

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

---

<b>PREFACE</b> .....	<b>i</b>
<b>CHAPTER 1: DUE PROCESS AND THE STATUTORY SCHEME— AN OVERVIEW</b> .....	<b>1</b>
I. COVERED EMPLOYEES GENERALLY CONSIDERED TO HAVE A PROPERTY INTEREST IN CONTINUED EMPLOYMENT AND PROCEDURAL DUE PROCESS, PRE- AND POST-DEPRIVATION.....	4
II. THE PRE-DEPRIVATION STATUTORY, REGULATORY ENTITLEMENTS OF COVERED EMPLOYEES.....	8
III. THE POST-DEPRIVATION APPEAL RIGHTS OF COVERED EMPLOYEES .....	16
A. SHORT SUSPENSIONS: “NON-ADVERSE ACTIONS”.....	20
B. MAJOR, APPEALABLE ADVERSE ACTIONS .....	21
IV. BOARD PROCESS AND PROCEDURE; POST-DEPRIVATION DUE PROCESS....	23
<b>CHAPTER 2: “LIBERTY, OR PROPERTY” AND DUE PROCESS: A CONSTITUTIONAL OVERVIEW</b> .....	<b>27</b>
I. DUE PROCESS OF LAW: WHAT IT IS; WHERE IT CAME FROM .....	28
II. SUBSTANTIVE DUE PROCESS; PROCEDURAL DUE PROCESS.....	29
A. “LIFE, LIBERTY, OR PROPERTY” .....	30
B. LIBERTY AND PROPERTY INTERESTS AND THE REQUIRED PROCESS .....	37
1. Liberty Interests.....	38
a. Liberty Interests: Harm to Reputation; Stigma-Plus .....	40
2. Property Interests.....	43
3. The Deprivation of a Liberty or Property Interests .....	48
4. Essential Due Process: Notice and a “Hearing” .....	48
<b>CHAPTER 3: “LIBERTY OR PROPERTY” AND DUE PROCESS IN GOVERNMENT EMPLOYMENT</b> .....	<b>65</b>
I. LIBERTY INTERESTS.....	65
A. LIBERTY INTEREST, NAME-CLEARING HEARINGS: THE PROCESS DUE .....	69
II. PROPERTY INTERESTS .....	80
A. PROPERTY INTERESTS FOUND (OR NOT FOUND) IN LEGISLATION.....	80
B. PROPERTY INTERESTS FOUND OR NOT IN HANDBOOKS, POLICIES.....	87
1. What Process Is Due and When.....	93
<b>CHAPTER 4: THE STONE, WARD CRITERIA, ANALYTICAL MODEL ..</b>	<b>101</b>
I. THE STONE CRITERIA: ONLY NEW AND MATERIAL INFORMATION CAN CONSTITUTE A DUE PROCESS VIOLATION .....	101

A.	STONE FACTOR 1: NEW OR CUMULATIVE (CLARIFYING, CONFIRMING INFORMATION) AND POST-REPLY INQUIRIES .....	105
B.	STONE FACTOR 2: THE EMPLOYEE KNEW OF THE ERROR AND HAD AN OPPORTUNITY TO RESPOND TO IT .....	108
C.	STONE FACTOR 3: MATERIAL AND THE WARD CLARIFICATION OF THE STONE ANALYTICAL MODEL .....	109
1.	Materiality Is Considered Established When Admitted to Be Influential.....	109
2.	An <i>Ex Parte</i> Communication Introducing New and Material Information Results in a Due Process Violation Whether It Goes to the Penalty or to the Merits .....	110
3.	Under <i>Ward</i> , the Board Is Required to Apply a Harmful Error Analysis to Unnoticed Information, if the Board Has Previously Found That Information Did Not Rise to the Level of a Due Process Violation .....	113
II.	THE CONFUSION BETWEEN HARMFUL PROCEDURAL ERROR AND A DUE PROCESS VIOLATION IN THE AFTERMATH OF <i>STONE</i> .....	115
III.	THE <i>STONE</i> , <i>WARD</i> CRITERIA: THE ESSENTIALS.....	120
A.	THE <i>STONE</i> ANALYTICAL MODEL.....	120
B.	THE ULTIMATE QUESTION: SUBSTANTIAL, PREJUDICIAL, MATERIAL .....	121
C.	THE <i>STONE</i> FACTORS REDUX .....	121
1.	<i>Stone</i> Factor One: New or Cumulative .....	122
2.	<i>Stone</i> Factor Two: Know of Error and Have Chance to Reply....	122
3.	<i>Stone</i> Factor Three: Type Likely to Result in Undue Pressure ...	123
4.	The Essentials: The Key Rules and Cases.....	123
<b>CHAPTER 5: THE <i>EX PARTE</i> COMMUNICATION .....</b>		<b>125</b>
I.	THE <i>EX PARTE</i> COMMUNICATION: WHAT IT IS, WHAT IT ISN'T; SOME COMMON AND UNCOMMON SITUATIONS .....	126
<b>CHAPTER 6: THE <i>STONE</i>, <i>WARD</i> FACTORS IN ACTUAL PRACTICE, REAL TIME.....</b>		<b>137</b>
I.	STONE FACTOR 1: NEW OR CUMULATIVE (CLARIFYING OR CONFIRMING) .....	139
A.	DEFINING NEW .....	139
B.	DEFINING CUMULATIVE.....	140
C.	RECURRING PROBLEM: DECIDING OFFICIAL POST-REPLY INQUIRIES AND REJECTIONS .....	143
D.	RECURRING PROBLEM: CHARGING DOWN AND PROVING UP; UNNOTICED AGGRAVATORS, AND RELATED ISSUES .....	153
E.	THE PROPOSAL NOTICE IS NOT TREATED AS A SELF-CONTAINED DOCUMENT: <i>MRU<sub>s</sub> ET AL</i> CAN PROVIDE NOTICE .....	163
F.	UNNOTICED INFORMATION PERTAINING TO CREDIBILITY FALLS OFTEN OUTSIDE THE SCOPE OF CUMULATIVE, CLARIFYING, CONFIRMING AND MAY BE CONSIDERED NEW AND MATERIAL ...	169

G.	A DECIDING OFFICIAL’S KNOWLEDGE ALONE, WITHOUT MORE, DOES NOT ESTABLISH UNNOTICED INFORMATION AS NEW AND MATERIAL.....	179
H.	THE SPECIFICITY OF THE UNNOTICED INFORMATION AND ITS REFERENCE TO ADDITIONAL DISTINCT INCIDENTS CAN ESTABLISH THAT INFORMATION WAS NEW, NOT CUMULATIVE.....	180
II.	STONE FACTOR 2: THE EMPLOYEE KNEW AND HAD AN OPPORTUNITY TO RESPOND .....	183
A.	DEFINING THE EMPLOYEE KNEW.....	183
B.	KNOW OR SHOULD HAVE KNOWN .....	184
C.	AN EMPLOYEE’S AWARENESS OF AN UNNOTICED INCIDENT DOES NOT, WITHOUT MORE, SHOW THAT INCIDENT TO BE CUMULATIVE OR THAT THE EMPLOYEE KNEW THE AGENCY WAS CONSIDERING IT OR RELYING ON IT.....	194
III.	STONE FACTOR 3: THE INFORMATION WAS OF A TYPE LIKELY TO RESULT IN UNDUE PRESSURE .....	208
A.	DEFINING UNDUE PRESSURE, MATERIALITY.....	208
B.	AN ADMISSION THAT UNNOTICED INFORMATION WAS CONSIDERED USUALLY PROVES MATERIALITY AND SATISFIES STONE FACTOR 3; BUT KNOWLEDGE ALONE, WITHOUT AN ADMISSION OR SPECIFIC DOCUMENTATION WILL NOT PROVE MATERIALITY.....	211
C.	SPECIFIC IDENTIFICATION, EVEN WITHOUT AN EXPRESS ADMISSION, CAN IN SOME INSTANCES ESTABLISH MATERIALITY, RELIANCE.....	222
D.	THE TYPE OF INFORMATION CAN ESTABLISH MATERIALITY.....	232

**CHAPTER 7: AGENCY INVESTIGATIONS: DUE PROCESS, RIGHTS, PRIVILEGES .....241**

I.	A FEDERAL EMPLOYEE HAS A DUTY TO COOPERATE IN AN ADMINISTRATIVE INVESTIGATION.....	242
A.	SELF-INCRIMINATION AND <i>MIRANDA</i> WARNINGS.....	244
B.	<i>KALKINES</i> , <i>GARRITY</i> , AND <i>WEINGARTEN</i> WARNINGS.....	246
1.	<i>Garrity</i> Warnings: No Use Immunity .....	246
2.	<i>Kalkines</i> Warnings: Use Immunity .....	248
a.	The Danger in Inadvertent Immunizations .....	252
3.	<i>Weingarten</i> Warnings.....	253
C.	THE DUTY TO COOPERATE: MSPB SUMMARY.....	254
II.	WORKPLACE SEARCHES AND THE FOURTH AMENDMENT.....	256
III.	REPRESENTATION IN INQUIRY OR INVESTIGATION .....	278
IV.	PRIVACY ACT RESTRAINTS ON AGENCY INVESTIGATIONS.....	280
V.	A BRIEF COMMENT ON THE FIRST AMENDMENT .....	282

**CHAPTER 8: AGENCY ADVERSE ACTIONS: DUE PROCESS, RIGHTS, PRIVILEGES .....285**

I.	5 USC 7513’S PREDECISIONAL REQUIREMENTS: DUE PROCESS OR NOT—WHAT HAPPENS WHEN NOT PROVIDED? .....	287
II.	THE ADVANCE NOTICE: TESTING FOR CLARITY .....	299

A.	THE CLARITY OF THE CHARGED MISCONDUCT .....	300
1.	Amendments to the Proposal.....	313
B.	THE DUE PROCESS REQUIREMENT FOR AN EXPLANATION OF THE AGENCY EVIDENCE; 5 USC 7513(E) AND 5 CFR 752.404(B)(1)'S REQUIREMENT FOR THE "MATERIALS RELIED UPON" .....	313
III.	THE OPPORTUNITY TO REPLY .....	320
A.	THE TIME PERIODS .....	320
B.	COLLAPSING THE NOTICE PERIOD UNDER THE CRIME PROVISION .....	323
C.	THE ORAL AND WRITTEN REPLIES.....	326
D.	THE ORAL REPLY AND ITS SCOPE .....	327
1.	The Oral Reply Official .....	328
2.	The Oral Reply In Practice.....	329
E.	POST-REPLY DECIDING OFFICIAL "INVESTIGATIONS" .....	339
IV.	DUE PROCESS, HARMFUL ERROR AND THE DECISIONAL PROCESS: REDUX FROM A DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVE.....	341
A.	THE AGENCY DECIDING OFFICIAL: A CONSTITUTIONAL OFFICER AND FUNDAMENTAL FAIRNESS.....	341
B.	THE DANGER IN CHANGING THE DECIDING OFFICIAL .....	349
C.	THE DECIDING OFFICIAL'S DECISION: REGULATORY AND DUE PROCESS REQUIREMENTS .....	358
D.	THE AGENCY DECISION AND THE REASONS NOTICED.....	363
E.	THE DECIDING OFFICIAL AND <i>EX PARTE</i> COMMUNICATIONS.....	366
F.	AMENDMENT, RESCISSION, RECHARGING.....	371

**CHAPTER 9: THE WARD MODEL—**

**DUE PROCESS AND HARMFUL ERROR .....373**

I.	THE STATUTORY, REGULATORY FRAMEWORK.....	376
II.	THE SEMINAL, DEFINING HARMFUL ERROR CASES .....	377
III.	SOME HARMFUL PROCEDURAL ERROR ISSUES AND CASES, POST-WARD, FOLLOWING <i>WARD'S</i> TWO-STEP ANALYSIS .....	396

**CHAPTER 10: DUE PROCESS—SECURITY CLEARANCES,**

**FURLOUGHS, BASE BARS, AND MORE .....407**

I.	BOARD REVIEW: <i>NAVY V. EGAN</i> .....	408
II.	REMOVALS, DEMOTIONS BASED ON THE REVOCATION OF A SECURITY CLEARANCE OR THE INELIGIBILITY TO OCCUPY A NONCRITICAL SENSITIVE POSITION .....	410
A.	SENSITIVE POSITIONS NOT REQUIRING SECURITY CLEARANCES ..	416
III.	INDEFINITE SUSPENSIONS BASED ON SECURITY DETERMINATIONS, INCLUDING DENIALS OF ELIGIBILITY TO OCCUPY A NONCRITICAL SENSITIVE POSITION .....	419
A.	<i>GARGIULO, BUELNA</i> : REDEFINING, RESTRICTING DUE PROCESS....	422
B.	<i>GARGIULO, BUELNA</i> AND NONCRITICAL SENSITIVE POSITIONS....	439
IV.	FURLOUGHS .....	443
V.	BASE BARS; LOSS OF MILITARY QUALIFICATIONS.....	448

**TABLE OF CASES .....453**