

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>PREFACE</b> .....	<b>i</b>
<b>CHAPTER ONE: OVERVIEW</b> .....	<b>1</b>
<b>CHAPTER TWO: TANGIBLE EMPLOYMENT ACTIONS</b> .....	<b>5</b>
I. TANGIBLE EMPLOYMENT ACTION DEFINITION.....	5
A. CHARACTERISTICS OF TANGIBLE EMPLOYMENT ACTIONS.....	6
B. COMMITTED BY SUPERVISOR.....	6
1. 1999 <i>Enforcement Guidance on Vicarious Liability</i> .....	7
2. Circuit Court Split.....	7
3. <i>Vance v. Ball State University</i> .....	7
4. Acting Supervisors .....	9
5. Apparent Authority .....	9
6. Team Leaders.....	9
7. Cat’s Paw and Tangible Employment Actions.....	9
C. SPECIFIC EMPLOYMENT ACTIONS.....	10
1. Threatened Tangible Employment Action .....	10
2. Change in Assignment/Duties .....	11
3. Leave-Related Actions.....	13
4. Failure to Hire/Promote.....	13
5. Denial of Career Advancement.....	13
6. Performance Appraisals.....	14
7. Negative Employment Reference .....	16
8. Denial of Overtime .....	17
9. Deprivations Impacting Job Performance.....	17
10. Denial of Bonus or Step Increase.....	18
11. Letter of Counseling, Reprimand.....	18
12. Constructive Discharge.....	18
13. Rescinded Actions .....	20
14. Denial of Reasonable Accommodation .....	20
15. Schedule Changes .....	21
16. Reductions in Force .....	21
17. Denial of Training.....	21
18. Collective Actions.....	21
D. BENEFICIAL TANGIBLE EMPLOYMENT ACTIONS.....	21
II. ACCEPTANCE/REJECTION OF SEXUAL ADVANCES.....	22
A. IMPLIED CONDITION .....	22
III. CAUSATION .....	23
A. CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE .....	23
1. Failure to Rebut Employer’s Reason for Action .....	23
2. Different Decision-Maker .....	24
3. Temporal Proximity .....	25
B. DIRECT EVIDENCE.....	26
1. Analysis in Direct Evidence Cases.....	26
2. Defining Direct Evidence.....	27
C. MIXED MOTIVES .....	27
IV. THIRD-PARTY CLAIMS.....	28
V. OTHER TYPES OF HARASSMENT .....	28
A. RELIGIOUS COERCION AND TANGIBLE EMPLOYMENT ACTIONS.....	29
B. REPRISAL .....	30
<b>CHAPTER THREE: HOSTILE WORK ENVIRONMENT—OVERVIEW</b> .....	<b>33</b>
I. HISTORY OF HOSTILE WORK ENVIRONMENT THEORY.....	33
A. <i>MERITOR SAVINGS BANK V. VINSON</i> .....	33
B. <i>HARRIS V. FORKLIFT SYSTEMS</i> .....	35

II.	BASIC ELEMENTS OF HOSTILE WORK ENVIRONMENT CLAIM.....	36
A.	ELEMENT ONE—MEMBERSHIP IN A PROTECTED CLASS .....	36
B.	ELEMENT TWO—UNWELCOME REQUIREMENT.....	36
C.	ELEMENT THREE—BASED ON A STATUTORILY PROTECTED CLASS.....	37
D.	ELEMENT FOUR—SEVERE AND PERVASIVE REQUIREMENT.....	37
E.	ELEMENT FIVE—LIABILITY .....	37
F.	AGENCY’S DEFENSES .....	37
G.	AGENCY’S AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE .....	38

**CHAPTER FOUR: TIMELINESS..... 39**

I.	THE 45-DAY TIME LIMIT.....	39
II.	THE PROBLEM OF “CONTINUING VIOLATIONS”.....	39
A.	THE <i>ANISMAN</i> ANTIDOTE.....	40
III.	<i>MORGAN</i> AND “UNLAWFUL EMPLOYMENT PRACTICES”.....	42
A.	<i>MORGAN</i> ON DISCRETE ACTS .....	42
B.	<i>MORGAN</i> ON HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT CLAIMS.....	44
IV.	THE LAW SINCE <i>MORGAN</i> .....	47
A.	HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT CLAIMS.....	47
1.	Independent Acts of Harassment—Relatedness Requirement .....	48
2.	Independent Acts of Harassment—Relief for Complainants.....	49
3.	Timeliness and Equitable Doctrines.....	50
4.	Claims With Discrete Acts—Relatedness Requirement.....	50
5.	Discrete Acts—Relief for Complainants .....	53
6.	Retaliation Claims .....	54

**CHAPTER FIVE: UNWELCOME CONDUCT ..... 57**

I.	UNWELCOME REQUIREMENT: OVERVIEW .....	57
II.	TIMING OF REPORTING HARASSING CONDUCT.....	58
A.	DELAYS IN REPORTING .....	58
B.	CONTEMPORANEOUS REPORTS.....	59
III.	PARTICIPATION IN OR SUBMISSION TO CONDUCT.....	59
A.	SUBMISSION TO SEXUAL ADVANCES .....	60
B.	PARTICIPATION IN CONDUCT .....	60
1.	Context .....	60
2.	Totality of the Circumstances Analysis .....	62
3.	Activities Outside Work.....	62
C.	CONSENSUAL RELATIONSHIPS .....	63
IV.	REACTION OF THE COMPLAINANT .....	64
V.	HARASSMENT BASED ON RELIGION AND WELCOMENESS DETERMINATIONS .....	66

**CHAPTER SIX: BASIS OF CONDUCT ..... 67**

I.	ESTABLISHING THE EVIDENTIARY LINK, THE ABRIDGED VERSION.....	68
II.	PROTECTED STATUS—SEX .....	68
A.	SEXUAL CONDUCT .....	69
1.	Physical Sexual Conduct.....	70
2.	Other Sexual Conduct .....	70
3.	Sexually Charged Comments.....	70
B.	GENDER-BASED CONDUCT .....	72
1.	Conduct Inherently Tied to Protected Status.....	73
2.	Facially Neutral Conduct Directed at Protected Employees.....	74
3.	“Sex-Plus” Harassment.....	76
4.	Gender Stereotyping .....	77
C.	GENDER IDENTIFICATION /TRANSGENDER STATUS .....	79
1.	Transgender Status and Bathroom Usage .....	84
D.	SEXUAL ORIENTATION .....	85
E.	THE COURTS AND BEYOND ON GENDER IDENTIFICATION AND TRANSGENDER STATUS.....	89
F.	SEX OF PERPETRATOR AND VICTIM .....	90
1.	Same-Sex harassment.....	90
2.	The “Equal Opportunity” Harasser.....	92
a.	The Evolution of “Equal Opportunity Harasser” Law in the Courts .....	92

b.	<i>Brown v. Henderson</i> .....	93
c.	The Commission's Position on "Equal Opportunity Harassers" .....	95
G.	CONDUCT DIRECTED TOWARD OTHERS .....	97
1.	Paramour Favoritism .....	97
a.	Single Incident—Consensual .....	98
b.	Single Incident—Coerced .....	98
c.	Widespread Favoritism .....	99
III.	ALL OTHER PROTECTED STATUSES, GENERALLY .....	100
A.	BASED ON RACE/COLOR .....	100
1.	Evidence of Race-Based Discrimination .....	102
2.	Based on Race—Racial Commentary and Slurs .....	103
3.	Based on Race—Conduct and Symbols of Racism .....	105
4.	Based on Race—Same Race Harassment .....	106
B.	BECAUSE OF NATIONAL ORIGIN .....	107
C.	BASED ON RELIGION .....	108
D.	BASED ON DISABILITY .....	111
E.	BASED ON AGE .....	114
F.	BASED ON REPRISAL .....	114
G.	ASSOCIATIONAL DISCRIMINATION .....	115

**CHAPTER SEVEN: SEVERE OR PERVASIVE CONDUCT ..... 119**

I.	THE BASICS .....	119
A.	SEVERE OR PERVASIVE .....	119
B.	OBJECTIVE AND SUBJECTIVE ELEMENTS .....	119
C.	STATING A CLAIM FOR RELIEF .....	120
D.	TOTALITY OF THE CIRCUMSTANCES .....	120
E.	SLIDING SCALE .....	121
F.	RETALIATION HARASSMENT/REPRISAL .....	121
II.	THE SEVERE OR PERVASIVE REQUIREMENT .....	123
A.	ONE-TIME AND ISOLATED INCIDENTS .....	123
1.	Sexual Harassment .....	123
2.	Sex-Based Harassment .....	124
3.	Racial/Color Harassment .....	125
a.	Slurs .....	125
b.	Racist Symbols .....	127
4.	National Origin Harassment .....	128
5.	Religious Harassment .....	128
6.	Disability Harassment .....	129
7.	Age Harassment .....	130
8.	Retaliatory Harassment .....	130
B.	REPEATED INCIDENTS/FREQUENCY OF THE CONDUCT .....	130
1.	Sexual and Sex-Based Harassment .....	131
2.	Racial Harassment .....	131
3.	National Origin Harassment .....	132
4.	Religious and Disability Harassment .....	132
C.	DURATION OF THE CONDUCT .....	133
1.	Sexual and Sex-Based Harassment .....	133
2.	Racial Harassment .....	134
3.	Religious Harassment .....	134
D.	PASSAGE OF TIME BETWEEN INCIDENTS .....	136
1.	Sexual and Sex-Based Harassment .....	136
2.	Race and National Origin Harassment .....	137
3.	Religious Harassment .....	137
E.	CONDUCT DIRECTED AT OTHERS .....	137
1.	Sexual and Sex-Based Harassment .....	138
2.	Race and National Origin-Based Harassment .....	139
3.	Age Harassment .....	140
F.	CONDUCT OUTSIDE OF THE COMPLAINANT'S PRESENCE .....	140
1.	Sexual and Sex-Based Harassment .....	140
2.	Race and National Origin Harassment .....	141

3.	Disability Harassment.....	142
4.	Religious Harassment .....	143
G.	PHYSICAL CONTACT OR CONDUCT .....	143
1.	Sexual Contact .....	143
2.	Non-Sexual and Incidental Physical Touching .....	144
3.	Physical Conduct vs. Actual Contact .....	145
H.	VERBAL CONDUCT .....	146
I.	ROUTINE SUPERVISION .....	147
J.	CHANGES TO DUTIES/ASSIGNMENTS/INCREASED WORK SCRUTINY .....	147
K.	CHANGES IN THE WORK ENVIRONMENT .....	149
1.	Exposure to Harm .....	149
2.	Exposure to Known Harasser .....	149
L.	PERPETRATOR AND RECIPIENT OF CONDUCT.....	150
1.	Harassing Conduct by Supervisor.....	150
2.	Vulnerability of Employee .....	150
3.	Third Party Harassment.....	151
M.	CONDUCT INVOLVING DISCRETE ACTS.....	151
N.	OFFENSIVE PICTURES OR SYMBOLS .....	153
1.	Sexual Harassment .....	153
2.	Religious Harassment .....	153
3.	Racial Harassment.....	154
O.	OFF-PREMISES CONDUCT .....	154
III.	AGENCY'S RESPONSE TO HARASSMENT COMPLAINT .....	155
<b>CHAPTER EIGHT: THE OBJECTIVE AND SUBJECTIVE ELEMENTS.....</b>		<b>157</b>
I.	REASONABLE PERSON .....	157
A.	REASONABLE WOMAN .....	158
B.	CHARACTERISTICS OTHER THAN GENDER.....	161
II.	SUBJECTIVE STANDARD .....	163
A.	SERIOUS PSYCHOLOGICAL HARM IS NOT NECESSARY.....	163
1.	Must Affect Terms or Conditions of Employment .....	164
B.	THE EMPLOYEE'S CONDUCT .....	165
<b>CHAPTER NINE: LIABILITY FOR HARASSMENT.....</b>		<b>167</b>
I.	OVERVIEW OF LIABILITY FOR HARASSMENT.....	167
II.	THE LIABILITY PROBLEM .....	167
A.	<i>RESPONDEAT SUPERIOR</i> /VICARIOUS LIABILITY.....	168
B.	29 CFR § 1604.11 .....	168
C.	<i>MERITOR SAVINGS BANK V. VINSON</i> .....	168
III.	RESOLVING THE LIABILITY PROBLEM.....	170
A.	THE RULES OF AGENCY .....	170
B.	THE RULES OF LIABILITY.....	170
1.	The "Alter Ego" Theory.....	170
IV.	HARASSMENT BY SUPERVISORS .....	171
A.	<i>BURLINGTON INDUSTRIES V. ELLERTH</i> .....	171
B.	<i>FARAGHER V. CITY OF BOCA RATON</i> .....	176
C.	<i>VANCE V. BALL STATE UNIVERSITY</i> /DEFINITION OF "SUPERVISOR".....	182
D.	APPARENT AUTHORITY .....	188
E.	TANGIBLE EMPLOYMENT ACTIONS .....	188
F.	HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT CLAIMS .....	188
1.	Anti-Harassment Policy Requirement.....	189
2.	Duty of Reasonable Care .....	189
3.	Failure to Avoid Harm.....	190
V.	HARASSMENT BY COWORKERS AND THIRD PARTIES.....	192
A.	KNOWLEDGE OF EMPLOYER .....	192
1.	Actual Knowledge.....	192
2.	Constructive Knowledge.....	193
B.	THIRD PARTY HARASSMENT .....	194
1.	Employee Organizations .....	194
VI.	PROMPT AND EFFECTIVE CORRECTIVE ACTION .....	195

A.	DUTY TO PROMPTLY INVESTIGATE .....	195
B.	DUTY TO TAKE INTERIM ACTIONS .....	198
C.	PROMPT AND EFFECTIVE REQUIREMENT .....	199
1.	Effectiveness of Action .....	200
2.	Severity/Pervasiveness of Conduct .....	201
3.	Duty of Further Inquiry .....	204
4.	Treatment of Victim .....	204
VII.	REMEDIES AND DAMAGES .....	204
A.	EQUITABLE REMEDIES.....	204
1.	Tangible Employment Actions .....	204
2.	Hostile Environment Cases .....	205
B.	COMPENSATORY DAMAGES.....	205
C.	CORRECTIVE AND PREVENTIVE RELIEF .....	205
1.	Disciplinary Actions.....	206
<b>CHAPTER TEN: AVOIDING LIABILITY.....</b>		<b>209</b>
I.	ANTI-HARASSMENT POLICIES, PROCEDURES AND PROGRAMS .....	209
A.	POLICY REQUIREMENTS .....	209
1.	Confidentiality Issues.....	211
B.	POSTING AND DISTRIBUTION.....	211
C.	REPORTING HARASSMENT .....	211
D.	ENFORCEMENT .....	212
II.	RESPONDING TO HARASSMENT COMPLAINTS.....	212
A.	PROMPT INVESTIGATIONS .....	212
B.	REMEDIAL ACTIONS .....	213
C.	ACTIONS PENDING INVESTIGATIONS.....	214
III.	TRAINING .....	214
<b>TABLE OF CASES.....</b>		<b>217</b>