

**WINNING AT THE MERIT SYSTEMS PROTECTION BOARD:
A STEP-BY-STEP HANDBOOK FOR FEDERAL AGENCY
SUPERVISORS, MANAGERS, LAWYERS, AND PERSONNEL
OFFICIALS
BY HAROLD J. ASHNER**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Dedication iii
Preface v
Summary Table of Contents ix
Table of Cases xxxi

PART I—INTRODUCTION TO MSPB

CHAPTER 1: A QUICK OVERVIEW 1

A. MSPB History—In Brief 1

 1. Creation of Appeal Rights 1

 2. Development of Appeals System 2

 3. Civil Service Reform and Reorganization 3

B. MSPB Mission 5

 1. Adjudication of Employee Appeals 5

 2. Merit Systems Oversight 6

C. Jurisdiction and Timeliness—In Brief 7

D. Appellate Jurisdiction—Cases 8

 1. Employing Agency Actions Based on Conduct or Performance 9

 2. Other Employing Agency Actions 10

 3. Actions by OPM 11

E. Appellate Jurisdiction—Procedures 11

 1. Agency Procedures 12

 2. Appeal Procedures 13

F. Original Jurisdiction 16

 1. Special Counsel Cases 17

 2. Actions Against ALJs 17

 a. Complaint Filed by Agency 18

 b. Complaint Filed by ALJ 20

 3. Performance-Based Removals from the SES 21

G. MSPB Organization 22

 1. Appointment and Tenure of Board Members 22

 2. Headquarters Offices 22

 3. Regional and Field Offices 24

CHAPTER 2: JURISDICTION—IN GENERAL	27
A. Basic Jurisdictional Concepts	27
B. Action Coverage	30
1. Involuntary Resignations	30
a. Common “Involuntariness” Arguments	30
<i>i. Duress</i>	31
<i>ii. Refusal to Permit Withdrawal of Resignation</i>	32
<i>iii. Mental Incompetence</i>	33
<i>iv. Time Pressure</i>	33
<i>v. Misrepresentation or Deception</i>	33
b. Ambiguous or Equivocal Resignations	34
c. Effect of Discrimination or Retaliation Claims	35
2. Involuntary Retirements	35
a. Disability Retirements	35
b. Buyout Offers	37
3. Involuntary Downgradings	38
4. Involuntary Transfers	38
5. Probationary Terminations	39
6. Short Suspensions	41
7. Constructive Suspensions	41
a. Placement on Enforced Leave	42
b. Denial of Request to Return	43
8. Classification Actions	44
9. Actions Affecting Pay	45
10. Failure to Promote	46
11. Reassignments	46
a. <i>Russell Appeals</i>	47
b. Unified Penalties	48
12. Prohibited Personnel Practices	49
13. Merit System Principles	49
C. Employee Coverage	50
D. Waiver of Appeal Rights	51
E. Moot Appeals	53
F. Withdrawn Appeals	56
1. Withdrawal Resulting in Dismissal <i>With</i> Prejudice	56
2. Withdrawal Resulting in Dismissal <i>Without</i> Prejudice	57
CHAPTER 3: TIMELINESS—IN GENERAL	59
A. Basic Timeliness Concepts	59
B. Determining Time Limit for Filing Appeal	60
C. Permitted Methods of Filing	62
D. Determining the Filing Date	62
E. Premature Appeals	64
F. Late Appeals	65
1. “Good Cause” and the <i>Alonzo</i> Framework	65
2. Common Reasons for Late Filing	67
a. Illness	68
b. Lack of Notice of Time Limit	69
<i>i. Constructive Action With No Decision Notice</i>	69
<i>ii. Decision Notice With No Appeal Rights</i>	71
c. Fault of Representative	71
d. Filing in Wrong Place	72
<i>i. In General</i>	72
<i>ii. Special Rule for Mixed Case Appeals</i>	72
CHAPTER 4: SPECIAL COUNSEL AND RELATED CASES	75
A. Special Counsel—A Quick Overview	75

1.	OSC History—In Brief	75
2.	OSC Mission	77
3.	OSC Organization	78
	a. Appointment and Tenure of Special Counsel	78
	b. Headquarters Offices	79
	c. Field Offices	81
4.	OSC Investigations—In General	82
B.	Individual Right of Action Appeals	84
1.	Requirements for IRA Appeals	84
	a. Jurisdiction over IRA Appeals	84
	i. “Protected Disclosure” Requirement	87
	ii. “Personnel Action” Requirement	87
	iii. Exhaustion Requirement	91
	b. Timeliness in IRA Appeals	94
	c. Election of Remedies in IRA Appeals	95
2.	Procedures in IRA Appeals	96
3.	Scope of Review in IRA Appeals	97
C.	Otherwise Appealable Action Appeals	98
1.	Timeliness and Exhaustion in OAA Appeals	98
2.	Procedures in OAA Appeals	99
3.	Review of Merits in OAA Appeals	99
D.	Corrective Action Cases	99
1.	Stay of Personnel Action	101
	a. OSC’s Stay Policy	101
	b. Procedures for Stay Request	102
	c. Test for Granting Stay	104
	d. Effect of Stay	105
2.	Procedures in Corrective Action Cases	105
3.	Merits of Corrective Action Cases	106
4.	Corrective Action Options	107
E.	Disciplinary Cases	107
1.	Procedures in Disciplinary Cases	108
2.	Merits of Disciplinary Cases	109
3.	Disciplinary Options	109
	CHAPTER 5: VETERANS AND RELATED CASES	111
A.	USERRA Appeals	111
1.	Jurisdiction	112
	a. Service in Uniformed Service	114
	b. Loss of Benefit of Employment	116
	c. Causal Connection	117
2.	Exhaustion	118
3.	Timeliness	118
4.	Procedures	119
5.	Scope of Review	120
6.	Analysis of Discrimination Allegation	120
7.	Remedies	122
B.	VEOA Appeals	123
1.	Exhaustion	125
2.	Timeliness	125
3.	Procedures	126
4.	Scope of Review	127
5.	Remedies	127

CHAPTER 6: CONTRACTUAL AND MIXED CASES	129
A. Contractual Exclusivity—In General	129
1. Determining Contractual Coverage	130
a. Mandatory Exclusions from Negotiated Grievance Procedure	131
b. Exclusions by Agreement from Negotiated Grievance Procedure	131
2. Exceptions to Contractual Exclusivity	132
a. Adverse Actions and Performance-Based Actions	132
b. Allegations of Discrimination	133
c. Other Prohibited Personnel Practice Allegations	133
3. Determining the Employee’s Election	134
B. Mixed Cases—In General	138
1. Mixed Case Appeals	139
2. Mixed Case Complaints	141
3. Mixed Case Grievances	142
C. Non-FLMRS Agencies	144

PART II—BUILDING A WINNING CASE

CHAPTER 7: GETTING THE FACTS	147
A. Communicating and Coordinating	147
1. Dealing with Witnesses	148
2. Asking the Right Questions	150
B. Investigating Misconduct	156
1. Ensuring Cooperation of Agency Employees	157
2. Ensuring Compliance with Employee and Union Rights	159
a. Constitutional Rights	159
<i>i. Right to Remain Silent</i>	159
<i>ii. Right to be Informed of Charges</i>	161
<i>iii. Right to Counsel</i>	161
<i>iv. Protection from Unlawful Search and Seizure</i>	162
b. Labor Relations Rights	163
<i>i. Weingarten Rights</i>	164
<i>ii. “Formal Discussion” Rights</i>	168
3. Planning the Investigation	169
a. Determining Purpose of Investigation	169
b. Identifying Potential Issues and Preliminary Theory	169
c. Determining Need for Expert Assistance	170
d. Planning Document Strategy	170
e. Planning Witness Strategy	171
4. Conducting the Investigation	173
a. Reviewing Documentation	173
b. Interviewing Witnesses	173
c. Preparing Witness Statements	178
5. Reporting the Investigation	180
C. Documenting the Action	181
1. Need for Early Documentation	181
2. Need for Specific Documentation	181
3. Common Types of Documentation	182
CHAPTER 8: EVIDENCE—THE BASIC RULES	185
A. Scope of Review	185
B. Burden of Proof	186
1. Determining Who Has the Burden of Proof	187

2.	The Agency’s Burden	188
3.	The Appellant’s Burden	189
C.	Standards of Proof	190
D.	Form of Evidence	191
1.	Real Evidence	192
2.	Demonstrative Evidence	192
3.	Documentary Evidence	193
4.	Testimonial Evidence	193
5.	Selecting the Best Form of Evidence	194
E.	Admissibility of Evidence	194
1.	Relevance and Materiality	194
2.	Unduly Repetitious Evidence	195
3.	Competence	196
4.	Exclusion of Otherwise Admissible Evidence	197
F.	Weight of Evidence	197
1.	Using the Most Convincing Evidence	197
2.	Weight of Position Statements	198
G.	Circumstantial Evidence	199
H.	Opinion Testimony	200
1.	Lay Witnesses	200
2.	Expert Witnesses	201
I.	Hearsay Evidence	204
1.	Purpose of the Hearsay Rule	204
2.	Non-Hearsay	204
3.	Hearsay Exceptions	205
4.	The Borninkhof Factors	206
J.	Character Evidence	207
K.	Polygraph Evidence	211
L.	Best Evidence Rule	213
M.	Evidentiary Shortcuts	214
1.	Presumptions	214
2.	Adverse Inferences	215
3.	Admissions	216
4.	Stipulations	217
5.	Official Notice	218
6.	Preclusion of Claims and Issues	219
a.	Law of the Case	219
b.	<i>Res Judicata</i>	220
c.	Collateral Estoppel	221
i.	<i>Criminal Convictions</i>	223
ii.	<i>Criminal Pleas</i>	224
iii.	<i>Criminal Acquittals</i>	224
	CHAPTER 9: ADVERSE ACTION PROCEDURES	225
A.	Basic Requirements	225
B.	Preparing the Advance Notice	227
1.	Providing “Adequate Notice” of the Charges	227
2.	Addressing Nexus	229
3.	Addressing the Penalty	229
4.	Addressing Affirmative Defenses	229
5.	Addressing Procedural Rights	229
C.	Dealing with the Notice Period	230
1.	Use of the Crime Provision	230
2.	Use of Leave and Reassignment	231

D.	Providing an Adequate Reply Opportunity	232
1.	Allowing Adequate Time	232
2.	Providing Required Information	232
3.	Selecting the Oral Reply Officer	233
4.	Allowing a Full Oral Reply	233
5.	Documenting the Oral Reply	234
6.	Making a Recommendation	234
E.	Preparing the Decision Notice	235
1.	Making the Decision	235
a.	New and Material Information	236
b.	Behind-the-Scenes-Adversary	237
2.	Addressing the Employee's Reply	238
3.	Addressing the Charges	238
4.	Addressing Nexus	239
5.	Addressing the Penalty	239
6.	Addressing Affirmative Defenses	240
F.	Regulatory Requirements for Decisions	240
	CHAPTER 10: SELECTING AND DRAFTING CHARGES	243
A.	Charging Terminology	243
B.	Determining What the Charge Is	245
1.	Charges That "Could Have Been" Brought	245
2.	Lesser-Included Offenses	245
3.	Splitting Charges	246
a.	General Rule Against MSPB Splitting of Charges	246
b.	Exception Allowing MSPB Splitting of Charges	248
c.	Splitting of Charges by Agency	249
4.	Merging Charges	250
C.	Determining What the Elements Are	251
D.	Proving the Charge	252
E.	Selecting Winning Charges	253
1.	Starting with the Facts	254
2.	Considering <i>All</i> Options	254
3.	Identifying Strengths and Weaknesses	255
4.	Avoiding Overcharging	255
5.	Avoiding Undercharging	255
6.	Avoiding Stale Charges	256
F.	Drafting Winning Charges	257
1.	Picking the Best "Labeling" Approach	257
2.	Keeping "Separate" Charges Separate	259
3.	Limiting Content of Charges	260
4.	Limiting Content of Specifications	260
5.	Linking Specifications to Charges	260
6.	Separating Charges, Specifications, Nexus, and Penalty	261
G.	Common Charges	261
1.	AWOL	261
a.	Absence From Duty	262
b.	No Leave Authorized	262
i.	Annual Leave	264
ii.	Sick Leave	265
iii.	Leave Without Pay	268
2.	Excessive Use of Approved Leave	269
3.	Failure to Follow Leave-Requesting Procedures	271
4.	Refusal to Accept Reassignment	272
5.	Insubordination	273
6.	Failure to Follow Instructions	274
7.	Sexual Harassment	274

a.	“ <i>Quid Pro Quo</i> ” Sexual Harassment	275
b.	“Hostile Environment” Sexual Harassment	275
c.	Sexual Harassment in Violation of Agency Policy	277
8.	Criminal Charges—In General	279
9.	Falsification	280
10.	Theft	282
11.	Willful Misuse of Government Vehicle	283
12.	Threats	283
CHAPTER 11: ESTABLISHING A NEXUS		287
A.	Purpose of Nexus Requirement	287
B.	MSPB’s Analytical Framework	289
C.	Common Nexus Issues	291
1.	AWOL	291
2.	Arrest	291
3.	Off-Duty Drug Offenses	292
4.	Sexual Harassment	295
5.	Nonpayment of Debts	295
D.	Addressing Nexus in Agency Notices	296
CHAPTER 12: SELECTING AND DEFENDING THE PENALTY		299
A.	Penalty Review Under <i>Douglas</i>	299
1.	Deference to Agency Discretion on Penalty	299
2.	The <i>Douglas</i> Factors	301
3.	Agency Burden of Proof on Penalty	303
4.	Addressing Penalty in Agency Notices	304
5.	Penalty Review Where Not All Charges Sustained	307
6.	Penalty Review Where Not All Specifications Sustained	308
7.	Exemplary Penalties	308
8.	“Zero Tolerance” Policies	309
9.	Mandatory Penalties	309
B.	<i>Douglas</i> Factor 1—Nature and Seriousness of Offense	309
C.	<i>Douglas</i> Factor 2—Position Held	312
D.	<i>Douglas</i> Factor 3—Past Disciplinary Record	313
1.	Limited Review Standard	313
2.	Reliance on Dissimilar Offenses	314
3.	Effect of Pending Challenge	315
E.	<i>Douglas</i> Factor 4—Past Work Record	316
F.	<i>Douglas</i> Factor 5—Ability to Perform	316
G.	<i>Douglas</i> Factor 6—Consistency with Practice	317
H.	<i>Douglas</i> Factor 7—Consistency with Policy	319
I.	<i>Douglas</i> Factor 8—Notoriety of Offense	321
J.	<i>Douglas</i> Factor 9—Notice or Warning	321
K.	<i>Douglas</i> Factor 10—Rehabilitation Potential	322
L.	<i>Douglas</i> Factor 11—Miscellaneous Mitigating Factors	323
M.	<i>Douglas</i> Factor 12—Adequacy of Alternative Sanctions	325
CHAPTER 13: PERFORMANCE-BASED ACTIONS		327
A.	Basic Requirements	327
B.	Documenting OPM’s Approval	331
C.	Using Valid Standards	332
1.	Objective Standards	332
2.	Supplementation of Standards	333
3.	Measurable Standards	334
4.	Reasonable Standards	334
5.	Absolute Standards	335
6.	“Backwards” or “Negative” Standards	336

7.	Extrapolation of Levels	337
8.	Multiple Components	338
D.	Providing an Adequate Opportunity Period	339
1.	Initiating the Opportunity Period	339
2.	Providing Adequate Time	341
3.	Providing Adequate Assistance	341
4.	Avoiding Obstacles to Improvement	341
E.	Deciding Whether to Take Action	341
1.	Successful Opportunity Period	342
2.	Unsuccessful Opportunity Period	342
3.	Dealing with the “Roller Coaster” Employee	343
F.	Selecting the Penalty	343
G.	Deciding Whether to Use Chapter 43 or Chapter 75	344
CHAPTER 14: AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES		347
A.	Affirmative Defense Categories	347
B.	Harmful Procedural Error	348
1.	Statutory Violations	349
2.	Violations of Agency Regulations or Collective Bargaining Agreement	349
3.	Failure to Follow Basic Procedures	350
C.	Prohibited Personnel Practices—In General	351
D.	Discrimination—In General	354
1.	Circumstantial Evidence and the <i>McDonnell-Douglas</i> Analysis	355
a.	Appellant’s <i>Prima Facie</i> Case	356
b.	Agency’s “Legitimate, Nondiscriminatory Reason”	356
c.	Appellant’s “Pretext” Showing	357
2.	Direct Evidence and the <i>Price Waterhouse</i> Analysis	359
E.	Religious Discrimination	360
F.	Disability Discrimination	361
1.	Basic Analytical Framework for Disability Discrimination	362
2.	Agency’s Right to Discipline	365
3.	“Individual with a Disability” Showing	366
a.	Actual Disability	366
i.	<i>Physical or Mental Impairment</i>	367
ii.	<i>“Substantially Limits” One or More “Major Life Activities”</i>	368
b.	Past Disability	372
c.	Perceived Disability	373
4.	Articulation of “Reasonable Accommodation” and the “Interactive Process”	374
5.	“Reasonable Accommodation” and “Undue Hardship”	375
a.	Past Accommodation Efforts	377
b.	“Trial” Accommodation Efforts	377
c.	Job Restructuring	378
d.	Reassignment	379
6.	Special Rules for Drug Addiction and Alcoholism	384
G.	Whistleblower Reprisal—WPA Cases	387
1.	Appellant’s “Protected Disclosure” Showing	388
a.	“Disclosure” Requirement	389
b.	WPA-Covered Wrongdoing Requirement	390
i.	<i>Violation of Law, Rule, or Regulation</i>	391
ii.	<i>Gross Mismanagement</i>	393
iii.	<i>Gross Waste of Funds</i>	393
iv.	<i>Abuse of Authority</i>	394
v.	<i>Substantial and Specific Danger to Public Health or Safety</i>	394
c.	“Reasonable Belief” Requirement	395
d.	“Manner of Disclosure” Requirement	396
i.	<i>Disclosures of Confidential Information</i>	397

ii.	<i>Disclosures to Wrongdoer</i>	398
iii.	<i>Disclosures to Supervisor About Others</i>	399
iv.	<i>Disclosures as Part of Normal Job Duties</i>	399
v.	<i>Disclosures in Appeal or Similar Proceedings</i>	401
e.	Protected Individuals Who Did Not Make Protected Disclosures	401
2.	Appellant’s “Contributing Factor” Showing	402
3.	Agency’s “But For” Showing	403
H.	Whistleblower Reprisal—Non-WPA Cases	404
I.	“Not in Accordance with Law”	405

PART III—WINNING ON APPEAL

CHAPTER 15:	RESPONDING TO THE APPEAL	407
A.	Reviewing the Acknowledgment Order	407
B.	Filing a Timely Response	409
1.	Regulatory Time Limit for Response	409
2.	Sanctions for Untimely Responses	409
3.	Requesting Extensions of Time	410
4.	Ensuring Timely Receipt of MSPB Orders	411
C.	Minimum Content Requirements	411
D.	Challenging the Adequacy of the Appeal	412
E.	Challenging Jurisdiction or Timeliness	413
1.	Deferring the Merits	414
2.	Deferring Jurisdiction or Timeliness	415
F.	Challenging the Appellant’s Representative	416
1.	Procedures	416
2.	Basis for Challenge	417
G.	Addressing the Merits	417
H.	Dealing with “Confidential” Appeals	419
1.	Sealing the Record	419
2.	Sanitizing the Decision	420
3.	“Doe” Appeals	420
CHAPTER 16:	PROPER PARTIES AND ACTIONS	423
A.	Consolidation and Joinder	423
1.	Procedures	423
2.	Purpose of Consolidation	424
3.	Purpose of Joinder	425
4.	Criteria	425
B.	Class Appeals	426
1.	Criteria	426
2.	Procedures	428
C.	Intervenors	429
1.	Intervenors as a Matter of Right	430
2.	Permissive Intervenors	431
3.	Role of Intervenors	431
D.	<i>Amicus Curiae</i>	432
E.	Substitution of Parties	432
CHAPTER 17:	PREHEARING PRACTICE	435
A.	120-Day Processing Goal	435
1.	Dismissal Without Prejudice	436
2.	Case Suspension	438
B.	<i>Ex Parte</i> Communications	439
C.	Motions	441
1.	Procedures	442

a.	Requirement to Contact Other Party	442
b.	Requirement for Written Motion	442
c.	Content of Motion	443
d.	Response to Motion	443
e.	Disposition of Motion	443
f.	“Informal” Motions Practice	444
2.	Common Motions	445
a.	Motion to Dismiss for Failure to Prosecute	445
b.	Motion for Extension of Time	446
c.	Motion to Dismiss for Failure to Establish <i>Prima Facie</i> Case	447
D.	Service Requirements	448
E.	Prehearing Orders	449
F.	Authority of Administrative Judge	450
G.	Sanctions	451
H.	Disqualification of Administrative Judge	454
I.	Interlocutory Appeals	456
J.	Discovery	459
1.	Scope of Discovery	460
a.	Relevant Information	460
b.	Nonprivileged information	461
2.	Discovery Tools	461
a.	Written Interrogatories	462
b.	Depositions	462
c.	Production of Documents or Things for Inspection and Copying	465
d.	Requests for Admission	465
3.	Discovery Procedures	466
a.	Overview of Discovery Procedures	468
b.	Requests for Discovery	469
c.	Board-Approved Discovery Requests	470
d.	Motions to Compel Discovery	471
4.	Controlling Discovery Costs	472
5.	Use of Discovered Information	473
6.	Using Discovery as an Affirmative Tool	473
7.	Defending Against Discovery	475
a.	Relevance and Undue Burden	476
b.	Privileged and Other Confidential Information	476
K.	Subpoenas	478
1.	Motions for Issuance of Subpoenas	478
2.	Motions to Quash or Limit Subpoenas	479
3.	Service	479
4.	Witness Fees	480
5.	Enforcement of Subpoenas	480
L.	Requesting and Scheduling Hearings	481
1.	Hearing Requests by Appellant	481
a.	Jurisdictional and Timeliness Hearings	481
b.	“Oral Argument Only” Hearings	482
2.	Waiver of Hearing by Appellant	483
3.	Hearing Requests by the Agency	485
4.	Scheduling the Hearing	485
a.	Selecting a Hearing Date	486
b.	Selecting a Hearing Location	487
c.	Telephone Hearings	488
d.	Video-Conference Hearings	489
e.	Requests for Postponement	490

5.	Adjudication Without a Hearing	492
M.	Venue	493
N.	Selecting, Requesting, and Preparing Witnesses	495
1.	Selecting Witnesses	495
a.	Selecting the Most Credible Witnesses	496
b.	Special Categories of Witnesses	497
i.	<i>Proposing and Deciding Officials</i>	497
ii.	<i>Investigators</i>	498
iii.	<i>Appellant as an Agency Witness</i>	498
2.	Requesting Witnesses	499
a.	Challenging the Appellant’s Witness Requests	500
b.	Defending the Agency’s Witness Requests	501
c.	Ensuring Attendance of Witnesses	502
i.	<i>Agency Employees</i>	502
ii.	<i>Other Federal Employees</i>	503
iii.	<i>Non-Federal Employees</i>	503
d.	Compensation of Approved Witnesses	503
i.	<i>Federal employees</i>	503
ii.	<i>Non-Federal Employees</i>	505
3.	Preparing Witnesses	505
O.	Selecting Exhibits	507
P.	Status and Prehearing Conferences	508
1.	Purpose	508
2.	Time and Place	510
3.	Preparing for the Conference	510
4.	Limiting the Issues	512
5.	Recording the Conference	514
CHAPTER 18: SETTLEMENT		515
A.	MSPB Emphasis on Settlements	515
B.	Common Settlement Terms	516
1.	“Last Chance Agreements”	516
2.	Return to Duty	516
3.	Clean Record	517
4.	Clean Reference	519
5.	Confidentiality Clause	522
6.	No-Harassment Clause	523
7.	Back Pay	524
8.	Cash Buyout	524
9.	Retirement Benefits	524
10.	Compensatory or Consequential Damages	525
11.	Unemployment Benefits	525
12.	Priority Promotion Consideration	525
13.	Attorney Fees	526
C.	Obtaining Settlement Authority	527
D.	Administrative Judge’s Role	528
E.	Reaching Agreement	530
F.	Oral Settlements	532
1.	“Agreements to Agree”	533
2.	Documenting the Agreement	533
G.	Settling Age Discrimination Claims	534
H.	Drafting an Enforceable Agreement	534
I.	Dismissal of Appeal	536
J.	Entering Settlement into Record	537
1.	Criteria for Acceptance	538
2.	Requirement for MSPB Jurisdiction	538
3.	Enforcement Alternatives	539

K.	Challenges to Settlements	539
1.	Procedures for Challenge	540
2.	Reasons for Challenge	540
CHAPTER 19: THE HEARING		545
A.	Preparation for the Hearing	545
B.	Failure to Appear	546
C.	Format of the Hearing	548
1.	Level of Formality	548
2.	Order of Presentation	548
a.	Order of Witnesses	550
b.	Intervenors	550
3.	Swearing In Witnesses	550
4.	Sequestering Witnesses	551
5.	“Off-the-Record” Discussions	551
6.	Public Hearings	552
7.	Disability Assistance	553
8.	Foreign Language Assistance	553
D.	Bifurcation of Hearing	554
E.	Role of Agency Representative	555
1.	Multiple Representatives	555
2.	Technical Advisors	557
3.	Representative as Witness	557
F.	Role of Administrative Judge	558
1.	Need for Impartiality	558
2.	Rulings on Motions and Objections	559
3.	Controlling Disruptive Conduct	560
4.	Determining the Administrative Judge’s Perspective	562
G.	Role of Witnesses	562
1.	MSPB’s Instructions for Witnesses	563
2.	Tips for Witnesses	564
H.	Transcript	567
1.	Controlling Transcript Costs	568
2.	Correcting the Transcript	570
I.	Opening Statement	570
J.	Presenting Evidence	572
1.	Contents of Official Record	572
2.	When to Present Evidence	572
3.	How to Present Documentary Evidence	573
4.	Authentication of Evidence	575
5.	Offer of Proof	576
K.	Credibility	576
1.	Factors Affecting Credibility	577
2.	Impeaching Your Own Witness	580
3.	Impeaching the Appellant’s Witness	580
4.	Rehabilitating the Agency’s Witness	581
L.	Direct and Cross-Examination	582
1.	Preparation	582
2.	Order of Questioning	583
3.	Conducting Direct Examination	583
a.	Content	583
i.	Ensuring Relevance	583
ii.	Eliminating Unnecessary Detail	584
iii.	Following a Logical and Effective Order	584
iv.	Disclosing Harmful Evidence on Direct Examination	586
b.	Style and Manner of Questioning	587

i.	<i>Narrative and Closed Questions</i>	587
ii.	<i>Leading Questions</i>	588
iii.	<i>Maintaining the Flow</i>	588
iv.	<i>Dealing With the Witness Who “Freezes”</i>	589
4.	Production of Prior Signed Statements	589
5.	Conducting Cross-Examination	590
a.	Purpose of Cross-Examination	590
b.	Deciding Whether to Cross-Examine	591
c.	Scope of Cross-Examination	591
d.	Style and Manner of Questioning	592
i.	<i>Effective Use of Leading Questions</i>	592
ii.	<i>Asking “Safe” Questions</i>	592
iii.	<i>Dealing With the Dishonest or Evasive Witness</i>	593
M.	Objections	593
1.	Purpose of Objections	593
2.	Making and Responding to Objections	594
3.	Types of Objections	595
4.	Deciding Whether to Object	597
N.	Rebuttal Evidence	597
1.	Preparation	598
2.	Requesting Continuances Based on Surprise	598
O.	Closing Statement	598
1.	Content	598
2.	Length	599
P.	Post-Hearing Brief	600
Q.	Closing the Record	601
	CHAPTER 20: DECISION AND REVIEW	603
A.	Issuance of Initial Decision	603
1.	Content of Initial Decision	604
2.	Non-Precedential Nature of Initial Decision	605
3.	Distribution of Initial Decision	605
4.	Finality of Initial Decision	606
5.	Use of Bench Decisions	607
B.	Interim Relief	608
1.	Duty Assignment	609
2.	Compensation and Benefits	611
3.	Initiating Interim Relief	612
4.	Ending Interim Relief	612
5.	Sanctions for Noncompliance	612
C.	Petition for Review	613
1.	Entitlement to File Petition for Review	614
2.	Deciding Whether to File Petition for Review	614
3.	OPM’s Role	615
4.	Timeliness of Petition for Review	618
5.	Criteria for Review	619
a.	New and Material Evidence	619
b.	Error of Law	620
6.	Content of Petition for Review	622
7.	Service Requirements	623
8.	Response and Cross-Petition for Review	624
9.	Board Processing of Petition for Review	625
a.	Closing the Record	625
b.	Petition for Review Settlement Program	625
c.	Adjudication	628
10.	Precedential Nature of Board Decisions	629
D.	Board Authority to Reopen Cases	630
E.	Judicial Review	631

1.	Proper Petitioner	632
2.	Proper Respondent	634
3.	Proper Court	635
4.	Time Limit for Seeking Judicial Review	637
	a. “Pure” MSPB Cases	637
	b. Mixed Cases	637
5.	Scope of Review	639
	a. “Pure” MSPB Cases	639
	b. Mixed Cases	640
6.	Frivolous Appeals	641
7.	Agency Representative’s Role	641
CHAPTER 21: REMEDIES		643
A.	Corrective Action	643
1.	Back Pay	644
2.	Leave	647
3.	Expungement of Records	648
4.	Equivalent Position	649
5.	Mitigation to Demotion	650
6.	Intervening Promotions	652
7.	Performance Appraisals	652
8.	Retaliation	653
9.	Compensatory Damages	653
	a. Eligibility for Compensatory Damages	654
	b. Procedures for Compensatory Damages Requests	654
	c. Criteria for Determining Damages	655
10.	Consequential Damages	658
11.	Correction of Prior Non-Appealable Actions	658
B.	Compliance	659
1.	Stay Requests	660
	a. OPM Requests	660
	b. Employing Agency Requests	661
2.	Enforcement Procedures for Decisions	662
	a. Proper Petitioner	662
	b. Time for Filing Petition	662
	c. Place for Filing Petition	663
	d. Content of Petition	664
	e. Submission in Response to Petition	664
	f. Petitioner’s Reply	665
	g. Developing the Facts	665
	h. Finding of Compliance	666
	i. Finding of Noncompliance	666
	i. <i>Submission to Board</i>	666
	ii. <i>Response by Petitioner</i>	667
	iii. <i>Board Decision</i>	668
3.	Enforcement Procedures for Settlements	668
C.	Attorney Fees	671
1.	Was the Appellant the “Prevailing Party”?	676
2.	Were Attorney Fees “Incurred”?	677
3.	Is an Award Warranted in the “Interest of Justice”?	678
	a. Category 1—Prohibited Personnel Practice	679
	b. Category 2—Clearly Without Merit, etc.	679
	i. <i>Subcategories of Category 2</i>	680
	ii. <i>Applicability to Stages of Appeal</i>	680
	iii. <i>Distinguishing Category 2 from Category 5</i>	680
	c. Category 3—Bad Faith	683
	d. Category 4—Gross Procedural Error	683

e.	Category 5—"Knew or Should Have Known"	683
i.	Agency's Duty of Inquiry	684
ii.	Agency's Duty of Competent Representation Before MSPB	684
iii.	Mitigation of Penalty	684
4.	Are the Requested Fees "Reasonable"?	686
a.	Hourly Rate	688
i.	Documentation	688
ii.	Out-of-Town Counsel	689
iii.	Rate for Travel Time	690
iv.	Contingency Enhancement	690
v.	Reduced Rates	690
vi.	Historical vs. Current Rates	690
vii.	Quality Bonus	691
viii.	Market vs. Cost-Plus Rates for Union Counsel	691
b.	Hours	692
i.	Documentation	692
ii.	Proper Proceedings	693
iii.	Reduction for Partial Success	695
iv.	Reduction for Unsuccessful Arguments	695
c.	Expenses and Costs	696
5.	Procedures	698

APPENDIX I: RESEARCH TOOLS	701
A. MSPB Sources	701
B. OPM Sources	702
C. Other Federal Government Sources	703
D. Private-Sector Sources	704

APPENDIX II: SAMPLE FORMS	707
---------------------------------	-----

Agency Adverse Action Forms

<i>Notice of Proposed Removal</i>	709
<i>Notice of Decision to Remove</i>	711

Agency Performance-Based Action Forms

<i>Notice of Proposed Removal</i>	713
<i>Notice of Decision to Remove</i>	715

MSPB-Generated Appeals Forms

<i>Acknowledgment Order (Initial Appeal)</i>	716
<i>Certificate of Service</i>	722
<i>Designation of Representative</i>	723
<i>Requirements for Agency File</i>	724
<i>Second Order to Respond</i>	727
<i>Subpoena to Testify at Hearing</i>	728

<i>Return of Service</i>	729
<i>Order and Notice of Hearing and Prehearing Conference</i>	730
<i>Model Instructions for Broadcast Coverage</i>	733
<i>Order Closing the Record</i>	735
<i>Acknowledgment Order (Compensatory Damages)</i>	736
<i>Acknowledgment Order (Consequential Damages)</i>	739
<i>Acknowledgment Order (Compliance)</i>	741
<i>Acknowledgment Order (Attorney Fees)</i>	743
Agency-Generated Appeals Forms	
<i>Motion to Dismiss Appeal as Untimely</i>	747
<i>Motion for Postponement of Hearing</i>	749
<i>Request for Admission</i>	751
<i>Agency’s Interrogatories to Appellant</i>	752
<i>Motion for Issuance of Subpoenas Duces Tecum</i>	754
<i>Motion to Compel Response to Written Interrogatories</i>	756
<i>Response in Opposition to Motion to Compel</i>	757
<i>Motion for Sanctions for Failure to Comply with Discovery Order</i>	759
APPENDIX III: STATUTES AND REGULATIONS	761
A. 5 U.S.C. §§ 1201–1222	761
B. 5 U.S.C. §§ 2301–2302	778
C. 5 U.S.C. §§ 4301–4305	782
D. 5 U.S.C. § 7121	785
E. 5 U.S.C. §§ 7511–7514	787
F. 5 U.S.C. §§ 7701–7703	789
G. 5 CFR Part 432	796
H. 5 CFR Part 752, Subpart D	802
I. 5 CFR Parts 1200–1201	807
J. 5 CFR Parts 1208–1209	866
K. 5 CFR Part 1800	877
APPENDIX IV: GLOSSARY	881
INDEX	901