

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION AND RECENT DEVELOPMENTS	1
I. CHANGES AFTER 9/11	1
II. BACKLOGS	2
III. ESPIONAGE	2
IV. LEAKING OF CLASSIFIED INFORMATION	3
V. SPEED SACRIFICED QUALITY?	5
A. AARON ALEXIS—THE NAVY YARD SHOOTER	5
B. CONGRESSIONAL RESPONSE	6
C. US ARMY MAJOR NIDAL HASAN—2009 FORT HOOD SHOOTER	7
D. US INVESTIGATIONS SERVICES INC.	7
VI. OTHER RECENT DEVELOPMENTS	8
A. MENTAL HEALTH ISSUES	8
B. EXPANDED SF-86	8
C. EFFECT OF STATES' LEGALIZATION OF MEDICAL AND RECREATIONAL MARIJUANA USE	8
D. DNA TESTING?	8
E. CONSOLIDATION AND RELOCATION	8
F. PROPOSED CHANGES IN THE ADJUDICATIVE GUIDELINES	9
VII. OTHER USEFUL REFERENCES	9
CHAPTER TWO: HISTORY	11
I. PRIVATE SECTOR EMPLOYEES (EMPLOYEES OF GOVERNMENT CONTRACTORS)	11
II. FEDERAL EMPLOYEES AND UNIFORMED SERVICES	12
III. FEDERAL EMPLOYEE SUITABILITY DETERMINATIONS	12
IV. EMPLOYEES NOT COVERED BY DOHA	13
A. HIGHER LEVEL CLEARANCES AND ACCESS	13
B. DEPARTMENT OF ENERGY AND NUCLEAR REGULATORY COMMISSION	14
V. COMPARISON BETWEEN CONTRACTOR AND FEDERAL EMPLOYEE PROCEDURES	14
VI. MAKING IMPROVEMENTS OVER THE YEARS	14
A. EMPLOYEE ASSISTANCE PROGRAMS	14
B. THE INTELLIGENCE REFORM AND TERRORISM PREVENTION ACT	15
CHAPTER THREE: ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEDURES	17
I. GOVERNMENT CONTRACTOR EMPLOYEES	17
A. INVESTIGATION	17
B. INTERIM CLEARANCE	19
C. JOINT PERSONNEL ADJUDICATION SYSTEM	19
D. REFERRAL TO DOHA	19
E. STATEMENT OF REASONS	20
F. REQUEST FOR HEARING	20
G. ROLE OF DEPARTMENT COUNSEL	21
H. ASSIGNMENT TO ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE	21
I. HEARING PROCEDURES	22
1. Right to Counsel	22
2. Right to Hearing	24
3. Location of Hearing	24
4. Discovery	24
5. Presentation of Case	26
6. Exhibits	27
7. Witnesses	27
8. Closing Statements	28
9. <i>Ex parte</i> Communications	28
10. Leaving the Record Open	29
11. No Conditional Clearance	29
12. Written Determination	30
13. Remedies	30
14. Appeals	30

15.	Reapplication	30
16.	Reimbursement	31
II.	FEDERAL EMPLOYEES	32
A.	DIFFERENCE BETWEEN SECURITY CLEARANCE AND SUITABILITY	32
B.	SECURITY CLEARANCE PROCESS	32
C.	CENTRAL ADJUDICATIONS	33
D.	INVESTIGATION.....	33
E.	STATEMENT OF REASONS.....	33
F.	RESPONSE TO THE STATEMENT OF REASONS	34
G.	FINAL CAF DECISION.....	34
H.	APPEAL OF LETTER OF DENIAL.....	34
I.	PERSONAL APPEARANCE PROCEDURE	36
1.	Assignment to Administrative Judge	36
2.	Personal Appearance Guide.....	36
3.	Right to Counsel	36
4.	Location.....	36
5.	Representatives of Parties.....	36
6.	Witnesses	36
7.	Order of Proceedings.....	37
8.	Recommended Decision	37
9.	Final Decision	37
10.	Conditional or Probationary Clearance.....	37
11.	Remedies.....	38
III.	DOHA PROCESSING TIME.....	38
IV.	STATISTICS	38
V.	PROCEDURES FOR HIGHER LEVEL CLEARANCES AND ACCESS	39
A.	CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE AGENCY	40
B.	NATIONAL SECURITY AGENCY	40
VI.	MILITARY DEBARMENT.....	41
VII.	CONDUCTING RESEARCH.....	42
A.	PRIVATE SECTOR CONTRACTOR CASES	42
B.	FEDERAL EMPLOYEE DECISIONS.....	42
C.	COURSES AND MATERIALS	42

CHAPTER FOUR: PROCEDURAL ISSUES APPLICABLE TO HEARINGS AND PERSONAL APPEARANCES 43

I.	BURDEN OF PROOF	43
II.	THE STATEMENT OF REASONS	45
III.	EVIDENCE	47
A.	NEXUS	48
B.	MATERIALITY	48
C.	EXCLUSIONARY RULE	48
D.	HEARSAY.....	49
E.	CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE	51
F.	OFFICIAL NOTICE/ADMINISTRATIVE NOTICE	51
1.	Scope of Administrative Notice	54
2.	Unauthorized Fact-Finding.....	54
3.	Admissibility Under the Federal Rules of Evidence	55
G.	BUSINESS RECORDS	55
H.	ADMISSIONS.....	56
I.	POST-RECORD EVENTS.....	57
J.	EVIDENCE OF JOB PERFORMANCE	58
K.	EVIDENCE OF APPLICANT’S VALUE TO EMPLOYER	59
L.	EVIDENCE OF APPLICANT’S NEED FOR JOB.....	59
M.	EVIDENCE, MEDICAL.....	59
N.	ADMISSIBILITY OF THE REPORT OF INVESTIGATION	61
O.	EVIDENCE OF NEW OR CHANGED CIRCUMSTANCES.....	62
P.	TESTIMONY AS TO FUTURE BEHAVIOR	62
Q.	SURPRISE EVIDENCE	62
R.	INTENT/STATE OF MIND	63

S.	ESTOPPEL	63
1.	Equitable Estoppel.....	63
a.	Where Government Has Previously Granted Clearance.....	63
b.	Effect of Prior Favorable Adjudication.....	64
2.	<i>Res Judicata</i>	64
3.	Collateral Estoppel.....	65
T.	CLEARANCES GRANTED TO SIMILARLY SITUATED INDIVIDUALS.....	65
U.	CONDUCT NOT CHARGED IN SOR.....	65
IV.	WITNESSES	66
A.	CREDIBILITY DETERMINATIONS	66
1.	The General Rule	66
2.	Numerous Exceptions.....	67
3.	Credibility Determinations Based on Written Record.....	71
4.	Credibility Determination as Proof of Contested Facts	71
5.	Expert Opinion as to Applicant Credibility	72
B.	CORROBORATION	72
C.	IMPEACHMENT	72
D.	DEMEANOR	73
E.	RECANTATION	73
F.	CLAIMS OF PRIVILEGE.....	74
G.	CHARACTER REFERENCES	74
V.	EXPERT WITNESSES	75
VI.	CONSTITUTIONAL ISSUES.....	80
A.	FIRST AMENDMENT	80
B.	FOURTH AMENDMENT	82
C.	FIFTH AMENDMENT.....	82
D.	SIXTH AMENDMENT	84
E.	EIGHTH AMENDMENT.....	85
VII.	JURISDICTIONAL ISSUES.....	85
A.	GENERAL ISSUES.....	85
B.	JURISDICTION WHEN APPLICANT QUILTS OR IS FIRED.....	86
VIII.	OTHER PROCEDURAL ISSUES	87
A.	ADVISORY OPINIONS	87
B.	ADP I, II, AND III CASES	87
C.	CLASSIFIED INFORMATION.....	87
D.	CONDITIONAL CLEARANCE.....	87
E.	DIRECTIVE, CHALLENGES TO.....	87
F.	FILE OF RELEVANT MATERIAL	88
G.	FOREIGN LAW.....	89
H.	GOOD FAITH	89
I.	INVESTIGATION.....	89
J.	LEVEL OF CLEARANCE	89
K.	OPERATING INSTRUCTIONS	90
L.	PRECEDENT	90
M.	RECIPROCITY	91
N.	TRUSTWORTHINESS DETERMINATIONS.....	92
O.	DEFERENCE TO EMPLOYER'S VERSION OF EVENTS	92
CHAPTER FIVE: CRIMINAL PROCEDURE		95
I.	FEDERAL RULES OF CRIMINAL PROCEDURE.....	95
II.	ADMISSIONS.....	95
III.	ARREST	95
IV.	COLLATERAL ESTOPPEL IN LIGHT OF PLEA OR CONVICTION	95
V.	STATE COURT PROCEEDINGS	99
VI.	PLEA OF " <i>NOLO CONTENDERE</i> "	101
VII.	THE <i>ALFORD</i> DOCTRINE.....	101
VIII.	BEING ON PROBATION	102
IX.	CRIMINAL SENTENCE	102
X.	JENCKS ACT	103
XI.	PRIVILEGE AGAINST SELF-INCRIMINATION	103

XI.	EFFECT OF ACQUITTAL, DISMISSED CHARGES, AND DROPPED CHARGES.....	103
XIII.	THE BOND AMENDMENT	104
CHAPTER SIX: THE POLYGRAPH		105
I.	CAN A MACHINE REALLY TELL WHEN SOMEONE IS LYING.....	107
II.	HOW DOES IT WORK?	109
III.	DOHA CASES INVOLVING POLYGRAPH ISSUES.....	111
A.	USE OF A PRIVATE POLYGRAPHER	111
B.	INTIMIDATION BY MACHINE.....	113
C.	ADMISSIBILITY OF GOVERNMENT POLYGRAPHER’S REPORT.....	114
D.	TOO DRUGGED FOR ACCURACY	114
E.	USE OF COUNTERMEASURES.....	114
CHAPTER SEVEN: APPEALS.....		117
I.	PROCEDURES	117
II.	REQUEST FOR STAY	117
III.	INTERLOCUTORY APPEALS	118
IV.	ORAL ARGUMENT	118
V.	APPEAL BRIEFS	118
VI.	STANDARD OF REVIEW	118
VII.	STATUTORY CONSTRUCTION	119
VIII.	ARGUMENTS THAT THE ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE WAS BIASED.....	119
IX.	REVERSE OR REMAND.....	122
X.	APPELLATE ARGUMENTS TO SUSTAIN DECISION BELOW	125
A.	THE SCOPE OF REVIEW IS NARROW.....	125
B.	SUPPORTING JUDGE’S WEIGHING OF EVIDENCE.....	126
C.	SUPPORTING JUDGE’S APPLICATION OF MITIGATING FACTORS.....	127
D.	ANY ERROR WAS HARMLESS.....	127
E.	THE JUDGE CONSIDERED ALL OF THE EVIDENCE	128
F.	JUDGE’S PURVIEW TO DETERMINE WITNESS CREDIBILITY.....	128
G.	VIEW DECISION AS WHOLE, NOT PARTICULAR PASSAGES	129
XI.	ARGUMENTS FOR REVERSAL OF THE DECISION.....	129
A.	CHALLENGING THE FINDINGS OF FACT	129
B.	CHALLENGING THE CONCLUSIONS OF LAW	129
C.	CHALLENGING WHETHER GOVERNMENT MET ITS BURDEN OF PROOF.....	130
D.	CHALLENGING THE JUDGE’S CREDIBILITY DETERMINATIONS	130
E.	FAILURE TO CONSIDER SIGNIFICANT EVIDENCE.....	130
F.	FAILURE TO PRESERVE RECORD	130
XII.	NO NEW EVIDENCE OR ARGUMENTS ON APPEAL.....	130
XIII.	RECONSIDERATION OF APPELLATE DECISION	130
CHAPTER EIGHT: CASE ANALYSES		131
I.	THE ADJUDICATIVE GUIDELINES	131
A.	THE GENERAL CRITERIA (“POLICY FACTORS”)	131
1.	The “Whole Person” Analysis	131
2.	The “Whole Record”	132
3.	No “Piecemeal Analysis”	132
4.	Consideration of Past Conduct	133
5.	Common Sense Determination	133
B.	THE SPECIFIC ADJUDICATIVE GUIDELINES	134
1.	Which Guideline is Applicable?.....	134
2.	Security Violations, Lack of	134
3.	Rehabilitation	134
4.	Recency.....	135
II.	CASE ANALYSES	135
A.	ADJUDICATIVE GUIDELINE A: ALLEGIANCE TO THE UNITED STATES.....	135
B.	ADJUDICATIVE GUIDELINE B: FOREIGN INFLUENCE.....	137
1.	Loyalty May Be Considered	140
2.	The “Geopolitical Considerations” in the Foreign Country Must Be Considered.....	140
3.	“Administrative Notice” Documents.....	141

4.	“Heightened Risk” of Exploitation	142
5.	The “Hostage Scenario”	144
6.	Activities and Occupation of the Foreign Relative	145
7.	The Applicant’s Relationship With the Foreign Relative(s)	146
8.	The Exception to the General Rule	148
9.	Treatment of Specific Countries.....	151
	a. Afghanistan	151
	b. Belarus.....	151
	c. China, People’s Republic of (PRC).....	153
	d. Egypt.....	156
	e. Hong Kong.....	156
	f. India and Nepal	157
	g. Iran.....	159
	h. Israel.....	162
	i. Lebanon.....	163
	j. Libya.....	164
	k. Morocco.....	164
	l. Nigeria.....	165
	m. Pakistan.....	166
	n. South Korea.....	166
	o. Russia.....	166
	p. Saudi Arabia	167
	q. Sudan.....	168
	r. Syria.....	168
	s. Taiwan	169
C.	ADJUDICATIVE GUIDELINE C: FOREIGN PREFERENCE	172
	1. Passport Cases.....	174
	2. Foreign Citizenship.....	176
	3. Violation of the Travel Ban	178
	4. Financial Interest in a Foreign Country	178
	5. Foreign Military Service	178
D.	ADJUDICATIVE GUIDELINE D: SEXUAL BEHAVIOR.....	179
	1. Has Enough Time Passed?.....	181
	2. Is the Applicant Vulnerable to Coercion?	183
	3. Was There Sufficient Evidence of Reform and Rehabilitation?	185
	4. Other Issues Involving Failure to Mitigate.....	187
E.	ADJUDICATIVE GUIDELINE E: PERSONAL CONDUCT	190
	1. Falsification	192
	a. Government Burden to Prove the Statement was False	194
	b. Was the Falsification Intentional?.....	195
	c. Attempts to Mitigate Falsification Charges	200
	i. Prompt Good Faith Effort to Correct	200
	ii. I am Sorry, So Sorry	200
	2. Personal Conduct Cases Not Involving Falsification	201
	a. Debts as Poor Judgment	201
	b. Poor Judgment; Vulnerability to Coercion	202
	c. Failure to Cooperate With Investigation	203
	d. Work-Related Misconduct	203
	e. Violation of Employer’s Policy.....	204
	f. Associating with a Criminal	205
F.	ADJUDICATIVE GUIDELINE F: FINANCIAL CONSIDERATIONS.....	206
	1. Decisions Discussing the “Financial Downturn” and Mortgage Lending Crisis	208
	2. Decisions Granting Clearance	210
	3. Decisions Denying Clearance	212
	a. Reliance on Statutes of Limitations	213
	b. Bad Judgment	214
	c. Insufficient “Track Record”.....	215
	d. Other Unfavorable Decisions re “Good Faith Efforts to Repay”	216
	e. Whose Debt Is It?.....	217
G.	ADJUDICATIVE GUIDELINE G: ALCOHOL CONSUMPTION.....	217

1.	Once Dependent, Always Dependent.....	218
2.	I Have Mended My Ways.....	219
3.	When Do Isolated Incidents Become a Pattern?.....	223
4.	How Much is Too Much?.....	224
5.	The In-Between Result: “Too Soon to Tell”.....	224
H.	ADJUDICATIVE GUIDELINE H: DRUG INVOLVEMENT.....	225
1.	What is “Recent”.....	226
2.	Marijuana Use.....	227
a.	Legal use.....	227
b.	Illegal Use.....	229
I.	ADJUDICATIVE GUIDELINE I: PSYCHOLOGICAL CONDITIONS.....	234
1.	Evidence of Cooperation With Treatment and Medication.....	236
2.	Reliance on Expert Psychiatrists.....	236
3.	Too Soon to Tell.....	239
J.	ADJUDICATIVE GUIDELINE J: CRIMINAL CONDUCT.....	240
1.	Was the Criminal Behavior Recent?.....	241
2.	What is a “Pattern”?.....	242
3.	How Much Reform and Rehabilitation is Enough?.....	242
4.	Falsification.....	243
5.	Involvement With Criminals.....	243
K.	ADJUDICATIVE GUIDELINE K: HANDLING PROTECTED INFORMATION.....	244
1.	Cases in Which Classified Information Was Not Involved.....	245
2.	Security Violation Cases Adjudicated Under Guideline E.....	246
3.	Multiple Security Violations.....	247
4.	Trying to Hide the Evidence...Not Good.....	252
L.	ADJUDICATIVE GUIDELINE L: OUTSIDE ACTIVITIES.....	253
M.	ADJUDICATIVE GUIDELINE M: USE OF INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY SYSTEMS.....	255
1.	Cases Under Guideline E.....	257

CHAPTER NINE: NOTEWORTHY COURT CASES..... 259

APPENDICES—TABLE OF CONTENTS 269

APPENDIX 1:	DOHA DOCUMENTS—INTERROGATORIES.....	271
APPENDIX 2:	DOHA DOCUMENTS—STATEMENT OF REASONS.....	275
APPENDIX 3:	DOHA DOCUMENTS—RESPONSE TO STATEMENT OF REASONS.....	277
APPENDIX 4:	DOHA DOCUMENTS—DISCOVERY LETTER.....	279
APPENDIX 5:	DOHA DOCUMENTS—WITHDRAWAL OF STATEMENT OF REASONS.....	283
APPENDIX 6:	DOHA DOCUMENTS—APPEAL BRIEF.....	285
APPENDIX 7:	CIA DOCUMENTS—DISAPPROVAL LETTER.....	295
APPENDIX 8:	CIA DOCUMENTS—PERSONAL APPEARANCE INSTRUCTIONS.....	297
APPENDIX 9:	CIA DOCUMENTS—DENIAL LETTER.....	299
APPENDIX 10:	IMPORTANT DOCUMENTS AND PUBLICATIONS.....	301
I.	DEFENSE DEPARTMENT DOCUMENTS.....	301
II.	INTELLIGENCE COMMUNITY DOCUMENTS.....	302
III.	EXECUTIVE ORDERS.....	302
IV.	POLYGRAPH DOCUMENTS.....	303
V.	OTHER USEFUL PUBLICATIONS AND WEBSITES.....	303
APPENDIX 11:	TIPS FOR PRACTITIONERS.....	305