

# SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

---

INTRODUCTION: CHARGES, PENALTIES, AND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES .....	1
--	---

## PART ONE—THE AGENCY CHARGE

CHAPTER 1: THE BASICS, THE ESSENTIALS—ADVERSE ACTIONS .....	9
CHAPTER 2: CHARGES AND PROOF REQUIREMENTS .....	19

## PART TWO—FRAMING OR WRITING THE CHARGE

CHAPTER 3: CAUSE—THE OFFICIAL, CSRA CHARGE .....	371
CHAPTER 4: “SPECIFIC REASONS”; SPECIFIC RULES.....	405
CHAPTER 5: CHARGES—THE KINDS OF CHARGES, THEIR PARTS, THEIR RULES .....	415
CHAPTER 6: THE SPECIFIC LABEL CHARGE .....	447
CHAPTER 7: GENERIC, NARRATIVE CHARGES.....	467
CHAPTER 8: THE CONJUNCTIVE CHARGE .....	489
CHAPTER 9: CHARGE INTERPRETATION .....	503
CHAPTER 10: MERGER, MULTIPLICITY OF CHARGES, AND ADMINISTRATIVE DOUBLE JEOPARDY .	545
CHAPTER 11: NOTICE; DUE PROCESS .....	571
CHAPTER 12: KEY CHARGES AND THEIR ALTERNATIVES.....	619
CHAPTER 13: SPECIAL, UNIQUE, OFTEN JOB-ENDING CHARGES—SECURITY-RELATED ISSUES; CONDITIONS OF EMPLOYMENT, INABILITY TO PERFORM, ILLEGAL DRUG USE .....	691
CHAPTER 14: THE INDEFINITE SUSPENSION CHARGE .....	727
CHAPTER 15: POWER CHARGING—CHARGING DOWN, PROVING UP; CHARGING IN THE ALTERNATIVE .....	753
CHAPTER 16: SELECTING, DRAFTING THE CHARGE; WORKING WITH PROPOSING, DECIDING OFFICIALS.....	773

## PART THREE—THE PENALTY

CHAPTER 17: PENALTY BASICS AND FUNDAMENTALS .....	803
CHAPTER 18: PENALTY REVIEW AND DEFERENCE .....	831
CHAPTER 19: THE <i>DOUGLAS</i> FACTORS BY THE NUMBERS .....	861
CHAPTER 20: TRICKS OF THE TRADE—SELLING/ATTACKING THE PENALTY; DEALING WITH DECIDING OFFICIALS .....	937

## PART FOUR—HOW TO DO IT (IN REAL TIME)

CHAPTER 21: HOW TO DO IT: MASTERING THE BASICS, APPLYING THE FUNDAMENTALS .....	961
CHAPTER 22: HOW TO DO IT: A CLOSER, “POST-GRAD” LOOK AT THE NUANCES.....	975

## PART FIVE—CHARGES AND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES

CHAPTER 23: CHARGES AND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES.....	991
TABLE OF CASES.....	1083



# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>INTRODUCTION: CHARGES, PENALTIES, AND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES .....</b>	<b>1</b>
---	----------

## PART ONE—THE AGENCY CHARGE

<b>CHAPTER 1: THE BASICS, THE ESSENTIALS—ADVERSE ACTIONS .....</b>	<b>9</b>
I. INTRODUCTION .....	9
A. JURISDICTION .....	9
II. ADVERSE ACTIONS .....	10
A. SHORT SUSPENSIONS (5 USC 7501–7504 NON-ADVERSE ACTIONS).....	11
B. MAJOR ADVERSE ACTIONS.....	11
C. COVERED EMPLOYEES .....	12
D. THE PROPOSAL: PREDECISIONAL DUE PROCESS AND STATUTORY, REGULATORY ENTITLEMENTS .....	14
1. Importance of the Proposal.....	14
2. No Predecisional Discovery; Materials Relied Upon, <i>et al.</i> .....	15
3. Oral, Written Replies.....	15
4. Preappeal Advocacy.....	16
E. THE AGENCY FINAL DECISION .....	16
F. THE EMPLOYEE’S STATUS PENDING THE AGENCY FINAL DECISION: FULL DUTY, PAY STATUS; REASSIGNMENT OR DETAIL; ADMINISTRATIVE LEAVE; INDEFINITE SUSPENSION .....	17
<b>CHAPTER 2: CHARGES AND PROOF REQUIREMENTS .....</b>	<b>19</b>
I. BURDENS AND SPECIFIC BURDEN CHARGES .....	19
A. ABSENCE WITHOUT LEAVE (AWOL) (TO INCLUDE TARDINESS) .....	19
1. Elements.....	19
2. Specification.....	19
3. Overview .....	19
4. Explanation.....	20
a. Absence From Duty Element .....	20
b. Absence Not Authorized or Request Properly Denied Element .....	21
c. Scope of Evidence.....	21
d. The Importance of Medical Evidence .....	21
e. Relationship of AWOL to Approved and Excessive Leave Cases.....	22
f. Relationship of AWOL to Failure to Follow Leave Procedure Cases.....	22
g. Constructive Suspensions and Absences.....	22
h. Relationship of AWOL to Insubordination .....	23
i. Main Cases.....	23
5. Defenses.....	32
6. Key Penalty Considerations .....	34
7. Related Charges.....	36
B. ABUSE OF LEAVE .....	36
1. Elements.....	36
2. Specification.....	37
3. Explanation.....	37
a. Nature of Charge .....	37
4. Defenses.....	37
5. Key Penalty Considerations .....	37
6. Related Charges.....	38
C. ABUSIVE, OFFENSIVE, INDECENT, DISGRACEFUL, DISRESPECTFUL, INSOLENT, OR INFLAMMATORY LANGUAGE .....	38
1. Elements.....	38
2. Specification.....	38
3. Explanation.....	38
a. Nature of Charge .....	38
b. Definitions and Examples of Offenses.....	40
c. Presence .....	42

	d.	Intent and Truth of Statements .....	42
	4.	Defenses .....	43
	5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	47
	6.	Related Charges .....	48
D.		ALCOHOL: POSSESSION, USE, OR IMPAIRMENT .....	49
	1.	Elements .....	49
	2.	Specification .....	49
	a.	Alcohol: Possession or Use Specification .....	49
	b.	Alternative Specification When Alcohol Possession Results From Alcohol Test .....	49
	c.	Alternative Specification When Alcohol Impairment Is Charged .....	49
	3.	Explanation .....	49
	a.	Nature of Charge and Definitions .....	49
	b.	Testing, Constitutional, and Chain of Custody Issues .....	49
	c.	Main Cases .....	49
	4.	Defenses .....	51
	5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	52
	6.	Related Charges .....	53
E.		ARREST .....	53
	1.	Elements .....	53
	2.	Specification .....	53
	3.	Explanation .....	53
	a.	Definition .....	53
	b.	Inappropriate Cause .....	53
	4.	Defenses .....	53
	5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	53
	6.	Related Charges .....	53
F.		ASSAULT, BATTERY, FIGHTING .....	54
	1.	Elements .....	54
	a.	Assault .....	54
	b.	Battery .....	54
	2.	Specification—Assault .....	54
	3.	Specification—Battery (or Fighting) .....	54
	4.	Explanation .....	54
	a.	Nature of Charges and Definitions .....	54
	b.	Battery-Type Offenses .....	55
	c.	Intent .....	55
	d.	Main Cases .....	55
	5.	Defenses .....	58
	6.	Related Charges .....	60
	7.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	60
	8.	Related Charges .....	61
G.		ATTEMPT .....	61
	1.	Elements .....	61
	2.	Specification .....	62
	3.	Explanation .....	62
	a.	Intent .....	62
	b.	Main Cases .....	62
	4.	Defenses .....	63
	5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	63
	6.	Related Charges .....	63
H.		BREACH OR VIOLATION OF PHYSICAL SECURITY POLICY .....	63
	1.	Elements .....	63
	2.	Specification .....	63
	3.	Explanation .....	63
	a.	Nature of Charge .....	63
	4.	Defenses .....	64
	5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	64
	6.	Related Charges .....	65
I.		CARELESS OR NEGLIGENT PERFORMANCE OF DUTIES .....	65
	1.	Elements .....	65

2.	Specification.....	65
3.	Explanation.....	65
a.	Lack of Due Care Requirement and Definitions.....	65
b.	Main Cases and Examples of Conduct Covered.....	65
4.	Defenses.....	69
5.	Key Penalty Considerations.....	70
6.	Related Charges.....	70
J.	CONDUCT UNBECOMING (TO INCLUDE CHARGES OF IMPROPER CONDUCT, DISHONEST CONDUCT, UNACCEPTABLE CONDUCT, AND UNPROFESSIONAL CONDUCT).....	70
1.	Elements.....	70
2.	Specification.....	71
3.	Explanation.....	71
a.	Nature of Charge.....	71
b.	Definitions, Examples of Conduct Covered, and Main Cases.....	71
4.	Defenses.....	80
5.	Key Penalty Considerations.....	81
6.	Related Charges.....	82
K.	CONFLICT OF INTEREST; APPARENT CONFLICT OF INTEREST.....	82
1.	Elements.....	82
a.	Conflict of Interest.....	82
b.	Apparent Conflict of Interest.....	82
2.	Specification.....	83
a.	Conflict of Interest.....	83
b.	Apparent Conflict of Interest.....	83
3.	Explanation.....	83
a.	Introduction.....	83
b.	Direct and Predictable.....	83
c.	Creating the Appearance.....	84
d.	Notice of the Policy Violated.....	84
e.	Definitions, Elements, and Main Cases.....	84
4.	Defenses.....	89
5.	Key Penalty Considerations.....	91
6.	Related Charges.....	91
L.	CONVERSION.....	91
1.	Elements.....	91
2.	Specification.....	92
3.	Explanation.....	92
a.	Intent.....	92
b.	Main Cases.....	92
4.	Defenses.....	92
5.	Key Penalty Considerations.....	92
6.	Related Charges.....	93
M.	CONVICTION (ACTION BASED ON CONVICTION ITSELF AND NOT BY USING CONVICTION TO PROVE UNDERLYING CONDUCT).....	93
1.	Elements.....	93
2.	Specification.....	93
3.	Explanation.....	93
a.	Nature of Charge.....	93
b.	Main Cases.....	93
4.	Defenses.....	95
5.	Key Penalty Considerations.....	95
6.	Related Charges.....	95
N.	CONVICTION (ACTION BASED ON UNDERLYING MISCONDUCT AS PROVEN BY THE CONVICTION).....	95
1.	Elements.....	95
2.	Specification.....	96
3.	Explanation.....	96
a.	Nature of Charge.....	96
b.	Main Cases.....	96
4.	Defenses.....	97
5.	Key Penalty Considerations.....	97

6.	Related Charges.....	97
O.	DISCLOSURE OF CONFIDENTIAL, PRIVACY ACT, OR SENSITIVE INFORMATION; UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE .....	98
1.	Elements.....	98
2.	Specification.....	98
3.	Explanation.....	98
a.	Nature of Charge .....	98
b.	Main Cases .....	99
4.	Defenses .....	101
5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	103
6.	Related Charges.....	104
P.	DISCRIMINATION: ACTIONS AND COMMENTS .....	104
1.	Elements.....	104
2.	Specification.....	104
3.	Explanation.....	104
a.	Nature of Charge .....	104
b.	Intent Not Required.....	104
c.	Main Cases .....	105
4.	Defenses .....	106
5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	106
6.	Related Charges.....	107
Q.	DISORDERLY CONDUCT .....	107
1.	Elements.....	107
2.	Specification.....	107
3.	Explanation.....	107
a.	No Intent .....	107
b.	Main Cases .....	107
4.	Defenses .....	109
5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	110
6.	Related Charges.....	110
R.	DRUGS: POSSESSION OR USE .....	110
1.	Elements.....	110
2.	Specification.....	111
a.	Alternative Specification When Drug Possession Results From Drug Test .....	111
3.	Explanation.....	111
a.	Nature of Charge and Definitions .....	111
b.	Executive Order Issues.....	111
c.	Constitutional Issues.....	112
d.	Chain of Custody Issues .....	112
e.	The Effect of the District and Several States Legalizing Marijuana .....	113
f.	Main Cases .....	113
4.	Defenses .....	117
5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	118
6.	Related Charges.....	119
S.	DRUGS: REFUSAL TO TAKE DRUG TEST .....	120
1.	Elements.....	120
2.	Specification.....	120
3.	Explanation.....	120
a.	Nature of Charge .....	120
b.	Main Cases .....	120
4.	Defenses .....	121
5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	121
6.	Related Charges.....	121
T.	EMBEZZLEMENT.....	122
U.	ENFORCED LEAVE .....	122
1.	Elements.....	122
2.	Specification.....	122
3.	Explanation.....	122
a.	Nature of Charge .....	122
b.	Jurisdictional Issues and Constructive Suspensions .....	122
c.	Main Cases (Jurisdictional and Merits).....	125

4.	Defenses .....	127
5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	128
6.	Related Charges .....	128
V.	ENGAGING IN A PROHIBITED RELATIONSHIP .....	128
1.	Elements .....	128
2.	Specification .....	128
3.	Explanation .....	128
a.	Nature of Charge .....	128
b.	Notice of Regulations, Policies, or Procedures .....	129
c.	Main Cases .....	129
4.	Defenses .....	130
5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	131
6.	Related Charges .....	131
W.	ETHICS VIOLATIONS, STATUTORY AND STANDARDS OF CONDUCT .....	131
X.	EXCESSIVE ABSENCE (EVEN THOUGH APPROVED) .....	131
1.	Elements .....	131
2.	Specification .....	132
3.	Explanation .....	132
a.	Nature of Charge .....	132
b.	Main Cases .....	132
4.	Defenses .....	134
5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	135
6.	Related Charges .....	135
Y.	FAILURE TO COMPLETE TRAINING .....	135
1.	Elements .....	135
2.	Specification .....	136
3.	Explanation .....	136
a.	Nature of Charge .....	136
b.	Main Cases .....	136
4.	Defenses .....	137
5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	137
6.	Related Charges .....	137
Z.	FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH LEAVE PROCEDURES .....	138
1.	Elements .....	138
2.	Specification .....	138
a.	If Leave Has Been Denied .....	138
b.	After Approval of Leave .....	138
3.	Explanation .....	138
a.	Nature of Charge .....	138
b.	Main Cases .....	138
4.	Defenses .....	139
5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	140
6.	Related Charges .....	140
AA.	FAILURE TO FOLLOW EEO PROCEDURES .....	141
BB.	FAILURE TO FOLLOW ORDERS, INSTRUCTIONS, OR PROCEDURES .....	141
1.	Elements .....	141
2.	Specification .....	141
3.	Explanation .....	141
a.	No Intent .....	141
b.	Main Cases .....	141
4.	Defenses .....	147
5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	148
6.	Related Charges .....	148
CC.	FAILURE TO REGISTER WITH SELECTIVE SERVICE SYSTEM .....	148
1.	Elements .....	148
DD.	FAILURE TO REPORT AN OFFENSE, STATUS, OR RELATIONSHIP .....	149
1.	Elements .....	149
2.	Specification .....	149
3.	Explanation .....	149
a.	Nature of Charge, Examples of Conduct Covered, and Main Cases .....	149

	b. Notice .....	150
	4. Defenses .....	151
	5. Key Penalty Considerations .....	151
	6. Related Charges .....	151
EE.	FAILURE TO REPORT FOR A FITNESS-FOR-DUTY EXAMINATION .....	151
	1. Elements .....	151
	2. Specification .....	152
	3. Explanation .....	152
	a. Nature of Charge .....	152
	b. Main Cases .....	152
	4. Defenses .....	153
	5. Key Penalty Considerations .....	157
	6. Related Charges .....	157
FF.	FAILURE TO REPORT FOR DUTY .....	158
GG.	FAILURE TO SAFEGUARD GOVERNMENT PROPERTY .....	158
HH.	FALSIFICATION; MISREPRESENTATION; FRAUD .....	158
	1. Elements .....	158
	2. Specification .....	158
	3. Explanation .....	158
	a. Nature of Charge .....	158
	b. Intent .....	158
	c. Alternatives to Intent .....	159
	d. Materiality .....	160
	e. Reliance .....	160
	f. Personal Gain .....	160
	g. Main Cases .....	160
	4. Defenses .....	175
	5. Key Penalty Considerations .....	177
	6. Related Charges .....	179
II.	FIGHTING .....	179
JJ.	FIREARM: POSSESSION AT WORK .....	179
KK.	FORGERY .....	179
LL.	FURLOUGH .....	179
	1. Elements .....	179
	2. Sample Notice .....	179
	3. Explanation .....	180
	a. Nature of Charge .....	180
	b. Other Recent Cases .....	183
MM.	GOVERNMENT VEHICLE OR GOVERNMENT LEASED VEHICLE, WILLFUL MISUSE .....	185
	1. Elements .....	185
	2. Specification .....	185
	3. Explanation .....	185
	a. Nature of Charge .....	185
	b. Intent .....	185
	c. The Minimum Statutory Penalty of a 30-Day Suspension .....	186
	d. Main Cases .....	186
	4. Defenses .....	188
	5. Key Penalty Considerations .....	189
	6. Related Charges .....	189
NN.	GRANTING PREFERENTIAL TREATMENT .....	189
	1. Elements .....	189
	2. Specification .....	190
	3. Explanation .....	190
	a. Nature of Charge .....	190
	b. Elements of Charge .....	190
	c. Main Cases .....	190
	4. Defenses .....	193
	5. Key Penalty Considerations .....	193
	6. Related Charges .....	194
OO.	INABILITY TO PERFORM (AS A RESULT OF A MEDICAL CONDITION) .....	194



1.	Elements.....	194
2.	Specification.....	194
a.	Specification Under Alternative Formulation.....	194
3.	Explanation.....	194
a.	Nature of Charge.....	194
b.	Recovery Before the Hearing.....	195
c.	Importance of Medical Evidence.....	197
d.	Fitness-For-Duty Examinations.....	198
e.	Importance of Performance-Related Information.....	198
f.	Effect on Receipt of Disability Retirement.....	198
g.	The Obligation to Consider Accommodation or Reassignment.....	199
h.	Main Cases.....	200
4.	Defenses.....	210
5.	Key Penalty Considerations.....	211
6.	Related Charges.....	211
PP.	INDEBTEDNESS, REFUSAL TO HONOR FINANCIAL OBLIGATIONS.....	211
1.	Elements.....	211
2.	Specification.....	212
3.	Explanation.....	212
a.	Nature of Charge.....	212
b.	No Intent.....	212
c.	The Significance of the Efficiency of the Service.....	212
d.	Main Cases.....	212
4.	Defenses.....	213
5.	Key Penalty Considerations.....	213
6.	Related Charges.....	214
QQ.	INDEFINITE SUSPENSION BASED ON A SECURITY CLEARANCE DETERMINATION OR INELIGIBILITY TO HOLD A NONCRITICAL SENSITIVE POSITION.....	214
1.	Elements.....	214
2.	Specification.....	214
3.	Explanation.....	214
a.	Nature of Charge.....	214
b.	“Minimum Due Process Requirement”?.....	214
c.	An Alternative Procedure.....	217
d.	Matters of National Security: <i>Egan</i> Applies to Determinations Related to Security Clearances and Eligibility to Occupy Noncritical Sensitive Positions.....	217
e.	Main Cases.....	219
4.	Defenses.....	224
5.	Key Penalty Considerations.....	225
6.	Related Charges.....	226
RR.	INDEFINITE SUSPENSION PENDING CRIMINAL CHARGES.....	226
1.	Elements.....	226
2.	Explanation.....	226
a.	Nature of Charge.....	226
b.	Condition Subsequent Element.....	227
c.	A Second Action After the Completion of the Condition Subsequent.....	227
d.	Shortening the Notice Period.....	228
e.	Nexus and Penalty.....	228
f.	The Confusion Caused by <i>Perez v. DOJ</i> .....	228
g.	Back Pay.....	232
h.	Main Cases.....	232
3.	Defenses.....	237
4.	Key Penalty Considerations.....	238
5.	Related Charges.....	238
SS.	INSUBORDINATION.....	238
1.	Elements.....	238
2.	Specification.....	238
3.	Explanation.....	238
a.	Intent.....	238
b.	Alternative Charges Treated or Not Treated as Insubordination.....	239

	c. Main Cases.....	239
	4. Defenses.....	245
	5. Key Penalty Considerations.....	247
	6. Related Charges.....	248
TT.	INTERFERING WITH AN AGENCY INVESTIGATION.....	248
	1. Elements.....	248
	2. Specification.....	248
	3. Explanation.....	248
	a. Nature of Charge.....	248
	b. Main Cases.....	248
	4. Defenses.....	249
	5. Key Penalty Considerations.....	249
	6. Related Charges.....	249
UU.	LACK OF CANDOR.....	250
	1. Elements.....	250
	2. Specification.....	250
	3. Explanation.....	250
	a. Nature of Charge.....	250
	b. Main Cases.....	253
	4. Defenses.....	260
	5. Key Penalty Considerations.....	261
	6. Related Charges.....	261
VV.	LARCENY.....	261
WW.	LAST CHANCE AGREEMENT VIOLATIONS.....	261
	1. Main Cases.....	262
XX.	LIBELOUS AND SLANDEROUS STATEMENTS.....	262
YY.	LOSS OF CREDENTIALS OR CERTIFICATION OR OTHER REQUIREMENT OF POSITION.....	263
	1. Elements.....	263
	2. Specification.....	263
	3. Explanation.....	263
	a. Nature of Charge.....	263
	b. Main Cases.....	265
	4. Defenses.....	269
	5. Key Penalty Considerations.....	270
	6. Related Charges.....	270
ZZ.	LOSS OF MILITARY QUALIFICATION REQUIREMENTS.....	270
	1. Elements.....	270
	2. Specification.....	271
	3. Explanation.....	271
	a. Nature of Charge.....	271
	b. Main Cases.....	271
	4. Defenses.....	272
	5. Key Penalty Considerations.....	272
	6. Related Charges.....	272
AAA.	LOSS OR DENIAL OF SECURITY CLEARANCE AND INELIGIBILITY TO OCCUPY A NONCRITICAL SENSITIVE POSITION.....	272
	1. Elements.....	272
	2. Specification.....	273
	3. Explanation.....	273
	a. Nature of Charge and Agency's Burden.....	273
	b. Main Cases.....	274
	4. Defenses.....	279
	5. Key Penalty Considerations.....	280
	6. Related Charges.....	280
BBB.	MANDATORY REMOVAL CHARGES (BY STATUTE).....	280
	1. Elements.....	280
	2. Specification.....	280
	3. Explanation.....	280
	a. Nature of Charge.....	280
	(i) Internal Revenue Service; Tax-Related.....	281

(ii)	VA: The Veterans Administration Accountability and Whistleblower Protection Act of 2017 .....	282
(a)	Senior Executives .....	283
(b)	Title V and Full-Time Hybrid VA Employees .....	283
(iii)	Law Enforcement; Firearm .....	284
(iv)	Health and Human Services .....	284
b.	Main Cases .....	285
4.	Defenses .....	286
5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	286
6.	Related Charges .....	286
CCC.	MISAPPROPRIATION OF GOVERNMENT PROPERTY .....	286
DDD.	MISTREATMENT OF MAIL .....	286
1.	Elements .....	286
2.	Specification .....	286
3.	Explanation .....	286
a.	Nature of Charge .....	286
b.	Main Cases .....	287
4.	Defenses .....	288
5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	288
6.	Related Charges .....	288
EEE.	MISTREATMENT OF SUBORDINATES .....	288
FFF.	MISUSE OF A COMPUTER .....	289
GGG.	MISUSE OF A CREDIT CARD .....	293
HHH.	MISUSE OF OFFICE .....	295
III.	MISUSE OF PROPERTY (INCLUDING UNAUTHORIZED USE, UNAUTHORIZED POSSESSION, AND UNAUTHORIZED REMOVAL) .....	296
1.	Elements .....	296
2.	Specification .....	296
3.	Explanation .....	296
a.	Nature of Charge .....	296
b.	Main Cases .....	297
4.	Defenses .....	303
5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	303
6.	Related Charges .....	304
JJJ.	OFF-DUTY MISCONDUCT .....	304
1.	Elements .....	304
2.	Specification .....	304
3.	Explanation .....	305
a.	Nature of Charge .....	305
b.	Main Cases .....	308
4.	Defenses .....	311
5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	312
6.	Related Charges .....	312
KKK.	PATIENT ABUSE, ENDANGERMENT .....	312
1.	Elements .....	312
2.	Specification .....	312
3.	Explanation .....	312
a.	Nature of Charge .....	312
b.	Main Cases .....	313
4.	Defenses .....	315
5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	316
6.	Related Charges .....	316
LLL.	PERFORMANCE-BASED ACTIONS UNDER CHAPTER 75 .....	316
1.	Elements .....	316
2.	Specification .....	317
3.	Explanation .....	317
a.	Nature of Charge .....	317
b.	The Differences Between a Chapter 75 and a Chapter 43 Action .....	317
c.	The Significance of the Presence or Absence of Performance Standards in a Chapter 75 Action .....	317
d.	Notice .....	317
e.	Main Cases .....	317

4.	Defenses .....	320
5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	321
6.	Related Charges .....	321
MMM.	PERJURY .....	322
NNN.	POOR JUDGMENT .....	322
OOO.	REASSIGNMENT, REFUSAL TO REPORT .....	322
1.	Elements .....	322
2.	Specification .....	322
3.	Explanation .....	322
a.	Nature of Charge and Burdens .....	322
b.	Main Cases .....	323
4.	Defenses .....	325
5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	325
6.	Related Charges .....	326
PPP.	REFUSAL (OR FAILURE) TO COOPERATE IN AN AGENCY INVESTIGATION .....	326
1.	Elements .....	326
2.	Specification .....	326
3.	Explanation .....	326
a.	Nature of Charge .....	326
b.	Conduct Constituting a Refusal or Failure to Cooperate .....	326
c.	Constitutional Considerations .....	327
d.	Main Cases .....	328
4.	Defenses .....	331
5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	332
6.	Related Charges .....	332
QQQ.	REFUSAL TO COOPERATE IN AGENCY SEARCH OF PROPERTY .....	332
1.	Elements .....	332
2.	Specification .....	332
3.	Explanation .....	333
a.	Nature of Charge .....	333
b.	Main Cases .....	333
4.	Defenses .....	333
5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	334
6.	Related Charges .....	334
RRR.	REPRISAL (FOR WHISTLEBLOWING) .....	334
1.	Elements .....	334
2.	Specification .....	334
3.	Explanation .....	334
a.	Nature of Charge .....	334
b.	The "Authority to Take" (or "to Influence") Element .....	334
c.	The "Taking or Failing to Take a Personnel Action" Element .....	335
d.	The Disclosure Element .....	335
e.	The Knowledge Requirement .....	335
f.	The Causation Element .....	335
g.	Main Cases .....	335
4.	Defenses .....	336
5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	336
6.	Related Charges .....	337
SSS.	REPRISAL (NON-WHISTLEBLOWING) .....	337
1.	Elements .....	337
2.	Specification .....	337
3.	Explanation .....	337
a.	Nature of Charge .....	337
b.	Protected Activity Element .....	337
c.	Significant Factor Element .....	338
d.	Main Cases .....	338
4.	Defenses .....	338
5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	339
6.	Related Charges .....	339
TTT.	SEXUAL HARASSMENT (TITLE VII AND AGENCY POLICY CHARGES) .....	339

1.	Elements.....	339
2.	Specification.....	340
3.	Explanation.....	340
	a. Nature of Charge .....	340
	b. Intent Not Required.....	340
	c. The Sexual-In-Nature Element .....	341
	d. The Unwelcomeness Element .....	341
	e. The Hostile Environment Element .....	341
	f. Main Cases.....	342
4.	Defenses.....	348
5.	Key Penalty Considerations .....	349
6.	Related Charges.....	350
UUU.	SEXUAL MISCONDUCT .....	350
VVV.	SOLICITATION OF MISCONDUCT.....	351
WWW.	THEFT .....	351
	1. Elements.....	351
	2. Specification.....	351
	3. Explanation.....	351
	a. Nature of Charge .....	351
	b. Intent .....	351
	c. Main Cases.....	352
	4. Defenses.....	354
	5. Key Penalty Considerations .....	354
	6. Related Charges.....	355
XXX.	THREAT.....	355
	1. Elements.....	355
	2. Specification.....	356
	3. Explanation.....	356
	a. Nature of Charge .....	356
	b. Intent Factor.....	356
	c. Considerations Underlying the <i>Metz</i> Factors .....	356
	(i) The Listener’s Reaction .....	356
	(ii) The Listener’s Apprehension of Harm .....	357
	(iii) The Speaker’s Intent.....	357
	(iv) Any Conditional Nature of the Statements.....	357
	(v) Attendant Circumstances.....	357
	(vi) The Special Problem of Remarks That Are Made in a Confidential Setting.....	358
	d. Alternative Charges.....	358
	e. Main Cases.....	359
	4. Defenses.....	365
	5. Key Penalty Considerations .....	367
	6. Related Charges.....	367
YYY.	UNAUTHORIZED USE, POSSESSION OR REMOVAL OF GOVERNMENT PROPERTY .....	367

## PART TWO—FRAMING OR WRITING THE CHARGE

<b>CHAPTER 3: CAUSE—THE OFFICIAL, CSRA CHARGE .....</b>	<b>371</b>
I. INSTANT ESSENTIAL KNOWLEDGE: SERVICE EFFICIENCY .....	371
II. A CLOSER, MORE SUBSTANTIVE LOOK AT SERVICE EFFICIENCY .....	372
III. CAUSE AS WILL PROMOTE SERVICE EFFICIENCY: A CASE-BY-CASE, FACT-DRIVEN CONCEPT .....	373
A. CAUSE DOES NOT REQUIRE THE VIOLATION OF A RULE, REGULATION, OR POLICY.....	374
B. INTENT AND NOTICE ARE NOT ESSENTIAL TO A FINDING OF SERVICE EFFICIENCY.....	375
C. CAUSE MAY VARY FROM AGENCY TO AGENCY, JOB TO JOB .....	376
D. SPECIFIC SERVICE EFFICIENCY DETERMINATIONS.....	377
IV. HOW TO PROVE SERVICE EFFICIENCY IN OFF-DUTY MISCONDUCT ACTIONS .....	384
A. THE REBUTTABLE PRESUMPTION OF NEXUS .....	384
B. FACTORS 2 AND 3 .....	386
V. FEDERAL CIRCUIT AND BOARD ROADMAPS TO PROVE OR DISPROVE NEXUS .....	389

<b>CHAPTER 4: “SPECIFIC REASONS”; SPECIFIC RULES.....</b>	<b>405</b>
I. INSTANT ESSENTIAL KNOWLEDGE: “SPECIFIC REASONS”.....	405
II. “SPECIFIC REASONS” AS CAUSE.....	405
III. THE IMPORTANCE OF GETTING IT RIGHT, OF CORRECTLY MATCHING THE REASON (AN UNEMBELLISHED, CLEAN CHARGE) TO FACTS, THE SPECIFICATION .....	406
IV. THE IMPORTANCE OF STATING SIMPLY, CONCISELY, CLEARLY THE SPECIFIED REASONS: WORDS MATTER .....	408
V. A GLIMPSE AHEAD AT THE EIGHT ESSENTIALS: THE RULES.....	410
<b>CHAPTER 5: CHARGES—THE KINDS OF CHARGES, THEIR PARTS, THEIR RULES .....</b>	<b>415</b>
I. INSTANT ESSENTIAL KNOWLEDGE: THE THREE CHARGES, THEIR PARTS, AND THEIR RULES .....	415
II. A CLOSER, MORE SUBSTANTIVE LOOK AT THE KINDS OF CHARGES .....	415
A. THE SPECIFIC LABEL CHARGE.....	416
1. The Specific Label Charge Illustrated.....	416
2. Specific Burden Charges: Specific Labels, Specific Burdens .....	417
B. THE GENERIC, GENERAL LABEL CHARGE .....	417
1. The Generic Charge Label Illustrated.....	418
2. The Generic Charge’s Golden Rule and It’s Caveat.....	419
C. THE NARRATIVE, NO-NAME CHARGE.....	421
1. The Narrative Charge Illustrated.....	421
D. THE PROCESS OF CHARGE SELECTION.....	422
E. TACTICAL CONSIDERATIONS IN CHARGE SELECTION.....	422
F. TACTICAL CONSIDERATIONS IN CHARGE DRAFTING .....	423
III. A CLOSER, MORE SUBSTANTIVE LOOK AT THE PARTS OF A CHARGE.....	423
A. THE CHARGE’S LABEL, BASIS .....	424
1. The Label, the Basis Rule, aka the Cardinal Commandment .....	425
2. The Model Label .....	431
B. THE ELEMENTS.....	434
1. The Elements Rule.....	435
C. THE SPECIFICATION .....	437
1. The Specification Rule .....	438
2. The Model Specification .....	438
D. THE RULE AGAINST SPLITTING .....	439
1. The Rule Against Splitting Also Known as the Rule Against Lesser-Included Offenses .....	440
2. The Rule Against Splitting and Specifications .....	441
E. THE LAW OF CHARGING REDUX .....	442
F. CHARGES MAY BE BROUGHT IN ANY FORM .....	442
1. The Inverted, Summary Charge .....	443
2. Agency Designations as to Charge or Specification Are Not Necessarily Controlling.....	444
<b>CHAPTER 6: THE SPECIFIC LABEL CHARGE .....</b>	<b>447</b>
I. INSTANT ESSENTIAL KNOWLEDGE: THE SPECIFIC LABEL CHARGE.....	447
II. A CLOSER, MORE SUBSTANTIVE LOOK AT THE SPECIFIC LABEL CHARGE .....	447
A. SPECIFIC LABEL CHARGE RULES AND GUIDELINES.....	448
B. SPECIFIC LABELS AND SPECIFIC BURDENS .....	449
1. Intent Charges; Proving Intent .....	452
C. DRAFTING THE SPECIFIC LABEL.....	458
D. THE SPECIFIC LABEL SPECIFICATION MUST MATCH THE CHARGE.....	462
<b>CHAPTER 7: GENERIC, NARRATIVE CHARGES.....</b>	<b>467</b>
I. INSTANT ESSENTIAL KNOWLEDGE: THE GENERAL, NARRATIVE CHARGES .....	467
II. A CLOSER, MORE SUBSTANTIVE LOOK AT THE GENERAL AND NARRATIVE CHARGES .....	467
III. THE GENERIC, GENERAL CHARGE.....	470
A. A WORD ABOUT THE CRITICAL IMPORTANCE OF THE SPECIFICATION UNDERPINNING THE GENERIC CHARGE: THE SPECIFICATION USUALLY TRUMPS THE GENERAL LABEL .....	470
B. A WORD ABOUT “CONDUCT UNBECOMING” AND “DISHONEST CONDUCT” .....	472
C. A WORD ABOUT “SLASH AND DASH” CHARGES AND USING “I.E.” OR “ETC.” OR COMMINGLING THE GENERIC CHARGE WITH SPECIFIC LABEL CHARGES .....	475
IV. THE NARRATIVE CHARGE .....	477
A. THE LAW OF THE NARRATIVE CHARGE: MISCONDUCT THAT IS CLEARLY NOTICED AND SATISFIES SERVICE EFFICIENCY IS CONSIDERED CHARGED.....	477

V.	THE GENERIC, NARRATIVE CHARGE: THE IMPORTANCE OF THE WELL-DRAFTED SPECIFICATION .....	480
VI.	THE NARRATIVE, GENERIC CHARGE AND THE PENALTY ANALYSIS .....	484
VII.	A USER'S GUIDE FOR THE NARRATIVE CHARGE .....	486
A.	WHEN TO USE THE NARRATIVE CHARGE.....	486
B.	SATISFYING CAUSE.....	486
C.	DEALING WITH THE NARRATIVE, GENERAL CHARGE .....	487
<b>CHAPTER 8: THE CONJUNCTIVE CHARGE .....</b>		<b>489</b>
I.	INSTANT ESSENTIAL KNOWLEDGE: UNDERSTANDING THE CONJUNCTIVE CHARGE .....	489
II.	A CLOSER, MORE SUBSTANTIVE LOOK AT CONJUNCTIVE CHARGES .....	489
III.	SPLITTING THE CONJUNCTIVE CHARGE .....	490
A.	TESTING FOR THE CONJUNCTIVE CHARGE: TWO OR MORE CHARGES .....	490
B.	THE CONSEQUENCES OF FLUNKING THE CONJUNCTIVE TEST.....	498
<b>CHAPTER 9: CHARGE INTERPRETATION .....</b>		<b>503</b>
I.	INSTANT ESSENTIAL KNOWLEDGE: UNDERSTANDING OF CHARGE INTERPRETATION .....	503
II.	A CLOSER, MORE SUBSTANTIVE LOOK AT CHARGE INTERPRETATION .....	504
III.	BASIC CHARGE INTERPRETATION: FINDING THE ESSENCE OF THE CHARGE .....	504
IV.	FINDING THE ESSENCE OF THE CHARGE .....	505
A.	FINDING THE ESSENCE IN THE AGENCY'S CASE.....	506
B.	FINDING THE ESSENCE IN THE APPELLANT'S CASE.....	508
V.	THE CARDINAL RULE: CHARGES ARE NOT TECHNICALLY CONSTRUED .....	509
A.	READING THE CHARGE IN LIGHT OF THE SPECIFICATIONS .....	510
B.	READING THE CHARGE IN LIGHT OF THE CIRCUMSTANCES .....	512
VI.	A FINAL CAUTIONARY WORD ABOUT WORD CHOICE.....	514
VII.	ADVANCED CHARGE INTERPRETATION: FINDING THE ELEMENTS.....	515
VIII.	"SPLITTING" THE CONSEQUENCE AND THE RESULT OF THE MISCONDUCT .....	516
A.	THE ESSENCE VERSUS EFFECT CHARGE: PARSING THE ESSENCE AND THE EFFECT .....	516
B.	THE ESSENCE VERSUS EFFECT SPECIFICATION: PARSING THE ESSENCE AND THE EFFECT .....	517
C.	WHEN THE RESULT IS THE CHARGE, AN ELEMENT, A PROOF REQUIREMENT .....	518
IX.	"SPLITTING" DESCRIPTIVE INFORMATION.....	521
X.	"SPLITTING" PURELY PENALTY INFORMATION .....	527
XI.	"SPLITTING" ELEMENTS AND DESCRIPTIVE INFORMATION REDUX.....	529
XII.	CHARGE INTERPRETATION: THE GENERIC, NARRATIVE CHARGE AND CHARGE RECHARACTERIZATION .....	529
A.	THE DANGER OF CHARGE RECHARACTERIZATION .....	530
B.	THE DEATH KNEEL FOR CHARGE RECHARACTERIZATION: THAT THE AGENCY DID NOT USE A SPECIFIC LABEL CHARGE PROVES THAT IT DID NOT CHARGE A SPECIFIC LABEL CHARGE.....	536
C.	CHARGE RECHARACTERIZATION, HYPER-TECHNICAL PLEADING RISES FROM THE ASHES: <i>O'LAGUE?</i> .....	539
D.	THE CASE FOR NO CHARGE RECHARACTERIZATION .....	543
<b>CHAPTER 10: MERGER, MULTIPLICITY OF CHARGES, AND ADMINISTRATIVE DOUBLE JEOPARDY .</b>		<b>545</b>
I.	INSTANT ESSENTIAL KNOWLEDGE: MERGER AND DOUBLE JEOPARDY .....	545
II.	A CLOSER, MORE SUBSTANTIVE LOOK AT MERGER.....	545
A.	ASKING FOR MERGER.....	546
III.	THE ALCHEMY OF MERGER .....	547
A.	SUBSTANTIVE MERGER.....	547
B.	PENALTY MERGER.....	548
IV.	MERGER'S FLASHING YELLOW LIGHTS .....	548
A.	MERGER OF SPECIFIC CHARGE AND VAGUE, GENERAL CHARGE WITH BOTH CHARGES PREDICATED UPON SAME UNDERLYING MISCONDUCT.....	549
B.	MERGER OF THE MISCONDUCT CHARGE WITH REGULATORY CITE CHARGE, BOTH BASED ON THE SAME UNDERLYING MISCONDUCT .....	552
C.	ONE GLOBAL SPECIFICATION UNDERPINNING MORE THAN ONE CHARGE.....	554
D.	LEGALLY DISTINCT: LESSER-INCLUDED OFFENSES; SEPARATE OR IDENTICAL CAUSES OF ACTION; EQUIVALENT CHARGES; DOES PROOF OF ONE PROVE THE OTHER? .....	556
V.	MERGING "CONTINUATION" CHARGES: WHEN THE UNDERLYING CONDUCT IS DISTINCT ENOUGH TO BE TREATED IN MULTIPLE CHARGES .....	559
VI.	THE RELATIONSHIP OF PENALTIES AND MERGER.....	561
VII.	ADMINISTRATIVE DOUBLE JEOPARDY .....	562



<b>CHAPTER 11: NOTICE; DUE PROCESS .....</b>	<b>571</b>
I. INSTANT ESSENTIAL KNOWLEDGE: NOTICE AND DUE PROCESS .....	571
II. A CLOSER, MORE SUBSTANTIVE LOOK AT BOARD DUE PROCESS LAW: THE RESULT OF A DUE PROCESS VIOLATION.....	572
III. A CLOSER, MORE SUBSTANTIVE LOOK AT NOTICE, E.G., SPECIFIC REASONS, CHARGE INTERPRETATION AND DUE PROCESS.....	574
IV. NOTICE: THE AGENCY NOTICE MUST ALLOW FOR AN INFORMED RESPONSE .....	575
V. TESTING THE ADEQUACY OF NOTICE: TRADITIONAL BOARD APPROACHES .....	580
VI. <i>STONE, WARD ET AL.</i> AND THE INCREASED EMPHASIS ON DUE PROCESS.....	583
VII. <i>WARD</i> AND ITS PROGENY: DUE PROCESS EXTENDS TO PENALTY .....	585
VIII. COMMON NOTICE ISSUES.....	591
IX. THE BOARD AND COURT’S APPLICATION OF <i>STONE, WARD</i> .....	599
X. RECENT BOARD AND COURT DECISIONS APPLYING <i>STONE, WARD</i> .....	607
XI. A WORD OF CAUTION: THE AFTERMATH OF <i>STONE</i> AND THE BOARD’S CONFUSION WITH HARMFUL ERROR; THE COURT’S CLARIFICATION .....	615
A. THE FEDERAL CIRCUIT STEPS IN .....	616
<b>CHAPTER 12: KEY CHARGES AND THEIR ALTERNATIVES.....</b>	<b>619</b>
I. INSTANT ESSENTIAL KNOWLEDGE: KEY AGENCY CHARGES AND ALTERNATIVES .....	619
II. A CLOSER, MORE SUBSTANTIVE LOOK AT KEY CHARGES AND THEIR ALTERNATIVES .....	619
III. A CLOSER LOOK AT KEY CHARGES .....	621
A. FALSIFICATION, MISREPRESENTATION, LYING, LACK OF CANDOR.....	621
1. Falsification, Misrepresentation, Lying.....	623
2. Lack of Candor.....	636
3. Improper Conduct .....	656
B. INSUBORDINATION AND FAILURE TO FOLLOW INSTRUCTIONS .....	658
C. THREAT AND “MAKING STATEMENTS THAT...” .....	665
1. The “McCarty Charge”: “Making Statements That Caused Anxiety and Disruption”.....	666
2. Inappropriate Remarks.....	668
D. THEFT AND 18 USC 641 .....	669
1. 18 USC 641 .....	669
2. Unauthorized Removal .....	672
E. SEXUAL HARASSMENT AND POLICY STATEMENTS .....	673
1. Policy Statement; Inappropriate Conduct .....	674
F. ASSAULT AND BATTERY .....	676
1. Unacceptable Conduct, Disorderly Conduct .....	677
2. Fighting, Disturbances .....	678
G. GOV MISUSE .....	678
1. Nonstatutory Charge .....	680
H. LEAVE-RELATED CHARGES; INABILITY TO PERFORM .....	681
I. AGENCY REGULATIONS, ETHICS.....	685
IV. A BRIEF ALTERNATIVE CHARGE CHECKLIST.....	687
<b>CHAPTER 13: SPECIAL, UNIQUE, OFTEN JOB-ENDING CHARGES—SECURITY-RELATED ISSUES; CONDITIONS OF EMPLOYMENT, INABILITY TO PERFORM, ILLEGAL DRUG USE .....</b>	<b>691</b>
I. INSTANT ESSENTIAL KNOWLEDGE: CRITICAL, SPECIALIZED CHARGES.....	691
II. A CLOSER, MORE SUBSTANTIVE LOOK AT SPECIAL, OFTEN JOB-ENDING CHARGES .....	691
III. ADVERSE ACTIONS RELATING TO SECURITY CLEARANCE DETERMINATIONS AND ELIGIBILITY FOR A SENSITIVE POSITION.....	692
A. DECISIONS RELATED TO SENSITIVE POSITIONS; <i>CONYERS</i> .....	694
B. ADMINISTRATIVE LEAVE.....	708
IV. OTHER CONDITIONS OF EMPLOYMENT DECISIONS .....	708
V. INABILITY TO PERFORM .....	715
VI. ILLEGAL DRUGS .....	717
VII. 5 USC 7371 MANDATORY REMOVAL FOR LAW ENFORCEMENT OFFICERS CONVICTED OF A FELONY .....	722
<b>CHAPTER 14: THE INDEFINITE SUSPENSION CHARGE .....</b>	<b>727</b>
I. INSTANT ESSENTIAL KNOWLEDGE: INDEFINITE SUSPENSIONS.....	727
II. A CLOSER, MORE SUBSTANTIVE LOOK AT THE INDEFINITE SUSPENSION.....	728
A. PRE- <i>PEREZ</i> INDEFINITE SUSPENSIONS, REASONABLE CAUSE, AND THE CRIME PROVISION.....	728



B.	<i>PEREZ</i> AND INDEFINITE SUSPENSIONS.....	730
----	--	-----

**CHAPTER 15: POWER CHARGING—CHARGING DOWN, PROVING UP; CHARGING IN THE**

	<b>ALTERNATIVE .....</b>	<b>753</b>
I.	INSTANT ESSENTIAL KNOWLEDGE: POWER CHARGING .....	753
II.	CHARGING DOWN AND PROVING UP.....	754
A.	HOW TO CHARGE DOWN AND PROVE UP .....	755
III.	ALTERNATIVE CHARGING .....	757
A.	THE BASIS FOR ALTERNATIVE CHARGING.....	758
IV.	ALTERNATIVE CHARGING: THE TECHNIQUE .....	760
A.	CHARGING IN THE ALTERNATIVE WITH THE NARRATIVE, GENERIC CHARGE .....	760
B.	ALTERNATIVE PLEADING: SPECIFICALLY NOTICING ALTERNATIVE CHARGES .....	762
V.	A HISTORICAL LOOK AT LESSER-INCLUDED OFFENSES .....	764
A.	THE BOARD HAS NOT FORMALLY RECOGNIZED LESSER-INCLUDED OFFENSES .....	765
B.	AN ILLUSTRATION OF THE BAR AGAINST LESSER-INCLUDED OFFENSES .....	765
C.	THE BASIS FOR THE BAR AGAINST LESSER-INCLUDED OFFENSES.....	765
D.	PRE- <i>CROUSE</i> BOARD DECISIONS ALLOWED LESSER-INCLUDED OFFENSES IN THE AGENCY FINAL DECISION .....	766
1.	Amended Notice .....	767
2.	“Rose” Charges.....	767
E.	SOME PRE- <i>CROUSE</i> BOARD DECISIONS ARGUABLY ALLOWED OR CAME CLOSE TO ALLOWING LESSER-INCLUDED OFFENSES.....	768
VI.	LESSER-INCLUDED OFFENSES AND MERGER .....	769

**CHAPTER 16: SELECTING, DRAFTING THE CHARGE; WORKING WITH PROPOSING, DECIDING**

	<b>OFFICIALS.....</b>	<b>773</b>
I.	INSTANT ESSENTIAL KNOWLEDGE: CHARGE SELECTION, CHARGE DRAFTING; WORKING WITH DECIDING AND PROPOSING OFFICIALS .....	773
II.	SELECTING THE CORRECT CHARGE .....	774
A.	CHARGE SELECTION AND PENALTY SELECTION GO HAND-IN-HAND .....	775
1.	Step One: Finding the Facts.....	776
2.	Step Two: Fitting the Charge to the Facts.....	776
3.	Step Three: Weighing the Alternatives and Penalty Range.....	776
4.	Step Four: Weighing Appellant’s Record .....	777
B.	AGENCY CHARGE SELECTION IS NOT LIMITED TO THE TABLE OF PENALTIES AND STANDARDS OF CONDUCT .....	777
C.	THE AGENCY NEED NOT BRING AN INTENT CHARGE OR HARD-TO-PROVE CHARGE.....	778
D.	OVER-CHARGING, UNDER-CHARGING, AND ALTERNATIVE CHARGING .....	779
III.	THE SEVEN HABITS OF HIGHLY EFFECTIVE CHARGE DRAFTERS.....	781
A.	THE CHARGE MUST BE EASILY DECIPHERABLE AND FORMATTED IN THE CONVENTIONAL STYLE .....	781
B.	THE CHARGE’S TITLE: JUST THE TITLE; ALL ELSE GOES ELSEWHERE .....	783
1.	The Model Label .....	783
C.	THE SPECIFICATION: JUST THE ESSENTIALS .....	785
1.	The Model Specification .....	785
a.	Pattern.....	785
b.	No Conclusions, Just the Facts .....	785
c.	The Unfocused Narrative.....	786
2.	The Rule of the 4 Ws: Facts.....	786
D.	EACH CHARGE SHOULD BE SEPARATELY STATED AND NUMBERED.....	787
E.	EACH CHARGE IS BASED ON ITS OWN SPECIFICATION.....	788
F.	THE CHARGE AND THE SPECIFICATION SHOULD BE CLEARLY SEPARATED FROM EACH OTHER.....	789
G.	THE CHARGE AND THE SPECIFICATION SHOULD BE CLEARLY SEPARATED FROM THE PENALTY ANALYSIS.....	789
1.	The Rule of W .....	790
IV.	THE “PUSH-DOWN PRINCIPLE”.....	790
V.	A WORD OF CAUTION: PUTTING IT ALL TOGETHER .....	792
VI.	WORKING WITH PROPOSING, DECIDING OFFICIALS.....	792
A.	UNDERSTANDING THE IMPORTANCE OF PREPARATION AND PROVIDING NOTICE .....	793
B.	UNDERSTANDING THE STANDARD OF SERVICE EFFICIENCY .....	793
C.	UNDERSTANDING THE IMPORTANCE OF A CONCISE, FOCUSED PROPOSAL AND FINAL DECISION NOTICE .....	795
D.	GUARDING AGAINST THE DECIDING, PROPOSING OFFICIALS’ PROPENSITY FOR OVERKILL BY CITING REGULATIONS, RULES, AND LAWS .....	795
E.	GUARDING AGAINST THE DECIDING, PROPOSING OFFICIALS’ PROPENSITY FOR OVERKILL BY USING	

	INTENT CHARGES .....	796
F.	PROPOSING AND DECIDING OFFICIALS AND DRAFTING THE AGENCY NOTICES .....	796
G.	PROPOSING AND DECIDING OFFICIALS' PROPENSITY FOR OVERKILL: ADJECTIVES, ADVERBS, NASTY WORDS .....	797
H.	PROPOSING AND DECIDING OFFICIALS' PROPENSITY FOR OVERKILL: CHARGING THE DAMAGE .....	797
I.	PROPOSING AND DECIDING OFFICIALS' PROPENSITY FOR OVERKILL: PILING ON .....	798

## PART THREE—THE PENALTY

### CHAPTER 17: PENALTY BASICS AND FUNDAMENTALS ..... 803

I.	INSTANT ESSENTIAL KNOWLEDGE: PENALTY BASICS .....	803
II.	A CLOSER, MORE SUBSTANTIVE LOOK AT <i>DOUGLAS</i> AND ITS RULES.....	804
A.	WITH A FEW EXCEPTIONS, AN AGENCY MUST MAKE A PENALTY SHOWING IN VIRTUALLY EVERY ACTION BASED ON MISCONDUCT .....	804
1.	No <i>Per Se</i> Exceptions .....	806
2.	Senior Executive Service.....	808
B.	THE AGENCY'S BURDEN UNDER <i>DOUGLAS</i> .....	808
III.	THE DECIDING OFFICIAL, THE PROPOSAL, NOTICE AND DUE PROCESS.....	809
A.	DUE PROCESS AND NOTICE .....	809
B.	THE DECIDING OFFICIAL'S INVOLVEMENT/INVESTIGATION .....	827
C.	REPLACING THE DECIDING OFFICIAL.....	827

### CHAPTER 18: PENALTY REVIEW AND DEFERENCE ..... 831

I.	INSTANT ESSENTIAL KNOWLEDGE: DEFERENCE AND PENALTY REVIEW.....	831
A.	<i>DOUGLAS</i> AND DEFERENCE .....	832
II.	<i>LACHANCE V. DEVAL</i> : THE REAFFIRMATION, REBIRTH OF DEFERENCE & THE MAXIMUM REASONABLE PENALTY.....	833
A.	WHEN ALL CHARGES ARE SUSTAINED .....	834
1.	The Generic, Umbrella Charge .....	836
B.	WHEN LESS THAN ALL CHARGES ARE UPHELD.....	838
C.	WHEN LESS THAN ALL SPECIFICATIONS ARE UPHELD.....	840
D.	WHEN ALL RELEVANT <i>DOUGLAS</i> FACTORS ARE NOT CONSCIENTIOUSLY CONSIDERED .....	843
E.	WHEN THE PENALTY IS UNREASONABLE.....	849
F.	THE MAXIMUM REASONABLE PENALTY.....	850
G.	PENALTY REMANDS TO AGENCIES .....	853
III.	THE BOARD'S POST- <i>LACHANCE/DEVAL</i> APPLICATION OF <i>DOUGLAS</i> MITIGATION .....	854
IV.	"A HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE": THE EVOLUTION OF <i>DOUGLAS</i> AND THE DEATH OF DEFERENCE.....	856
A.	THE <i>SKATES</i> TRILOGY AND THE BATTLE OVER DEFERENCE .....	856
B.	THE DEATH OF DEFERENCE: THE BOARD'S <i>WHITE</i> DECISION .....	857
C.	<i>WHITE</i> AND THE SPECIFICATIONS: NO APPLICATION .....	858
1.	<i>White's</i> Affirmation.....	859

### CHAPTER 19: THE *DOUGLAS* FACTORS BY THE NUMBERS ..... 861

I.	INSTANT ESSENTIAL KNOWLEDGE: THE <i>DOUGLAS</i> FACTORS .....	861
II.	<i>DOUGLAS</i> FACTOR 1: SERIOUSNESS OF THE OFFENSE .....	862
A.	SERIOUSNESS; RELATIONSHIP TO DUTIES .....	863
1.	Agency Showings as to Seriousness .....	866
2.	<i>De Minimis</i> Value; Custody, Control; Technical Violation .....	867
3.	Seriousness and Zero-Tolerance .....	869
4.	Seriousness and Exemplary Penalties.....	872
B.	INTENT, INADVERTENCE .....	872
C.	PERSONAL GAIN, REPEATED .....	874
III.	<i>DOUGLAS</i> FACTOR 2: EMPLOYEE'S POSITION .....	874
A.	LAW ENFORCEMENT .....	874
B.	SUPERVISORS .....	876
C.	PERSONNEL RESPONSIBLE FOR THE SAFETY OF OTHERS .....	876
D.	POSITIONS OF TRUST .....	876
E.	CONTACTS WITH PUBLIC .....	877
IV.	<i>DOUGLAS</i> FACTOR 3: DISCIPLINARY RECORD.....	877
A.	PRIOR DISCIPLINE MUST BE NOTICED IN THE PROPOSAL IF TREATED AS AN AGGRAVATING FACTOR.....	878
1.	Recordation.....	879

B.	REVIEW OF PRIOR DISCIPLINE .....	880
C.	SUBSTANCE: CLOSER IN TIME, CLOSER IN NATURE .....	882
D.	SUBSEQUENT ACTIONS .....	883
1.	Pending or Subsequent Reversal .....	884
E.	NO NOTICE REQUIREMENT IF PAST DISCIPLINE USED FOR PURPOSES OTHER THAN AN AGGRAVATING FACTOR ..	884
F.	NONDISCIPLINARY PENALTY ENHANCERS .....	884
V.	DOUGLAS FACTOR 4: LENGTH OF SERVICE AND WORK RECORD .....	884
A.	WORK RECORD.....	885
1.	Work Record and Performance Appraisals.....	886
B.	LENGTH OF SERVICE.....	886
C.	GETTING ALONG WITH FELLOW WORKERS .....	887
VI.	DOUGLAS FACTOR 5: EROSION OF SUPERVISORY CONFIDENCE.....	887
VII.	DOUGLAS FACTOR 6: DISPARATE TREATMENT; CONSISTENCY OF PENALTY WITH THAT IMPOSED ON OTHER EMPLOYEES.....	890
A.	BOARD DISPARATE PENALTY LAW .....	890
1.	Agency Guidance on Defending a Disparate Penalty Attack.....	899
2.	Employee Guidance on Proving a Disparate Penalty.....	907
B.	A BRIEF LOOK AT THE OLD LAW .....	909
1.	“Substantial Similarity” .....	910
2.	“Substantial Similarity”: Work Unit.....	910
3.	“Substantial Similarity”: Time.....	911
C.	RELIANCE ON SETTLED CASES .....	911
VIII.	DOUGLAS FACTOR 7: CONSISTENCY WITH AGENCY PENALTY GUIDE OR AGENCY POLICY .....	912
IX.	DOUGLAS FACTOR 8: NOTORIETY .....	916
X.	DOUGLAS FACTOR 9: NOTICE.....	917
XI.	DOUGLAS FACTOR 10: POTENTIAL FOR REHABILITATION.....	919
A.	EVIDENCE OF THE POTENTIAL FOR REHABILITATION OR THE LACK OF IT .....	921
1.	Acknowledgment, Remorse, or the Lack of It.....	922
2.	Remedial Measures .....	923
3.	Notice and Progressive Discipline.....	924
4.	Board Testimony .....	924
B.	DEFENDING AND REHABILITATION .....	924
C.	DISABILITIES, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES, AND REHABILITATION.....	925
XII.	DOUGLAS FACTOR 11: MITIGATING CIRCUMSTANCES .....	927
A.	CAUSAL CONNECTION .....	930
B.	CORRECTION, CONTROL .....	932
C.	PROVOCATION .....	932
D.	OTHER CIRCUMSTANCES .....	933
E.	DRUG-RELATED MISCONDUCT .....	933
XIII.	DOUGLAS FACTOR 12: EFFECTIVENESS OF A LESSER SANCTION .....	934
XIV.	PENALTY POTPOURRI .....	935
A.	COMPOUND, UNIFIED PENALTIES.....	935
B.	MITIGATION/DEMOTION .....	935
C.	DEMOTION OF NON-SUPERVISORS AND LONG SUSPENSIONS .....	935
D.	NO PILING ON; NO RUNNING UP THE SCORE; THE SANCTION .....	935

## CHAPTER 20: TRICKS OF THE TRADE—SELLING/ATTACKING THE PENALTY; DEALING WITH

### DECIDING OFFICIALS ..... 937

I.	INSTANT ESSENTIAL KNOWLEDGE: WORKING THE PENALTY, THE DECIDING OFFICIAL .....	937
A.	THE PENALTY SHOWING FROM AN ADVOCACY PERSPECTIVE .....	938
1.	Theory and Theme.....	938
a.	Theory .....	938
b.	Theme .....	938
2.	The Proposal Notice and the Proposing Official .....	939
a.	Notice of All Reasons and Aggravating Factors .....	939
b.	The Materials Relied Upon.....	939
3.	The Final Decision and the Deciding Official .....	940
a.	Consideration of the Oral, Written Response.....	940
b.	Consideration of Unnoticed Information .....	940
c.	The Final Decision.....	941

4.	Prehearing Submissions .....	942
5.	Discovery.....	943
6.	Deciding Official's Testimony .....	943
7.	The Agency's Unique Interests and the Harm .....	944
a.	Conclusory Testimony From Deciding Officials.....	946
b.	Exaggeration of Aggravating Factors .....	946
8.	The Need to Anticipate Unproven Charges.....	947
9.	The Need to Approach Correctly Disparate Penalties.....	948
II.	AGENCY PENALTY ADVOCACY: A CHECKLIST .....	949
III.	DECIDING OFFICIALS AND COMMON ERRORS <i>VIS-À-VIS</i> BOARD LAW .....	951
A.	USING THE EMPLOYEE TO SEND A MESSAGE TO OTHERS .....	952
B.	RELYING ON INFORMATION NOT DISCLOSED TO THE APPELLANT .....	952
C.	FAILING TO EXPLAIN WHY AN ALTERNATIVE WAS NOT CONSIDERED .....	952
D.	PROVIDING CONCLUSORY TESTIMONY .....	952
E.	TOO MUCH FIRST HAND INVOLVEMENT IN THE ADVERSE ACTION .....	953
F.	FAILING TO CONSCIENTIOUSLY CONSIDER RELEVANT PENALTY FACTORS .....	953
G.	RELYING ON PRIORS NOT IN THE PROPOSAL .....	953
H.	RELYING ON DISCIPLINE OUTSIDE THE RECKONING PERIOD .....	954
I.	RELYING TOO HEAVILY ON ZERO TOLERANCE POLICIES .....	954
J.	AGENCY ACTIONS NOT CONSISTENT WITH CLAIMED LOSS OF TRUST .....	954
K.	SUPERVISORY ACQUIESCENCE (CONDONATION) .....	955
L.	OVERREACHING: EXAGGERATION OF AGGRAVATING FACTORS .....	955
M.	OVERREACHING: EXAGGERATION OF THE SERIOUSNESS OF AN OFFENSE .....	955
N.	IGNORING THE UNWELL EMPLOYEE .....	956
O.	RELYING ON A PENALTY GUIDE WHICH IS TOO GENERAL .....	956
P.	FAILING TO CONVEY THE AGENCY INTEREST IN THE ACTION .....	956

## **PART FOUR—HOW TO DO IT (IN REAL TIME)**

### **CHAPTER 21: HOW TO DO IT: MASTERING THE BASICS, APPLYING THE FUNDAMENTALS ..... 961**

I.	THE SAGA OF NANCY MAGILL .....	961
A.	THE FACTS.....	961
II.	THE AGENCY PROPOSAL NOTICE .....	962
III.	THE ESSENTIAL STEPS AN APPELLANT MUST TAKE (OR CONVERSELY THE AGENCY MUST TEST ITS PROPOSAL AGAINST) UPON RECEIPT OF THE PROPOSAL: GETTING THE MATERIALS RELIED UPON AND TAKING THE PROPOSAL APART, BREAKING DOWN THE CHARGES .....	964
A.	THE MATERIALS RELIED UPON (MRUS).....	964
B.	THE CHARGES, THE SPECIFICATIONS, THE EVIDENCE.....	964
C.	THE CHRONOLOGY .....	968
D.	THE PROOF GRID.....	969
E.	THE CAST OF CHARACTERS .....	971
IV.	THE REPLY STAGE .....	971
V.	THE AGENCY DECISION NOTICE.....	971
A.	AN INITIAL TAKE ON THE AGENCY DECISION NOTICE REDUX .....	972
B.	THE APPEAL AND THE AGENCY FILE.....	973
C.	THE APPEAL AND THE AGENCY FILE.....	973

### **CHAPTER 22: HOW TO DO IT: A CLOSER, "POST-GRAD" LOOK AT THE NUANCES..... 975**

I.	THE SAGA OF NANCY MAGILL REDUX.....	975
A.	THE ESSENTIAL FACTS .....	975
B.	THE AGENCY NOTICES .....	976
1.	The Proposal .....	976
2.	The Agency Decision Notice .....	978
C.	THE APPEAL AND THE AGENCY FILE.....	979
II.	ANALYSIS OF CERTAIN ISSUES .....	980
A.	MS. MAGILL'S DUAL, UNITARY PENALTY.....	980
B.	THE POTENTIAL MERGER OF CHARGES I, II, III .....	981
C.	THE POTENTIAL DUE PROCESS, WARD VIOLATION .....	982
D.	A FEW ADDITIONAL CHARGE INTERPRETATION ISSUES .....	984

III.	REDRAFTED NOTICES .....	984
A.	THE AGENCY NOTICES .....	984
1.	The Proposal .....	984
2.	The Agency Decision Notice .....	987

## PART FIVE—CHARGES AND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES

### CHAPTER 23: CHARGES AND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES..... 991

I.	INTRODUCTION .....	991
II.	HARMFUL PROCEDURAL ERROR.....	991
III.	PROHIBITED PERSONNEL ACTIONS, 5 USC 2302 (B) .....	993
A.	PROHIBITED DISCRIMINATION, 5 USC 2302(B)(1).....	997
1.	The Process for “Mixed Cases”.....	997
2.	Theories of Discrimination and Relevant Case Law.....	999
a.	Disparate Treatment, Intentional Discrimination Claims.....	999
(i)	Sex (Gender) Discrimination .....	1000
(ii)	National Origin Discrimination .....	1001
(iii)	Age Discrimination.....	1001
(iv)	Religious Discrimination.....	1002
(v)	Race Discrimination .....	1002
(vi)	Disability Discrimination (Disparate Treatment).....	1006
(vii)	Sexual Orientation Discrimination.....	1006
b.	Mixed-Motive Discrimination .....	1006
c.	Reasonable Accommodation Claims—Religion and Disability Discrimination.....	1008
(i)	Religious Discrimination (Reasonable Accommodation).....	1009
(ii)	Disability Discrimination (Reasonable Accommodation).....	1010
d.	EEO Reprisal .....	1018
e.	EEO Harassment .....	1023
B.	WHISTLEBLOWER REPRISAL UNDER 5 USC 2302(B)(8) .....	1024
1.	Some History .....	1025
2.	The Threshold Elements for an IRA .....	1026
3.	The Common Elements—Protected Disclosure, <i>Prima Facie</i> Case and the Agency Burden .....	1028
a.	Protected Disclosure Under (b)(8) .....	1028
(i)	The Reasonable Belief Standard .....	1029
(ii)	The Categories of Wrongdoing.....	1034
(a)	Any Violation of Any Law, Rule, or Regulation.....	1034
(b)	Abuse of Authority .....	1038
(c)	Gross Mismanagement or Gross Waste of Funds .....	1042
(d)	A Substantial and Specific Danger to Public Health or Safety.....	1049
(iii)	Protection Without a Disclosure .....	1054
(a)	Perceived Whistleblower.....	1054
(b)	Association With a Whistleblower.....	1055
(iv)	When a Disclosure Is Not a Disclosure.....	1056
b.	The <i>Prima Facie</i> Case .....	1059
(i)	Cases in Which the Timing Standard Was Met.....	1062
(ii)	Cases in Which the Timing Standard Was Not Met .....	1063
c.	The Agency’s Burden to Prove That It Would Have Taken the Same Action Anyway .....	1063
(i)	Clear and Convincing Evidence .....	1064
(ii)	The <i>Carr</i> Factors, Briefly.....	1064
(iii)	Analyzing The Agency’s Burden: <i>Whitmore</i> .....	1064
(iv)	The <i>Carr</i> Factors Analysis.....	1066
(a)	<i>Carr</i> Factor One: The Strength of the Agency’s Evidence in Support of Its Personnel Action .....	1066
(b)	<i>Carr</i> Factor Two: The Existence and Strength of Any Motive to Retaliate on the Part of the Agency Officials Who Were Involved in the Decision.....	1066
(c)	<i>Carr</i> Factor Three: Any Evidence That the Agency Takes Similar Actions Against Employees Who Are Not Whistleblowers, But Who Are Otherwise Similarly Situated .....	1068
C.	APPEAL RIGHT AND OTHER REPRISAL, 5 USC SECTION 2302(B)(9).....	1074
IV.	THE ACTION WAS NOT IN ACCORDANCE WITH LAW .....	1080

**TABLE OF CASES..... 1083**