

# SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

PREFACE .....	i
INTRODUCTION .....	1
CHAPTER 1: OVERVIEW.....	3
CHAPTER 2: THE PRECOMPLAINT PROCESS—COUNSELING.....	31
CHAPTER 3: FORMAL COMPLAINT PROCESS— ACCEPTANCE AND DISMISSAL.....	131
CHAPTER 4: INVESTIGATION OF COMPLAINTS.....	267
CHAPTER 5: SETTLEMENT OF COMPLAINTS.....	299
CHAPTER 6: EEO HEARINGS.....	395
CHAPTER 7: FINAL AGENCY ACTION .....	497
CHAPTER 8: EEOC APPEALS.....	509
CHAPTER 9: REPRESENTATIVES AND OFFICIAL TIME .....	575
CHAPTER 10: THEORIES OF DISCRIMINATION— INTENTIONAL DISCRIMINATION.....	603
CHAPTER 11: THEORIES OF DISCRIMINATION—ADVERSE IMPACT.....	693
CHAPTER 12: THEORIES OF DISCRIMINATION— HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT.....	709
CHAPTER 13: BASES OF DISCRIMINATION UNDER TITLE VII.....	865
CHAPTER 14: REHABILITATION ACT AND GINA.....	961
CHAPTER 15: AGE DISCRIMINATION IN EMPLOYMENT ACT.....	1261
CHAPTER 16: REPRISAL .....	1289
CHAPTER 17: PERSONNEL ACTIONS.....	1355
CHAPTER 18: CLASS ACTION COMPLAINTS .....	1403
CHAPTER 19: EEO ALTERNATIVES .....	1439
CHAPTER 20: FORMS OF RELIEF .....	1473
CHAPTER 21: ATTORNEY FEES.....	1713
TABLE OF CASES .....	1771
INDEX .....	1841



# TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE .....	i
INTRODUCTION .....	1
I. ORGANIZATION OF THE <i>GUIDE</i> .....	1
A. RESEARCH FOR THE BOOK .....	2
B. OTHER REFERENCE SOURCES .....	2
CHAPTER 1: OVERVIEW .....	3
I. AUTHORITY AND JURISDICTION .....	3
A. STATUTORY AUTHORITY .....	3
1. Title VII of the 1964 Civil Rights Act .....	3
2. Rehabilitation Act of 1973 .....	3
3. Americans With Disabilities Act Amendment Act of 2008 .....	4
4. Age Discrimination in Employment Act .....	4
5. Equal Pay Act .....	4
6. Civil Rights Act of 1991 .....	4
7. Congressional Accountability Act of 1995 .....	4
8. No FEAR Act of 2002 .....	5
9. Genetic Information Nondiscrimination Act of 2008 .....	6
B. EFFECT OF THE CIVIL SERVICE REFORM ACT .....	6
C. ORGANIZATION OF THE COMMISSION .....	7
D. JURISDICTION .....	7
1. Covered Actions .....	7
2. Employees Covered .....	8
3. Agencies Covered .....	8
4. Unions .....	8
5. Remedial Powers .....	10
E. CIVIL ACTIONS .....	10
II. AGENCY EEO PROGRAMS .....	10
A. ORGANIZATION OF PART 1614 .....	10
B. AGENCY PROGRAMS .....	11
1. Affirmative Employment Under Part 1614 .....	11
2. Management Directive 715 .....	12
III. PROCESSING EEO COMPLAINTS—PART 1614 AND MD-110 .....	17
A. COMPLAINT COVERAGE .....	17
1. Legislative and Judicial Branches .....	17
2. Overseas Employees .....	18
3. Department of Veterans Affairs .....	18
4. Military Employees .....	18
5. General Accounting Office .....	18
B. AGENCY PROCESSING OF COMPLAINTS .....	18
1. Agency EEO Directors .....	18
2. Avoiding Conflicts of Interest .....	18
3. Complaint Processing Variances .....	19
4. EEO Counselors and the Precomplaint Stage .....	19
5. Alternative Dispute Resolutions .....	20
6. Notice of Final Interview .....	21
7. Formal Complaints .....	21
8. Dismissal of Complaints .....	22
9. Partial Dismissals .....	22
10. Investigations .....	22
11. Disposition of Complaints .....	24
12. Hearings .....	25
13. Administrative Judge Decisions .....	25
14. Final Agency Decisions and Actions .....	25
15. Appeals to the EEOC .....	26

16. Interim Relief .....	26
17. Requests for Reconsideration .....	27
IV. CLASS COMPLAINTS .....	27
A. EEO COUNSELING .....	27
B. FORMAL COMPLAINT REQUIREMENTS .....	27
C. AGENCY PROCESSING.....	27
D. PROCESSING BY ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE .....	28
1. Notification of Class Members .....	28
2. Development of the Record .....	28
3. Resolution of Complaints .....	28
4. Hearings .....	29
5. Judges' Decisions .....	29
E. FINAL AGENCY ACTIONS .....	29
1. Individual Relief .....	29

## CHAPTER 2: THE PRECOMPLAINT PROCESS—COUNSELING..... 31

I. THE 45-DAY TIME LIMIT .....	32
A. AGENCY BURDEN ON APPEAL .....	32
B. WAIVER OF PRECOMPLAINT COUNSELING .....	33
1. Denial of Counseling .....	33
2. Reopening Counseling.....	33
3. Delay by Agency .....	33
C. DETERMINING THE PERIOD FOR INITIATING COUNSELING .....	34
1. Personnel Actions .....	34
2. Notification of Personnel Action .....	36
3. Events Not Constituting Personnel Actions .....	37
4. Events Occurring During Counseling .....	37
5. New Claims Raised After Counseling .....	38
D. ESTABLISHING DATE OF COUNSELOR CONTACT .....	38
II. EXTENDING THE TIME PERIOD FOR INITIATING COUNSELING .....	39
A. TOLLING THE PERIOD FOR COUNSELING .....	39
1. Reasonable Suspicion Standard .....	39
2. Awareness Personnel Action Is Final .....	44
3. Evidence on Tolling .....	45
4. Uncertainty of Law.....	45
5. Disabled Employees .....	46
6. Language Barriers .....	46
B. NOTICE OF PROCEDURES AND TIME LIMITS .....	46
1. Posting Requirements .....	46
2. Constructive Notice .....	47
3. Constructive Notice—Applicants .....	50
4. Agency's Burden.....	51
5. Age Discrimination .....	52
C. WAIVER OF TIME LIMIT .....	52
1. Agency Waiver of Time Limit.....	52
2. Mental Duress or Physical Inability .....	52
3. Status as Minor.....	54
4. Death or Illness in Family .....	54
5. Death of Counsel.....	54
6. Military Duty .....	55
7. Self-Incrimination Concerns.....	55
8. Complainants Who Are Attorneys.....	55
9. Circumstances Beyond Control.....	55
10. Fear of Reprisal .....	55
11. Use of Procedures Other Than EEO .....	56
12. Use of Negotiated Grievance Procedure .....	56
13. New Employees and Applicants .....	57
14. Independent Consultants and Contractors.....	58
15. Amended Complaints .....	58
16. Doctrine of Laches.....	58
D. ESTOPPEL .....	58

1.	Failure to Assert Timeliness .....	58
2.	Reliance on Agency Advice and Actions .....	59
3.	Reliance on Agency Inaction .....	66
4.	Reliance on Advice by Third Parties .....	66
5.	Developing Record on Estoppel.....	66
III.	CONTINUING VIOLATIONS .....	66
A.	THE SUPREME COURT’S VIEW— <i>MORGAN</i> .....	67
B.	THE COMMISSION’S VIEW BEFORE <i>MORGAN</i> — <i>ANISMAN</i> .....	70
C.	PRESENT VIABILITY OF CONTINUING VIOLATION CLAIMS .....	73
D.	ELEMENTS OF SERIAL CONTINUING VIOLATION CLAIM .....	74
1.	Personnel Actions .....	74
2.	Nexus Requirement.....	74
3.	Knew or Should Have Known Requirement .....	76
4.	Standards of Proof .....	78
E.	HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT CASES .....	79
F.	SYSTEMIC OR RECURRING VIOLATIONS .....	86
1.	Lilly Ledbetter Fair Pay Act of 2009.....	89
2.	Reasonable Accommodation Cases .....	91
3.	Health Insurance Benefit Cases.....	95
G.	UNTIMELY FORMAL COMPLAINT .....	96
H.	ISSUES OF RELIEF .....	96
I.	PARTIAL DISMISSALS .....	96
1.	Identical Complaints .....	96
IV.	REQUESTS FOR COUNSELING .....	96
A.	DOCUMENTATION OF CONTACT .....	96
B.	PREMATURE COMPLAINTS .....	96
C.	CONTACT NOT INVOLVING COUNSELORS .....	97
1.	Wrong Agency Officials.....	97
2.	Wrong Agency or Wrong Agency Component .....	99
3.	Contact With EEOC .....	99
D.	ANONYMOUS CONTACTS.....	100
E.	CONTACT BY MAIL .....	100
F.	CONTACT BY PHONE.....	100
G.	CONTACT BY EMAIL.....	100
H.	CONTENTS OF CONTACT .....	100
I.	CONTACT BY REPRESENTATIVES .....	101
J.	EXTENDING THE COUNSELING PERIOD .....	101
K.	AMENDING PREVIOUS COMPLAINTS .....	102
L.	MIXED CASE APPEALS.....	102
V.	DUTIES OF EEO COUNSELOR .....	102
A.	ADVISING COMPLAINANTS ON PROCEDURES .....	103
1.	Counselor as Investigator.....	104
2.	Initial Interview .....	105
3.	Alternative Dispute Resolution .....	106
4.	Class Complaint Counseling .....	106
5.	Alternative Forums: MSPB & Grievances .....	106
6.	ADEA and EPA Complaints.....	108
B.	DETERMINING CLAIMS .....	108
1.	Definition of Claim.....	108
2.	Definition of Issues .....	109
3.	Definition of Evidence .....	109
4.	Counselor’s Duty to Clarify .....	109
C.	INQUIRIES AND RESOLUTION EFFORTS BY COUNSELORS .....	110
1.	Limited Inquiry.....	111
2.	Resolution Efforts.....	113
D.	CHOICE OF COUNSELOR .....	115
E.	ANONYMITY FOR COMPLAINANTS .....	115
VI.	PROTECTION FOR COUNSELORS .....	115
A.	RESTRAINT BY COUNSELOR.....	116
VII.	EXCLUSION OF ALLEGATIONS .....	116
A.	SUFFICIENCY OF ALLEGATIONS .....	116

B.	DISMISSAL OF COMPLAINTS .....	116
C.	FAILURE TO PROSECUTE .....	117
D.	WITHDRAWAL OF ALLEGATIONS .....	118
VIII.	NOTICE OF FINAL INTERVIEW .....	119
A.	CONSTRUCTIVE RECEIPT OF NOTICE .....	122
IX.	EEO COUNSELOR'S REPORT .....	123
A.	RESPONDING MANAGEMENT OFFICIALS .....	123
X.	INCIDENTS OCCURRING AFTER PRECOMPLAINT COUNSELING .....	124
XI.	ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE RESOLUTION .....	124
A.	CORE PRINCIPLES .....	125
1.	Voluntariness .....	125
2.	Neutrality.....	125
3.	Confidentiality.....	125
4.	Enforceability.....	126
B.	TYPES OF ADR .....	126
1.	Mediation .....	126
2.	Facilitation .....	126
3.	Settlement Conferences .....	127
C.	DEVELOPING ADR PROGRAMS .....	127
1.	Factors to Consider .....	127
2.	Training.....	127
3.	Resources for Neutrals.....	128
D.	AGENCY ADMINISTRATION AND PROCESSING .....	128
1.	Time Frames.....	128
2.	Alternatives to ADR .....	128
3.	Counseling Process and ADR.....	128
4.	ADR and Complaint Processing .....	129
5.	Information About the Agency's ADR Program .....	129
6.	Notice of Rights and Responsibilities.....	129
7.	EEO Counselor's Role .....	129
8.	Requirements of Resolutions.....	129
9.	Attorney Fees.....	129
E.	ADR AFTER PRECOMPLAINT PROCESSING .....	129

## CHAPTER 3: FORMAL COMPLAINT PROCESS— ACCEPTANCE AND DISMISSAL.....131

I.	REQUIREMENTS OF FORMAL COMPLAINT .....	131
A.	COMPLAINANT'S DUTY TO PROCEED .....	133
II.	AGENCY PROCESSING OF COMPLAINT .....	133
A.	ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF COMPLAINT .....	133
B.	DEFINING COMPLAINT CLAIMS .....	135
1.	Avoiding Fragmentation .....	136
2.	Spin-Off and Dissatisfaction With Process Complaints .....	139
C.	DISMISSAL PROCESS .....	141
1.	Partial Dismissals .....	141
2.	Termination of Agency Jurisdiction to Dismiss .....	142
D.	ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE RESOLUTION.....	142
E.	EFFECT OF HEARING REQUEST .....	142
III.	BASES FOR DISMISSAL OF COMPLAINTS .....	142
A.	UNTIMELY COMPLAINTS .....	143
1.	Constructive Receipt.....	145
2.	Filing With EEO Counselor .....	145
3.	Filing Complaint With Wrong Agency .....	145
4.	Service on Attorney Representative .....	146
5.	Service on Non-Attorney Representative .....	146
6.	Failure to Provide Complaint Form.....	147
7.	Request to Clarify Allegations .....	147
8.	Removal of Harm .....	147
9.	Mental or Physical Incapacity .....	147
10.	Death or Illness in Family .....	149

11. Serious Medical Condition.....	149
12. Circumstances Beyond Complainant’s Control .....	150
13. Unavailability of Complainant.....	150
14. Failure to Sign Complaint .....	150
15. Failure to Include Formal Complaint.....	150
16. Calendar Days .....	151
17. Premature Complaints .....	151
18. Filing by Mail .....	151
19. Postmarks .....	151
20. Filing by Inter-Office Mail.....	153
21. Filing by Telefax .....	153
22. Filing by Email .....	153
23. Filing in Person.....	154
24. Failure to Find Counsel .....	154
25. Illness of Counsel .....	154
26. Absence of Counsel.....	154
27. Mistake by Counsel.....	154
28. Denial of Official Time.....	155
29. Training .....	155
30. Active Military Duty .....	155
31. Doctrine of Laches .....	155
32. Agency Bad Faith and Mistaken Advice .....	156
33. Need to Obtain Supporting Documentation.....	156
34. Severity of the Harassment.....	156
B. STANDING: FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM .....	157
C. STANDING: FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM—DEFINITION OF EMPLOYEE .....	163
1. Current Employees .....	163
2. Applicants for Employment .....	163
3. Former Employees .....	164
4. Deceased Employees .....	167
5. Reinstated Employees .....	167
6. Relatives of Employees.....	167
7. Veterans .....	167
8. Complaints on Behalf of Others .....	168
9. Group Complaints.....	169
10. Temporary Appointees .....	169
11. National Guard Technicians .....	169
12. Other Military/Civilian Positions.....	173
13. Public Health Service—Commissioned Officers .....	173
14. Independent Consultants and Contractors .....	173
15. Law Enforcement and Security Contractors.....	183
16. Tribal Employees .....	185
17. Compensated Work Therapy Program .....	185
18. SEE Program .....	185
19. Volunteers .....	185
20. Informants .....	186
21. Interns .....	186
22. Prisoners .....	187
23. Peace Corps Volunteers .....	187
24. Foreign Nationals .....	187
D. STANDING: FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM—AGENCY JURISDICTION .....	187
1. Collateral Attacks on Jurisdiction.....	190
2. Executive Agencies .....	190
3. Legislative and Judicial Employees .....	190
4. Employees Working at Other Agency Locations .....	191
5. Office of Personnel Management .....	192
6. General Services Administration .....	194
7. Auxiliary Agencies .....	194
8. Military Departments .....	195
9. Presidio Trust.....	198
10. Advisory Councils.....	198

11. Unions .....	198
12. Employee Organizations .....	199
E. FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM: INVESTIGATIONS AND OTHER PROCEEDINGS—COLLATERAL ATTACKS .....	199
1. Office of Inspector General .....	203
2. Office of Workers Compensation Programs .....	203
3. On-The-Job Injuries and Workers' Compensation .....	204
4. Occupational Health and Safety Claims.....	204
5. Debt Collection Act .....	204
F. STANDING: FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM—SPECIFIC ACTIONS .....	204
1. Proposed Actions and Preliminary Steps .....	204
2. Future Actions .....	207
3. Security Clearances .....	207
4. Harassment Investigations .....	207
5. Oral and Written Work Discussions .....	207
6. Failure to Issue Performance Standards.....	208
7. Change in Position Description—Work Duties .....	208
8. Transfers .....	208
9. Discretionary Duties.....	208
10. Privileges of Employment .....	208
11. Compensatory Damages .....	209
12. Refusal to Discriminate .....	209
13. Discriminatory Work Orders .....	210
14. Failure to Discipline .....	210
15. Upward Mobility.....	210
16. Searches.....	210
17. Continuing Vacancies .....	210
18. Collateral Duties .....	210
19. Outside Activities .....	210
20. Union Activities .....	210
21. Training.....	211
22. Mental Evaluations .....	211
23. Medical Suitability Determinations.....	211
24. Drug and Alcohol Tests .....	211
25. EAP Referrals.....	211
26. Testimony and Statements in Proceedings .....	211
27. Disclosures to Counsel .....	212
28. Settlement Negotiations.....	212
29. Whistleblowing .....	213
30. Family and Medical Leave Act Claims .....	213
31. Complaints About Nonsupervisory Employees .....	213
32. Complaints About EEO Complaints.....	213
33. Dismissal on Merits .....	214
34. Failure to Allege Personal Harm.....	214
35. Reliance Upon Other Statutes—Privacy Act and FOIA.....	215
36. Failure to Allege Bases of Discrimination .....	215
37. Forced Leave .....	216
38. Cancelled Vacancy Announcements.....	216
39. Denial of Opportunity to Apply for Position .....	216
40. Letters of Warning.....	216
41. Change in Schedule .....	216
G. STANDING: FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM—HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT.....	216
1. Derogatory Remarks and Hostile Environment .....	216
2. Sexual Harassment .....	221
H. STANDING: FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM—REPRISAL COMPLAINTS .....	222
1. Retaliatory Investigations.....	225
2. Security Clearance Investigations.....	225
I. IDENTICAL COMPLAINTS .....	225
1. Identical Civil Actions .....	227
2. <i>Res Judicata</i> and Collateral Estoppel .....	229
3. Offensive Collateral Estoppel.....	231
4. Dismissal for Failure to Exhaust.....	231



5. Law of the Case Doctrine .....	232
J. PROCESSING DISSATISFACTION OR SPIN-OFF COMPLAINTS .....	232
K. FAILURE TO PROSECUTE OR COOPERATE .....	234
1. Precomplaint Counseling .....	236
2. Requests for Additional Information.....	236
3. Cooperation With Investigators .....	239
4. Inability to Locate Complainant.....	240
5. Settlement Negotiations .....	241
6. Adjudication on Record .....	241
7. Hearings .....	241
8. Delay by Agency .....	241
L. ABUSE OF PROCESS .....	241
1. Unclean Hands Doctrine.....	248
2. Agency Abuse of Process .....	249
3. Agency Conflict of Interest .....	249
M. OFFERS OF FULL RELIEF .....	249
1. Offer of Resolution .....	249
N. MOOTNESS .....	250
1. Relief Through Other Forums .....	251
2. Job Assignments .....	252
3. Cancellation of Vacancy Announcement .....	252
4. Allegations of Harassment.....	252
5. Subsequent Promotions .....	254
6. Constructive Discharge.....	254
7. Termination of Employment.....	254
8. Performance and Other Work Appraisals.....	255
9. Apologies.....	255
10. Discipline of RMO.....	255
11. Reasonable Accommodation .....	255
12. Compensatory Damages .....	255
13. Attorney Fees .....	256
O. MATTERS NOT RAISED WITH COUNSELOR .....	256
1. Matters Raised and Not Included in Formal Complaint .....	257
P. ELECTION OF REMEDIES .....	257
1. Negotiated Grievance Procedure .....	257
2. MSPB Appeals .....	258
Q. EFFECT OF STATUTES AND REGULATIONS .....	259
R. CONTRACTUAL OBLIGATIONS .....	259
S. RELIEF REQUESTED .....	259
IV. AMENDMENT AND CONSOLIDATION OF COMPLAINTS .....	259
A. BASIS OF DISCRIMINATION .....	260
B. SUBSTANTIVE AMENDMENTS .....	260
1. Time Limits .....	262
2. MSPB Appeals.....	262
3. Amendment After Hearing Request.....	262
C. CONSOLIDATION .....	262
1. Time Limits .....	264
2. Amending Consolidated Complaints .....	264
3. Different Complainants.....	264
V. WITHDRAWAL OF COMPLAINTS .....	264

## CHAPTER 4: INVESTIGATION OF COMPLAINTS.....267

I. TRAINING FOR INVESTIGATORS .....	268
II. INVESTIGATIVE PROCEDURES .....	268
A. METHODS OF INVESTIGATION .....	269
B. TIMELINESS .....	270
III. ROLE OF THE INVESTIGATOR .....	270
A. GATHERING INFORMATION .....	271
B. RULES OF EVIDENCE.....	271
1. Characteristics of Evidence.....	271
2. Types of Evidence.....	272

3. Sources of Evidence .....	272
4. Evidence on Remedies .....	272
C. FACILITATING ADR .....	273
D. ROLE OF COMPLAINANT'S REPRESENTATIVE .....	273
IV. DISMISSAL OF ALLEGATIONS .....	273
A. UNCLEAR ALLEGATIONS.....	273
B. PARTIAL DISMISSAL OF CLAIMS .....	274
C. BAD FAITH ALLEGATIONS.....	274
D. <i>PRIMA FACIE</i> CASE .....	274
E. RELIEF GRANTED .....	274
F. PROCEDURAL ISSUES .....	274
G. FAILURE TO GIVE AFFIDAVIT .....	274
V. DEVELOPMENTS DURING INVESTIGATION.....	274
A. EVIDENCE .....	274
B. AMENDMENTS .....	275
C. NEW CLAIMS .....	276
VI. FAILURE TO INVESTIGATE CLAIMS .....	277
A. DIFFERENT BASIS OF DISCRIMINATION .....	277
B. INADEQUATE INVESTIGATIONS .....	277
1. Decisions by Administrative Judges.....	277
2. Final Agency Decisions .....	280
3. Disability Discrimination Claims.....	284
4. Evidence on Remedies .....	285
5. Contract Investigators.....	285
C. <i>EX PARTE</i> INVESTIGATIONS .....	285
VII. INTERVIEW OF WITNESSES .....	285
A. DISCLOSURE OF INFORMATION TO WITNESSES.....	285
B. FAILURE TO INTERVIEW WITNESSES .....	286
C. EMPLOYEE'S RIGHT TO INTERVIEW WITNESSES .....	286
D. RESPONSIBLE MANAGEMENT OFFICIALS .....	286
E. RIGHT TO UNION REPRESENTATION .....	287
VIII. COMPLAINT FILE .....	287
A. EVIDENCE .....	287
1. Rejection of Evidence .....	287
2. Completeness of Record.....	288
B. COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS .....	288
C. REQUIRED DOCUMENTS .....	288
1. Retention of Records .....	288
2. FOIA and Privacy Act Requirements .....	289
IX. COOPERATION OF COMPLAINANT .....	290
A. RIGHT TO IMPARTIAL INVESTIGATION .....	292
B. UNTIMELY INVESTIGATIONS .....	294
C. LOCATION OF INVESTIGATION .....	295
D. SUPPLEMENTAL INVESTIGATIONS .....	295
X. CONSOLIDATION .....	295
XI. OFFICIAL TIME .....	295
A. TRAVEL TIME .....	296
B. TRAVEL EXPENSES .....	296
XII. CONCLUSIONS OF INVESTIGATORS .....	296
A. CREDIBILITY FINDINGS OF INVESTIGATOR.....	296
XIII. NOTICE OF HEARING RIGHTS .....	296
<b>CHAPTER 5: SETTLEMENT OF COMPLAINTS.....</b>	<b>299</b>
I. SETTLEMENT POLICIES .....	299
A. REGULATORY GUIDANCE .....	300
B. CONFIDENTIALITY AND PRIVILEGE .....	300
C. SETTLEMENT REMEDIES .....	301
D. SETTLEMENT REQUIREMENTS .....	302
1. Oral Agreements .....	302
2. Knowing and Voluntary Agreements .....	305
3. Intent of the Parties .....	308

4.	Signature of Agreement .....	310
5.	Consideration .....	315
6.	Responding Management Official.....	315
E.	EFFECT OF SETTLEMENT .....	315
II.	OFFERS OF RESOLUTION .....	316
A.	MODEL LANGUAGE FOR OFFER.....	317
B.	OFFERS OF FULL RELIEF .....	318
III.	INTERPRETATION OF AGREEMENTS .....	318
A.	PLAIN ENGLISH RULE .....	318
1.	Use of Extrinsic Evidence.....	318
B.	INTERPRETING LANGUAGE IN CONTEXT.....	319
C.	CONSTRUING LANGUAGE AGAINST DRAFTER .....	319
D.	WAIVER OF RIGHTS .....	319
1.	ADEA Rights .....	322
E.	VAGUE AGREEMENTS .....	322
F.	SPECIFIC TERMS OF SETTLEMENT.....	323
1.	Apologies .....	323
2.	Terms of Art .....	324
3.	Priority Consideration.....	324
4.	Seniority .....	326
5.	Back Pay .....	326
6.	Lump Sum Payments and Taxes .....	328
7.	Interest.....	328
8.	Reinstatement.....	329
9.	Supervisory Contact.....	329
10.	Performance Appraisals .....	329
11.	Restoration of Benefits.....	329
12.	Fair Treatment.....	330
13.	Transfers; Reassignments .....	330
14.	Telework .....	330
15.	Promotions .....	330
G.	SELECTIVE INTERPRETATION.....	331
H.	EXPUNGEMENT OF RECORDS—"CLEAN PAPER" AGREEMENTS .....	331
1.	Employment References .....	333
I.	TIME LIMITS ON AGREEMENTS .....	335
1.	Duration of Agreement.....	335
2.	Execution of Terms.....	337
J.	ELEMENT OF GOOD FAITH .....	339
1.	Bad Faith Negotiations .....	340
2.	Bad Faith Execution.....	342
K.	INTEGRATION OR ZIPPER CLAUSES .....	343
L.	CONFIDENTIALITY CLAUSES .....	344
1.	Disclosure of Settlements .....	346
2.	Confidentiality of Settlement Process .....	346
M.	SEVERABILITY CLAUSES .....	347
N.	SUPERVISION CLAUSES .....	347
O.	GENERAL RELEASES .....	347
P.	MISREPRESENTATIONS IN THE SETTLEMENT PROCESS .....	348
Q.	COLLECTIVE BARGAINING AGREEMENTS .....	349
R.	AGENCY POLICIES AND PROCEDURES.....	351
IV.	COMPENSATORY DAMAGES .....	352
V.	COMPLIANCE WITH SETTLEMENT AGREEMENTS .....	353
A.	ENFORCEMENT OF AGREEMENTS .....	353
1.	Time Limits .....	354
2.	Invalid Settlement Agreements .....	357
3.	Compliance Through Prior Acts.....	358
4.	Death of Complainant.....	358
5.	Impossibility of Compliance.....	358
6.	Bankruptcy .....	358
7.	Agreements With More Than One Complainant.....	358
8.	Agreements Reached After Decision .....	358

B.	REMEDIES FOR FAILURE OF AGENCY TO COMPLY .....	359
1.	Partial Compliance—Return to <i>Status Quo Ante</i> .....	359
2.	Partial Compliance—Age Discrimination .....	362
3.	Interest as Sanction .....	362
4.	Attorney Fees.....	362
C.	FAILURE OF EMPLOYEE TO COMPLY .....	363
1.	Agency Compliance Petitions.....	363
D.	SETTLEMENTS IN CIVIL ACTIONS .....	363
E.	FILING OF NEW COMPLAINTS.....	363
F.	REPRISAL .....	364
G.	DISCRIMINATORY SETTLEMENT AGREEMENTS .....	365
H.	SUBSEQUENT ACTS .....	367
VI.	VOIDING SETTLEMENT AGREEMENTS .....	367
A.	UNFORESEEN CIRCUMSTANCES .....	367
B.	BAD FAITH .....	368
1.	Coercive Agreements.....	369
2.	Rescinding of Agreement.....	370
C.	ADVICE OF REPRESENTATIVES.....	370
D.	DETRIMENTAL RELIANCE AND RATIFICATION .....	370
E.	LACK OF CONSIDERATION—ILLUSORY AGREEMENTS.....	372
1.	Mutual Mistake of Fact or Law .....	376
F.	WAIVER OF PROSPECTIVE EEO CLAIMS AND LAST CHANCE SETTLEMENTS .....	379
G.	LACK OF REPRESENTATIVE AUTHORITY .....	381
H.	OLDER WORKERS' BENEFIT PROTECTION ACT .....	381
1.	Revocation of Agreement .....	389
I.	SUBSEQUENT AGREEMENTS .....	390
VII.	SETTLEMENTS REACHED THROUGH OTHER PROCEDURES .....	390
VIII.	RETIREMENT ISSUES .....	391
IX.	ATTORNEY FEE ISSUES .....	393
A.	FAILURE TO MENTION FEE ISSUE .....	393
B.	SEVERANCE OF FEE ISSUES .....	393
1.	Fee Determination by Judge.....	394
C.	DETERMINING REASONABLE FEES .....	394

## CHAPTER 6: EEO HEARINGS.....395

I.	PREHEARING MATTERS .....	396
A.	POWERS OF THE ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE.....	396
1.	Administrative Judges' Handbook .....	399
2.	Subpoenas .....	399
3.	Contract Administrative Judges .....	399
B.	RIGHT TO HEARING .....	399
1.	Request for Hearing .....	400
2.	Service of Hearing Request .....	403
3.	Effect of Hearing Request.....	403
4.	Withdrawal of Request for Hearing .....	403
5.	Waiver of Hearing.....	404
6.	Failure to Attend Hearing .....	404
C.	AGENCY'S HEARING RESPONSIBILITIES .....	405
D.	RIGHT TO NEUTRAL ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE .....	405
E.	VENUE .....	406
F.	REVIEW OF REPORT OF INVESTIGATION .....	407
1.	Sanctions for Nonhearing-Related Conduct .....	408
G.	DISMISSAL OF COMPLAINTS.....	410
1.	Review of Partial Dismissals.....	410
H.	PREHEARING ORDERS .....	410
1.	Docketing Order .....	410
2.	Acknowledgment and Order .....	411
3.	Scheduling Order .....	411
4.	Prehearing Conference .....	411
I.	WITNESS LISTS .....	412
1.	Unavailability of Witnesses .....	412

J.	SCHEDULING OF HEARING .....	412
1.	Notice of Remand .....	413
2.	Convenience to Parties .....	414
3.	Hearing Notice .....	414
K.	BIFURCATED DAMAGES HEARINGS .....	414
L.	POSTPONEMENT OR CONTINUANCE OF HEARING .....	414
M.	SETTLEMENT .....	416
1.	Conferences With Hearing Judge.....	416
2.	Conferences With Settlement Judge.....	416
3.	Alternative Dispute Resolution .....	417
4.	Settlement Agreements.....	417
N.	OFFERS OF FULL RELIEF .....	417
1.	Test for Full Relief.....	418
2.	Writing Requirement .....	419
3.	Time Limits .....	419
4.	<i>Poirrier</i> Settlements .....	419
5.	Final Action.....	420
6.	Elements of Full Relief .....	420
7.	Compensatory Damages .....	420
8.	Unconditional Relief.....	420
9.	Reinstatement.....	421
10.	Back Pay.....	421
11.	Interest .....	421
12.	Performance Ratings.....	421
13.	Reassignments .....	421
14.	Training.....	421
15.	Denial of Leave.....	421
16.	Retirement Issues.....	421
17.	Damage to Reputation.....	421
18.	Harassment.....	422
19.	Relief Through Other Procedures.....	422
20.	Admission of Discrimination.....	422
21.	Enforcement of Offers .....	422
O.	STIPULATIONS .....	422
P.	AGENCY REPRESENTATIVES .....	423
Q.	SPIN-OFF COMPLAINTS .....	423
R.	AMENDMENT AND CONSOLIDATION OF COMPLAINTS .....	423
1.	Amendments.....	423
2.	Consolidation .....	425
S.	DEFINITION OF CLAIMS .....	425
T.	RULINGS OF ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE .....	425
1.	Nondispositive Rulings .....	425
2.	Motion Practice.....	425
3.	Motion to Reconsider .....	425
II.	SUMMARY JUDGMENT .....	426
A.	SUMMARY JUDGMENT STANDARDS.....	427
1.	Appellate Standards .....	429
B.	SUMMARY JUDGMENT PROCEDURES.....	429
1.	<i>Sua Sponte</i> Summary Judgment.....	429
2.	Motion by Party .....	430
3.	Oral Argument.....	431
4.	Failure to Respond to Motion .....	431
5.	Pending Discovery Issues.....	432
C.	DISPUTES OF MATERIAL FACT .....	432
D.	JUDGMENT AS A MATTER OF LAW .....	437
E.	PARTIAL SUMMARY JUDGMENT .....	437
III.	DISCOVERY .....	438
A.	DISCOVERY SCOPE AND PROCEDURES .....	438
1.	Time Period Covered by Discovery .....	440
B.	DISCOVERY DEVICES .....	441
1.	Interrogatories .....	441

2.	Production of Documents .....	441
3.	Depositions .....	442
4.	Requests for Admissions .....	443
5.	Medical Examinations .....	444
6.	Restrictions on Medical Records.....	445
7.	Restrictions on Tax Records .....	445
8.	Commission Guidance on Discovery .....	445
9.	Discovery Costs.....	447
C.	OBLIGATION TO PRODUCE EVIDENCE .....	447
1.	Privacy Act Objections .....	448
2.	<i>In Camera</i> Review .....	448
3.	Tax Returns .....	448
4.	Protective Orders .....	449
5.	<i>Pro Se</i> Complainants.....	450
D.	MOTIONS TO COMPEL DISCOVERY .....	450
E.	DISCOVERY SANCTIONS .....	450
1.	Justice Memo Halting Fees as Sanctions .....	452
2.	Reinstatement of Fees as Sanctions .....	455
3.	Good Faith Obligation.....	456
4.	Sanctions Against Complainants .....	457
5.	Sanction Procedures .....	459
6.	Sanction Orders .....	459
F.	PSYCHOTHERAPIST PRIVILEGE .....	460
IV.	HEARING PROCEDURES .....	462
A.	PRELIMINARY HEARING MATTERS .....	463
1.	Persons Allowed at Hearing .....	463
2.	Off-The-Record Discussions.....	463
3.	Presentation of Evidence.....	463
4.	Reasonable Accommodation of Complainant and Witnesses.....	463
5.	Introductory and Opening Statements .....	463
B.	EVIDENCE .....	463
1.	Relevancy .....	463
2.	Unduly Repetitious Evidence .....	464
3.	Hearsay Evidence .....	464
4.	Documentary Evidence .....	464
5.	Use of "Private" Documents .....	465
6.	Best Evidence.....	465
7.	Destruction of Evidence .....	465
8.	Failure to Produce Evidence .....	468
C.	WITNESSES .....	469
1.	Designation of Witnesses.....	470
2.	Exclusion of Witnesses .....	470
3.	Exclusion of Complainant .....	472
4.	Alternative Means of Testimony .....	472
5.	Telephonic Hearings and Testimony .....	473
6.	Video Hearings and Testimony.....	476
7.	Presence of Complainant .....	477
8.	Representations of Counsel .....	477
9.	Statement During Settlement .....	477
10.	Witness Intimidation .....	477
11.	Failure to Produce Witness .....	477
12.	EEO Counselors .....	479
D.	CREDIBILITY DETERMINATIONS .....	479
1.	Rules of Deference .....	480
2.	Demeanor .....	481
3.	Findings Related to Motivation.....	482
4.	Split Credibility Findings.....	482
5.	Self-Serving Testimony.....	482
6.	Relationship of Parties.....	482
7.	Leading Questions .....	483
8.	Plausibility of Testimony.....	483

9. Internally Inconsistent Testimony .....	483
10. Findings Based on Evidence of Record .....	484
11. Testimony and Findings in Other Proceedings .....	484
12. Corroboration Evidence .....	484
13. Impeachment Evidence .....	484
14. Findings Based on Assumptions.....	485
15. Refusal to Testify.....	485
16. Previous Credibility Findings .....	485
17. Scripted Testimony .....	485
18. Qualifications of Witness .....	486
19. Appeal of Credibility Findings .....	486
20. Credibility vs. Veracity.....	486
E. ALLEGATIONS RAISED AT HEARING .....	487
F. OBJECTIONS .....	487
G. OFFICIAL TIME .....	487
H. ROLE OF JUDGE .....	487
1. Regulating Conduct of Hearing .....	488
2. Developing the Record .....	488
3. Amended Complaints .....	489
I. RESPONSIBLE MANAGEMENT OFFICIAL .....	489
J. RECORD OF HEARING .....	490
K. CLOSING STATEMENTS .....	490
L. CONDUCT OF REPRESENTATIVES .....	490
1. <i>Ex Parte</i> Communications .....	490
M. CLOSING THE HEARING RECORD.....	491
V. POSTHEARING MATTERS.....	491
A. DECISIONS OF ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE .....	491
1. Contents of Decision.....	491
2. Bench Decisions .....	492
3. Adopting Position of Parties .....	492
4. Delay in Decisions.....	492
5. Errata Decisions .....	492
6. Default Judgments .....	492
7. Directed Verdict.....	493
8. Decision by Judge Not Presiding.....	493
9. External Evidence.....	494
10. Relief .....	494
B. BIAS .....	494

## CHAPTER 7: FINAL AGENCY ACTION .....497

I. FINAL AGENCY ORDER AFTER HEARING .....	498
A. TIME LIMITS.....	498
B. PROCEDURAL ISSUES .....	499
II. FINAL AGENCY DECISION WITHOUT HEARING .....	499
A. COMPLAINANT’S CONSIDERATIONS.....	500
B. CONTENTS OF FINAL DECISION .....	501
1. Credibility Findings.....	501
C. ADOPTING FINDINGS OF INVESTIGATOR .....	502
D. REASONS ARTICULATED .....	502
E. DECIDING OFFICIAL .....	502
F. RESCINDING FINAL AGENCY DECISION .....	503
1. Draft Decisions.....	504
G. ADJUDICATION IN LIEU OF DISMISSAL .....	504
III. REQUIREMENTS OF FINAL AGENCY ACTION .....	504
A. APPEAL RIGHTS .....	505
1. Partial Dismissals .....	505
2. Failure to Issue Final Agency Action.....	505
B. ATTORNEY FEES .....	506
IV. FILING OF CIVIL ACTION .....	507
V. ENFORCEMENT OF FINAL AGENCY DECISIONS .....	508

# CHAPTER 8: EEOC APPEALS.....509

I.	APPEALABLE ACTIONS .....	509
A.	FINAL AGENCY ACTIONS .....	509
1.	Failure to Issue Final Agency Action.....	510
B.	FINAL AGENCY DECISIONS .....	510
1.	Failure to Issue Final Agency Decision.....	511
C.	MSPB AND NEGOTIATED GRIEVANCE DECISIONS .....	511
II.	PROCEDURES FOR APPEAL—COMPLAINANTS .....	511
A.	TIME LIMITS .....	512
1.	Dismissal by Administrative Judge .....	512
2.	Computation of Time .....	513
3.	Decisions Amended by Administrative Judge .....	514
4.	Waiver of Time Limit .....	514
5.	Filing With Wrong Agency .....	515
6.	Filing by Telephone .....	516
B.	SERVICE OF DOCUMENTS .....	516
III.	PROCEDURES FOR APPEAL—AGENCIES .....	517
A.	TIME LIMITS .....	517
B.	SERVICE OF DOCUMENTS.....	518
C.	INTERIM RELIEF.....	518
D.	BRIEF IN SUPPORT OF APPEAL .....	518
IV.	RECORD ON APPEAL .....	518
A.	COMPLAINT FILE .....	519
B.	IDENTIFICATION OF PARTIES.....	520
C.	SUPPLEMENTATION OF RECORD .....	520
1.	New Evidence .....	520
D.	SUBMISSION OF EVIDENCE .....	521
E.	DISMISSED CLAIMS .....	521
V.	SCOPE OF REVIEW.....	522
A.	JURISDICTIONAL ISSUES .....	522
B.	PRESERVING ISSUES FOR APPEAL .....	522
1.	Withdrawal of Hearing Request.....	522
2.	Agency Implementation of Decision.....	522
C.	HARMLESS ERROR .....	522
D.	SELF-CORRECTION OF ERROR.....	522
1.	Effect of Other Cases.....	522
E.	MULTIPLE CLAIMS.....	523
F.	NEW CLAIMS .....	523
1.	Claims Not Raised by Parties .....	523
G.	CONSOLIDATION OF APPEALS .....	523
VI.	STANDARDS OF REVIEW .....	523
A.	ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE DECISIONS .....	524
1.	Summary Judgment .....	524
2.	Witness Credibility .....	525
3.	Burdens of Persuasion .....	526
4.	Prehearing and Hearing Rulings.....	526
5.	Basis of Discrimination .....	526
6.	Factual Errors .....	526
7.	Attorney Fee Awards .....	526
B.	FINAL AGENCY DECISIONS .....	526
1.	Credibility Determinations .....	526
C.	PROCESSING COMPLAINTS .....	527
D.	PRO SE COMPLAINANTS.....	527
E.	SHORT-FORM DECISIONS.....	527
F.	PRECEDENTIAL VALUE OF EEOC DECISIONS .....	528
G.	PRECEDENTIAL VALUE OF DECISIONS BY OTHER AGENCIES.....	528
H.	INTERPRETATION OF COURT DECISIONS .....	528
VII.	REVIEW OF SANCTIONS .....	529
A.	SANCTIONS AGAINST AGENCIES .....	531
1.	Failure to Timely Complete Investigation.....	531
2.	Failure to Produce or Destruction of Documents.....	532



3. Failure to Produce or Destruction of Supervisory Notes .....	535
4. Failure to Produce Witnesses .....	536
5. Failure to Respond to Judge's Orders.....	537
6. Failure to Produce File on Appeal.....	539
7. Default Judgments .....	540
B. ATTORNEY FEES AS SANCTIONS .....	550
1. Fees as Sanctions Under ADEA.....	551
2. Appointment of Attorney as Sanction .....	552
C. SANCTIONS AGAINST COMPLAINANTS .....	552
1. Threatening Conduct.....	558
D. SANCTIONS AT APPELLATE LEVEL .....	558
1. Sanctions on Procedural Dismissals .....	561
E. EFFECT OF DISMISSAL ON SANCTIONS.....	561
VIII. COMPLIANCE AND ENFORCEMENT .....	561
A. ENFORCEMENT OF COMMISSION DECISIONS .....	562
1. Remands.....	567
IX. FILING OF CIVIL ACTION .....	567
A. EFFECT OF FILING.....	567
B. TIME FOR FILING.....	567
X. REQUESTS FOR RECONSIDERATION .....	568
A. PROCEDURES AND TIME LIMITS .....	568
B. EFFECT OF REQUEST .....	569
C. CRITERIA FOR RECONSIDERATION .....	569
1. Clearly Erroneous Interpretation .....	570
2. Substantial Impact.....	570
3. New and Material Evidence .....	571
4. Inconsequential Factual Error.....	572
5. Commission's Own Motion.....	572
XI. REQUESTS FOR CLARIFICATION .....	572
A. REQUESTS FOR ENFORCEMENT .....	572
XII. APPEAL OF EEOC DECISIONS .....	573
A. DELAY IN EEOC DECISIONS.....	573

## CHAPTER 9: REPRESENTATIVES AND OFFICIAL TIME .....575

I. RIGHT TO REPRESENTATION .....	575
II. AGENCY REPRESENTATIVES .....	575
A. ROLE OF AGENCY REPRESENTATIVE.....	575
1. Definition of Agency Representative.....	575
2. Role During Agency Processing of Complaint.....	575
3. Attorney-Client Relationship .....	578
B. SCOPE OF REPRESENTATION .....	578
C. EEOC RESTRICTIONS ON AGENCY REPRESENTATIVES .....	578
D. FLRA RESTRICTIONS ON AGENCY REPRESENTATIVES .....	579
1. Disciplinary Meetings.....	579
2. Formal Meetings.....	580
III. COMPLAINANTS' REPRESENTATIVES.....	583
A. SCOPE OF REPRESENTATION .....	583
B. DESIGNATION OF REPRESENTATIVE .....	583
C. SERVICE OF DOCUMENTS .....	584
D. UNION REPRESENTATIVES .....	584
E. WITHDRAWAL FROM REPRESENTATION .....	584
F. COMPLAINTS BY REPRESENTATIVES .....	584
IV. EXCLUSION, DISQUALIFICATION, AND LIMITATIONS ON REPRESENTATIVES .....	585
A. CONFLICTS OF INTEREST .....	585
1. Official Time Restrictions .....	586
B. EXCLUSION OF REPRESENTATIVES .....	586
1. Exclusion Procedure.....	586
2. Authority for Exclusion.....	587
3. Standards for Exclusion.....	587
4. Exclusion through Settlement.....	588
C. DISQUALIFICATION AND SUSPENSION .....	588

1.	Procedure for Disqualification and Suspension .....	588
2.	Standard for Disqualification and Suspension .....	589
3.	Referral to Bar .....	591
D.	USE OF SANCTIONS .....	591
V.	USE OF OFFICIAL TIME .....	592
A.	OFFICIAL TIME COMPLAINTS .....	592
B.	DEFINITION OF REASONABLE TIME .....	593
1.	Consultations With Representative .....	594
2.	EEO Counseling .....	594
3.	EEO Meetings.....	594
4.	EEOC Settlement Conferences .....	595
5.	Preparation Time .....	595
6.	Soliciting Evidence on Agency Time .....	595
7.	Official Time Policies.....	595
8.	Official Time Requests and Denials .....	595
9.	Duty Status of Employee .....	596
10.	Civil Actions .....	596
C.	REPRESENTATIVES AND OFFICIAL TIME .....	596
1.	Restrictions on Representatives' Time .....	596
2.	Official Time Complaints .....	597
3.	Representation of Applicants for Employment .....	599
4.	Representation of Former Employees .....	599
D.	TECHNICAL REPRESENTATIVES .....	599
E.	COMPENSATION AND BENEFIT ISSUES.....	600
1.	Overtime .....	600
2.	Restoration of Time.....	600
3.	Payment of Costs .....	600
VI.	USE OF AGENCY EQUIPMENT AND RESOURCES .....	601
VII.	PROCESSING OFFICIAL TIME COMPLAINTS .....	601

## CHAPTER 10: THEORIES OF DISCRIMINATION— INTENTIONAL DISCRIMINATION.....603

I.	CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE CASES .....	604
A.	EVOLUTION OF “DISPARATE TREATMENT” THEORY .....	604
1.	Elements of <i>Prima Facie</i> Case .....	606
2.	Penalties .....	608
3.	Effect of Regulations and Policies .....	608
4.	Discretionary Acts .....	608
5.	Performance Expectations .....	608
B.	BASIS FOR DISPARATE TREATMENT .....	609
1.	Comparison Employees .....	610
2.	No Comparison Employees .....	614
3.	Subjective Criteria .....	616
4.	Accuracy of Beliefs.....	616
C.	APPLICATION FOR POSITION .....	617
1.	Cancellation of Position .....	617
2.	Constructive Application.....	617
3.	Multiple Vacancies .....	617
D.	QUALIFICATION FOR POSITION .....	617
E.	ALLEGED DISCRIMINATING OFFICIALS.....	617
F.	ELEMENT OF INTENT .....	617
1.	Knowledge of Protected Group .....	619
2.	Genuine Mistakes.....	620
3.	Intent of Third Parties .....	622
G.	DISCRIMINATORY INFLUENCE OF OTHERS—THE “CAT’S PAW” .....	623
H.	DIRECT EVIDENCE OF DISCRIMINATION .....	627
II.	AGENCY BURDEN OF PRODUCTION—CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE.....	627
A.	DISPARATE TREATMENT .....	628
1.	Similarly Situated Employees; Meaningful Distinctions .....	630
2.	Probationary Employees .....	632

3. Training .....	632
4. Leave Restrictions .....	633
5. Work Habits .....	633
6. Nonselections and Promotions .....	633
7. Past Discipline .....	635
8. Experience .....	635
9. <i>Post Hoc</i> Justifications.....	635
10. Best Interests of Agency .....	636
11. Natural Consequences of Discriminatory Acts .....	636
12. Mandatory Sanctions .....	637
13. Failure of Agency to Cooperate .....	637
14. Failure of Agency to Provide Reasons .....	637
B. WITNESS CREDIBILITY .....	639
C. AFFIRMATIVE ACTION PLANS .....	639
D. AVOIDING ADVERSE IMPACT LITIGATION.....	641
E. RELIANCE ON AGENCY REGULATIONS .....	642
F. RELIANCE ON COLLECTIVE BARGAINING AGREEMENT .....	642
G. RELIANCE ON STATE LAW .....	643
H. CORRECTING DISCRIMINATION BY NONSUPERVISORY PERSONNEL .....	643
III. PRETEXT—CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE CASES .....	643
A. <i>HICKS</i> AND THE BURDEN OF PERSUASION .....	643
1. Commission Interpretation of <i>Hicks</i> .....	647
2. Agency’s Burden Under <i>Hicks</i> .....	651
3. Proof of Intent Under <i>Hicks</i> .....	651
4. <i>Hicks</i> in Jury Cases.....	654
5. Case Law Prior to <i>Hicks</i> .....	654
B. CAUSAL CONNECTION .....	655
1. Disciplinary Cases .....	655
2. Zero Tolerance Policies.....	656
3. Hiring Freezes .....	657
4. Light Duty .....	657
5. Preselection .....	657
6. Nonselection .....	658
7. Training .....	660
8. Qualifications .....	660
9. Test Results .....	660
10. Inadequate Resources .....	661
11. Work Environment .....	661
12. Receipt of Unemployment Compensation .....	661
C. PRIOR DISCRIMINATION .....	661
D. STATISTICAL EVIDENCE .....	661
E. PROCEDURAL IRREGULARITIES .....	662
F. COLLECTIVE BARGAINING AGREEMENTS .....	663
G. DEROGATORY COMMENTS .....	663
H. EVIDENCE OF BIAS .....	665
1. Past Statements and Actions .....	665
2. “Me Too” Evidence.....	666
I. TIMING OF AGENCY ACTION.....	666
J. CROSS EXAMINATION .....	667
1. Inconsistent Statements .....	667
K. EQUITABLE AND COLLATERAL ESTOPPEL.....	667
L. COURT ORDERS .....	668
M. ALTERNATIVE, NONDISCRIMINATORY REASONS .....	668
IV. DIRECT EVIDENCE AND “MIXED MOTIVE” CASES .....	668
A. THE <i>PRICE WATERHOUSE</i> ANALYSIS .....	669
B. CIVIL RIGHTS ACT OF 1991 .....	674
1. ADEA .....	675
C. <i>DESERT PALACE</i> , CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE AND THE MIXED-MOTIVE ANALYSIS .....	675
D. DEFINING DIRECT EVIDENCE .....	677
E. MIXED MOTIVES IN HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT CASES .....	681
F. REBUTTING MIXED MOTIVE EVIDENCE .....	682

V. LIMITATIONS ON LIABILITY .....	685
A. AFTER-ACQUIRED EVIDENCE DOCTRINE .....	685
B. STANDARD OF PROOF .....	689
C. THE “CLEAR AND CONVINCING” STANDARD .....	690

## CHAPTER 11: THEORIES OF DISCRIMINATION—ADVERSE IMPACT.....693

I. THE <i>GRIGGS</i> CASE .....	693
II. THE <i>WARDS COVE</i> CASE .....	694
III. THE CIVIL RIGHTS ACT OF 1991 .....	696
A. <i>PRIMA FACIE</i> CASE .....	697
1. Agency’s Investigatory Burden .....	698
B. AGENCY’S BURDEN—BUSINESS NECESSITY .....	698
1. Criminal Arrests .....	698
C. ALTERNATIVE METHODS .....	699
D. SUBJECTIVE SELECTION PRACTICES .....	699
E. STATUTE OF LIMITATIONS .....	699
F. AGE DISCRIMINATION IN EMPLOYMENT ACT .....	700
IV. UNIFORM GUIDELINES ON EMPLOYEE SELECTION PROCEDURES .....	700
A. “BOTTOM LINE” CONCEPT .....	700
B. VALIDITY STUDIES .....	703
C. SUITABLE ALTERNATIVES .....	703
1. Affirmative Action .....	703
V. AFFIRMATIVE ACTION PROGRAMS .....	703
A. RECRUITMENT .....	705
1. Responsibilities of OPM .....	705
2. Responsibilities of Agencies .....	705
B. SELECTION AND ADVANCEMENT .....	705
1. Conditions for Affirmative Action .....	706
2. Establishing Affirmative Action Plans .....	706
3. Effects of Adopting a Plan .....	706
4. Using Plan as Affirmative Defense .....	707
5. Training Programs .....	707
C. VIOLATIONS OF AFFIRMATIVE ACTION PLANS .....	707
1. Court Orders and Consent Decrees .....	707
2. Special Emphasis Programs .....	707

## CHAPTER 12: THEORIES OF DISCRIMINATION— HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT.....709

I. TANGIBLE EMPLOYMENT ACTION: SEXUAL HARASSMENT .....	711
A. DEFINITIONS .....	711
1. Tangible Employment Action .....	711
2. Supervisors .....	712
3. Link With Hostile Environment .....	714
4. Tangible Employment Actions on Bases Other Than Sex .....	714
B. ELEMENTS OF A CLAIM .....	715
1. <i>Prima Facie</i> Case .....	715
2. Tangible Employment Actions .....	715
3. Unwelcome Advances .....	715
4. Preferential Treatment for Submission to Advances .....	715
5. Threats of Tangible Employment Actions .....	717
6. Knowledge of Agency .....	718
7. Causal Connection With Gender .....	718
8. Reprisal .....	719
9. Violent Responses to Harassment .....	719
II. HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT SEXUAL HARASSMENT .....	720
A. <i>MERITOR</i> AND <i>HARRIS</i> .....	721
B. BURDENS OF PROOF .....	722
1. “ <i>Prima Facie</i> ” Case .....	722
2. Agency’s Burden .....	723
C. NATURE OF CONDUCT—PROTECTED BASIS .....	724

1. Gender-Based Harassment .....	726
2. Sexual Conduct .....	728
D. UNWELCOME ADVANCES .....	733
1. Consensual Conduct .....	737
2. Harassment of Manager by Subordinate.....	738
E. SEVERE AND PERVASIVE REQUIREMENT .....	738
1. “Reasonable Person” vs. “Reasonable Woman” .....	739
2. Severity and Frequency of Conduct—Sliding Scale .....	740
3. Severity .....	741
4. Isolated or One-Time Incidents .....	741
5. Repeated Incidents.....	743
6. Passage of Time Between Incidents .....	744
7. Low-Level Harassment .....	745
8. Context in Which the Alleged Harassment Occurred .....	746
9. Trivial or Inconsequential Conduct—Sexual Harassment.....	747
10. Work Performance and the “Hostility” Requirement .....	747
11. Continuous Conduct or Presence of Harasser .....	748
12. Physical Contact or Conduct .....	748
13. Offensive Looks.....	750
14. Sexual Innuendo.....	751
15. Physical Proximity .....	751
16. Increased Work Scrutiny and Assignments.....	751
17. Nature of Work .....	751
18. Conduct Directed Toward Others.....	752
19. Psychological Harm .....	753
20. Subjective Test.....	755
21. Use of Tangible Employment Actions .....	756
22. Corroborative Evidence and Demeanor Evidence .....	757
23. Harassment Outside of the Workplace .....	758
III. SEX OF PERPETRATOR AND VICTIM .....	760
A. HARASSMENT OF MALE EMPLOYEES .....	760
1. Environment Hostile Toward Females .....	762
2. Complaints by Alleged Harasser.....	764
B. SAME-SEX HARASSMENT AND <i>ONCALE</i> .....	764
1. Sexual Orientation and Gender Stereotyping .....	766
2. Sexual Orientation Cases—Current State .....	773
3. Gender Identification Cases—Current Status .....	777
4. Gender Identification—Bathroom Usage .....	782
5. Gender Identification and the Courts.....	783
6. Prohibited Personnel Practice .....	783
7. Office of Special Counsel.....	784
C. HARASSMENT OF BOTH SEXES .....	784
IV. OVERVIEW OF LIABILITY FOR HARASSMENT .....	786
A. THE RULES OF AGENCY: THE MASTER-SERVANT RELATIONSHIP .....	787
B. BASIC RULES OF LIABILITY .....	787
C. TANGIBLE EMPLOYMENT ACTION HARASSMENT .....	788
1. Supervisors .....	788
2. Supervisors Who Lack Authority.....	788
D. HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT HARASSMENT—SUPERVISORS .....	789
1. Definition of Supervisor.....	790
2. Knowledge of Agency .....	795
3. Reasonable Care and the Affirmative Defense .....	795
4. Harassment Policies .....	799
5. Failure to Avoid Harm .....	799
6. Harassment of Detailed Employees.....	801
7. Prompt Remedial Action .....	801
8. “Alter Ego” Theory.....	802
9. Harassment of Manager by Subordinate.....	802
E. HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT HARASSMENT—COWORKERS.....	802
1. Knowledge of Agency .....	802
2. Agency’s Duty to Investigate .....	804

3. Failure to Cooperate in Investigation.....	806
F. HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT HARASSMENT—SUPERVISORS AND COWORKERS .....	806
1. Prompt and Effective Corrective Action.....	806
2. Restoration of Employee Benefits.....	822
3. Duty to Make Follow-Up Inquiries .....	823
4. Past Harassment by Perpetrator .....	823
5. Cessation of Conduct .....	823
G. SUMMARY JUDGMENT .....	825
H. DISCIPLINE OF RMO .....	825
1. Harassers’ Claims Over Discipline .....	826
I. AGENCY-WIDE CORRECTIVE MEASURES .....	827
J. HARASSMENT BY THIRD PARTIES .....	828
1. Employee Organizations .....	829
K. CONSTRUCTIVE ADVERSE ACTIONS .....	829
L. MOOTNESS .....	831
V. PROOF PROBLEMS .....	831
VI. OTHER BASES OF HARASSMENT .....	832
A. PROPOSED PART 1609.....	832
B. HARASSMENT BASED ON RELIGION .....	835
1. Tangible Employment Actions .....	836
2. Hostile Work Environment.....	836
C. HARASSMENT BASED ON RACE .....	840
1. Tangible Employment Actions .....	840
2. Hostile Environment—Racial Slurs .....	840
3. Hostile Environment—One-Time Incidents .....	844
4. Hostile Environment—Repeated Incidents.....	845
5. Hostile Environment—Incidents Occurring Outside of the Complainant’s Presence.....	845
6. Hostile Environment—Increased Work Scrutiny and Assignments.....	845
7. Same Race Harassment.....	845
8. Racist Symbols.....	845
9. Hostile Environment—Conduct Directed Toward Others.....	849
10. Hostile Environment—Subjective Test.....	850
D. ETHNIC HARASSMENT AND SLURS .....	850
E. HARASSMENT BASED ON DISABILITIES .....	853
1. Comments Made Outside of the Complainant’s Presence.....	858
2. Increased Scrutiny of Work and Assignments.....	859
F. HARASSMENT BASED ON AGE .....	859
G. HARASSMENT BASED ON REPRISAL .....	860
1. Harassment by Filing Civil Action.....	862

## CHAPTER 13: BASES OF DISCRIMINATION UNDER TITLE VII .....865

I. RACE AND COLOR DISCRIMINATION .....	866
A. THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN RACE AND COLOR .....	866
1. Same Race or Color.....	866
2. Racial Stereotyping .....	866
B. REVERSE DISCRIMINATION .....	867
1. Beneficent Discrimination .....	867
2. Remedial Discrimination .....	868
C. MARITAL STATUS AND OTHER ASSOCIATIONS .....	868
D. SICKLE CELL ANEMIA .....	868
E. CRIMINAL ARRESTS AND CONVICTIONS .....	868
F. POLITICAL STATEMENTS .....	871
G. GROOMING CODES .....	871
II. SEX DISCRIMINATION .....	871
A. <i>BONA FIDE</i> OCCUPATIONAL QUALIFICATION .....	872
B. SENIORITY SYSTEMS .....	877
C. MARITAL STATUS .....	877
D. TRANSGENDER STATUS .....	877
E. CAREGIVER RESPONSIBILITIES.....	877
F. RECRUITMENT .....	878
G. PREGNANCY DISCRIMINATION ACT .....	878

1.	Burdens of Proof .....	879
2.	Direct Evidence of Pregnancy Discrimination .....	883
3.	Disparate Treatment .....	884
4.	Past and Potential Pregnancy .....	886
5.	Remarks About Pregnancy .....	887
6.	Breast-Feeding .....	888
7.	Abortion and Contraception.....	889
8.	Marital Status .....	889
9.	Leave .....	889
10.	Light Duty .....	890
11.	BFOQ Defense .....	890
H.	GENDER-BASED SUBJECTIVE CRITERIA .....	891
I.	DRESS CODES AND GROOMING STANDARDS .....	891
J.	MEDICAL EXAMS.....	892
K.	COLLECTION OF GENDER INFORMATION.....	893
L.	EQUAL PAY ACT .....	893
1.	Regulatory Guidance .....	893
2.	EPA Analysis and Burdens of Proof .....	893
3.	Relationship to Title VII .....	897
4.	Liquidated Damages .....	897
M.	“SEX PLUS” DISCRIMINATION .....	897
III.	NATIONAL ORIGIN .....	897
A.	CITIZENSHIP .....	898
B.	SECURITY CLEARANCES .....	899
C.	MARITAL STATUS AND OTHER ASSOCIATIONS .....	899
1.	Client and Customer Preferences.....	899
D.	SELECTION PROCEDURES .....	899
1.	Bottom Line Concept .....	900
2.	Height and Weight Requirements .....	900
3.	Education .....	900
E.	LANGUAGE FLUENCY .....	900
1.	Accent Discrimination .....	901
2.	Foreign Languages .....	906
3.	“Speak English Only” Rule and Restrictive Language Policies .....	906
F.	MIXED NATIONALITY .....	912
G.	<i>BONA FIDE</i> OCCUPATIONAL QUALIFICATION .....	912
H.	NATIVE AMERICANS .....	912
IV.	RELIGION .....	913
A.	DEFINITION .....	913
1.	Nature and Sincerity of Belief .....	914
B.	INTENTIONAL DISCRIMINATION CASES.....	915
1.	Discrimination Within Religions.....	915
2.	Failure to Hold Belief .....	915
3.	Espousal of Beliefs .....	915
4.	Clothing and Religious Articles.....	918
5.	Observances on Agency Premises.....	919
6.	Same-Sex Marriage and Communications With LGBT Content.....	919
7.	National Security Interests.....	920
C.	ACCOMMODATION OF BELIEFS .....	920
1.	<i>Prima Facie</i> Case .....	920
2.	Request for Accommodation .....	921
3.	Privacy Act Considerations .....	922
4.	Accuracy of Employee’s Beliefs .....	922
5.	Practices Requiring Accommodation .....	922
6.	Choice of Accommodation.....	923
D.	ACCOMMODATION PROCEDURES AND ANALYSIS .....	923
E.	SPECIFIC ACCOMMODATIONS.....	925
1.	Work Schedules .....	925
2.	Break Schedules.....	927
3.	Teleworking.....	927
4.	Reassignments.....	927

5.	Dress and Grooming Standards .....	928
6.	Prayer and Proselytizing .....	929
7.	Health Effects of Religious Observances .....	930
8.	Personal Effects .....	930
9.	Personal Identification.....	931
10.	Optional Religious Activities .....	932
11.	Probationary Employees .....	933
12.	Cooperation in Agency Investigations.....	933
13.	Drug Rehabilitation Programs .....	933
F.	UNDUE HARDSHIP .....	934
1.	Work Schedules .....	934
2.	Overtime .....	939
3.	Collective Bargaining Agreements .....	939
4.	Selection Schedules .....	941
5.	Preemployment Inquiries .....	941
6.	Sex-Segregated Schools .....	941
7.	Postal Service Oath .....	941
8.	Photographs .....	942
9.	Espousing Religious Ideas .....	942
V.	WHITE HOUSE GUIDELINES ON RELIGION .....	943
A.	EXPRESSION IN WORKPLACE .....	943
1.	Private Work Areas .....	943
2.	Expression Among Employees.....	943
3.	Expression Directed at Employees.....	943
4.	Expression in Public Areas .....	944
B.	DISCRIMINATION BASED ON RELIGION .....	944
1.	Personnel Actions and Employment Conditions.....	944
2.	Hostile Environment .....	944
3.	<i>Bona Fide</i> Occupational Requirement .....	945
C.	RELIGIOUS ACCOMMODATION .....	946
VI.	CIVIL RIGHTS ACT OF 1991 .....	946
A.	PURPOSE OF LEGISLATION .....	946
B.	DISCRIMINATION REMEDIES .....	946
1.	Intentional Discrimination .....	947
2.	Punitive Damages .....	947
3.	Compensatory Damages .....	947
4.	Expert Witness Fees .....	947
5.	Interest on Back Pay Awards .....	947
6.	Retroactivity of Remedies .....	947
7.	Jury Trials .....	951
C.	BURDENS OF PROOF .....	951
1.	Intentional Discrimination Cases.....	951
2.	Disparate or Adverse Impact Cases .....	951
3.	Seniority Systems .....	952
4.	Consent Orders and Decrees .....	952
D.	STATUTE OF LIMITATIONS .....	952
1.	Age Discrimination in Employment Act.....	952
E.	LEGISLATIVE BRANCH EMPLOYEES .....	952
1.	House of Representatives Employees .....	952
2.	U.S. Senate Employees .....	953
VII.	CONGRESSIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY ACT—LEGISLATIVE EMPLOYEES.....	956
A.	EMPLOYEES COVERED.....	956
B.	COVERAGE PROVIDED .....	956
C.	RIGHTS AND REMEDIES .....	956
D.	ATTORNEY FEES.....	956
E.	ENFORCEMENT .....	957
F.	ADMINISTRATIVE AND JUDICIAL PROCEDURES .....	958
1.	Counseling.....	958
2.	Mediation.....	958
G.	ELECTION OF REMEDIES .....	959
1.	Administrative Hearing.....	959



2. Appeals .....	959
3. Judicial Review.....	960
H. CIVIL ACTIONS.....	960

## CHAPTER 14: REHABILITATION ACT AND GINA.....961

I. APPLICATION OF THE ACT .....	963
A. IMPACT OF THE ADA AMENDMENTS ACT OF 2008.....	963
1. Effective Date.....	964
2. ADAAA Regulations.....	964
B. QUALIFIED INDIVIDUALS .....	964
1. Individuals Without Disabilities .....	965
2. Drug and Alcohol Abuse .....	966
C. AGENCIES AND EMPLOYEES COVERED .....	966
1. Legislative and Judicial Employees .....	966
2. Probationary Employees .....	966
3. Temporary Employees.....	967
4. Association With Persons With Disabilities .....	967
5. Disabled Veterans .....	969
D. THEORIES OF DISCRIMINATION .....	969
II. DEFINING QUALIFIED INDIVIDUALS .....	969
A. PHYSICAL AND MENTAL IMPAIRMENTS .....	971
1. Record of Impairment.....	971
2. Regarded as Impairments .....	971
B. MAJOR LIFE ACTIVITIES .....	972
1. <i>Toyota</i> and Major Life Activities .....	973
2. Major Bodily Functions .....	974
3. Working .....	975
C. SUBSTANTIAL LIMITATION UNDER THE ADA .....	975
1. Substantial Limitation: The Commission's Past View.....	975
2. Substantial Limitation and the <i>Sutton</i> Trilogy .....	975
3. <i>Toyota</i> and Substantial Limitation .....	981
D. SUBSTANTIAL LIMITATION UNDER THE ADAAA—RULES OF CONSTRUCTION.....	985
1. Broad and Inclusive Coverage .....	986
2. Most People Comparison .....	986
3. Extensive Analysis Not Required .....	987
4. Individualized Assessment .....	987
5. No Scientific or Medical Evidence Required.....	987
6. Mitigating Medications, Measures and Devices .....	988
7. Episodic Conditions; Conditions in Remission .....	990
8. Limitation of Major Life Activities.....	991
9. Transitory and Minor Impairments .....	992
10. A Common-Sense Approach.....	993
11. Substantial Limitation on Working .....	994
12. Predictable Assessments.....	996
13. Condition, Manner and Duration .....	997
14. Proving Substantial Limitation.....	998
E. CASE LAW ANALYSIS UNDER THE ADAAA .....	999
F. RECORD OF DISABILITIES .....	1001
G. REGARDED AS DISABILITIES.....	1002
1. <i>Nassau County School Board v. Arline</i> .....	1002
2. Regarded as Disabilities and Working .....	1005
3. Regarded as and Other Major Life Activities .....	1010
H. DEMONSTRATION OF QUALIFIED .....	1013
1. Essential Job Functions, Generally .....	1013
2. Nexus Requirement .....	1014
3. Job Attendance—Current Conventions and Past Practice .....	1016
4. Job Attendance—Nexus .....	1018
5. Job Attendance—Essential Functions and Undue Hardship.....	1019
6. Job Attendance—Return to Work Requirement .....	1025
7. Job Attendance—Views of the Courts .....	1025
8. Job Attendance—Shifting Burdens of Proof.....	1026

9. Performance of Essential Job Functions .....	1027
10. How Essential Job Functions Are Performed .....	1029
11. Essential Job Functions and Production Standards.....	1030
12. Essential Job Functions and Position Descriptions.....	1031
13. Essential Job Functions and Performance Ratings .....	1031
14. Removing Essential Job Functions .....	1031
15. Reassignment and Modifying Essential Functions .....	1031
16. Essential Functions and Position Requirements .....	1032
17. Inability to Perform in Current Position .....	1033
18. Reasonable Accommodation .....	1033
19. Effect of Disability Retirement .....	1034
I. KNOWLEDGE OF DISABILITY.....	1034
1. Intentional Discrimination.....	1035
2. Reasonable Accommodation.....	1035
3. Constructive Knowledge.....	1036
J. REQUESTS FOR ACCOMMODATION .....	1038
K. MEDICAL EVIDENCE .....	1040
1. Reasonable Medical Documentation.....	1041
2. Updating Medical Information.....	1044
3. Agency's Burden—Individualized Assessment.....	1045
III. SPECIFIC DISABILITIES .....	1045
A. PHYSICAL DISABILITIES .....	1045
1. Physical Characteristics .....	1045
2. Use of Limbs .....	1045
3. Walking and Standing .....	1045
4. Hearing Loss .....	1045
5. Vision Impairments .....	1046
6. Obesity .....	1047
7. Conditions Affecting Hygiene .....	1047
8. Allergies and Chemical Sensitivities .....	1047
9. Breathing Conditions.....	1048
10. Cardiac Conditions .....	1048
11. Cancer.....	1048
12. Cerebral Palsy .....	1049
13. Sickle Cell Anemia .....	1049
14. Diabetes .....	1049
15. Epilepsy.....	1052
16. Sleep Disorders .....	1052
17. HIV and AIDS .....	1053
18. Lifting Restrictions .....	1055
19. Reproduction .....	1056
20. Pregnancy-Related Disabilities .....	1056
21. Intellectual Disabilities.....	1056
B. DRUG AND ALCOHOL ABUSE .....	1057
1. Statutory Basis.....	1057
2. 1991 Civil Rights Act and ADA .....	1057
3. Evidence of Disability .....	1060
C. MENTAL DISABILITIES .....	1061
1. Physical Effects.....	1061
2. Violent Behavior .....	1061
3. Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder.....	1062
4. Individual Fears .....	1062
5. Depression .....	1063
6. Job-Related Stress .....	1063
7. Thinking and Concentrating .....	1063
8. Learning Disabilities .....	1063
9. Inability to Interact .....	1064
IV. PROCESSING COMPLAINTS UNDER REHABILITATION ACT .....	1064
A. INITIATION OF COMPLAINT .....	1064
1. Requests for Accommodation.....	1064
2. Reasonable Accommodation Analysis.....	1065

3.	Combination With Title VII Bases .....	1066
B.	COMPLAINT STAGE .....	1066
1.	Investigations .....	1066
C.	INTENTIONAL DISCRIMINATION CASES .....	1066
1.	Temporary Appointments .....	1068
2.	Reductions-In-Force .....	1068
3.	Misconduct and Performance Cases .....	1068
4.	Agency-Induced Misconduct .....	1069
5.	Selection and Promotion .....	1070
6.	Reassignments .....	1070
7.	Fear for Safety of Others .....	1070
8.	Requiring Acceptance of Accommodation .....	1070
9.	Overtime .....	1071
10.	Medical Insurance Benefits.....	1071
11.	Alternative Discrimination Theories.....	1073
D.	DISPARATE IMPACT CASES .....	1073
E.	HOSTILE WORK ENVIRONMENT .....	1073
F.	HEARING STAGE.....	1074
V.	HIRING, PLACEMENT AND ADVANCEMENT .....	1074
A.	PREFERENTIAL TREATMENT .....	1075
1.	Affirmative Action Plans and Goals .....	1076
2.	Targeted Disabilities.....	1076
3.	Veterans Preference .....	1076
4.	Executive Order 13163 .....	1076
B.	SCHEDULE A APPOINTMENTS .....	1076
C.	JOB INTERVIEWS .....	1078
1.	Reasonable Accommodation.....	1078
D.	EMPLOYMENT CRITERIA AND QUALIFICATION STANDARDS .....	1078
1.	Requiring a Disability.....	1082
2.	Applicants for Employment.....	1082
3.	Uncorrected Vision Standards .....	1083
4.	Aviation and Transportation Security Act .....	1088
E.	CLASS ACTIONS .....	1090
VI.	MEDICAL INQUIRIES AND EXAMINATIONS .....	1090
A.	PREEMPLOYMENT INQUIRIES .....	1091
1.	OPM Inquiries .....	1095
2.	Conditional Offers of Employment.....	1095
3.	Drug Tests .....	1096
4.	Disabled Veterans.....	1096
5.	Polygraph Examinations.....	1096
6.	Relief for Violations .....	1097
B.	POSTAPPOINTMENT INQUIRIES .....	1099
1.	Fitness-For-Duty Examinations: Performing Essential Functions and Direct Threat .....	1100
2.	Fitness-For-Duty Exams and the MSPB.....	1107
3.	Documentation of Continuing Absence or Accommodation.....	1107
4.	Clearance to Return to Work .....	1108
5.	Requests for Updated Medical Information .....	1109
6.	Medical Inquiries and <i>Giglio</i> .....	1110
7.	Annual Hearing Tests .....	1110
8.	Bid Positions.....	1111
9.	Employee Assistance Programs .....	1111
10.	Disability Retirement .....	1111
C.	MEDICAL DISCLOSURES AND CONFIDENTIALITY OF MEDICAL INFORMATION .....	1111
1.	Disclosure in EEO Investigations.....	1114
2.	Disclosure by Agency Counsel .....	1115
3.	Subpoena of Medical Information .....	1115
D.	CONFIDENTIALITY OF MEDICAL DOCUMENTS .....	1115
VII.	PERFORMANCE AND CONDUCT ISSUES .....	1116
A.	ADOPTING PERFORMANCE AND CONDUCT STANDARDS .....	1117
B.	PERFORMANCE STANDARDS .....	1117
1.	Performance Evaluations.....	1118

C.	CONDUCT STANDARDS .....	1119
1.	Source of Rules .....	1119
2.	Disciplinary Actions.....	1120
D.	DISCUSSION OF DISABILITY .....	1121
VIII.	OVERVIEW OF REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION AND UNDUE HARDSHIP .....	1121
A.	DEFINITION OF REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION .....	1124
1.	Nexus Requirement.....	1124
2.	Acceptance or Rejection of Accommodation .....	1125
3.	Constructive Discharge .....	1125
4.	Balancing Test.....	1126
5.	Presumption of Reasonableness .....	1126
6.	Temporary Accommodations .....	1126
7.	Preference of Employee .....	1127
8.	Good Faith Accommodation Efforts .....	1130
9.	Rights of Other Employees .....	1132
10.	Discipline as Accommodation .....	1132
IX.	DEFENSES TO REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION .....	1132
A.	UNDUE HARDSHIP .....	1132
1.	Proving Undue Hardship .....	1133
B.	“DIRECT THREAT” OR “ELEVATED RISK” DEFENSE .....	1136
1.	Requirements of Direct Threat Defense.....	1138
2.	Direct Threat and Medical Exams and Inquiries.....	1150
3.	Inherently Dangerous Positions.....	1151
X.	PROCESSING REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION REQUESTS .....	1154
A.	KNOWLEDGE OF ACCOMMODATION NEED .....	1155
B.	FORM OF ACCOMMODATION REQUESTS .....	1156
1.	Timing of Request.....	1158
2.	Timing of Submission of Medical Information .....	1159
3.	Failure to Request .....	1159
C.	INDIVIDUALIZED INQUIRIES ON DISABILITIES .....	1159
1.	Reasonable Documentation .....	1160
2.	Health Providers .....	1160
3.	Accuracy of Agency Information.....	1160
4.	Comparative Evidence .....	1160
5.	What Constitutes an Individualized Inquiry .....	1161
D.	IDENTIFYING POSSIBLE ACCOMMODATIONS .....	1161
1.	Failure of Complainant to Cooperate.....	1163
2.	Effect of OWCP Considerations .....	1165
E.	TIMELINESS OF REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION .....	1165
F.	FAILURE TO ENGAGE IN THE INTERACTIVE PROCESS.....	1169
XI.	REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION AND THE FAMILY AND MEDICAL LEAVE ACT.....	1170
XII.	TYPES OF REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION .....	1171
A.	JOB ANALYSIS .....	1171
B.	JOB RESTRUCTURING .....	1172
C.	INTERPRETERS AND READING ASSISTANTS .....	1172
1.	Interpreters and Signers .....	1172
2.	TTY and TDD Devices.....	1178
3.	Management Cooperation in Use of Assistive Devices.....	1178
4.	Reading Assistants.....	1179
D.	PERSONAL EQUIPMENT .....	1180
1.	Assistive Animals .....	1181
2.	Hearing Devices.....	1182
E.	PRIVATE SPACE .....	1182
F.	REQUESTS FOR ASSISTANCE .....	1182
1.	Single-Day Accommodations.....	1182
G.	LEAVE USAGE .....	1182
1.	Leave Offenses .....	1186
2.	Denial of Leave as Retaliation.....	1187
3.	Family and Medical Leave Act .....	1187
4.	Separation for Medical Reasons.....	1188
H.	WORK HOUR MODIFICATIONS .....	1188

1.	Shift Changes and Work Schedules .....	1188
2.	Training .....	1192
3.	Breaks .....	1192
4.	Overtime Assignments .....	1193
I.	WORK LOCATION MODIFICATIONS AND TELEWORKING .....	1193
1.	Teleworking Policies in General .....	1194
2.	Teleworking as an Accommodation .....	1194
3.	Telework Policies .....	1198
4.	Foreign Service Assignments .....	1199
5.	Privacy Accommodations .....	1199
J.	BUILDING AND WORKSPACE ACCOMMODATIONS .....	1200
K.	MOBILITY ACCOMMODATIONS .....	1200
L.	TRANSPORTATION .....	1200
1.	Parking Spaces .....	1202
2.	Travel Requirements .....	1203
3.	Transfer for Medical Treatment .....	1203
M.	TRAINING AS AN ACCOMMODATION .....	1203
N.	ACCOMMODATIONS FOR TRAINING .....	1204
O.	TRAVEL FOR TRAINING .....	1204
P.	BENEFITS AND PRIVILEGES OF EMPLOYMENT .....	1205
Q.	VOLUNTARY DUTIES .....	1205
R.	MEDICAL QUALIFICATIONS .....	1206
1.	Physical Qualifications .....	1206
S.	MENTAL ILLNESS .....	1207
1.	Stress-Related Conditions .....	1207
2.	Resignations and Constructive Discharges .....	1207
3.	Supervisory Changes .....	1209
T.	SMOKE AND FRAGRANCE-FREE ENVIRONMENT .....	1209
U.	PREVENTIVE HEALTH CARE .....	1212
V.	ALCOHOL AND SUBSTANCE DEPENDENCY .....	1212
1.	The MSPB and EEOC—Causal Connection and Punishment .....	1213
2.	Pretreatment Offenses .....	1218
3.	Attendance Problems .....	1219
4.	Relapses .....	1219
5.	Programs With Religious Affiliations .....	1220
W.	DISCRIMINATION IN ACCOMMODATION .....	1220
1.	Changes in Accommodations .....	1221
2.	Employee Assistance Programs .....	1221
X.	AGGRAVATION OF EXISTING CONDITION .....	1221
Y.	COLLECTIVE BARGAINING AGREEMENTS .....	1221
1.	Union Duties .....	1223
Z.	AGENCY REGULATIONS .....	1223
AA.	SETTLEMENT AGREEMENTS .....	1223
BB.	REASSIGNMENT, PROMOTIONS AND DEMOTIONS .....	1223
1.	<i>Ignacio v. USPS</i> .....	1224
2.	Reassignment Under Part 1614 .....	1225
3.	Reassignment Under the ADA .....	1228
4.	Position in Question .....	1233
5.	Accommodation in Reassignment Position .....	1234
6.	Ceiling on Advancement .....	1235
7.	Promotion as Accommodation .....	1235
8.	Reassignment to Previous Position .....	1236
9.	Reassignment to Special Needs Position .....	1236
10.	Job Modification in Lieu of Reassignment .....	1237
11.	Applicants for Employment .....	1239
12.	Probationary Employees .....	1239
13.	Light or Limited Duty .....	1239
14.	Work-Related Injuries .....	1241
15.	Collective Bargaining Agreements .....	1242
16.	Reassignment to Different Supervisor .....	1246
17.	Conditions Attached to Reassignment .....	1246

CC. AFFIRMATIVE ACTION .....	1246
DD. DISABILITY RETIREMENT .....	1247
1. Constructive Discharge.....	1247
EE. WORKERS' COMPENSATION .....	1247
1. Restoration of Employment .....	1249
2. Modified Duty Positions .....	1250
3. OWCP and Reasonable Accommodation.....	1250
FF. SECURITY CLEARANCES .....	1251
GG. REMEDIES .....	1251
HH. BACK PAY .....	1251
1. Resignation or Retirement.....	1251
2. Good Faith Exception to Damages .....	1251
XIII. THE GENETIC INFORMATION NONDISCRIMINATION ACT—OVERVIEW .....	1251
A. GINA-SPECIFIC DEFINITIONS .....	1252
1. Genetic Information Generally.....	1252
2. Genetic Tests.....	1252
3. Genetic Monitoring .....	1252
4. Genetic Services .....	1252
5. Manifested Disease or Disorder .....	1252
B. EMPLOYEES AND AGENCIES COVERED.....	1253
1. Family Members .....	1253
2. Family Medical History .....	1254
C. PROHIBITED EMPLOYMENT PRACTICES .....	1255
1. Employment Actions and Terms of Employment.....	1255
2. Segregating and Classifying Employees.....	1255
3. Retaliation for Protected Activity .....	1255
4. Acquisition of Genetic Information .....	1255
5. Confidentiality of Collected Information.....	1258
D. REMEDIES.....	1259

## CHAPTER 15: AGE DISCRIMINATION IN EMPLOYMENT ACT ..... 1261

I. STRUCTURE OF THE ACT .....	1261
A. PROHIBITED ACTIVITIES .....	1261
1. Reprisal .....	1261
2. Older Workers Benefits Act .....	1264
B. LAWFUL ACTIVITIES .....	1264
1. <i>Bona Fide</i> Occupational Requirements .....	1264
2. Benefit Plans .....	1264
3. Law Enforcement Officers .....	1265
4. Mandatory Retirement Age .....	1266
C. PROCEDURES FOR FILING ADMINISTRATIVE ADEA COMPLAINTS .....	1266
1. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies .....	1266
D. PROCEDURES FOR FILING IN U.S. DISTRICT COURT .....	1267
1. Proper Defendants .....	1267
2. Statute of Limitations .....	1267
3. Part 1614 Statute of Limitations .....	1270
4. Jury Trials .....	1272
II. AGE DISCRIMINATION ANALYSIS .....	1272
A. CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE .....	1272
1. Discrimination Against Persons Under 40 .....	1272
2. Discrimination Within Protected Group .....	1273
3. Reverse Age Discrimination .....	1273
4. Rehired Annuitants.....	1275
5. "Age Plus" Discrimination .....	1275
6. Direct Evidence of Discrimination .....	1275
B. DISPARATE IMPACT .....	1275
1. <i>Bona Fide</i> Occupational Qualification .....	1276
2. Bottom Line Concept .....	1277
3. Preemployment Inquiries .....	1277
4. Experience .....	1277
C. HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT .....	1277

D.	PAY SCALES.....	1277
E.	ACCOMMODATION .....	1277
III.	THE AGENCY’S BURDEN.....	1278
A.	INTENTIONAL DISCRIMINATION .....	1278
1.	Recency of Experience .....	1278
2.	Recency of Education .....	1279
3.	Length of Service.....	1279
4.	Career Goals.....	1279
B.	DISPARATE IMPACT .....	1280
1.	<i>Bona Fide</i> Occupational Qualification .....	1280
2.	Factors Other Than Age .....	1280
3.	Education .....	1280
4.	Recruitment.....	1280
5.	Training.....	1280
6.	Physical Requirements .....	1280
IV.	ESTABLISHING PRETEXT .....	1281
A.	DISCRIMINATORY STATEMENTS .....	1281
B.	ECONOMIC FACTORS .....	1282
C.	AGE AS DETERMINATIVE FACTOR .....	1282
1.	Element of Intent .....	1287
D.	RETIREMENT ELIGIBILITY .....	1287
E.	FORCED RETIREMENT .....	1287
V.	COMPENSATORY AND LIQUIDATED DAMAGES .....	1287
VI.	ATTORNEY FEES .....	1287

## CHAPTER 16: REPRISAL ..... 1289

I.	INITIATING COMPLAINTS OF REPRISAL .....	1290
A.	PROCESSING COMPLAINTS OF REPRISAL .....	1290
1.	Filing Reprisal Complaints.....	1290
2.	Amendment and Consolidation .....	1290
3.	Expedited Complaints of Reprisal .....	1290
4.	Processing Delays .....	1290
5.	Settlement Agreements .....	1290
II.	PROTECTED ACTIVITY—PARTICIPATION CLAUSE .....	1290
A.	EEO COUNSELING .....	1291
B.	EEO EMPLOYEES .....	1292
C.	MANAGEMENT EMPLOYEES .....	1293
D.	WITNESSES .....	1294
E.	REPRESENTATIVES .....	1294
F.	AGENCY REPRESENTATIVES.....	1294
G.	RESPONSIBLE MANAGEMENT OFFICIALS .....	1295
H.	GRIEVANCES .....	1295
I.	MSPB APPEALS .....	1295
J.	SETTLEMENT .....	1295
K.	FITNESS FOR DUTY .....	1295
L.	AFFIRMATIVE ACTION .....	1295
M.	REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION REQUESTS .....	1296
N.	HARASSMENT COMPLAINTS .....	1296
O.	WHISTLEBLOWING .....	1297
P.	ADMINISTRATIVE DECISIONS.....	1297
Q.	WORKERS’ COMPENSATION CLAIMS .....	1297
R.	TAKING CONFIDENTIAL DOCUMENTS.....	1297
1.	Use of Confidential Documents at Hearing.....	1298
S.	DENIAL OF OFFICIAL TIME .....	1298
T.	COMPLAINTS BEYOND EEO PURVIEW.....	1298
U.	COMPLAINTS BY OTHERS—ASSOCIATION COMPLAINTS .....	1298
1.	Participation in Proceedings Involving Others .....	1300
2.	Soliciting Complaints.....	1301
V.	CONTACTS OUTSIDE EEO PROCESS .....	1301
W.	PUBLICATION OF EEO ACTIVITIES.....	1302
III.	PROTECTED ACTIVITY—OPPOSITION CLAUSE .....	1302

A.	BASIS OF OPPOSITION .....	1304
1.	Association With Opponents .....	1304
2.	Discrimination Against Others .....	1304
B.	BALANCING TEST .....	1305
C.	THREATS TO FILE COMPLAINTS .....	1306
1.	Requests to Withdraw Complaint .....	1307
D.	GRIEVANCES .....	1307
E.	INTERNAL HARASSMENT INVESTIGATIONS .....	1307
IV.	PROOF IN REPRISAL CASES .....	1308
A.	NASSAR AND THE "BUT FOR" TEST .....	1309
B.	PRIMA FACIE CASE .....	1313
1.	Good Faith Belief .....	1314
C.	ADVERSE TREATMENT REQUIREMENT .....	1314
1.	The History of the Adverse Treatment Requirement.....	1315
2.	<i>Burlington Northern</i> and Beyond .....	1316
3.	Types of Materially Adverse Actions.....	1319
4.	Proposed Actions and Preliminary Steps.....	1320
5.	Former Employers and Employees .....	1320
6.	Actions by Non-Employers .....	1321
7.	Chilling Effect and the Terms and Conditions of Employment.....	1321
8.	Defamation Actions—Threatened Civil Actions .....	1328
D.	CAUSAL CONNECTION .....	1330
E.	LEGITIMATE REASONS .....	1331
F.	CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE AND PRETEXT .....	1334
1.	Proximity in Time .....	1335
2.	Knowledge Requirement .....	1338
3.	Other Factors .....	1339
4.	Nexus With Personnel Actions.....	1343
G.	DIRECT EVIDENCE OF REPRISAL .....	1344
H.	MIXED MOTIVE CASES.....	1346
I.	STATEMENTS MADE DURING TESTIMONY .....	1347
V.	RESTRAINT AND INTERFERENCE WITH PROCESS: <i>PER SE</i> VIOLATIONS .....	1347

## CHAPTER 17: PERSONNEL ACTIONS..... 1355

I.	DISCIPLINARY ACTIONS .....	1355
A.	PROPOSED DISCIPLINARY ACTIONS .....	1355
1.	Work Discussions .....	1356
2.	Written Work Criticisms.....	1357
3.	Monitoring Work Behavior.....	1358
B.	CONSTRUCTIVE DISCHARGE .....	1358
1.	Competitive Service Employees .....	1363
2.	Agency Bad Faith.....	1364
C.	CONSTRUCTIVE SUSPENSION .....	1364
D.	OTHER CONSTRUCTIVE ACTIONS.....	1364
E.	PROBATIONARY EMPLOYEES .....	1365
F.	CONSISTENCY OF DISCIPLINE .....	1365
1.	Problem Employees.....	1366
2.	Progressive Discipline .....	1366
3.	Supervisory Orders.....	1366
G.	HARASSMENT AS DEFENSE TO DISCIPLINE .....	1366
H.	FITNESS-FOR-DUTY EXAMINATION .....	1366
I.	CRIMINAL OFFENSES .....	1367
1.	Criminal Investigations .....	1367
2.	Non-Criminal Investigations .....	1367
J.	ACTS OCCURRING IN CONTEXT OF PERSONNEL ACTION.....	1367
K.	BASIS OF CHARGE .....	1367
L.	RECORDS OF DISCIPLINARY ACTION .....	1368
II.	PROMOTIONS AND APPOINTMENTS .....	1368
A.	PRIMA FACIE CASE .....	1369
B.	BEST QUALIFIED LISTS .....	1370
1.	Unqualified Candidates .....	1370



2.	Ranking Candidates .....	1371
3.	Failure to Apply for Position .....	1371
4.	Superior Qualifications— <i>Ash v. Tyson Foods</i> .....	1371
C.	SELECTION CRITERIA .....	1373
1.	Subjective vs. Objective .....	1373
2.	Interviews .....	1375
3.	Temporary Appointments .....	1376
4.	Selection Certificates .....	1376
5.	Selection Panels and Recommending Officials .....	1377
6.	Education and Licenses .....	1377
7.	Supervisory Appraisals .....	1377
8.	Past Experience .....	1377
9.	Training .....	1378
10.	EEO Activity .....	1378
11.	Criminal Convictions .....	1378
12.	Failure to Disclose Criteria.....	1379
D.	FAILURE TO FOLLOW PROCEDURES .....	1379
1.	Rule of Three .....	1379
E.	AGENCY'S BURDEN .....	1379
F.	NONCOMPETITIVE SELECTIONS .....	1380
1.	Conversions .....	1380
2.	Accretion of Duties .....	1381
G.	RECOMMENDING OFFICIALS .....	1381
H.	PRESELECTION .....	1381
1.	Unfair Advantages in Selection Process.....	1382
I.	POSTSELECTION PERFORMANCE.....	1383
J.	BIDDING FOR FUTURE VACANCIES .....	1383
K.	RECRUITMENT .....	1383
L.	RESCISSION OF VACANCY ANNOUNCEMENT .....	1383
1.	Priority Referrals .....	1385
2.	Failure to Post Vacancy.....	1385
M.	FALSIFIED APPLICATIONS .....	1385
N.	COMMUNICATION OF DECISION.....	1386
O.	REASONS FOR DECISION .....	1386
III.	PERFORMANCE-BASED ACTIONS .....	1386
A.	<i>PRIMA FACIE</i> CASE .....	1386
1.	Midyear Reviews .....	1387
B.	NOTICE OF POOR PERFORMANCE .....	1387
1.	Documentation of Poor Performance .....	1387
C.	OPPORTUNITY TO IMPROVE .....	1387
D.	SUBJECTIVE APPRAISAL CRITERIA .....	1387
E.	PERFORMANCE EVALUATIONS .....	1388
1.	Past Performance Ratings .....	1388
F.	PERSONNEL ACTIONS BASED ON PERFORMANCE .....	1389
G.	SCRUTINY OF WORK .....	1389
H.	EMPLOYMENT REFERENCES .....	1389
IV.	REDUCTION-IN-FORCE .....	1389
A.	SEVERANCE PAY VS. RETIREMENT ANNUITY.....	1389
B.	PERFORMANCE CREDITS.....	1390
C.	REASSIGNMENTS .....	1390
V.	TERMS AND CONDITIONS OF EMPLOYMENT .....	1390
A.	WORK ENVIRONMENT .....	1390
1.	Smoking Policies .....	1391
B.	USE OF AGENCY FACILITIES .....	1391
C.	WORK HOURS .....	1391
D.	OVERTIME COMPENSATION .....	1391
1.	Assignment of Work Hours .....	1391
E.	DRESS CODES .....	1391
F.	POSITION CLASSIFICATION .....	1392
G.	POSITION TITLES AND WORK DUTIES.....	1392
H.	REORGANIZATIONS .....	1392

- I. DEROGATORY COMMENTS AND ACTIONS ..... 1392
  - 1. Release of Information on Employee ..... 1392
  - 2. FOIA and Privacy Act Requests ..... 1393
- J. LEAVE ..... 1393
- K. HEALTH BENEFITS ..... 1393
- L. COMPLIANCE WITH REGULATIONS ..... 1394
- M. TEMPORARY ASSIGNMENTS ..... 1394
- N. SECURITY CLEARANCES ..... 1394
- O. EMPLOYEE SEARCHES ..... 1400
- P. UNION ACTIVITIES ..... 1400
  - 1. Collective Bargaining Agreements ..... 1400
  - 2. Union Representation ..... 1400
- Q. OUTSIDE CONTRACTS ..... 1400
- R. ACTIVITIES OUTSIDE WORKPLACE..... 1400
- S. GARNISHMENT OF WAGES ..... 1401
- T. DISABILITY RETIREMENT ..... 1401
- U. UNEMPLOYMENT COMPENSATION ..... 1401
- V. WORKERS' COMPENSATION ..... 1401
- W. PARTICIPATION IN EEO PROCESS..... 1402
- X. COMMON WORKPLACE OCCURRENCES..... 1402
- Y. PRE-DECISIONAL ACTIONS..... 1402

## CHAPTER 18: CLASS ACTION COMPLAINTS ..... 1403

- I. FILING A CLASS COMPLAINT ..... 1403
  - A. DEFINITION OF CLASS ..... 1403
  - B. REQUIREMENTS OF A CLASS COMPLAINT ..... 1403
  - C. CLASS COMPLAINT COUNSELING ..... 1404
    - 1. Time Frame for Counseling ..... 1404
    - 2. EEO Counselors ..... 1404
    - 3. Individual Complaints ..... 1404
    - 4. Exception to Mandatory Counseling ..... 1404
    - 5. Notice of Final Interview ..... 1405
  - D. FORMAL COMPLAINT ..... 1405
    - 1. Effect of Filing on Individuals ..... 1405
  - E. ASSIGNMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGE ..... 1406
- II. CERTIFICATION STAGE ..... 1406
  - A. DISMISSAL OF COMPLAINT ..... 1406
    - 1. Lack of Specificity and Detail ..... 1407
    - 2. Dismissal Under 1614.107 ..... 1407
    - 3. Timeliness of Complaint ..... 1407
    - 4. Issues Not Raised in Counseling ..... 1407
    - 5. Identical Complaints ..... 1408
    - 6. Failure to Prosecute ..... 1408
    - 7. Failure to Meet Class Prerequisites ..... 1408
    - 8. Delay in Seeking Certification ..... 1408
    - 9. Settlement Prior to Certification..... 1409
    - 10. Notification of Dismissal ..... 1409
  - B. CLASS PREREQUISITES ..... 1409
    - 1. Numerosity ..... 1410
    - 2. Commonality and Typicality ..... 1411
    - 3. Adequacy of Representation ..... 1421
    - 4. Waiver of Requirements ..... 1423
  - C. EFFECT OF WITHDRAWAL OR DISMISSAL ..... 1423
    - 1. Individual Civil Actions ..... 1424
  - D. ABEYANCE OF INDIVIDUAL COMPLAINTS ..... 1424
  - E. CERTIFICATION DECISION ..... 1424
    - 1. Notification of Acceptance ..... 1424
    - 2. Conditional Certification and Modification of Certification ..... 1425
    - 3. Final Agency Action ..... 1425
    - 4. Opting Out ..... 1425
- III. POST-CERTIFICATION PROCESSING..... 1426

A.	DEVELOPMENT OF RECORD: DISCOVERY .....	1426
B.	SETTLEMENT OR INFORMAL RESOLUTION OF CLASS ACTIONS .....	1426
1.	Settlement Orders.....	1429
C.	SUMMARY JUDGMENT .....	1429
D.	HEARING .....	1429
1.	Official Time .....	1429
2.	Mixed Cases .....	1430
E.	DECISION .....	1430
F.	FINAL AGENCY ACTION .....	1430
1.	Notifying Class Members of Decision .....	1430
2.	Individual Claims for Relief .....	1430
G.	APPEAL STANDARDS .....	1431
1.	Agency Appeals.....	1431
2.	Complainant Appeals.....	1431
H.	REQUESTS TO REOPEN .....	1431
I.	ATTORNEY FEES .....	1431
IV.	CLASS ACTION THEORIES .....	1432
A.	INTENTIONAL DISCRIMINATION .....	1432
1.	<i>Prima Facie</i> Case .....	1432
2.	Disparate Treatment Analysis .....	1432
B.	ADVERSE IMPACT .....	1434
1.	Use of Statistical Evidence .....	1434
2.	Use of Anecdotal Evidence .....	1435
C.	REPRISAL .....	1435
D.	DISABILITY DISCRIMINATION AND REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION .....	1435
E.	VIOLATION OF CONSENT DECREES .....	1436
V.	CLASS ACTION RELIEF .....	1436
A.	ESTABLISHING INDIVIDUAL RELIEF .....	1436
B.	CLASS RELIEF .....	1437

## CHAPTER 19: EEO ALTERNATIVES ..... 1439

I.	NEGOTIATED GRIEVANCE PROCEDURES .....	1439
A.	EMPLOYEES AND AGENCIES COVERED .....	1440
1.	U.S. Postal Service .....	1440
2.	Other Exempt Agencies .....	1441
B.	ELECTING THE FORUM .....	1441
1.	Electing Both Forums .....	1442
2.	Union Election .....	1442
3.	Unsuccessful Election .....	1442
4.	Withdrawal of Grievance .....	1443
5.	Adjudication of Grievance .....	1443
6.	Failure to Raise Discrimination Allegation .....	1443
7.	Unfair Labor Practice Complaints .....	1443
8.	Subsequent Actions .....	1443
C.	EFFECTS OF ELECTION .....	1444
1.	Application of Law .....	1444
2.	Preservation of Grievance Rights .....	1444
D.	KNOWLEDGE OF DISCRIMINATION .....	1444
E.	ABSENCE OF DISCRIMINATION PROVISION IN AGREEMENT .....	1444
1.	Expiration of Agreement .....	1444
F.	DISCRIMINATION IN GRIEVANCE PROCEDURE .....	1444
1.	Inadequate Representation.....	1445
G.	EFFECT OF ARBITRATION DECISION .....	1445
H.	REVIEW BY EEOC .....	1445
1.	Arbitrability .....	1446
2.	Failure to Address Discrimination Allegations.....	1446
3.	Enforcement of Arbitration Awards .....	1446
II.	MIXED CASES BEFORE THE MERIT SYSTEMS PROTECTION BOARD .....	1446
A.	DEFINITION OF MIXED CASES AND APPEALS .....	1447
B.	JURISDICTION OF THE MSPB .....	1447
1.	Purpose of Mixed Case Legislation .....	1448

2.	Matters Clearly Within Board Jurisdiction .....	1449
3.	Matters Not Within Board Jurisdiction .....	1449
4.	Multiple Personnel Actions or Claims .....	1451
5.	Constructive Adverse Actions.....	1455
6.	Probationary Employees .....	1457
7.	Failure to Give Hearing Rights .....	1457
8.	Incorrect Appeal Rights .....	1458
9.	Whistleblower Complaints.....	1458
C.	ELECTION OF FORUM .....	1458
1.	Notice of Election Rights .....	1459
2.	Filing With Wrong Agency .....	1460
3.	Withdrawal of Appeal .....	1460
D.	EFFECTS OF ELECTION .....	1460
1.	Election of MSPB.....	1460
2.	Election of EEO Procedure .....	1461
3.	Effect of Final Agency Decision .....	1461
4.	Breach of Settlement Allegations .....	1461
5.	Last Chance Settlement Agreements .....	1462
E.	DUAL FILING PROCEDURES .....	1462
F.	REVIEW OF MSPB DECISIONS BY EEOC .....	1463
1.	Contents of Petition for Review .....	1463
2.	Consideration by EEOC .....	1463
3.	Failure to Raise Allegations of Discrimination .....	1464
4.	Failure of Board to Consider Allegations .....	1464
5.	Failure of Board to Consider Evidence.....	1467
G.	REFERRAL TO THE MSPB .....	1467
1.	Remand for Additional Evidence.....	1467
H.	REFERRAL TO SPECIAL PANEL .....	1467
I.	PARTIAL RELIEF .....	1468
1.	Relief Through Settlement .....	1468
J.	ALLEGATIONS RELATED TO BOARD PROCEEDINGS .....	1468
1.	Board-Ordered Relief .....	1468
K.	APPEAL OF DECISION TO DISMISS MIXED CASE .....	1468
L.	EFFECT OF DECISIONS BY OTHER AGENCIES .....	1468
M.	JUDICIAL REVIEW IN MIXED CASES .....	1468
III.	OTHER FORUMS .....	1470
A.	ADMINISTRATIVE GRIEVANCE PROCEDURES .....	1470
B.	WORKERS' COMPENSATION .....	1470
C.	ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE RESOLUTION .....	1470

## CHAPTER 20: FORMS OF RELIEF ..... 1473

I.	ELEMENTS OF EQUITABLE RELIEF .....	1473
A.	COMMISSION REGULATIONS ON RELIEF .....	1474
B.	NOTICE OF VIOLATION .....	1474
C.	RELIEF FOR INDIVIDUALS .....	1475
1.	Default Judgment .....	1475
D.	PUNITIVE RELIEF .....	1475
E.	CORRECTIVE RELIEF .....	1476
F.	COMPENSATORY DAMAGES .....	1476
G.	ESCAPING LIABILITY FOR DISCRIMINATION .....	1476
II.	PERSONS ELIGIBLE FOR RELIEF .....	1477
A.	RELIEF FOR APPLICANTS .....	1477
B.	RELIEF FOR EMPLOYEES .....	1478
1.	Displacement of Beneficiaries of Discrimination .....	1478
2.	Conditional Relief .....	1480
3.	Interim Relief .....	1480
4.	Reinstatement .....	1481
5.	Partial Remedies.....	1482
6.	Relief Following Default Judgment.....	1483
7.	Scope of Relief.....	1484
C.	RELIEF FOR THIRD PARTIES .....	1484

D.	RELIEF FOR CONTRACTORS .....	1485
III.	TYPES OF EQUITABLE RELIEF .....	1485
A.	BACK PAY—GENERAL .....	1485
1.	Ready, Willing, and Able to Work .....	1488
2.	Loss of Pay by Spouse .....	1489
B.	DEDUCTIONS FROM BACK PAY .....	1489
1.	Duty to Mitigate Damages .....	1489
2.	Corresponding Personnel Actions .....	1497
3.	Unemployment Compensation .....	1497
4.	Workers Compensation .....	1498
5.	Self-Employment Income .....	1500
6.	Health Insurance Premiums .....	1500
7.	Retirement Benefits .....	1501
8.	Debt to Agency .....	1502
9.	Voluntary Separation Incentive Pay .....	1502
10.	Union Dues .....	1503
C.	CALCULATING BACK PAY .....	1503
1.	Level of Back Pay .....	1503
2.	Period of Back Pay .....	1504
3.	Pay Steps .....	1505
4.	Overtime .....	1506
5.	Premium Pay .....	1507
6.	SES Positions .....	1508
7.	Thrift Savings and 401 (k) Plans .....	1508
D.	BACK PAY—U.S. POSTAL SERVICE .....	1509
E.	BACK PAY—NONAPPROPRIATED FUND AGENCIES .....	1509
F.	ADJUSTMENT OF RETIREMENT BENEFITS .....	1510
G.	INTEREST ON BACK PAY .....	1510
1.	Age Discrimination in Employment Act .....	1514
2.	U.S. Postal Service .....	1514
H.	TAX CONSEQUENCES OF BACK PAY AND DAMAGES .....	1514
1.	Taxability of Back Pay and Damages .....	1514
2.	Tax Consequences .....	1518
I.	ENTITLEMENT TO POSITIONS .....	1519
1.	Substantially Equivalent Positions .....	1521
2.	Geographic Location .....	1523
3.	Subsequent Promotions—"Job Skipping" .....	1524
4.	Probation .....	1527
5.	Temporary Appointments .....	1527
6.	Priority Consideration .....	1528
7.	Noncompetitive Selections .....	1529
8.	Failure to Qualify .....	1529
9.	Multiple Victims of Discrimination .....	1530
10.	Limited Liability Defense .....	1532
J.	OTHER FORMS OF EQUITABLE RELIEF .....	1533
1.	Front Pay .....	1533
2.	Restoration of Leave and Benefits .....	1538
3.	Seniority .....	1539
4.	Medical Expenses .....	1539
5.	Transfer or Reassignment .....	1540
6.	Relief Requested .....	1541
7.	Speculative Relief .....	1541
8.	Performance Evaluations .....	1541
9.	Performance-Based Awards .....	1541
10.	Remand v. Relief .....	1542
11.	Effect of Resignation or Retirement .....	1542
12.	Declaratory and Injunctive Relief .....	1545
13.	Certifications and Background Checks .....	1546
14.	Apologies .....	1546
15.	Remedial and Preventive Training .....	1546
16.	Systemic Relief .....	1548

17. Travel Expenses .....	1548
18. Loss of Vehicle .....	1549
19. Housing Expenses .....	1549
20. Cost of Living Allowances .....	1549
21. Recruitment.....	1549
K. RELIEF IN HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT CASES .....	1549
IV. RELIEF UNDER THE ADEA AND EPA .....	1549
A. LIQUIDATED DAMAGES .....	1550
V. COMPENSATORY DAMAGES .....	1550
A. AUTHORITY TO AWARD .....	1550
1. Adverse Impact Cases .....	1558
2. Unintentional Discrimination Cases.....	1558
B. DEFINITION OF COMPENSATORY DAMAGES .....	1559
1. Damages vs. Equitable Relief .....	1559
2. Past Pecuniary Damages .....	1560
3. Future Pecuniary Damages .....	1560
4. Nonpecuniary Damages .....	1562
5. Causation .....	1562
6. Findings of Administrative Judge .....	1563
C. DAMAGES UNDER REHABILITATION ACT .....	1564
1. Good Faith Exception .....	1564
D. DAMAGES UNDER ADEA.....	1566
E. DAMAGES UNDER EPA .....	1566
F. SEVERANCE OF DAMAGE ISSUES .....	1567
1. Offers of Full Relief .....	1567
G. TIME FOR ASSERTING DAMAGES .....	1567
1. Sufficiency of Claim .....	1568
2. Damages Hearings .....	1569
H. COMMISSION TRILOGY ON DAMAGES .....	1570
I. MOOTNESS .....	1580
J. PECUNIARY DAMAGE AWARD STANDARDS .....	1581
1. Medical Expenses.....	1582
2. Nominal Damages .....	1582
3. Housing Expenses.....	1582
4. Mortgage Foreclosure .....	1583
5. Outside Earnings .....	1583
6. Attorney Fees .....	1583
7. Computer Equipment.....	1583
8. Back Pay as Pecuniary Damages.....	1583
K. FUTURE PECUNIARY DAMAGES .....	1583
L. CALCULATING NONPECUNIARY DAMAGES .....	1586
1. Evidence Required .....	1588
2. Credibility Determinations .....	1589
3. Presumption of Harm .....	1589
4. Failure to Produce Evidence.....	1590
5. Statutory Cap .....	1590
6. Monetary Awards—Introduction.....	1591
7. Monetary Awards—\$5,000 and Less.....	1591
8. Monetary Awards—\$5,001–\$10,000 .....	1597
9. Monetary Awards—\$10,001–\$15,000 .....	1603
10. Monetary Awards—\$15,001–\$20,000 .....	1608
11. Monetary Awards—\$20,001–\$25,000 .....	1613
12. Monetary Awards—\$25,001–\$30,000 .....	1617
13. Monetary Awards—\$30,001–\$35,000 .....	1618
14. Monetary Awards—\$35,001–\$40,000 .....	1623
15. Monetary Awards—\$40,001–\$50,000 .....	1625
16. Monetary Awards—\$50,001–\$60,000 .....	1636
17. Monetary Awards—\$60,001–\$70,000 .....	1641
18. Monetary Awards—\$70,001–\$75,000 .....	1643
19. Monetary Awards—\$75,001–\$80,000 .....	1649
20. Monetary Awards—\$80,001–\$90,000 .....	1653

21. Monetary Awards—\$90,001–\$100,000.....	1656
22. Monetary Awards—\$100,001–\$125,000 .....	1664
23. Monetary Awards—\$125,001–\$150,000 .....	1669
24. Monetary Awards—\$150,001–\$200,000 .....	1676
25. Monetary Awards—\$200,001 and Above .....	1682
M. SPECIFIC DAMAGE ISSUES.....	1683
1. Previous Physical or Mental Illness .....	1683
2. Discovery of Psychiatric Evidence .....	1689
3. Physical Injuries.....	1689
4. Other External Factors .....	1689
5. Preexisting Fears.....	1691
6. Mitigation of Damages .....	1691
7. Termination of Employment .....	1691
8. Inability to Find Employment .....	1691
9. Loss of Outside Employment.....	1691
10. Harm to Others .....	1691
11. Couples Therapy.....	1692
12. Low Resistance Due to Stress or Fatigue .....	1692
13. Previous Rape .....	1692
14. Lack of Expert or Medical Testimony .....	1692
15. Pre-Act Conduct .....	1693
16. Retaliation Claims .....	1693
17. Breach of Settlement Agreements.....	1694
18. Effects of Litigation .....	1694
19. Multiple Victims of Discrimination.....	1694
20. Multiple Claims of Discrimination.....	1694
21. Age Discrimination Claims.....	1695
22. Partially Prevailing Complainants.....	1695
23. Conduct Outside Workplace .....	1695
24. Health Insurance and Medical Expenses .....	1695
25. Health Care Travel Expenses.....	1696
26. FECA Claims .....	1696
27. Loans, Interest, and Penalties.....	1696
28. Job Search Expenses .....	1697
29. Travel Expenses .....	1697
30. Moving and Housing Expenses and Loss on Sale of Home .....	1697
31. Foreclosure Costs .....	1698
32. Housekeeping Expenses.....	1699
33. Loss of Rental Income .....	1699
34. Chiropractor Expenses .....	1699
35. Massage Therapy.....	1699
36. Pet Care.....	1699
37. Auto Accidents.....	1699
38. Repossession of Auto.....	1699
39. Undisputed Amounts .....	1699
40. Collateral Source Rule .....	1699
N. ISSUANCE OF DAMAGE DECISIONS.....	1700
1. Appellate Decisions.....	1700
O. INTEREST ON COMPENSATORY DAMAGES .....	1700
P. TAXES ON COMPENSATORY DAMAGES .....	1701
Q. PUNITIVE DAMAGES .....	1702
R. DAMAGES IN OTHER FORUMS.....	1706
1. Merit Systems Protection Board .....	1706
2. Arbitration .....	1706
VI. DISCIPLINARY AND CORRECTIVE ACTION .....	1706
A. OFFICE OF SPECIAL COUNSEL .....	1708
B. MERIT SYSTEMS PROTECTION BOARD .....	1708
VII. ENFORCEMENT OF REMEDIES .....	1709
A. PETITIONS FOR ENFORCEMENT .....	1710
B. ENFORCEMENT BY COMMISSION.....	1710
1. Sanctions for Noncompliance .....	1711

VIII. TIMING OF RELIEF .....	1711
A. DOCTRINE OF LACHES .....	1711

## CHAPTER 21: ATTORNEY FEES..... 1713

I. PROCEDURES FOR SUBMITTING FEE REQUEST .....	1714
A. REQUIREMENTS OF FEE PETITION .....	1715
1. Proper Party .....	1715
B. EXTENSIONS OF TIME .....	1715
C. FILING WITH WRONG AGENCY .....	1716
D. FAILURE TO ISSUE FEE DECISION .....	1716
E. MSPB CASES .....	1716
II. PREVAILING PARTIES .....	1716
A. PRESUMPTION OF ENTITLEMENT.....	1722
B. REVIEW STANDARD FOR AJ AWARDS.....	1722
C. PREVAILING THROUGH SETTLEMENT .....	1722
1. Breach of Settlement Agreements .....	1724
2. Compliance and Enforcement Petitions .....	1724
D. PREVAILING ON PROCEDURAL ISSUES .....	1724
1. Fees as Sanctions .....	1725
2. Fees Against Employees .....	1726
3. Official Time Complaints .....	1726
4. <i>Per Se</i> Regulatory Violations .....	1726
E. PREVAILING THROUGH GRIEVANCE PROCEDURE .....	1727
F. ACTIONS OUTSIDE TITLE VII.....	1728
G. OFFERS OF RESOLUTION .....	1728
H. MOOT CASES .....	1728
I. UNJUST AWARDS .....	1729
III. THE “LODESTAR” .....	1729
A. REASONABLE HOURLY RATE .....	1732
1. Prevailing Market Rate and Nonlocal Counsel .....	1733
2. Applicable Time Period .....	1735
3. <i>Laffey</i> Matrix .....	1735
4. Customary Rate .....	1735
5. Contractual Rate .....	1736
6. Discount Rates .....	1737
7. Rates in MSPB Cases .....	1738
8. Excise Taxes .....	1738
9. Contingency Agreements .....	1738
B. ADJUSTMENTS TO HOURLY RATES .....	1739
1. Downward Adjustments .....	1739
2. Fee Enhancements .....	1739
3. Experience of Counsel.....	1742
C. HOURS REASONABLY EXPENDED .....	1743
1. Claims Not Raised in Complaint.....	1744
2. Fees in Counseling Stage .....	1744
3. Preparation of Complaint.....	1744
4. Partial and Fractionable Fees .....	1744
5. Frivolous Claims.....	1748
6. Contact With Clients .....	1748
7. File Updates.....	1748
8. Clerical Work .....	1748
9. Ascertaining Case Status .....	1749
10. Settlement Negotiations .....	1749
11. Legal Research .....	1749
12. Review of Documents.....	1749
13. Preparation of Discovery Materials.....	1749
14. Investigation Preparation .....	1750
15. Investigation by Counsel.....	1750
16. Hearing Preparation .....	1750
17. Summary Judgment Motions.....	1750
18. Review of Decisions.....	1750



19. Related Actions .....	1750
20. Time Records .....	1750
21. Experience of Counsel .....	1752
22. Work on Appeal .....	1752
23. Fee Petitions .....	1752
D. TAXES ON FEE AWARDS .....	1753
E. INTEREST ON FEE AWARDS .....	1754
F. FAILURE OF COUNSEL TO REIMBURSE COMPLAINANT .....	1755
1. Attorney Fee Liens .....	1755
G. MIXED MOTIVE CASES .....	1755
H. BAR STATUS OF COUNSEL .....	1758
I. SERVICES RENDERED BY OTHERS .....	1758
1. Multiple Attorneys .....	1758
2. Change in Counsel .....	1760
3. Paralegals .....	1760
4. Investigators .....	1760
J. COMPENSATORY DAMAGES .....	1760
K. AGE DISCRIMINATION .....	1760
1. Reprisal .....	1761
2. Mixed Cases .....	1761
3. Civil Actions .....	1761
4. Fees as Sanctions .....	1762
L. ADA INQUIRY AND EXAMINATION VIOLATIONS .....	1762
M. NOTICE OF REPRESENTATION .....	1763
N. DEFENSE OF FEE AWARDS .....	1763
1. Standard of Review .....	1764
O. UNION AND NON-PROFIT LEGAL REPRESENTATIVES .....	1764
P. FEDERAL EMPLOYEE REPRESENTATIVES .....	1764
Q. LAYMAN REPRESENTATIVES .....	1764
R. BURDENS OF PROOF .....	1764
S. ENFORCEMENT ACTIONS .....	1764
T. FEDERAL COURT WORK .....	1765
U. TRAVEL TIME .....	1766
V. AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES FOR AGENCIES .....	1766
W. COSTS .....	1766
1. Witness Fees .....	1767
2. Expert Witness Fees .....	1768
3. Out-Of-Town Attorneys .....	1768
4. Business Equipment .....	1769
5. Interest .....	1769
6. Taxes .....	1769
7. Reasonable Accommodation Expenses .....	1769

TABLE OF CASES .....	1771
----------------------	------

INDEX .....	1841
-------------	------

