2905
4. Classification Dispute .....	2905
B. <i>BONA FIDE</i> RIF: <i>LOSURE</i> .....	2906
1. Substantive Rights, Harmful Error.....	2906
2. RIF as Adverse Action.....	2909
3. Challenge to Reorganization .....	2913
a. Reorganization Defined; Single Position RIF .....	2913
b. Managerial Discretion.....	2913
c. Funding Decision .....	2914
d. Redistribution of Duties .....	2916
e. Planning for Future Events .....	2916
f. Comparative Qualifications as a Factor in Selection of Positions for RIF .....	2917
g. Contribution to Agency Mission; Funding of Individual Position .....	2917
h. Contracting Out Challenge .....	2918
i. Sham, Paperwork Reorganization: Old, New Position Identical; Delayed Reorganization .....	2918
j. Merit Promotion, Hiring, Placement During RIF.....	2921
k. Events Preceding, Subsequent to RIF .....	2921
C. DISCRIMINATION DEFENSES .....	2922
1. Age .....	2927
2. Religion.....	2928
D. PROCEDURAL ISSUES .....	2928
1. Internal Procedures .....	2928
2. Timing of Job Offer; Timing of Release of Employees .....	2928
3. Correction of Retention Standing Error .....	2928
4. Adequacy of RIF Notice .....	2929

# CHAPTER 11: HARMFUL ERROR.....2931

I.	STATUTORY STANDARD .....	2931
A.	HARMFUL ERROR DEFINED.....	2931
1.	<i>Parker</i> .....	2932
2.	Might Have/Would Have Analysis .....	2933
B.	HARMFUL ERROR APPLIED .....	2934
1.	Mixing Harmful Error and Other Doctrines.....	2934
a.	Mitigation of Penalty .....	2934
b.	Prohibited Personnel Practice .....	2934
2.	Statutory, Regulatory Violation; Action Not in Accordance With Law .....	2934
a.	Unfair Labor Practice .....	2936
b.	Privacy Act; Disclosure of Confidential Information .....	2938
c.	Constitution.....	2939
d.	Invalid Regulation .....	2939
3.	Collective Bargaining Contract Violation.....	2940
a.	Disputed Coverage .....	2942
b.	Impact of Arbitration Award .....	2942
c.	Employment Contract .....	2943
4.	Problem With Representation .....	2943
a.	Cautionary Notes to Counsel .....	2943
5.	Treatment of Affirmative Defense if Action Is Set Aside as Erroneous.....	2944
II.	ERROR IN PRELIMINARY PROCEDURES.....	2944
A.	AGENCY INVESTIGATION .....	2944
1.	Due Process .....	2945
2.	Right to Counsel; Union Representative.....	2945
3.	Entrapment .....	2947
4.	Agency Predecisional Hearing .....	2948
5.	Security Clearance Investigation .....	2948
B.	STALE CHARGES; LACHES .....	2949
1.	General Rule .....	2949
2.	Agency Regulation; Collective Bargaining Agreement .....	2951
3.	Performance Case .....	2951
C.	ESTOPPEL; DOUBLE JEOPARDY .....	2951
1.	Estoppel .....	2951
2.	Double Jeopardy .....	2952
a.	Reinitiation of a Proposal After an Adverse Action Is Canceled.....	2959
b.	Action Initiated After Earlier Action Invalidated for Procedural Reason.....	2960
c.	Consecutive Adverse Actions.....	2961
d.	Action Following Acquittal .....	2961
III.	ERRORS IN PROPOSAL NOTICE AND REPLY PROCESS .....	2961
A.	BASIC RIGHTS .....	2961
1.	Pre-Decision Proposal Not Mandated in Some Cases When Due Process Is Provided Following Decision .....	2964
2.	Right to Counsel .....	2966
B.	PROPOSAL NOTICE.....	2967
1.	Purpose, Sufficiency of Notice; Due Process .....	2967
a.	Supporting Evidence.....	2968
b.	Technical Deficiencies .....	2969
c.	Failure to Provide Notice of Appeal or Statutory Right .....	2969
d.	Error in Date .....	2969
e.	Other Minor Error .....	2970
f.	Assessing Sufficiency of Charge.....	2971
2.	Specific Charge; Only Conduct Described .....	2975
a.	Conduct Postdating Proposal .....	2980
b.	Amendment .....	2980
3.	Framing of Charge .....	2980
a.	General Charge; Charge Label; Detailed Narrative; <i>Otero</i> and <i>Cross</i> .....	2980
b.	Variation Between Stated Charge and Supporting Narrative or Specification; <i>Nazelrod</i> and <i>Lachance</i> .....	2984
c.	Splitting of Charge.....	2990
d.	Independent Elements of Single Charge .....	2992
e.	Multiple Specifications Supporting a Single Charge .....	2996
f.	Lesser Included Offense .....	2999

g.	Past Discipline; Performance Record; Aggravating Factors .....	2999
4.	Citation of Standards of Conduct.....	2999
5.	Charge Tied to Penalty Table Classification .....	2999
6.	Criminal Charge .....	3000
7.	Mixing Chapters 43 and 75 .....	3001
8.	Cumulative Charges; Merger of Charges.....	3001
9.	Charge of Unbecoming or Improper Conduct .....	3003
10.	Service of Notice.....	3005
C.	INADEQUATE REPLY AND NOTICE PERIOD .....	3007
1.	Calculation .....	3007
2.	Not Less Than Seven Days for Reply .....	3008
3.	30-Day Advance Notice of Action .....	3010
D.	SHORTENED NOTICE PERIOD; CRIME PROVISION .....	3011
1.	Procedure to Invoke Shortened Notice .....	3012
2.	Reasonable Belief of Crime.....	3013
a.	Arrest, Warrant .....	3015
b.	Conduct Caused by Mental Impairment.....	3015
3.	Emergency Suspension for Reason Other Than Reasonable Belief of Crime .....	3015
4.	Indefinite Suspension.....	3016
E.	FAILURE TO PROVIDE EVIDENCE FILE, OTHER INFORMATION.....	3016
1.	Loss or Destruction of Evidence .....	3019
F.	ORAL AND WRITTEN REPLIES.....	3019
1.	Proof of Harm; Failure to Consider a Reply; Due Process.....	3021
a.	Investigation of Information Provided by the Employee.....	3026
b.	Criminal Proceeding Pending .....	3027
2.	Waiver of Reply Right .....	3027
a.	Extension Request .....	3027
3.	Decisionmaker, Reply Officer .....	3031
4.	Right to Confrontation.....	3031
5.	Right to Information.....	3031
6.	Inadequate Representation.....	3032
G.	AGENCY DECISIONAL PROCEDURES; <i>EX PARTE</i> COMMUNICATIONS.....	3032
1.	Early Law From Courts.....	3032
2.	<i>Sullivan</i> ; Regulatory Prohibitions; Adverse External Influences .....	3035
3.	<i>Stone</i> ; Current, Broadened Due Process Test.....	3038
a.	Reinitiation of Action Following Due Process Reversal .....	3044
4.	Early Law From MSPB .....	3044
5.	Deciding Official Consults Witness, Advisor; Information Not Disclosed to Employee .....	3047
a.	Information From Witness.....	3047
b.	Impact of 5 USC 2302(b)(2).....	3048
c.	Report, Investigation .....	3048
d.	Advisor.....	3049
e.	Past Discipline as Rebuttal to Mitigation .....	3049
f.	Multiple Charges.....	3049
6.	Proposing and Deciding Official Confer .....	3051
7.	Information Pertaining to Aggravation or Mitigation of Penalty; <i>Ward</i> .....	3052
a.	Potential Publicity, Notoriety, Other Harm.....	3070
b.	Information or Documents in the Evidence File Not Referenced in the Proposal .....	3072
c.	Information Provided to the Deciding Official Before the Reply Process Begins .....	3073
d.	Evaluation of Information Presented During Reply .....	3074
e.	Penalty Table, Standards of Conduct.....	3075
f.	Performance Cases.....	3077
g.	Harmful Error Analysis Before <i>Ward</i> .....	3079
8.	Predisposition to Take Adverse Action; Offer to Permit Resignation; Uninformed Deciding Official .....	3080
a.	Biased Proposing Official.....	3084
b.	Malicious Initiation of Action .....	3085
9.	Deciding Official Who Is Biased or Whose Decision Is Directed .....	3085
10.	Involvement of OSC.....	3086
11.	Changes in Proposing, Deciding Official .....	3086
12.	Lack of Authority.....	3090
a.	Deciding Official .....	3090

b. Proposing Official .....	3091
13. Lack of Discretion .....	3091
14. Pending Retirement Application .....	3092
15. Specificity of Decision Letter .....	3092
a. No Decision Letter .....	3092
b. Retroactive Decision Letter .....	3093
c. Notice of Appeal Rights .....	3093
16. Delayed Decision .....	3093

## CHAPTER 12: DISCRIMINATION .....3095

I. DISCRIMINATION ISSUES .....	3095
A. PROCEDURES IN MIXED CASES .....	3096
1. Multiple Agency Review Processes .....	3097
2. Multiple Filing Options; Pleading Requirements; Timing of MSPB Appeal .....	3098
a. Withdrawal or Abandonment of EEO Allegation .....	3099
b. Authority of Judge to Strike Frivolous EEO Allegation; Summary Judgment .....	3100
3. Jurisdictional Problems With EEO Complaints .....	3103
a. Filing Dates .....	3103
b. Timeliness of EEO Complaint .....	3105
c. EEO Class Action .....	3108
d. EEO Complaint Withdrawn .....	3109
e. What Constitutes a Complaint .....	3110
f. Coextensive Issues; Scope of Complaint .....	3111
g. Premature Appeal .....	3111
4. Duty to Resolve Issues and Inform Appellant of Elements of Proof .....	3112
5. Jurisdiction Over Appealable Action; Constructive Adverse Action .....	3113
a. Probationer .....	3114
b. Restoration Appeal Involving Employee Partially Recovered From Compensable Injury .....	3114
6. Election of Remedies .....	3115
a. Grievance Collective Bargaining Agreement .....	3115
b. Informed Election; Treatment of EEO Complaint .....	3116
c. Effect of Subject Matter of Preexisting Complaint on Subsequent Appeal; Complaint Involving Proposed Action .....	3117
7. MSPB Remand; EEOC Remand .....	3118
8. Strategic Considerations .....	3121
B. BURDEN OF PROOF .....	3121
1. <i>Prima Facie</i> Case .....	3122
2. Analysis Following the <i>Prima Facie</i> Case .....	3125
a. Analysis of Motivation, Pretext .....	3128
b. Mixed Motives; Proof That Action Would Have Been Taken Without Discriminatory Motive .....	3129
c. Element of Intent; Employer Error .....	3136
d. Significance of Agency's Proof of Charges .....	3137
e. Significance of Agency's Failure to Prove Charge .....	3139
f. Comparable Employees; Disparate Treatment .....	3140
C. EVIDENCE .....	3146
1. Direct Evidence; Evidence Considered as a Whole; Comparators; Taint of Agency Official; Cat's Paw .....	3147
2. Circumstantial Evidence; Pretext; Presumption .....	3150
3. Disparate Impact .....	3152
4. Statistics .....	3153
5. Supervisory Practices; Remarks .....	3154
D. FORMS OF DISCRIMINATION .....	3155
1. Race .....	3155
2. Age .....	3157
3. Religion .....	3162
4. Marital Status .....	3163
5. Pregnancy .....	3163
6. Sex; Sexual Orientation; Equal Pay Act .....	3164
7. Retirement Cases: Application by OPM of Statutory Requirements .....	3164
E. REPRISAL .....	3165
1. Convincing Mosaic; Evidence Considered as a Whole; Comparators .....	3176
2. Collateral Personnel Action of Evidentiary Weight in an EEO Affirmative Defense .....	3179



3.	Taint of Reprisal by Lower Level Official; Cat's Paw .....	3180
II.	REHABILITATION ACT: DISABLING CONDITIONS .....	3181
A.	REGULATORY STRUCTURE.....	3183
B.	PRIMA FACIE CASE; ACCOMMODATION REQUIREMENTS .....	3187
1.	Individual Regarded or Perceived as Disabled .....	3189
2.	Individual Associated With Disabled Person .....	3196
3.	Substantial Limitation of Major Life Activity .....	3196
a.	Life Activity of Working .....	3198
4.	Order and Burden of Proof.....	3202
a.	Disparate Treatment .....	3211
b.	Mixed Motive Analysis.....	3211
5.	Causal Connection.....	3214
6.	Transitory or Temporary Disability.....	3216
a.	Corrected or Mitigated Condition .....	3218
7.	Limitation on General Employability .....	3219
a.	Allergy.....	3221
b.	Stress Disorder .....	3223
c.	Other Mental Disability; Proof of Disability.....	3228
8.	Conditions Not Protected by Rehabilitation Act .....	3229
a.	Gambling Compulsion .....	3229
b.	Sexual Disorder .....	3229
c.	Pregnancy .....	3229
9.	Qualified Disabled Employee .....	3230
a.	Dangerousness; Risk Assessment; Direct Threat .....	3231
b.	Lack of Medical Release .....	3237
10.	Knowledge of Disability.....	3237
a.	When Disability Claim or Defense Must Be Raised .....	3238
11.	Suggesting Nonapparent Accommodation; Duty of Reasonable Inquiry .....	3240
a.	Interactive Process .....	3242
C.	ACCOMMODATION THROUGH JOB RESTRUCTURING, ASSISTANCE .....	3244
1.	Light Duty and Job Modification.....	3244
a.	Lifting Requirements.....	3249
b.	Postal Service Collective Bargaining Agreements.....	3251
c.	Inappropriate Job Modification; Increased Job Burden .....	3252
2.	Provision of, Modification to, Job Equipment .....	3252
3.	Alteration of Work Schedule, Worksite; Telework .....	3254
4.	Alteration of Training Requirement.....	3265
D.	ACCOMMODATION THROUGH REASSIGNMENT .....	3266
1.	<i>Ignacio</i> .....	3268
2.	Evaluation of Reassignment Effort .....	3270
a.	Reassignments Across Organizational Lines .....	3275
E.	ALTERNATIVE ACCOMMODATIVE REQUIREMENTS .....	3281
1.	Collective Bargaining Agreement.....	3281
2.	Agency Regulation .....	3282
3.	Restoration From Compensable Injury .....	3283
4.	Demotion; Promotion.....	3283
5.	Modification of Agency Policy, Facility.....	3284
6.	Job Training; Change in Supervision .....	3285
7.	Referral for Counseling.....	3288
F.	AGENCY DEFENSES .....	3288
1.	Disqualifying Misconduct .....	3288
2.	Undue Hardship.....	3289
a.	Unreasonable Accommodation.....	3292
b.	Restrictions in Collective Bargaining Agreement .....	3294
3.	Lack of Qualification for Position.....	3295
a.	Failure to Provide Evidence of Fitness for Position With Medical Standard .....	3296
4.	Receipt of Disability Annuity.....	3297
5.	Rebuttal .....	3298
6.	Restriction on Remedy .....	3298
G.	ALCOHOLISM AND SUBSTANCE ABUSE.....	3298
1.	Necessity for Accommodation: <i>Ruzek</i> .....	3300

a.	Suitability.....	3301
b.	Postal Service Employee .....	3302
2.	Notice of Disability.....	3302
a.	Agency Request for Information.....	3302
3.	Proof of Disease .....	3303
4.	Causal Connection: Misconduct Caused by Disease .....	3304
a.	Alcohol or Drug Use on the Job .....	3308
b.	Revocation of Driver's License .....	3308
c.	Possession of Drugs.....	3308
d.	Misappropriation or Theft of Drugs.....	3309
e.	Misappropriation of Funds .....	3309
5.	Qualified Disabled Employee; <i>Hougens</i> and Disqualifying Conduct .....	3310
a.	Current Substance Abuser .....	3313
b.	Disqualifying Misconduct: Removal Appropriate.....	3315
c.	Less Serious Conduct: Concurrent Rehabilitation, Discipline.....	3320
6.	Firm Choice, Last Chance Agreement.....	3322
a.	Requirement of Collective Bargaining Agreement, Agency Regulation .....	3324
b.	Failed Rehabilitation Attempt.....	3326
7.	Undue Hardship .....	3329
III.	AVENUES OF FURTHER REVIEW OF EEO DEFENSES .....	3329
A.	EEOC.....	3329
B.	SPECIAL PANEL.....	3330
C.	COURT.....	3338
1.	Scope of District Court Review.....	3340
a.	Effect of District Court Review .....	3341
b.	Time for District Court Review; Tolling or Estoppel; Exhaustion of Remedies .....	3345
2.	Effect of Waiver of EEO Claim .....	3348

## CHAPTER 13: PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICES.....3349

I.	OVERVIEW.....	3349
A.	SIGNIFICANCE OF DISCOVERY.....	3351
II.	TYPES OF PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICES .....	3352
A.	WHISTLEBLOWING REPRISAL.....	3354
1.	Whistleblower Protection Enhancement Act of 2012; Retroactivity .....	3354
2.	Statutory Definitions Control .....	3356
a.	"Gross" Waste or Mismanagement .....	3357
b.	Violation of Law, Rule, or Regulation .....	3364
c.	Abuse of Authority .....	3372
d.	Threat to Public Health and Safety.....	3377
e.	Disclosure of Censorship Related to Research, Analysis, or Technical Information.....	3403
3.	Dispute Over Form of Whistleblowing .....	3403
a.	Disclosure of Potential Harm or Wrongdoing .....	3403
b.	Complaint to Wrongdoer.....	3404
c.	Disclosure to Someone Who Cannot Directly Remedy the Problem.....	3407
d.	Minor Personal Grievance .....	3409
e.	Internal, Policy Disagreement.....	3409
f.	Disclosure Made During Normal Course of Duties.....	3415
g.	Required Report Under Office of Government Ethics Rules, E.O. 12675 .....	3427
h.	Communication Indirectly Involving the Government; Private Wrongdoing .....	3427
i.	Communication to News Media; Congress.....	3430
j.	Disclosure in Court.....	3431
k.	Complaint to the Inspector General .....	3431
l.	Disclosure of Information Already Known or Public.....	3432
m.	Sequential Allegations .....	3434
4.	Whistleblowing No Shield Against Misconduct.....	3434
a.	Abusive Whistleblower; Robust Language; Chain of Command.....	3435
b.	Threatened Disclosure.....	3439
5.	Personnel Treated as Whistleblowers .....	3440
a.	Individual Perceived as Whistleblower .....	3440
b.	Whistleblower's Aide, Associate.....	3444
c.	Individual Serving as Conduit of Information; Internal Disclosure .....	3445

d. Former Employee .....	3446
e. Contractor Employee .....	3446
6. Protected Disclosure: Reasonableness .....	3447
a. "Reasonably Believes"; False Statement .....	3447
b. Motivation of Whistleblower .....	3453
c. Information Developed After Disclosure .....	3453
d. Belief Shared by Other Employees; Disinterested Observer .....	3453
e. Response of Agency to Disclosure .....	3454
f. Expertise of Whistleblower .....	3455
g. Specificity of Disclosure .....	3456
h. Presumed Agency Good Faith; "Irrefragable Proof" Standard .....	3458
7. Unprotected Disclosure; Dispute Concerning Coverage of Disclosure Under 2302(b)(8) or 2302(b)(9) .....	3461
a. Disclosure Prohibited by Law; Regulation Incorporating Statutory Provision .....	3464
b. EEO Complaint .....	3474
c. Other Appeals, Charges, FECA Claims, Grievances, and Complaints .....	3478
8. Disclosures in Multiple Forums .....	3482
B. PROHIBITED PRACTICES OTHER THAN WHISTLEBLOWING REPRISAL .....	3484
1. Discrimination Proscribed by Civil Rights Laws; 5 USC 2302(b)(1)(A) .....	3485
a. Sexual Harassment .....	3485
2. Improper Personnel Recommendation; 5 USC 2302(b)(2) .....	3485
3. Obstruction of Competition; 5 USC 2302(b)(4) .....	3486
4. Influencing Employment Decision; 5 USC 2302(b)(5) .....	3486
5. Improper Preference, Promotion; 5 USC 2302(b)(6) .....	3487
6. 5 USC 2302(b)(9); Appeal Right; Grievance, Complaint; OSC and IG Involvement; Refusal to Obey Unlawful Order .....	3489
a. WPEA: Exercise of, Testimony or Assistance in, Appeal, Complaint, or Grievance .....	3495
7. Discrimination Unrelated to Job Performance; 5 USC 2302(b)(10) .....	3497
8. Discrimination Against Veteran; 5 USC 2302(b)(11) .....	3499
9. Violation of Merit System Principle; 5 USC 2302(b)(12) .....	3499
a. Failure to Provide Effective Training; 5 USC 2301(b)(7); Training for Government Personnel on Whistleblowing Protections .....	3502
10. Nondisclosure Agreement; 5 USC 2302(b)(13) .....	3503
11. Refusal to Violate Law, Regulation, or Rule .....	3503
III. INDIVIDUAL RIGHT OF ACTION .....	3505
A. STATUTORY AND REGULATORY REQUIREMENTS AND LIMITATIONS .....	3507
1. Time for Initiating IRA Appeal With OSC and MSPB .....	3514
a. Laches in Filing OSC Complaint .....	3515
b. Case That May Be Either Initiated With OSC or Appealed Directly to MSPB .....	3516
c. Jurisdiction Limitations of an IRA Rather Than an Adverse Action Appeal .....	3517
d. Premature Appeal Following Resort to OSC .....	3517
e. Belated Receipt of OSC Closeout Notice .....	3518
f. Calculation of Appeal Period; Late IRA Appeal; Waiver .....	3519
g. Equitable Tolling .....	3521
h. OSC Reopening .....	3524
B. JURISDICTIONAL ISSUE .....	3527
1. <i>Rusin</i> Model: Nonfrivolous Allegations Establish Jurisdiction .....	3528
a. Nonfrivolous Allegations Based on the Written Record .....	3532
b. Hearing .....	3534
2. Jurisdictional Analysis Before <i>Rusin</i> .....	3535
3. Variations in Order of Proof; Bifurcation; Necessity to Consider Entire Record .....	3536
4. Exhaustion of Remedies; Amendment of Appeal .....	3545
5. Election and Preclusion of Remedies .....	3549
a. Grievance or MSPB Appeal .....	3550
b. Exhaustion of OSC Process; Direct Appeal of Otherwise Appealable Action .....	3553
c. EEO Complaint .....	3557
6. Collateral Jurisdiction Over EEO Claim Presented in IRA Appeal Not Involving Otherwise Appealable Action .....	3557
7. Restricted Jurisdiction Over Merits Determination, Collateral Prohibited Personnel Practice, Constitutional, Discrimination, and Harmful Error Claims in Otherwise Appealable Action Initiated Through OSC as IRA .....	3558
8. Status of Particular Agencies and Employees .....	3560
a. Postal Service .....	3560
b. Department of Veterans Affairs Title 38 Employee .....	3562
c. National Guard Technician .....	3566

d.	Federal Bureau of Investigation .....	3569
e.	Judicial Branch.....	3572
f.	Federal Reserve Board .....	3572
g.	NAF Employee .....	3573
h.	Independent Counsel .....	3573
i.	Office Of Special Counsel .....	3573
j.	Federal Aviation Administration .....	3573
k.	Transportation Security Agency .....	3574
l.	Intelligence, Counterintelligence Agencies; Foreign National.....	3577
m.	Government Corporation .....	3580
n.	Other Entities .....	3580
o.	Experts and Consultants; Personnel Appointed Outside Title 5.....	3581
p.	Lawyer .....	3583
q.	Former Employee .....	3583
r.	Inspector General Office .....	3584
s.	Employee of Agency Other Than the Agency Charged With Reprisal .....	3584
t.	Private Sector Employee; Applicant for Employment .....	3585
u.	Uniformed Service .....	3586
v.	Administrator of Federal Benefits.....	3588
9.	Retroactivity of 1989 Whistleblower Amendments; Continuing Violation .....	3588
C.	PLEADING REQUIREMENTS.....	3589
1.	Duty of Judge to Inform Appellant of Jurisdictional Requirements.....	3589
2.	Specificity of Underlying Disclosure; Labeling of Disclosure Not Required .....	3591
3.	Pleading to OSC .....	3594
a.	Classification or Labeling of Disclosure Not Required .....	3602
b.	Curative Filing With OSC .....	3604
c.	Proof of Scope of Complaint Made to OSC; Post-Complaint Submission.....	3605
d.	Information First Submitted With PFR .....	3608
e.	Serial Complaints to OSC.....	3609
f.	OSC Closeout Letter.....	3609
4.	Pleading to MSPB .....	3610
D.	COVERED AND EXCLUDED PERSONNEL ACTIONS.....	3612
1.	Threatened Personnel Action .....	3612
a.	Proposed Action; Dispute Arising During Compliance.....	3615
2.	Failure to Take Personnel Action.....	3616
3.	Performance Appraisal; Evaluation of Qualifications or Abilities.....	3618
4.	Awards and Acts Preliminary to Awards .....	3618
5.	Denial of Within-Grade Increase .....	3619
6.	Promotion, Appointment.....	3619
7.	Decision Concerning Leave; Change in Duties; Idling; Overtime; Harassment .....	3620
a.	Degree of Significance of Change of Duties, Responsibilities, or Working Conditions.....	3622
b.	Hostile Environment.....	3622
8.	Reprimand; Admonition; Counseling; Performance Warning; Performance Improvement Period .....	3623
9.	Suspension .....	3627
10.	Probationary Termination .....	3627
11.	Failure to Renew Appointment; Failure to Reinstate .....	3627
12.	Reassignment, Transfer, and Detail .....	3628
13.	Fitness Examination; Investigation .....	3629
14.	Security Clearance Suspension, Revocation; Other Certification .....	3630
15.	Training .....	3635
16.	Defamatory Statement; Tort; Arrest; False Allegation; Blacklisting .....	3635
17.	Reduction in Force.....	3637
18.	Classification Issue .....	3638
19.	Constructive Adverse Action .....	3638
20.	Action Affecting Private Sector Employment Opportunity .....	3642
21.	Other Action.....	3642
E.	REMEDIES .....	3643
1.	Transfer .....	3645
IV.	CASES BROUGHT BY OSC .....	3645
A.	STATUTORY BASES.....	3646
1.	Corrective Action Petition; Stay .....	3646

2.	Disciplinary Complaint.....	3648
3.	Board Authority in Disciplinary, Corrective Action Case.....	3648
4.	Judicial or Administrative Finding of Discrimination by Federal Employee; 5 USC 1216(a)(5) .....	3648
5.	Hatch Act; FOIA Violation .....	3648
B.	SPECIAL COUNSEL OPERATIONS.....	3652
1.	Organizational Structure .....	3652
2.	Disclosure Unit .....	3652
3.	MSPB Referral to OSC.....	3653
C.	RIGHT TO COUNSEL IN OSC INVESTIGATION.....	3653
D.	OSC DISCIPLINARY ACTION .....	3654
1.	Limits on Prosecutorial Authority.....	3655
a.	Employee Who Takes or Recommends Personnel Action.....	3656
b.	Prior Resort to Agency-Employer for Disciplinary Action .....	3656
2.	OSC Complaint.....	3657
3.	Rights of Employee, Respondent .....	3658
4.	OSC Subpoena; Discovery Procedures .....	3658
5.	Hearing by Administrative Law Judge; MSPB Review.....	3659
6.	Disciplinary Penalty.....	3659
E.	OSC CORRECTIVE ACTION PETITION .....	3664
1.	Regulatory Provisions .....	3666
2.	Filing a Complaint With OSC .....	3667
a.	OSC Deferral Policy on EEO Charge .....	3668
b.	Proceeding to Compel OSC Action .....	3668
F.	LITIGATION WITH OSC.....	3671
1.	Purpose of MSPB Hearing .....	3671
a.	Obtaining Records .....	3671
b.	Evidence From Other Investigation .....	3672
c.	Dismissal of OSC Action .....	3672
2.	Settlement .....	3672
3.	Judicial Review in OSC and IRA Cases.....	3672
a.	Stay Pending Judicial Review.....	3673
V.	BURDEN OF PROOF IN REPRISAL CASE .....	3673
A.	ANALYSIS UNDER WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION ACT .....	3673
1.	Analysis Required by Judge.....	3673
2.	Statutory, Regulatory Provisions .....	3674
3.	Contributing Factor Analysis .....	3674
a.	Order of Proof .....	3676
b.	<i>Per Se</i> Timing/Knowledge Test .....	3677
c.	Evidence Other Than Timing.....	3680
d.	Knowledge by Agency Manager of Appellant’s Whistleblowing; Constructive Knowledge; Cat’s Paw.....	3686
e.	Disclosure After the Personnel Action .....	3692
f.	Settlement Offer .....	3694
g.	Reprisal Without Unlawful Motivation: Reprisal by Investigation—the Atypical Case; <i>Marano</i> .....	3694
h.	Charge Arising Out of Conduct During Retaliatory Investigation.....	3702
i.	OSC Corrective Action Case .....	3705
j.	Otherwise Appealable Action .....	3706
4.	Agency’s Clear and Convincing Evidence; <i>Carr</i> Factors.....	3706
a.	Constructive Adverse Action.....	3724
5.	Evidence of Reprisal .....	3724
a.	Strength of Agency’s Case; Probationer; Term Employee.....	3726
b.	Strength of Motive to Retaliate .....	3730
c.	Comparison Employees .....	3731
d.	Preliminary Reprisal Leading to Personnel Action .....	3733
e.	Shifting or Belated Explanations for Agency Action.....	3733
B.	ANALYSIS FOR PROHIBITED PRACTICES NOT COVERED BY WPA, WPEA; VIOLATIONS OF 5 USC 2302(B)(9) .....	3734
1.	<i>Mt. Healthy</i> .....	3737
2.	Importance of Untainted Deciding Official .....	3739
3.	Timing of Action .....	3742
4.	Severity of Charged Misconduct .....	3742
5.	Discipline Related to Refusal of Reassignment .....	3743
6.	Reprisal Against Individual Involved in Union Activity .....	3743

7.	Performance Case .....	3749
8.	Disciplinary Case Against Individual Charged With Reprisal.....	3749
a.	Analysis by Agency Deciding Official.....	3756
C.	DEPARTMENT OF VETERANS AFFAIRS.....	3756
VI.	STAYS OF PERSONNEL ACTIONS .....	3757
A.	STAY THROUGH INDIVIDUAL APPEAL.....	3757
1.	Basis for Stay Sought by Appellant.....	3759
a.	Intervention by OPM.....	3761
2.	Scope of Stay .....	3761
3.	MSPB Review of Judge's Stay Decision .....	3761
B.	STAY THROUGH OSC PROCEEDING .....	3762
1.	Statutory, Regulatory Provisions .....	3763
2.	Initial Stay.....	3765
a.	Potential for Disruption by Employee's Return to Workplace .....	3767
b.	Obtaining Clarification of Stay Order .....	3768
3.	Extension of Stay.....	3768
a.	Indefinite Stay.....	3771
4.	Proof Supporting Stay Application .....	3772
5.	Nature of Relief.....	3772
a.	Hostile Environment; Protective Order.....	3773
b.	Restraint On Employee Communication With OSC, Congress.....	3776
6.	Termination of Stay.....	3778
7.	Relation of Stay and Appeal Proceedings .....	3778
8.	Use of Stay to Protect Other Proceeding.....	3779
a.	EEO Case .....	3779
b.	Union Rights Under Statute.....	3779
9.	Effect Of Prior Settlement Agreement.....	3779
10.	Employees Covered by Stay .....	3779
a.	SES .....	3779
b.	Presidential Appointee; Policymaker .....	3779
c.	At Will Employee .....	3779
d.	Former Agency Employee.....	3780
C.	DEPARTMENT OF VETERANS AFFAIRS.....	3780

## CHAPTER 14: RETIREMENT AND RESTORATION RIGHTS .....3781

I.	RETIREMENT.....	3781
A.	OVERVIEW OF THE PRINCIPAL RETIREMENT SYSTEMS.....	3782
1.	Conversions.....	3783
B.	FEDERAL EMPLOYMENT.....	3784
1.	Effect of Reemployment.....	3786
C.	COVERED AND CREDITABLE SERVICE.....	3786
1.	Service Requirements for CSRS.....	3787
2.	When-Actually-Employed; Seasonal Employee; Leave Without Pay; Part-Time .....	3790
3.	Indefinite Appointment.....	3791
4.	Temporary Employment.....	3792
5.	Personal Service Contract .....	3792
6.	Nonappropriated Fund.....	3798
7.	Others.....	3799
8.	Effect of Military Service; Deposit for Military Service.....	3799
a.	National Guard, Other Uniformed Service .....	3812
(i)	Abandonment of Civilian Career for Military Service .....	3814
9.	Period of Receipt of OWCP Benefits .....	3819
10.	Sick Leave Credit.....	3820
D.	DISABILITY RETIREMENT.....	3820
1.	Statutory, Regulatory Standards.....	3820
a.	Concept of Disability .....	3822
b.	Cause of Disability .....	3824
c.	Medical Condition Postdating Disability Retirement.....	3824
2.	Disability Incurred While in the Federal Service.....	3824
a.	Preexisting Condition .....	3825
3.	Position Last Occupied.....	3825



a.	Qualifying Position.....	3825
4.	Disability Must Continue at Least One Year.....	3826
a.	Possible Future Disability.....	3827
5.	Situational or Transitory Condition; Hostile Environment.....	3828
a.	Workplace Stressor May Be Sufficient.....	3829
b.	Workplace Stressor May Be Insufficient.....	3830
c.	Alcoholism or Drug Addiction; Inability to Control Condition.....	3831
6.	Partial Disability Does Not Qualify.....	3831
7.	Reassignment in Lieu of Disability Retirement.....	3831
a.	Adequacy of Position Offered Through Reassignment.....	3832
b.	Permanent Light Duty Position.....	3833
c.	Postal Service: Different Craft.....	3837
d.	Failure to Accept a Suitable Position.....	3839
8.	Effect of Disability Accommodation on Annuity Entitlement.....	3840
a.	Conflicting Agency Evidence Concerning Accommodation.....	3842
9.	Necessity for Cessation of Pay or Separation From the Federal Service.....	3842
10.	One Year for Disability Retirement Application.....	3843
a.	Waiver; Separation for Medical Reason: Notice Not Provided.....	3844
b.	Waiver; Mental Incompetence.....	3847
c.	New Condition Raised With Judge or in PFR; Condition That Should Have Been Considered by OPM.....	3851
d.	Evidence of Progression of Disease Presented in PFR.....	3852
e.	Technical Constructions Concerning Filing Date: Method of Filing; Filing With Former Agency.....	3852
11.	Agency-Initiated Disability Retirement Application.....	3855
a.	Service Credit Requirement.....	3857
12.	Application After Employee's Death.....	3857
13.	Bar to Concurrent Receipt of Disability Retirement, Workers Compensation Benefit.....	3857
14.	Withdrawal of Disability Retirement Application.....	3858
15.	Rescission of Disability Retirement Grant.....	3859
16.	Evidence of Disability.....	3860
a.	Scope of Board Review; <i>Chavez</i> .....	3861
b.	Significance of Position Description, Qualification Requirements.....	3865
c.	Objective Medical Evidence.....	3865
d.	Content of Medical Report.....	3865
e.	Lack of Evidence of Precise Medical Causation Not Determinative.....	3866
f.	<i>Mullins-Howard</i> : Disability Established Without Unduly Detailed Medical Causation Analysis.....	3869
g.	Subjective Evidence.....	3874
h.	Testimony of Supervisor; Performance Appraisal.....	3874
i.	Hearsay.....	3874
j.	Absence; Use of Leave.....	3874
k.	Post-Separation Medical Evidence.....	3875
l.	Medical Condition Not Presented to OPM.....	3877
m.	Removal for Physical Inability to Perform; <i>Bruner; Settlement</i> .....	3877
n.	Loss of Military Status.....	3882
o.	OWCP Determination.....	3883
p.	Social Security Administration Determination.....	3883
q.	VA Disability Rating.....	3886
r.	Security Clearance Determination.....	3886
s.	Agency Medical Disqualification.....	3887
t.	Removal for Misconduct.....	3887
17.	Refusal to Undergo Diagnostic or Other Procedure.....	3888
a.	Possible Improvement Through Future Surgery.....	3889
18.	Specific Conditions.....	3889
19.	Earnings Recovery.....	3890
a.	Current Rate of Pay.....	3892
b.	Basic Pay; Cost of Living Adjustment.....	3892
c.	Bonus.....	3893
d.	Miscellaneous Income.....	3894
e.	Business Expense.....	3894
f.	Pension Contribution.....	3894
20.	Decline of Earnings.....	3894
a.	Discontinued Service Annuity Upon Recovery of Earning Capacity.....	3895

21. Conversion From Disability to Optional Retirement .....	3896
22. Conversion From Optional to Disability Retirement .....	3896
23. Recovery From Disability: Burden of Proof .....	3896
a. Restoration of Annuity.....	3897
24. Calculation of Annuity.....	3898
25. Loss of Annuity for Certain Offenses.....	3899
E. LUMP SUM DEATH BENEFITS.....	3900
1. Submission of Designation.....	3907
2. Child Who Qualifies to Receive Lump Sum Payment .....	3910
3. Other Distributions.....	3911
a. Slayer Statute .....	3911
4. Time for Application.....	3911
F. SURVIVOR ANNUITIES .....	3912
1. Eligibility of Employee for Retirement as Condition to Annuity .....	3914
2. Application for Annuity.....	3914
3. Time, Method of Election .....	3915
a. Notice to Annuitant of Necessity to Notify OPM of Remarriage to Secure Annuity .....	3916
b. Delay in Notice to OPM of Annuity Election .....	3917
c. Lack of Proper Notice From OPM Concerning Annuity Election .....	3918
d. Incorrect Information From Employing Agency Concerning Annuity Election.....	3929
e. Annuity Election Form; Signature; Submission .....	3931
f. Effect of Mental Incompetence on Timeliness of Election .....	3933
g. Authority to Act on Behalf of Incompetent Employee to Create Annuity .....	3934
h. Employee Mentally Incompetent to Make Adverse Election .....	3935
i. Community Property Interests .....	3936
4. State Law Defines Marital Status; Common Law Marriage; Qualifying Widow.....	3937
a. Current Spouse; Duration of Marriage; Widow: Issue of Marriage.....	3938
b. Accidental Death .....	3939
c. Putative Spouse .....	3939
5. Effect of Remarriage After Retirement .....	3941
6. Calculation.....	3941
a. Survivor Annuity Based on Disability Annuity.....	3942
b. Health Benefits .....	3944
c. Social Security Benefit Offset—CSRS .....	3944
d. Social Security Benefit—FERS.....	3945
7. Consent of Spouse to Waiver of Survivor Annuity .....	3946
a. Consent by Current Spouse to Discontinue Survivor Annuity.....	3952
b. Attempt to Modify Amount of Spousal Survivor Annuity .....	3954
c. Consent by Current Spouse for Former Spouse Annuity .....	3955
8. Marriage of at Least Nine Months; Parent of Issue by Marriage; Exceptions .....	3955
9. Survivor Annuity for Child Incapable of Self-Support .....	3956
a. Children in School.....	3962
G. DISCONTINUED SERVICE ANNUITY .....	3963
H. LAW ENFORCEMENT RETIREMENT .....	3972
1. Process of Determining and Appealing LEO Status.....	3972
2. Agency Head Determination; Timeliness of Request for LEO Status.....	3974
3. Substantive Criteria for LEO Determination .....	3983
a. Customs and Border Patrol Officers.....	3993
b. Decisions Before 2000.....	3996
4. Evidence Considered .....	4000
5. Supervisory Credit .....	4003
6. Effect of Disability Retirement.....	4006
I. FIREFIGHTER RETIREMENT .....	4007
J. AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLER RETIREMENT.....	4015
K. OTHER ANNUITY INTERESTS .....	4016
1. Deferred Annuity.....	4016
2. FERS Minimum Retirement Age Annuity.....	4016
3. Supplemental, Redetermined Annuity .....	4017
4. Alternative Form of Annuity.....	4020
5. Voluntary Early Retirement Authority.....	4023
L. APPORTIONMENT OF ANNUITY BY COURT ORDER.....	4024

1.	Lifetime Annuity.....	4024
2.	Former Spouse Survivor Annuity .....	4025
a.	Intent to Create Former Spouse Survivor Annuity or Other Benefit.....	4026
b.	Reduction in Lifetime Annuity.....	4028
c.	Wording of Decree .....	4029
d.	Ambiguous Provision in Divorce Decree; Extrinsic Evidence; Rules of Construction .....	4031
3.	Challenge to Court Order Affecting Annuity Interest.....	4035
a.	Qualifying Court Order.....	4036
b.	Amendment to Court Order Affecting Former Spouse Annuity; Construction of Annuity Interest Following Ineffective Amendment.....	4046
c.	Bifurcated Decree.....	4058
d.	Spouse Equity Act of 1984 as Amended .....	4061
M.	ANNUITY CALCULATION ISSUES.....	4063
1.	Estoppel as Basis to Create, Continue, or Adjust Benefit or Overpayment .....	4063
2.	Refund.....	4066
3.	Redeposit .....	4072
a.	Personal Service Agreement .....	4074
4.	High Three Salary Calculation: Basic Pay; Lump Sum Back Pay Settlement.....	4074
5.	Onset of Disability Annuity Payment.....	4078
6.	VA Medical Professional; VA Benefit Reduction.....	4080
7.	Annuity Reduction for VA Employees Removed for Certain Performance or Misconduct.....	4081
8.	Law Enforcement Enhanced Annuity Rate .....	4081
9.	Minimum, Maximum Annuity .....	4081
10.	Annuity Allotment .....	4081
11.	Impact of Receipt of Medicare Benefits, Social Security on CSRS, FERS.....	4081
12.	Deposit for Post-1956 Military Service .....	4084
13.	Deposit for Creditable Service; Annuity Supplement.....	4084
14.	Interest .....	4085
15.	Taxes.....	4086
16.	Cost of Living Adjustment for Reinstated Annuity .....	4086
17.	Diversion of Annuity Payment.....	4087
18.	Reemployed Annuitant.....	4087
19.	Individual Retirement Record.....	4087
20.	Reconstructing Employment Record.....	4090
N.	OVERPAYMENTS.....	4090
1.	Proving the Debt; Evidence Supporting Waiver; OPM Records .....	4091
2.	Basis for Waiver .....	4092
a.	Annuitant Without Fault and Recovery Against Equity and Good Conscience .....	4094
b.	Knowledge of Overpayment; Set-Aside Rule .....	4096
c.	OPM Fault in Creating Overpayment .....	4097
d.	Unconscionability of Recovery; Recovery Delay .....	4098
e.	Financial Hardship.....	4102
f.	Adjustment of Repayment Schedule; Length of Recovery .....	4104
g.	Ordinary and Necessary Living Expenses; Future Events.....	4104
h.	Assets Available to Satisfy Overpayment; Income/Expense Margin.....	4105
i.	Detrimental Reliance.....	4106
j.	Age of Debt.....	4110
k.	Calculation of Overpayment; Interest .....	4110
l.	Recovery Schedule Adjustment When There Is No Annuity Entitlement .....	4111
m.	Collection From Survivor for Debt of Original Annuitant .....	4111
n.	Insurance Issue Related to Overpayment.....	4114
O.	OFFSETS; DEBT COLLECTION FROM ANNUITY .....	4116
II.	RESTORATION RIGHTS UPON RECOVERY FROM OCCUPATIONAL INJURY OR ILLNESS.....	4121
A.	SEPARATION OR FURLOUGH MUST RESULT FROM COMPENSABLE INJURY .....	4124
1.	Separation for Reason Other Than Result of Injury or Illness.....	4126
a.	Factual Determination on Cause of Separation .....	4133
b.	Termination When OWCP Determination Supports Employee's Refusal to Return to Work.....	4135
c.	AWOL Covered by Period of Compensation.....	4137
d.	Effect of Resignation .....	4137
e.	Separation by Settlement Agreement.....	4138
B.	SIGNIFICANCE OF OWCP DETERMINATION; RECEIPT OF COMPENSATION .....	4138

1.	Requirement of Medical Examination .....	4142
C.	MEANING OF "RECOVERY" .....	4143
1.	Fully Recovered Within a Year .....	4144
2.	Fully Recovered After a Year .....	4146
a.	Priority Consideration: Necessity for Position to Be Filled by Another Person.....	4149
b.	Geographic Extent of Consideration .....	4151
c.	Method, Duration of Priority Consideration .....	4151
3.	Partially Recovered .....	4152
a.	Geographic Extent of Consideration: Local Commuting Area.....	4156
b.	Arbitrary or Capricious Restoration Effort .....	4160
c.	Accommodation Requirement.....	4162
d.	Postal Service National Reassessment Process; Realignment of Employees; <i>Latham</i> .....	4163
e.	Other Postal Service Limited Duty Restoration Decisions .....	4175
f.	Discontinuation of Modified Assignment .....	4176
4.	Physically Disqualified Employee .....	4177
a.	Geographic Extent of Consideration .....	4178
D.	PARTICULAR GROUPS OF EMPLOYEES .....	4178
1.	Probationer.....	4179
2.	Reemployed Annuitant.....	4179
3.	Postal Service.....	4180
4.	Nonappropriated Fund .....	4183
E.	WHEN RESTORATION IS TO OCCUR .....	4183
1.	Light Duty .....	4185
2.	Effect of Disability Retirement.....	4185
F.	TIME TO APPLY FOR RESTORATION .....	4187
1.	Form of Restoration Request .....	4188
G.	REMEDY.....	4188
1.	Same or Equivalent Position .....	4189
a.	Return to <i>Status Quo</i> .....	4190
b.	Interim Promotion.....	4191
2.	Regraded Position.....	4191
3.	Seniority Inapplicable.....	4191
4.	Priority Placement Program .....	4192
5.	Benefits Upon Restoration.....	4193
H.	MSPB APPEAL RIGHTS.....	4199
1.	Time for Appeal.....	4199
a.	Lack of Notice of Appeal Right .....	4199
b.	Settlement .....	4201
2.	Burden of Proof; Jurisdictional Allegations .....	4201

## CHAPTER 15: ATTORNEY FEES.....4203

I.	ENTITLEMENT STANDARDS .....	4203
A.	STATUTORY AND REGULATORY BASIS FOR FEES .....	4203
1.	Use of Counsel; Licensure.....	4204
2.	Governing Statutes and Regulation .....	4207
a.	Civil Rights Statutes .....	4208
b.	Whistleblower Protection Act .....	4208
3.	Jurisdiction Over Action Under Appeal .....	4209
4.	Miscellaneous Appeals .....	4209
a.	Regulation Review Proceeding .....	4209
b.	Retirement Appeal.....	4209
c.	OSC Case: Prohibited Personnel Practice and Hatch Act Litigation .....	4210
d.	Sanction .....	4218
B.	PREVAILING PARTY STATUS .....	4218
1.	Mitigation.....	4220
2.	Other Relief.....	4221
3.	Must Prevail Through MSPB Procedures.....	4222
a.	Mixed-Motive Determination .....	4223
4.	Cancellation of Action Appealed.....	4224
a.	Enforcement Proceeding Mooted by Agency Action .....	4230
5.	Settlement .....	4233

a.	Prevailing Party Status Through Settlement .....	4233
b.	Relief Through Settlement Must Be Related to MSPB Appeal.....	4235
c.	Interest of Justice Criteria .....	4235
d.	MSPB Jurisdiction to Accept and Enforce Settlement Providing for Fees or Supporting Fee Motion .....	4236
C.	INTEREST OF JUSTICE: AN OVERVIEW .....	4240
1.	<i>Allen</i> Criteria .....	4240
a.	Financial Hardship.....	4241
2.	Preservation of Claims Supporting Entitlement; Significance of Final Merits Decision .....	4241
a.	Overlapping Fee Entitlement Standards .....	4242
3.	Statutory Examples Not Exclusive .....	4242
D.	BAD FAITH .....	4242
1.	Malicious Action; Inadequate Inquiry .....	4243
a.	Disparate Treatment .....	4243
2.	Action Reversed but Some Charges Sustained.....	4243
3.	Unreasonable Litigation Tactics; Failure to Settle.....	4243
a.	Frivolous PFR .....	4243
4.	Compliance .....	4244
E.	CLEARLY WITHOUT MERIT OR WHOLLY UNFOUNDED .....	4244
1.	Failure to Adhere to Legal Precedent.....	4245
2.	Inadequate Initial Inquiry Into Facts .....	4245
3.	Lack of Legitimate Basis for Agency Action .....	4246
a.	Development of Dispositive Information During MSPB Appeal.....	4246
4.	Mitigation .....	4246
5.	Factual Dispute .....	4246
6.	Performance Appeal .....	4248
7.	Retirement Appeal.....	4248
a.	Legal Error by OPM .....	4252
b.	Incorrect Advice From OPM .....	4252
c.	Issue of Mental Incompetence .....	4252
F.	KNEW OR SHOULD HAVE KNOWN .....	4255
1.	Lack of Reasonable Inquiry .....	4255
2.	Disregard of Legal Precedent .....	4256
3.	Regulatory Error.....	4256
4.	Reduction in Force.....	4257
5.	Performance-Based Action .....	4257
6.	Mitigation .....	4257
a.	Not All Charges Sustained .....	4260
7.	Negligent Presentation of Case .....	4261
8.	Decision of Another Tribunal .....	4261
9.	Retirement Appeal .....	4261
a.	Failure of OPM to Evaluate Evidence Available During Reconsideration Process .....	4261
b.	Legal Error by OPM .....	4264
10.	Settlement .....	4264
G.	GROSS PROCEDURAL ERROR.....	4265
1.	Denial of Advance Notice or Appeal Right .....	4267
a.	Involuntary or Constructive Adverse Action .....	4268
b.	Enforced Leave .....	4269
c.	Indefinite or Emergency Suspension .....	4270
2.	Mitigation.....	4270
3.	Performance-Based Action.....	4270
4.	Reduction in Force.....	4270
H.	SUBSTANTIALLY INNOCENT.....	4271
1.	<i>Yorkshire</i> .....	4273
2.	MSPB Treatment of <i>Yorkshire</i> .....	4274
3.	Appellant Who Ensnares the Agency .....	4275
4.	Mitigation: <i>Boese, VanFossen</i> .....	4275
a.	Factually Close Case.....	4279
b.	Prior Law .....	4279
5.	Performance-Based Appeal .....	4280
6.	Other Legal Error .....	4280
I.	OTHER AUTHORITY FOR FEE AWARDS .....	4280

1.	Back Pay Act .....	4280
a.	Postal Service Employee .....	4281
2.	Equal Access to Justice Act .....	4282
a.	Administrative Law Judge Case .....	4285
b.	Basis for Compensating Court Time .....	4286
c.	Prevailing Party .....	4287
d.	Substantial Justification .....	4292
e.	Basis for Awarding MSPB Time .....	4294
f.	Hourly Rate; <i>Pro Bono</i> or Contingent Representation; COLA; Expenses .....	4295
g.	Procedure; Time for Filing; Application .....	4297
h.	Application to MSPB Cases .....	4298
3.	Civil Rights Case .....	4299
a.	Result Achieved .....	4301
4.	Prohibited Personnel Practice Case .....	4302
5.	USERRA; VEOA .....	4303
6.	Other Bases for Fee Claims; Equitable Assessment of Fee .....	4305
II.	PROCEDURES FOR OBTAINING FEES .....	4305
A.	HOW FEES ARE INCURRED .....	4305
1.	Attorney-Client Relationship; Fee Payment .....	4305
a.	Law Clerk, Paraprofessional; <i>Pro Se</i> Appellant.....	4305
2.	Union Counsel .....	4306
a.	Demise of the Cost-Plus Formula.....	4306
b.	History of the Cost-Plus Rule .....	4309
c.	Repayment of Fees to Union Required .....	4310
3.	Federally Employed Attorney .....	4310
4.	Public Interest Organization .....	4310
B.	COMPENSABLE SERVICES .....	4310
1.	Work Performed Before Final Adverse Action or Other Decision .....	4311
2.	Research .....	4313
3.	Discovery .....	4313
4.	Settlement, Mediation.....	4313
5.	PFR .....	4313
a.	OPM Reconsideration Petition .....	4314
6.	Time in Court .....	4315
a.	Appropriate Charge for Court Time .....	4318
b.	Practice Notes .....	4319
7.	Preparation of Fee Motion .....	4319
8.	Defense of Fee Motion .....	4319
9.	Enforcement Proceeding.....	4319
10.	Related Proceeding .....	4325
a.	MSPB .....	4326
b.	Grievance .....	4326
c.	Privacy Act .....	4327
d.	Unemployment Compensation .....	4327
e.	Criminal Case .....	4327
f.	EEO Complaint.....	4328
g.	Media Contact; Congressional Activity.....	4329
11.	Anticipated Time; Supplemental Petition .....	4329
12.	Unsuccessful Claim, Issue, or Defense .....	4329
a.	<i>Hensley</i> .....	4330
b.	Mitigation.....	4336
c.	Tangentially Related Issue .....	4337
d.	Clearly Separate Claim .....	4338
e.	Unsuccessful EEO Claim .....	4338
f.	Unsuccessful Whistleblower Claim .....	4340
C.	REASONABLENESS OF FEES.....	4340
1.	Hourly Rate.....	4341
a.	Evidence of Reasonableness; Fee Agreement; Result Achieved .....	4342
b.	Initial Decision in Another Appeal; Decision of Another Tribunal .....	4349
c.	Settlement .....	4349
d.	Out-Of-Town Counsel .....	4350



e.	Travel Time .....	4350
2.	Contingency Arrangement, Enhancement; <i>City of Burlington</i> .....	4351
a.	Early Treatment by MSPB of Contingent Adjustments .....	4353
b.	Enhancement for Payment Delay; Interest .....	4354
c.	Enhancement for Quality Work .....	4355
d.	Enhancement for Wear and Tear .....	4358
e.	Traditional Contingency Agreement; Fee Cap .....	4358
3.	<i>Laffey Matrix</i> .....	4359
4.	Below Market Rate .....	4364
5.	Reasonableness of Time Invested .....	4367
a.	Responsibility of Judge .....	4368
b.	Articulated Analysis Required .....	4370
c.	Notice to Counsel of Defect in Fee Motion .....	4371
d.	Expertise and Diligence of Counsel; Likely Outcome .....	4372
e.	Time at Hearing .....	4372
f.	PFR .....	4372
g.	<i>Amicus</i> Brief .....	4373
h.	Time Preparing Counsel Fee Motion .....	4373
i.	Consolidated Cases .....	4374
j.	Multiple Counsel; Duplicative Work .....	4374
k.	Clerical, Secretarial Work .....	4376
6.	Examples of Fee Awards .....	4377
a.	Rates .....	4377
b.	Amounts .....	4377
D.	COSTS AND EXPENSES .....	4378
1.	Transcript .....	4379
2.	Photocopy; Electronic Production .....	4380
3.	Travel .....	4380
4.	Secretarial Expense .....	4380
5.	Postage; Courier .....	4380
6.	Fee for Expert, Consultant .....	4380
7.	Investigator .....	4380
8.	Accounting Expense .....	4381
9.	Telephone or Facsimile .....	4381
10.	Electronic Research .....	4381
11.	Taxes .....	4382
12.	EEO, Whistleblower Protection Act, USERRA, and VEOA Cases; Broader Coverage .....	4382
13.	Direct Recovery of Costs by Appellants .....	4383
E.	FEE MOTION .....	4385
1.	Who May File .....	4386
2.	Time and Place of Filing .....	4386
a.	Premature Motion .....	4387
b.	Timing of Agency Response .....	4387
c.	Late Motion .....	4387
3.	Motion Must Be Complete When Filed .....	4391
a.	Incomplete Motion .....	4392
4.	Developing Evidence to Support Motion .....	4392
a.	Hearing Concerning Fee Entitlement in Settled Appeal .....	4392
b.	Hearing and Discovery Concerning Reasonableness .....	4393
5.	Format of Motion .....	4393
a.	What to Include .....	4394
b.	Fee Agreement .....	4395
c.	Itemization of Time .....	4395
d.	Retrospective Reconstruction of Time .....	4396
6.	Supplemental or Corrected Motion .....	4397
7.	Unopposed, Moot, or Settled Motion .....	4398
8.	Service of Motion .....	4398
9.	Opposition to Motion .....	4398
10.	Initial Decision on Motion .....	4398
a.	Obligation of Judge to Ensure Due Process .....	4398
b.	Requirements of Addendum Initial Decision .....	4399

c. Initial Decision Controls Basis for Fee Determination .....	4399
d. Change in Judge .....	4400
e. Hourly Rate Analysis.....	4400
11. Waiver of Fee Through Settlement Agreement .....	4401
a. Effect of Settlement on Claims of Multiple Counsel .....	4402
12. Settlement of Fee Claim .....	4403
13. Payment of Fee to Counsel and Client .....	4404
a. Payment to Counsel .....	4404
b. Repayment of Fee by Counsel to Client .....	4404
14. PFR of Fee Decision .....	4405
a. Interim Fee .....	4405
b. Time Spent on PFR .....	4405

## CHAPTER 16: SETTLEMENT, REMEDIES, AND ENFORCEMENT .....4407

I. SETTLEMENT.....	4407
A. ELEMENTS OF SETTLEMENTS .....	4407
1. Settlement Resources; Mediation Appeals Program.....	4409
2. Minimum Requirements .....	4409
a. Hatch Act Case.....	4410
3. Settlement After Initial Decision .....	4410
4. Regulatory Process .....	4410
5. Filing, Acceptance of Settlement for Enforcement .....	4411
a. Intent That Agreement Be Subject to MSPB Enforcement Authority .....	4412
b. Unfiled Settlement .....	4414
c. Oral Advice of Settlement .....	4415
d. Specific Oral Settlement Agreement Entered Into the Record .....	4417
e. Distinguishing Oral Agreement and Ongoing or Incomplete Negotiation .....	4421
f. Oral Agreement to Be Followed by Written Agreement .....	4425
g. Appellant’s Understanding of Agreement .....	4426
6. Jurisdiction to Accept Settlement: <i>Delorme</i> .....	4427
a. Prior Law .....	4428
b. Settlement Arising From Disputed Last Chance Agreement.....	4432
7. Flexibility, Scope of Settlement .....	4433
a. Incomplete Settlement; Omitted Terms .....	4433
8. Conditional Settlement; Lapsed Offer; Implied Term .....	4435
9. Settlement Requiring Specific Action by Judge .....	4437
10. Integration or “Zipper” Clause .....	4438
11. Modification, Amendment of Agreement.....	4442
12. Waiver of Statutory Right; Release .....	4442
a. Unemployment Compensation .....	4443
b. Workers’ Compensation .....	4444
c. Older Workers’ Benefit Protection Act .....	4444
d. RIF Entitlement .....	4453
e. Limitation on the Right to Seek Future Federal Employment .....	4453
13. Retirement Benefit.....	4454
14. Settlement Provision Affecting Other Agencies .....	4454
15. OSC Case .....	4455
B. SETTING ASIDE A SETTLEMENT .....	4456
1. Agreement Challenged as Invalid; Use of PFR .....	4456
2. Timing of PFR.....	4458
3. Bases for Setting Aside a Settlement .....	4460
a. Threat of Unwarranted Action; Duress .....	4461
b. Hardship.....	4463
c. Disappointment; Confusion .....	4463
d. Lack of Understanding .....	4464
e. Mental Incapacity; Stress .....	4465
f. Time Pressure.....	4468
g. Coercion or Bias by Judge .....	4468
h. Coercion by Counsel or Union Representative; Lack of Signature by Counsel .....	4472
i. Error or Lack of Authority of Appellant’s Counsel or Union Representative—Agreement Sustained .....	4475

j.	Error or Lack of Authority of Appellant’s Counsel or Union Representative— <i>Bona Fide</i> Challenge to Agreement .....	4478
k.	Error or Lack of Authority of Government Counsel.....	4482
l.	Fraud; Misrepresentation; Bad Faith; Merit of the Underlying Action .....	4483
m.	Mutual, Unilateral Mistake .....	4488
n.	Lack of Mutual Assent.....	4495
o.	Lack of Consideration .....	4498
p.	Incorrect Information From the Agency Concerning Retirement Eligibility.....	4498
q.	Provision Unlawful or Contrary to Public Policy or Collective Bargaining Contract .....	4499
r.	Change in Law .....	4504
4.	Unfiled Settlement Agreement; Preappeal Settlement .....	4504
5.	Collateral Attack on Settlement Through New Appeal .....	4507
6.	Breach of Settlement: Election Between Rescission or Enforcement.....	4508
a.	Agency May Rescind .....	4509
b.	Restoration of Consideration Received; “Tender Back”.....	4509
c.	Enforcement Petition to Rescind Settlement.....	4511
II.	APPELLATE REMEDIES .....	4512
A.	REMEDIAL ORDERS AND RIGHTS .....	4512
1.	Statutory Basis for Remedial Authority .....	4512
2.	OPM Regulation .....	4512
3.	Collateral Result of Restoration Order; Action Related to Case Under Appeal .....	4513
a.	Effect on Remedial Order of Decision of Another Tribunal .....	4517
b.	Reversal of Criminal Conviction .....	4518
4.	Back Pay and Related Remedies .....	4519
a.	Necessary Findings .....	4519
b.	Pay Entitlement: Ready, Willing, and Able to Work .....	4519
c.	Maximum Recovery Period .....	4525
d.	Liability for Event Preceding Adverse Action .....	4525
e.	Method of Payment .....	4526
f.	Method of Calculation.....	4526
g.	Reinstatement With No or Limited Pay; Time-Served or Other Suspension; After-Acquired Evidence; Shortened Notice Period .....	4526
h.	After Acquired Evidence .....	4528
i.	Loss of Security Clearance.....	4528
j.	Bonus and Award; Differential; Relocation Expense .....	4529
k.	Premium, Overtime, Holiday Pay .....	4530
l.	Overtime for Postal Service Employee .....	4535
m.	Interest—Back Pay Act .....	4536
n.	Interest—Postal Service Employee .....	4539
o.	Insurance Benefit.....	4540
p.	Retirement, TSP Contribution or Loan.....	4541
q.	Leave Account; FMLA; Military Leave .....	4546
r.	Restoration of Leave for Participation in MSPB or Related Proceedings; Compensatory Time; Official Time .....	4549
s.	Interim Promotion; WIGI; Pay Increase.....	4551
t.	Applicant for Employment .....	4555
u.	Federal Aviation Administration Employee .....	4555
5.	Duty to Mitigate Damages Through Interim Employment .....	4555
a.	Employee Other Than Postal Service.....	4555
b.	Postal Service Employee .....	4556
6.	Deductions From Back Pay .....	4558
a.	Retirement, TSP Contribution .....	4559
b.	Debt to Retirement Fund.....	4560
c.	Annuity Entitlement or Adjustment.....	4560
d.	Union Dues; Insurance; Medicare .....	4560
e.	Taxes; Increased Taxes.....	4566
f.	Unemployment, OWCP, Workers’ Compensation.....	4567
g.	Interim Earnings; Job Search, Relocation Cost; Replacement Earnings; Retirement Income; Fraudulent Earnings Information .....	4570
h.	Other Deductions .....	4573
7.	Retraining .....	4574
8.	Reemployment Right.....	4574

9.	Purging of Records; Modification of Documentation, Performance Appraisal .....	4575
a.	Coding of Personnel Document.....	4578
b.	Adjustment to AWOL Charge .....	4578
10.	Damages; Regulation Governing Recovery.....	4579
a.	Availability of Compensatory Damages .....	4582
b.	Awards of Compensatory Damages—Civil Rights Acts .....	4587
c.	Effect of Receipt of FECA and Insurance Benefits on Recovery of Compensatory Damages .....	4595
d.	Consequential Damages and Costs—Whistleblower Case .....	4597
e.	Compensatory Damages—Whistleblower Case.....	4607
f.	Damages Under VEOA, USERRA .....	4611
g.	Monetary Relief for Prohibited Personnel Practices Not Covered by the WPA or EEO Law .....	4612
h.	Punitive Damages .....	4615
i.	Taxation of Damages, Attorney Fees.....	4615
11.	Nontraditional Remedies .....	4616
a.	Waiver of Debt.....	4616
b.	Apology; Evidence Destruction .....	4616
c.	Protection Against Intervening Event .....	4616
d.	Protection Against Future Event.....	4617
e.	Front Pay .....	4617
f.	Equitable Relief; Other Remedies .....	4617
III.	ENFORCEMENT.....	4619
A.	ENFORCEMENT OF MSPB DECISION .....	4619
1.	Authority to Order Compliance; Sanctions.....	4620
2.	Limitation on Enforcement Authority to Award Back Pay or Monetary Remedy .....	4621
a.	Mootness .....	4623
b.	Burden of Proof; Proof of Compliance .....	4624
3.	Enforcement Procedure .....	4625
a.	Enforcement Petition Regulation, Guidance .....	4626
b.	Duty to Supply Information; Accounting.....	4628
c.	Evidence Supplied After Decision of Judge .....	4630
d.	Time for Initiating Enforcement.....	4631
e.	Agency Request for Extension of Time.....	4634
f.	Unclear or Impossible Compliance .....	4634
g.	Evidence of Compliance; Statement of Intent; Representative’s Statement.....	4634
h.	Hearing.....	4635
i.	Discovery .....	4636
j.	Referral to Comptroller General .....	4637
k.	Sanction Against Agency .....	4638
l.	Multiple Enforcement Petitions; <i>Res Judicata</i> .....	4639
m.	Analysis by Judge .....	4640
n.	MSPB Review of Initial Decision on Enforcement Petition .....	4640
4.	Allegation of Reprisal, Bad Faith, Discrimination, or Harassment .....	4642
a.	Discipline Related to Agency Noncompliance .....	4643
b.	Performance Appraisal Dispute .....	4643
5.	Back Pay Dispute .....	4644
a.	Delay in Payment.....	4646
b.	Damages.....	4646
6.	Reinstatement to the Same Position; <i>Status Quo Ante</i> Remedy .....	4646
a.	Medical Limitation .....	4650
b.	Administrative Leave .....	4652
c.	Effect of Retirement.....	4652
d.	Obligation Under Collective Bargaining Agreement .....	4653
e.	Other Post-Reinstatement Action; Medical Certification Requirement.....	4653
f.	Postal Service Reorganization.....	4654
g.	Security Clearance Problem.....	4655
h.	Demotion .....	4657
i.	Term or Temporary Appointment.....	4664
j.	Seniority Adjustment .....	4665
k.	Pay System Change .....	4666
l.	Insurance .....	4666
m.	Other Working Conditions .....	4666

7.	Compelling Reason for Reassignment; Detail; Different Duties.....	4667
a.	Replacement Employee .....	4668
b.	Placement on Administrative Leave Pending Subsequent Removal Attempt.....	4668
c.	Detail or Other Variation of Permanent Position.....	4669
d.	Reasons Related to Original Action.....	4669
e.	Overriding Interest.....	4670
8.	Reinstatement With Accommodation for Disability .....	4677
9.	Lack of Authority to Enforce Compliance.....	4680
10.	Sovereign Immunity Issue.....	4681
B.	ENFORCEMENT AND INTERPRETATION OF SETTLEMENT AGREEMENTS .....	4681
1.	Scope of Enforcement Authority .....	4683
a.	Only Filed Settlement May Be Enforced .....	4684
b.	Allegation of Discrimination; Whistleblowing Reprisal .....	4685
c.	Damages.....	4686
2.	Agency Enforcement Initiative .....	4687
a.	Appellant's Agreement to Resign or to Take Other Action; Agency Self Help .....	4688
b.	Agreement Not to Reapply for Employment With Agency .....	4688
c.	Agreement to Withdraw EEOC Case or Other Litigation .....	4689
3.	Agreement That Appellant First Notify Agency of Noncompliance Allegation .....	4690
a.	Agreement That the Parties Attempt to Adjust Disputes Under the Settlement.....	4691
4.	Election Between Enforcement and Rescission; Pleading in the Alternative .....	4692
a.	Modification of Settlement Provision .....	4693
5.	Role of MSPB Regional or Field Office .....	4693
a.	Treatment of Enforcement Issue; Evidence on PFR .....	4694
6.	Time for Initiating Enforcement.....	4694
a.	Reasonableness of Timing of Enforcement; Laches Defense .....	4699
7.	Burden of Proof .....	4701
a.	Evidence Required .....	4705
b.	Mutual Breach; "Clean Hands" .....	4705
8.	Interpretation and Application of Settlement: Legal Principles .....	4707
a.	Materiality of Breach .....	4708
b.	Good Faith Required; Harassment; Bad Faith.....	4713
c.	Foreclosure of Future Discipline or Other Agency Action for Past Conduct.....	4717
d.	Time for Compliance if None Set in Settlement Agreement .....	4720
9.	Interpretation of Agreement: External Law; Extrinsic or Parol Evidence; Ambiguous Term; History of Performance; Hearing.....	4722
a.	Back Pay Obligation; Omitted Term .....	4727
b.	Amendment to Agreement; Counterproposal .....	4729
10.	Specific Settlement Provisions .....	4730
a.	Term of Art .....	4730
b.	Obligation to Reinstatement or Restore to Duty; Precondition to Restoration.....	4730
c.	Agreement to Reassign, Demote, Suspend; Work Schedule Change; Light Duty Position .....	4732
d.	Employee May Be Terminated or Will Resign or Retire Upon Specified Condition; Agreement Not to Reapply ..	4733
e.	Promotion, Placement Consideration; Priority Consideration .....	4735
f.	Agreement to Provide Affirmative, Neutral, or Controlled Reference .....	4739
g.	"Clean Record" or "Clean Paper"; Expungement or Withdrawal of Record; Implied Requirement; NDAA; Executive Order 13,839 .....	4747
h.	Nondisclosure or Confidentiality Clause.....	4763
i.	"Need to Know" Exception to Confidentiality Clause.....	4770
j.	Whistleblower Protection Enhancement Act Provision.....	4775
k.	Waiver of Protection of Confidentiality or Affirmative Reference Provision .....	4775
l.	Damages Unavailable for Breach of Clause Requiring Affirmative Reference, Other Violations .....	4776
m.	Adjustment of Performance Appraisal, Documentation.....	4777
n.	Agreement to Provide Assistance to Employee .....	4779
o.	Agreement to "Cancel" Action; Back Pay, Interest, Damages, or Other Entitlement; Bonus or Award; Lump Sum Provision .....	4779
p.	Annuity Issues .....	4784
q.	Unemployment Compensation .....	4789
11.	Debt Recoupment .....	4789
12.	Allegation of Reprisal or Harassment.....	4790
13.	Settlement Reached in Another Tribunal.....	4793

14. Settlement Involving Action of Third Party .....	4793
15. Privacy Act Issue .....	4793
16. Provision That Violates Collective Bargaining Agreement .....	4794
17. Unlawful Provision .....	4794
C. INTERVENING ABOLITION OF POSITION; SUBSEQUENT ADVERSE ACTION DURING ENFORCEMENT PROCEEDING .....	4795

## CHAPTER 17: JUDICIAL REVIEW.....4799

I. OVERVIEW OF THE APPELLATE PROCESS .....	4799
A. NATURE OF THE DECISION UNDER REVIEW .....	4799
1. Final Decision.....	4799
a. Denial of Request for Reopening.....	4801
2. Statutory Basis for Review; CSRA and Whistleblower Protection Enhancement Act of 2012 .....	4804
a. Collateral MSPB Order.....	4805
b. Decision Remanding Case to Judge; Final Order Rule .....	4805
c. Counsel Fee Award, Application .....	4807
3. Proper Parties in Court; Standing; Mootness .....	4808
a. Proper Respondent in Court .....	4809
b. OSC Disciplinary Case .....	4813
c. Arbitration Award .....	4814
4. Authorization to Appeal .....	4814
5. <i>Amicus</i> Submission .....	4814
6. Counsel Authorized to Appear in Appeal; Federal Circuit Admission.....	4814
7. Government Appellate Review Request; Cross-Appeal.....	4815
a. Review Request by OPM .....	4815
b. Discrimination Issue .....	4816
8. Court of Appeals for the Federal Circuit.....	4817
a. Nonprecedential Decision.....	4818
b. Summary Affirmation .....	4819
c. Court Practice .....	4820
d. <i>Pro Se</i> Appeal .....	4823
e. Stay Pending Court Review.....	4824
9. Record Below .....	4824
a. Appendix .....	4825
b. New and Material Evidence .....	4826
B. SCOPE OF REVIEW .....	4826
1. Arbitrary and Capricious.....	4827
2. Issues of Law, Jurisdiction; Contract Interpretation; Constitutional Issues .....	4827
a. Decisional Rationale Omitted by MSPB; Departure From Precedent .....	4829
3. Procedural Error by MSPB.....	4830
a. Ruling on Witnesses and Evidence .....	4831
b. Ruling on Discovery .....	4832
c. Timeliness of MSPB Filing .....	4833
4. Substantial Evidence; Factual Dispute.....	4834
a. Credibility .....	4837
b. Nexus .....	4841
5. Agency Rule of Conduct .....	4842
6. Penalty Determination .....	4842
a. Performance Action.....	4846
7. Reduction in Force .....	4846
8. Whistleblower Reprisal: Circuits Other Than the Federal Circuit .....	4846
C. DEFERENCE; INTERPRETATION OF STATUTES, REGULATIONS, LABOR AND OTHER CONTRACTS .....	4847
1. Agency Statutory Interpretation .....	4847
a. Regulation Applying Statute; Agency Interpretation of Regulation .....	4849
2. Agency Handbook, Instruction .....	4854
3. MSPB Decision .....	4855
4. Principles of Statutory and Regulatory Interpretation .....	4855
a. Language Controls.....	4857
b. Consideration of the Statutory Scheme .....	4859
c. Avoidance of Absurd Consequences .....	4860
d. Statements of Legislators .....	4860
e. Amendment; Failure to Amend.....	4860



f. Retroactivity .....	4860
g. Change in Law .....	4864
5. Interpretation of Collective Bargaining Agreement.....	4864
6. Settlement; Last Chance Agreement .....	4866
D. RETIREMENT AND ANNUITY APPEALS .....	4867
1. Disability Retirement .....	4869
2. Optional Retirement .....	4873
E. DISCRIMINATION ISSUES .....	4873
1. Reprisal.....	4876
2. Procedural Problem.....	4878
3. Jurisdictional Issue; Constructive Adverse Action; <i>Perry</i> .....	4878
4. Timeliness, Procedural Issue; <i>Kloeckner</i> .....	4885
5. Review of Board Decisions That Include EEO Defenses or Both EEO and Whistleblower Reprisal Defenses.....	4891
6. Transfer To and From District Courts.....	4893
7. District Court Review .....	4894
a. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies .....	4894
b. Summary Adjudication of EEO Issues; Disposition of Civil Service Issues .....	4895
c. Scope of Review .....	4897
d. Compliance With District Court Decision .....	4897
8. Discharge of Probationer .....	4897
F. REVIEW OF ARBITRATION AWARDS.....	4899
1. Mixed Case.....	4901
2. Time for Seeking Review .....	4907
3. Decisional Standards for Arbitrator .....	4908
a. Arbitrability .....	4912
b. Bargaining History .....	4913
c. Past Practice.....	4913
4. Attorney Fees Award.....	4915
5. Review Sought by OPM .....	4916
6. Award Involving Department of Veterans Affairs Title 38 Employee .....	4916
7. Award Involving Nonappropriated Fund Instrumentality Employee.....	4918
8. Award Reviewed by Federal Labor Relations Authority.....	4918
G. VEOA, USERRA CLAIMS.....	4919
II. PREREQUISITES FOR JUDICIAL REVIEW .....	4920
A. TIME FOR INITIATING JUDICIAL REVIEW.....	4920
1. Equitable Tolling .....	4924
B. EXHAUSTION OF MSPB ADMINISTRATIVE REMEDIES .....	4928
1. Issue Must Be Raised With the MSPB .....	4928
a. Exception to Exhaustion Requirement .....	4930
b. Mandamus.....	4930
2. Necessity for PFR to MSPB.....	4931
a. Challenge to Settlement.....	4933
3. Ripeness for Judicial Review .....	4933
III. JUDICIAL REMEDIAL AUTHORITY .....	4934
A. AUTHORITY TO REMAND .....	4935
1. Remand to Effect Settlement .....	4936
2. Judicial Control of MSPB Procedures .....	4936
B. AUTHORITY TO TRANSFER .....	4936
C. SANCTIONS .....	4937
1. Examples of Sanctionable Conduct .....	4939
IV. JUDICIAL RELIEF OUTSIDE THE REFORM ACT .....	4941
A. PARTIES TO THE SUIT .....	4942
1. Sovereign Immunity.....	4943
2. Absolute Immunity.....	4943
3. Qualified Immunity.....	4943
a. Action Against Union .....	4943
B. SUITS BASED ON STATUTE AND CONSTITUTION .....	4943
1. Administrative Procedure Act .....	4943
a. Use of the APA .....	4944
b. Scope of Review; Preclusive Effect of the Reform Act .....	4944
c. Scope of Relief .....	4948

2.	Privacy Act; FOIA .....	4948
a.	Scope of the Act .....	4949
b.	Enforcement of the Act .....	4949
c.	Use of the Privacy Act .....	4950
d.	Position Classification .....	4950
3.	Mandamus Act .....	4951
a.	Position Classification .....	4951
4.	Tucker Act .....	4954
a.	Position Classification .....	4959
b.	Overtime Pay Claim .....	4960
c.	Environmental Differential, Hazard Pay, Travel Pay .....	4961
d.	Claims Concerning Tenure, Contract Employment, Promotion, and Bonuses .....	4963
e.	Whistleblower Reprisal Claim .....	4968
f.	Claims Based on Constitution .....	4970
g.	EEO Settlement .....	4970
h.	MSPB Settlement .....	4973
5.	Federal Tort Claims Act .....	4975
6.	Back Pay Act .....	4976
a.	Implied Preclusion Under the CSRA .....	4979
b.	Promotion Claim .....	4980
7.	Family Medical Leave Act .....	4981
8.	Overtime, Pay Statutes .....	4981
9.	Unfair Labor Practice .....	4983
10.	Constitution .....	4983
a.	Property Interest .....	4985
b.	Liberty Interest; Name Clearing Hearing .....	4986
(i)	Termination of Probationer, Others .....	4987
c.	First Amendment .....	4988
11.	Injunction Action .....	4990
C.	ACTIONS FOR DAMAGES AGAINST INDIVIDUALS AND GOVERNMENT; <i>BIVENS</i> .....	4997
1.	Preclusion in the Circuits .....	5001
a.	D.C. Circuit .....	5001
b.	First Circuit .....	5004
c.	Second Circuit .....	5004
d.	Third Circuit .....	5004
e.	Fourth Circuit .....	5005
f.	Fifth Circuit .....	5005
g.	Sixth Circuit .....	5006
h.	Seventh Circuit .....	5006
i.	Eighth Circuit .....	5007
j.	Ninth Circuit .....	5007
k.	Tenth Circuit .....	5008
l.	Eleventh Circuit .....	5009
2.	Claims Based on State Law; Westfall Act; Federal Tort Claims Act; Defamation; Tort Action Arising From Assault; No FEAR Act .....	5010

## CHAPTER 18: RESEARCH, REFERENCE MATERIALS, AND FORMS.....5017

I.	RESEARCH AND REFERENCES .....	5017
II.	FORMS .....	5018

## BIBLIOGRAPHY .....5039

## TABLE OF CASES .....5047

## INDEX .....5197